Order Number 8920208

Facets of the life and teaching of Chan Master Yunmen Wenyan (864–949). (Volumes I and II)

App, Urs Erwin, Ph.D.
Temple University, 1989

Copyright ©1989 by App, Urs Erwin. All rights reserved.
FACETS OF
THE LIFE AND TEACHING
OF CHAN MASTER
YUNMEN WENYAN
雲門文偃
(864–949)

A Dissertation
Submitted to
the Temple University Graduate Board

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
of
Doctor of Philosophy

by
Urs E. App
May 1989

Volume I
Title of Dissertation: Facets of the Life and Teaching of Chan Master Yunmen Wenyan (864 - 949)

Author: Urs E. APP

Read and Approved by:

Date submitted to Graduate Board: April 13, 1989

Accepted by the Graduate Board of Temple University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Date

(Dean of Graduate School)
Radikal sein ist die Sache an der Wurzel fassen. Die Wurzel für den Menschen ist aber der Mensch selbst.

To be radical is to take hold of a matter at its root. Now for man the root is man himself.

Karl Marx
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

It is with great pleasure that I acknowledge the help and encouragement of so many people and institutions which were vital to the completion of this work. Above all, I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my main advisor, Professor Richard DeMartino, whose example and instruction have guided my efforts in the field of Zen Studies from the very beginning. I consider myself extremely fortunate to have had the privilege of studying under his guidance, and I will endeavor to better express my gratitude to him in future writings and research. My heartfelt thanks also go to many earlier teachers and mentors, Japanese and Western: to Mr. Takagi Akifumi who in 1974-75 gave me free daily instruction in Japanese; to Dr. Arai Katsuko, my Japanese mother; to the philosopher Professor Nishitani Keiji who nurtured my interest in Zen thought (1977-79); to Professor Nathan Sivin who guided my first steps into sinology (1981-82); to Professor Iriya Yoshitaka without whose seminars on the Records of Yunmen (1982-1986), expert advice, and perceptive criticism of my translations I would not even have dared to write on Yunmen; and to Professor Yanagida Seizan whose lectures, seminars (1982-86), writings, and advice all reflect exemplary and inspiring scholarship. I also extend my thanks to Professors Thomas Dean and Charles Fu, the other members of my doctoral committee.

My thanks also go to many relatives and friends who have, directly and indirectly, provided support and encouragement for my work. Above all I am indebted to my best friend Steven Antinoff who not only re-opened the door to my interest in Zen (1976-79), introduced me to Dr. DeMartino, and over several years as house-mate and co-student shared and discussed my central interests, but also gave me some helpful suggestions concerning chapter III. I would also like to thank my dear parents and my generous eldest brother Pius for their moral and financial support of my work, especially during the last phase of research and redaction in Switzerland (1986-89). I am also grateful for the considerable financial help which I received from Temple University in the form of tuition remissions and stipends and from the Japanese Government in the form of a Monbusho scholarship (1982-83).
# Table of Contents

## Volume I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Abbreviations</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conventions</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes to the introduction</td>
<td>xxiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapters

### I. The Life of Master Yunmen Wenyan 雲門文信 (864-949)

- A. Introduction .................................. 1
- B. Concise Biography ............................... 2
  1. Youth and early monastic life
  2. Master Muzhou; awakening
  3. Beginning pilgrimage; Master Xuefeng
  4. Further pilgrimage
  5. Settling down in Guangdong; teaching
- C. Translation of the Master’s grave inscription .. 10

### II. The Records of Yunmen: Structure and History

- A. Introduction .................................. 18
- B. Survey of the structure of the text .......... 19
  Table 1: Proportional structure of the text
- C. History of the text ............................. 22
  1. Taking and gathering of notes
  2. The first manuscripts
  3. The earliest printed edition
  4. Texts commented by Muan Shanqing
  5. The Su Xie edition of 1076
  6. The Yuanjue edition from around 1144
  7. The Xukai guzunsu yuyao excerpts
  8. Extant complete texts
- D. Conclusion .................................... 39
III. FACETS OF MASTER YUNMEN'S TEACHING
A. Approach .......................................................... 40
B. Teaching Situations and Patterns .......................... 42
   Table 2: Distribution of teaching patterns  .......... 42
   1. Formal public instruction
   2. Exchanges initiated by someone's question
   3. Verse
   4. Ordinary informal instruction
   5. Informal instruction based on a quote
   6. Substitute answers
C. The Students' Questions ..................................... 49
   1. Question types according to Fenyang Shanzhao
   2. Major themes of students' questions
D. The Central Concern .......................................... 60
E. Overcoming Suffering ......................................... 68
   1. No way will do
   2. No-way as way
   3. One must do it oneself
   4. One must be the solution
F. The Chan Teacher and his Task ............................ 80
   1. The teacher's handicap
   2. Enlightened expression and paradox
   3. Yunmen's view of the Chan teacher's role
G. Yunmen's Teaching Method ................................ 94
   1. Introduction
   2. Characterizations of Yunmen and his 'house style'
   3. Distribution and types of Yunmen's questions
   4. Types of Yunmen's answers
   5. Challenge and testing
   6. Criticism, admonition, and encouragement
   7. Sample public instruction with comment
H. Koan and Doubt .................................................. 142
   1. Doubt
   2. Koan
I. Breaking through Duality .................................. 160
   1. Jizang's three levels of the two truths
   2. The three levels of Baizhang
   3. Going beyond duality
   4. Letting go
J. Nonduality ....................................................... 173
   1. Authentic nonduality
   2. The True Self
   3. Freedom
IV. SELECTED INSTRUCTIONS IN TRANSLATION ...... 188

SELECTIVE BIBLIOGRAPHY ............... 205

VOLUME II

APPENDICES

1. Translation of prefaces to the Records of Yunmen .. 217
2. Biographical chart .................. 220
3. Map to Yunmen's life .................. 223
4. List of main biographical sources ........ 224
5. Annotated list of biographical sources ........ 225
6. List of lost and extant Records of Yunmen .......... 237
7. Content of early Records of Yunmen ........ 238
8. Chodang chip passages and the Yunmenlu .......... 239
9. Jingde chuandenglu passages and the Yunmenlu .... 240
10. The Zuting shiyuan commentary and the Yunmenlu ... 241
11. The Xukai guzunsu yuyao text and the Yunmenlu ... 246
12. List of translated passages ............. 248
13. Index to notes on Chan vocabulary ........... 251

ENDNOTES ........................................ 258
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BD  Bukkyōgo daijiten
BJS  Baojing shunmei
BED  Busho kaisetsu daijiten (Ono/Karuyama)
BWZ  Dunhuang bianwen zi yi tongshi
BYL  Fuguo Yuanwu chanshi biyianlu
BGZL  Baizhang guanglu
BGZLC  Baizhang guanglu Cleary translation
CBS  Chūgoku bukkyōshi jiten
CC  Chodang chip
CEL  Congronglu
CYZ  Changyuan zhuquandji douru
CZJ  Chūgoku zenshū jinmei sakuin
DDJ  Daodejing
DHBW  Dunhuang bianwenji
DHFY  Dabui hayu
DHS  Dabui shu
DSL  Dongshanlu
DSSZ  Deshan shizhong
FZGM  Fozu gangou
FZJ  Fozu tongji
FZTZ  Fozu lidai tongzai
GZYL  Guszusu yulu
GZYY  Guszusu yuyao
HG  Höbōgin
JDL  Jingde chuandeng lu
JDLK  Jingde chuandeng lu (Korean edition)
JGJ  Jingang jing
JGL  Jueguan lun
JK  Shōkusan joketsu
JLF  Jiliyuanshitsurien
JWDS  Jiu wudai shi
KG  Kattō gosen [Fanagida ed.]
LDHY  Liandeng buiyao

仏教語大辞典
寳鏡三味歌
Bijutsu kagaku doulikei
百丈廣録
百丈廣録

listed abbr.

ABREVIATIONS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LJJL</td>
<td>Linjilu</td>
<td>T 47, Nr.1985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LJLD</td>
<td>Linjilu Demièville translation</td>
<td>ZZ 148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LJLS</td>
<td>Linjilu Sasaki translation</td>
<td>ZZ 130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LJLY</td>
<td>Linjilu Yanagida translation</td>
<td>ZZ 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LJNL</td>
<td>Linjianlu</td>
<td>ZZ 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LXTL</td>
<td>Longxing fojiao biannian tonglun</td>
<td>ZZ 135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>(Morohashi) Daikanwa jiten</td>
<td>ZZ 148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBB</td>
<td>Mohe banre boluoai jing</td>
<td>ZZ 130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MZ</td>
<td>Mochisuki: Bukkyō daijiten</td>
<td>ZZ 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZHL</td>
<td>Mushou yulu</td>
<td>ZZ 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NLZL</td>
<td>Musu yulu</td>
<td>ZZ 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MZLY</td>
<td>Musu yulu Iriya translation</td>
<td>ZZ 120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NHJSZ</td>
<td>Nanhan jinshizhi</td>
<td>ZZ 148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NHWZL</td>
<td>Nanhan wensilue</td>
<td>ZZ 130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NES</td>
<td>Nanhan shu</td>
<td>ZZ 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODA</td>
<td>Ods: Bukkyō daijiten</td>
<td>ZZ 120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PJS</td>
<td>Pang jushu yulu</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PJSI</td>
<td>Pang jushu yulu Iriya translation</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PJSB</td>
<td>Pang jushu yulu Sasaki/Iriya/Fraser translation</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWYF</td>
<td>Peiwen yunfu</td>
<td>ZZ 148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>(Ricci Institute) Hanfa songhe zidian</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSBP</td>
<td>(Oda) Chūgoku rekishi bunpō</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S959</td>
<td>Shixingbei stele of 959</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S964</td>
<td>Beiming stele of 964</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S6Z</td>
<td>Chanlin sengbaozhuan</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSZ</td>
<td>Song gaozengzhuan</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH</td>
<td>Soothill/Hodous (Dict. of Chinese Buddh. terms)</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>Zenrin shōkisen [Yanagida ed.]</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td>Shoroku sokugokai</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SJSCL</td>
<td>Shishi jigu lue</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SZBY</td>
<td>Sengzhan paiyun</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VKN</td>
<td>Weizhongjing (Vimalakirti Sutra)</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDNY</td>
<td>Wudeng huiyan</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WJTL</td>
<td>Wujiu yulu</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WJZSW</td>
<td>Wujiu zhengzongsan</td>
<td>ZZ 137</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ABBREVIATIONS**
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Proportional structure of the Yunmenlu

Table 2: Distribution of teaching patterns in the Yunmenlu
CONVENTIONS

1. Transliterations and abbreviations

- The Pinyin transliteration is used for Chinese not because it is the most logical or the best but because it is the de facto standard today. Some publications in this field still use the Wade-Giles system, and others Japanese readings; instead of making everything even more complicated by including long lists of corresponding transliterations (which can be found in most dictionaries anyway), I chose to insert many Chinese characters; thus at least the reader familiar with these characters will immediately know what is meant.

- The Pinyin rule is broken only a few times, when Chinese place names are very well known in Wade-Giles or other transliterations (for instance 'Szechwan').

- For Japanese, the revised Hepburn transliteration is used. Long vowels are indicated by the symbol 除了 except in the case of well-known Japanese cities such as Kyoto and Tokyo where they are not indicated.

- For Korean terms, the McCune-Reischauer transliteration was chosen.

- A multitude of repeated references is made, particularly in the footnotes, to Chinese and Japanese texts. As they will only be of service to readers familiar with those languages, abbreviations (based on Pinyin transliteration for Chinese or Hepburn for Japanese) are preferred to transcribed titles; in exchange, these abbreviations are immediately followed by what they stand for, written in Chinese and Japanese characters. Thus the reader familiar with these characters will very rarely need to use the list of abbreviations. The only exceptions to this are the abbreviations YML (referring to the Records of Yunmen), T (for the Taishô collection of Buddhist texts), ZZ (for the Zokuzôkyô collection, and M (for the Morohashi Chinese-Japanese dictionary; these abbreviations occur frequently enough to make the constant repetition of their titles in Chinese characters redundant.
2. References to dictionaries, texts, and persons

- References to Morohashi and other dictionaries: In general, (volume and) page numbers are followed by the letters a, b, c, and sometimes d; these letters indicate the horizontal columns or segments of a given page. Particular characters or compounds are indicated by character and compound number.

- References to the Taishô canon: A bold T is followed by the volume number, the text number in brackets (for instance {235}), the page number, the page segment symbol (a, b, or c), and the line number.

- References to the Zokuzōkyō canon: A bold ZZ is followed by the volume number of the Taiwan edition; the page numbering follows the old double-page edition which is also kept (in Chinese numbers) in the side margins of the Taiwan edition (a first page recto, b first page verso, c second page verso, d second page recto).

- References to Mujaku Dōchû materials: printed materials are referred to in the ordinary way; for unpublished manuscripts, the volume number is indicated.

- References to Chinese classics: When Harvard-Yenching concordances are available, their text pagination and line numbering is used.

- Titles of works appear in italics except in abbreviations.

- Personal names are used as in their countries of origin; hence references to names of Japanese and Chinese persons begin with the surname and end with the given name(s).

3. Chronological issues

- The age of persons is given in the Western fashion, not in the Chinese manner where one is age 1 at birth.

- When Chinese calendar information appears in the form of sexagesimal cycle symbols and reign mottos (nianhao 年號), the corresponding Western calendar date is indicated.

4. Authorship of translations

If not otherwise mentioned, all translations from Chinese, Japanese, French, and German sources are by the author. A few more or less
reliable translations of Chan texts have been of good service to me; this was also the case when I prepared and used my own translation of these texts. The following works merit particular mention: Ruth Sasaki et al.'s English, Paul Demiéville's French, and Yanagida Seizan's Japanese translations of the Records of Linji, Iriya Yoshitaka's English and Japanese translations of the Recorded Sayings of Layman Pang, and Thomas and J.C. Cleary's English translation of the Blue Cliff Record.

5. Translation and Annotation

Every effort has been made to make the translations both literal and readable. In the case of historical materials such as inscriptions and prefaces, the tendency is to give as literal a rendering of the text as possible, while translations of instructions and dialogues are somewhat more idiomatic for the sake of readability. The footnotes reflect this double endeavor by often providing literal equivalents where idiomatic expressions appear in the translation, and vice-versa.

Sanskrit equivalents of Chinese Buddhist terms are in general not given. There is no indication that the Chan masters knew Sanskrit, but they were familiar with Chan texts and, to a varying degree, with Chinese Buddhist literature. The texts and passages that are quoted or referred to in footnotes stem mostly from the corpus with which the masters themselves are likely to have been familiar. Thus the overwhelming majority of textual references and quotes stems from or is made to Chinese texts of the Tang, Five Dynasties, and Song periods, and reference works which relate directly to such texts are mentioned with preference.

For the sake of easier use all notes to the text (i.e., notes on pages numbered in Arabic numerals) appear at the end of volume II. As a fair number of Chan terms are discussed in some detail, a Pinyin index (Appendix 13) is included for the convenience of interested readers, researchers, and translators.
INTRODUCTION

(Notes to this introduction are found on pp. xiii-xxiv)

The overall aim of this dissertation is, as its title indicates, to provide information on the life and teaching of Chan Master Yunmen Wenyan 雲門文偃 who lived from 864 to 949 in China.

Information on Master Yunmen's life stems from stone inscriptions and various other texts. Chapter I not only furnishes a concise biography of the Master based on a critical analysis of the most reliable biographical sources but also a translation of the biographical part of the earliest stone inscription. In the notes to this translation all important biographical source materials are analyzed and compared. Additional information pertaining to the Master's biography and its sources is found in appendices 2, 3, 4, and 5 of volume II.

The bulk of Master Yunmen's teaching was transmitted in the form of a single text in three volumes, the Extensive Records of Yunmen (Yunmen guanglu 雲門廣錄; in the following called Records of Yunmen, Records, or abbreviated as YML). The history and structure of the Records of Yunmen are outlined in the second chapter and in appendices 6 and 7. For our research we used the oldest and most reliable text available, namely, that contained in the Guzunsu yulu 古尊宿語錄. Its original is stored in Taiwan's National Central Library 台灣國立中央圖書館 in Taiphei, but a photocopy of the part on Yunmen is also found at the library of Komazawa University 駒沢大学 in Tokyo. Since this edition is not generally available, its unpunctuated text was painstakingly compared with the widely available but flawed Taisho text. In this dissertation all references to the YML are made to the Taisho text, but whenever significant discrepancies with the older Song text from Taiwan exist, these are noted.

The third chapter is an attempt to distill and analyze some central facets of Master Yunmen's teaching from this text, and chapter four consists of the writer's annotated translations of Master Yunmen's major public instructions.

The appendices in volume II of this dissertation contain the translations of the YML's prefases and present additional information concerning biographical and textual issues.
The writer first came across sayings by Master Yunmen in English translations of the best known kōan (chin. gongan 公案) collections, the Blue Cliff Record (Biyanlu 碧巖錄, jap. Hekiganroku) and the Gateless Barrier (Wumenguan 無門關, jap. Munmonkan). In both of these famous collections, and also in a third one, the Congronglu 從容錄 (jap. Shōyōroku), Yunmen is the protagonist of more "cases" (ze 則) than any other master. Throughout the ages, fellow Chan masters as well as translators and commentators have expressed their highest esteem of Yunmen; one expression of this esteem is the following characterization of the founders of Chan's "five houses" (wujia 五家) and their "house style" (jiafeng 家風): "Yunmen 雲門 the emperor, Linji 臨濟 the general, Guiyang 造仰 the ministers, Fayan 法眼 the merchant, and Caodong 曹洞 the peasants." However, in spite of the praise heaped on Yunmen in past and present, and in spite of the Master's prominence as the founder of a Chan "house", there is to the writer's knowledge not a single book in any language exclusively devoted to him. Though translations of some of his sayings and conversations exist, they are usually not based on the comprehensive collection of Yunmen's teaching, the Records of Yunmen (YM), but rather on fragments cited in later kōan collections and Chan compendiums. The same sources also form the basis of most accounts of the Master's life. Various circumstances led the writer to try to change this situation. The most important impetus toward research on Yunmen came from participation (1982-1986) in a class at Hanazono College 花園大学 (Kyoto, Japan) where the eminent Chan philologist Prof. Iriya Yoshitaka 入矢義高 read and commented the first volume of the Records of Yunmen. Through this class, through group research directed by Prof. Iriya on the records of Yunmen's co-disciple Xuansha Shibei 玄沙師備 (835-908), and through the writer's own research and translation efforts (to which Prof. Iriya again contributed by correcting some of the English translations), the initial vague impression that Yunmen is one of China's most interesting and original Chan masters gradually gained profile. This dissertation is a record of some initial steps towards a better understanding and appreciation of Yunmen and his teaching.
The so-called "School of Yunmen" or "House of Yunmen", one of China's Five Houses of Chan, did not exist in Yunmen's time nor was there any awareness that later Chan historians were going to make a "school" out of Yunmen and his successors. Much effort was and is applied by modern scholars to uproot the tidy tree of lineages which Song monks had planted, and even the very notion of "Chan monastic communities" during the Tang has been questioned. This dissertation does not deal with such large issues pertaining to the history of religion. Neither does it presume to be a study of Yunmen's position and role in Chan history or even to present a complete picture of his "life and teaching." This dissertation aims at a more modest goal: to throw light on some important facets of the life and teaching of just one man, a man who lived and taught in South China a thousand and some years ago. Admittedly, this man came to play a very important role in the history of Chan, but that story (and the history of the Yunmen School) could be the subject of another thesis.

The so-called "Golden Age of Zen" is a field of study where even the most famous masters are still hardly explored; to compare the situation with the West, it is as if the life and teachings of major religious figures like Meister Eckhart or Teresa of Avila were still barely known and scientific research on Christianity in its beginning. In such a research situation there are particular needs and priorities, and of course no final word on anything can be expected. The access to Yunmen's words through translation is certainly a major initial need. Hence a fair amount of text from the YML was translated into English (see list in Appendix 13). Much of the translated text appears for the first time in a language other than Chinese.

The language of the Records of Yunmen is, like that of many other Chan records, a mixture of classical Chinese, colloquialisms, and Buddhist terminology. Words and expressions that are not found in dictionaries are frequently encountered; thus the collection of examples of usage and their analysis are an inevitable task of the translator. The notes to this dissertation show the degree of the writer's efforts in this direction. They contain many examples, translated or simply referred to, which should make choices in trans-
lation transparent and should allow fellow researchers and translators to either confirm the given findings and renderings or to draw their own different conclusions.

Since World War II, the study of the texts and history of the Chan movement has advanced at a fast pace, particularly in Japan. The reasons for this sudden development of scientific Chan study are manifold; in essence, the recent progress is due to the acknowledgment that these texts originated in a certain historical and doctrinal context, are written in a specific language, and have their own history. Of course, modern researchers have some precursors in earlier centuries; the most outstanding figure is certainly Mujaku Dōchū 無著道忠, a Japanese monk who lived from 1653-1744. The historical and philological study of Chan texts and related materials (particularly also of materials found in the caves of Dunhuang 敦煌) has in recent decades produced various results. Among other improvements, a preciser picture of the historical development of Chan and its textual corpus, some knowledge of certain important masters and editors, and a stronger philological basis for the translation of Chan texts were gained. The works of Yanagida Seizan 柳田聖山 and Iriya Yoshitaka 入矢義高 and -- in a different manner -- the publications of Ōta Tatsuo 太田辰夫 and Suzuki Tetsuo 鈴木哲雄 exemplify the achievements of the last decades. Philological progress in Chan/Zen studies is very apparent, particularly in Iriya's and Yanagida's translations of Chan texts into Japanese. Such philological research, and the translations built on it, constitute important tasks in the comparatively young scientific discipline of Zen research. The investigation and translation of primary sources will, among other things, open up new perspectives for another difficult yet crucial aspect of Chan/Zen studies: interpretation.

While scholarly production in the philological and historical field of Zen Studies has, especially in Japan, made great progress, the analysis and description by Japanese scholars of the religio-philosophical content of Chan/Zen texts -- which poses problems of a quite different order -- has not advanced in the same spectacular manner. More often than not, the question of religious content or of
meaning is relegated by Japanese authors to footnotes which knit an elaborate network of references to other texts without actually taking a stance on the import or meaning of the passage in question. The diligence and precision which modern Japanese scholars exhibit in their struggle with Chan texts and Chan history thus stands in a marked contrast to their reluctance to draw conclusions regarding the religious content and meaning of the texts.

The mirror image of the Japanese scholarly attitude is observed in talks and books by Japanese and Western Zen Masters who for the most part care little about philology. Even more strikingly, the flood of Western publications about Chan/Zen contains many examples which bespeak their authors' inability or reluctance to face the hardships and joys of precise philological and historical research on primary Chan sources; this, coupled with the extreme scarcity of reliable translations and a good dose of fascination with "Oriental mystique", inspires various authors to flights of imagination as to what Zen is really about. The results abound on the shelves of the "Esoterica and Magic" sections in our bookstores. Whatever their views, most of these Western authors exhibit at least a legitimate eagerness to find out about the essence and meaning of Zen. But apart from the publications of D.T. Suzuki 鈴木大拙, his contemporary Hisamatsu Shin'ichi 久松真一, and their student and disciple Richard DeMartino, not many books or articles have appeared in Western languages which address the content of Chan/Zen texts with authority. Such publications may not be easy reading, and inconsistencies of terminology (particularly in Suzuki) may be a more or less serious drawback. But the more primary Chan sources are critically studied, the more such authoritative writings prove helpful and enlightening.

This dissertation grew out of various interests, religious and philological, and it exhibits both "Japanese" and "Western" influence. This is apparent both in its history (preparation in the United States, four years of research and writing in Japan, and almost three years of additional study and writing in Switzerland) and its content: the chapters on Yunmen's biography and on the history of his Records tend, like the annotated translations of his teachings, to
emulate the qualities of Japanese scholarship, while chapter III con-
stitutes an attempt to address, to a certain extent at least, the
question of religious content and meaning.

The word "teaching" in the title of the third chapter is un-
derstood both in a verbal (the act, art, profession of teaching) and a
nominal sense (that which is taught). The Records of Yunmen contain
plenty of material to shed light on both aspects. The content of the
Chan masters' teaching is notoriously and (for the unawakened) in-
herent difficulty to approach, and their methods of teaching --
though more accessible on the surface -- are not much easier to see
through because they are very much informed and formed by the
teaching's content. The connection between teaching content and method
in Chan Buddhism is a fascinating theme, and Master Yunmen is a par-
ticularly interesting case for such a study; we have not only a large
corpus of anecdotes that show how he dealt with students but also a
fair number of coherent sermons that have lost little of their direct-
ness and force in a millennium. It is hoped that the study of some
central characteristics of the Master's teaching method (section G of
chapter III) will help in gaining not only a better understanding of
certain central aspects of the Master's teaching but also of Chan
teaching in general. This concerns the Chan masters' self-expression
and use of paradox (section F), their ways of challenging and testing
the students (section G 5), their stress on and means of provoking
doubt and the use of koan (section H), etc.

Interpretation necessitates choices, and one choice was that of
what material ought to be translated from the YML. The Master's
coherent discourse, i.e. his public instructions and longer passages
of exchanges, were used as the main source material for chapter III.
Many short exchanges were included as illustrations, but many others
were too cryptic or too open to diverse interpretations to be used in
this manner. The following are two such examples whose notes may give
an impression of the possible range of interpretation. The first example concerns one of the most famous sayings of Master Yunmen which
adorns many a Japanese tea room:15
Addressing the assembly, [Master Yunmen] said, "I don't ask you about before the fifteenth day; try to say something about after the fifteenth day!" Yunmen himself answered in place of [the listeners], "Every day is a good day!

Instead of taking this last pronouncement of Yunmen as an expression of his own well-being, one could interpret it in a quite different manner: Yunmen often answered in place of the listeners and in doing so expressed their own secret thoughts. Taken in this way Yunmen's words could correspond to "tomorrow is another day" or "mañana, mañana"; hence Yunmen's words could express (and implicitly criticize) his disciples' lack of effort and tendency to postpone what is most urgent. A second example:

Once [Master Yunmen] said, "Just you, all of you who go round the empire on pilgrimage, you don't realize the aim of the patriarchs. Well, the pillar realized it. How can you know that the pillar has realized the patriarchs' aim?" In place [of the asked monks, Yunmen] said, "Nine times nine is eighty one."19

The Master's coherent discourse (e.g. the instruction translated and commented on pp. 138-141) speak a clearer language; such instructions were thus used with preference as basis for interpretative efforts. The above examples show how difficult interpretation can be when the meaning of some word or the whole context is not clear. Since the monks and their master lived in a milieu shaped during several centuries of Buddhist and several generations of Chan teaching, many of their remarks, questions, answers, and allusions remain even more cryptic to us who lack this context. Chapter III tries to provide some of the context primarily through exegesis of Yunmen's own words, though those of other Chan masters and Buddhist scriptures with which Yunmen was familiar are occasionally cited to support the argument. Furthermore, certain seminal ideas of Buddhism (such as the two truths19) or Chan concepts (e.g. "going beyond" [xiangshang 向上]20) serve to bring out the import of the Master's sayings and to support the writer's argument.

Faced with a profusion of short and often paradoxical questions, answers, and actions of a master, a systematic description of a
master's "teaching" seems a very difficult task indeed, even if some longer and coherent passages are available. Rather than trying to conceive an a priori dogmatic grid and then pressing Yunmen's words in it, the writer chose the following 'gradual' approach: during repeated readings of the whole text, note was taken of themes and aspects that seemed important in Yunmen's teaching. In this manner, a catalogue of well over 100 relevant themes emerged gradually over the years, and the resulting mountain of notes coagulated around the themes or "facets" that are taken up in this dissertation. In a concurrent effort, other Chan records were studied to gain an impression of the teachings with which the Master came into contact during his long years of pilgrimage. The analyses of chapter III are one product of this learning process, and though they cannot be regarded as a systematic and complete presentation of the master's teaching ("The Teaching of ..."), the writer hopes to have seen, described, and illustrated at least some central facets of it.
NOTES TO THE INTRODUCTION

1. See p. 39 where the few differences are listed.

2. Takakusu, Junjiro et al., eds, Taishō shinshō daiizakyō (Tokyo: 1924-32). The YML text is included as number 1988 in volume 47 of this 100-volume collection. This version of the YML is neither the oldest nor the most reliable one; its punctuation is often questionable and in quite a number of instances definitely mistaken, and there are a number of typographical errors.


5. Examples are found on p. 96 ff. of this dissertation.

6. Cf. ZCB 信学大辞典, pp. 78c, 746c, and 1295a.


8. See p. 1 of this dissertation.


10. This is the title of John C. Wu's book which consists of essays on some of the most famous Chan masters of the Tang and the Five Dynasties.

11. My notes reflect both an effort to profit from past and present Japanese and Chinese philological scholarship and the will to draw information whenever possible from the primary sources of Chan rather than secondary literature. I did my best to avoid the bad custom of some Western scholars to adapt or simply copy footnotes from Japanese and Chinese authors without acknowledging the sources. A particularly bad example is Patrick Carre's recent "Les entretiens de Houang-po" where more than half of the numerous notes are adapted and taken over without acknowledgment from Iriya's Japanese translation (Denshin 佛教 禅 school, Zen no goroku series vol. 8).


15. This famous short monologue forms the core of case 5 of the BYL, 華嚴論叢, 748[2003]145c12-14 and is also quoted in WDBY, 無量義經, ZZ138:273a1ff.

16. Shi'wuri 十五日: it is not clear what Yunmen means by the 'fifteenth day' (middle of the lunar month). Iriya et al (ZG 禪學大辞典, Vol.15, p.29) suggest that it refers to one of the four 'fast days' (busshi 布薩), which take place on the first, eighth, fifteenth, and thirtieth day of each month. One finds also many references to six such days which aremarked by heightened demonic activity and particular divine attention to human transgressions (the 8th, 14th, 15th, 22nd, 29th, and 30th day of each month; see the information on jiujiu 六齋日 provided in SH Sootbhill/Hodous, p. 139, ZGO 禪學大辞典, p. 1071).

Another possible interpretation: the 'fifteenth day' could refer to one of the two monthly fast days with confession-and-repentance ceremonies (busshi 布薩式). These days fell on the full and new moon days, i.e. on the fifteenth and last day of each month. In these ceremonies, the faults and transgressions of the previous half-month were confessed and repentated before the whole monastic community (cf. ZGO 禪學大辞典, p. 1071). From this point of view, Yunmen would say: "I don't want to hear about [your transgressions] of the last half-month; tell me about [your resolutions for] the coming half-month."

A third interpretation: the 'fifteenth day' is the full-moon day, and the full moon symbolizes enlightenment (see Luk, Zen and Ch'an Teachings II, p. 198).

17. See p. 45 ff. and p. 122.

18. Jiujiu 六齋日: Yunmen was quite fond of this expression; it is found no less than five times. Every time, Yunmen uses this phrase to answer a different question: "What is the one road beyond [duality]?" (546c4); "What is the very first phrase?" (546c20); "The character 以 will not do, and the character 八 isn't it. I'm not yet clear about which character it is." (567a17); the present question posed by Yunmen himself (567a18); and "How about the lion's roar?" (567a18). Two interpretations have hitherto been advanced:

A. ZGO 禪學大辞典, p. 585c says that this answer is an expression of absolute reality, and that also the one who asks is in himself perfect.
B. Prof. Iriya mentioned in his lectures the interesting fact that this expression stands at the very beginning of Tang-time multiplication tables (whereas we start with 1x1=1). Thus it could, in this writer's view, correspond to some very basic knowledge, something that everybody knows. A possible translation in the light of this interpretation could be "1x1", or "ABC". Cf. the German expression to describe a complete ignoramus: "He doesn't even know the ABC (der kennt nicht mal das ABC)."

C. A third possible interpretation is based on the following passage in BYL 华严经, case 95, T48[2003]218b5 where the qualities of the arhat are described: "They are able to cut off the nine times nine, or eighty one kinds of passion." Which of these interpretations is to be preferred here is difficult to say. However, additional examples found in Chan texts -- T 47: 651a19, 682b5, 701a-4, 715a12, and particularly 763c14 and 765c16 (where Yunmen twice says "Six times six is thirty six, nine times nine is eighty one") -- seem to favor some interpretation on the lines of the first one, make the second one somewhat less likely, and nearly exclude the possibility of the third one. Thus "nine times nine is eighty one" would be in the same category as other answers by Yunmen where numbers appear, particularly "seven times nine is sixty three" (540b24 and 542c19).


CHAPTER I

THE LIFE OF MASTER YUNMEN WENYAN

[A. INTRODUCTION; B. CONCISE BIOGRAPHY; C. TRANSLATION OF YUNMEN'S GRAVE INSCRIPTION]

A. INTRODUCTION

In the 20th century several attempts have already been made in East and West to present Master Yunmen's life. Most were based on the Chinese biographical elements that are found in Chan literature and other well-known Buddhist sources. Only a few writers took advantage of Tokiwa Daijō's publication of the texts of two stone inscriptions about the Master, and of the discovery of the Chodang chip. These three sources (described in Appendix 5, sources no. 2, 3, and 4) were written shortly after Yunmen's death in the 10th century and almost surely came down to us without subsequent revision — a fate which differs from all other materials we now have. It is these three texts which offer the opportunity of establishing a biography of the Master based on a critical comparison of different strata of sources. This is the aim of this chapter.

The approach is the following: in section B of this chapter, a biography of the Master is presented; it is on purpose concise and exclusively based on the most reliable sources. Later legends are only mentioned if they became very famous (as in the case of the Master's broken leg). Temporal and geographical orientation may be facilitated by referring to Appendices 2 and 3 which present a calendar chart featuring the major events of the Master's life and a map with his most important way stations. The concise biography of section B contains many cross references (indicated by small square brackets) to the notes of section C. Section C consists of the translation of relevant parts of the most comprehensive and trustworthy biographical source, the Master's grave inscription. This inscription was written three years after the Master's death in the year 952, was subsequently engraved in a slab of stone, and survived in this form the millennium which separates us from Master Yunmen. The notes to this last section
are rather detailed and comprehensive: they take all major biographical sources into account. An overall view of these sources can be gained through a chronological list of the main biographical sources (Appendix 4). In contrast to the notes of the translation which compare the content of different sources in relation to specific facts or events of the Master's life, Appendix 5 provides a general description of these sources together with a detailed analysis of their specific biographical content.

B. CONCISE BIOGRAPHY

1. YOUTH AND EARLY MONASTIC LIFE; MASTER ZHI CHENG

Master Yunmen was born in the year 864 in Jiaxing, a town between Shanghai and Hangzhou near China's Eastern Coast. His family name was Zhang but he came to be known under his religious name Wenyan and later under the name of the mountain where he taught, Yunmen. He appears to have shown early signs of spiritual inclination. Though some sources with short biographies do not mention this and the exact time is unclear, it is reasonably certain that sometime in his youth he went to his hometown's Kongwang temple and became boy attendant of Vinaya Master Zhi Cheng. Not much is known about the boy's character apart from biographical commonplaces such as intelligence, outstanding memory, and eloquence.

His physical appearance is first described about 150 years after his death by the author of the author of who claims to have seen Master Yunmen's statue: bony face with strong jaws, narrow but broad eyes, pupils like lacquer dots, elegant eyebrows close to the eyelashes, and a steady and penetrating gaze.

He got ordained in the year 884 at the usual age of 20 years in the city of Changzhou not far from Suzhou. It is quite possible that this ceremony took place in the Doushuai temple. Yunmen is said to have liked studying the Vinaya texts and even
to have lectured on them,\textsuperscript{55} and he probably studied a variety of other Buddhist texts\textsuperscript{55} while staying during several years with his first master. Exactly how many years he stayed remains open to speculation; it has to be kept in mind that between Yunmen's ordination at age 20 and the beginning of his pilgrimage at age 30 no exact dates are known.

2. MASTER MUZHOU; AWAKENING

Some time in his mid twenties, Yunmen left his first Master\textsuperscript{56} and went to Muzhou 睦州\textsuperscript{57} in order to call on Chan Master Muzhou Daozong 睦州道從,\textsuperscript{57} a man who belonged to the Huangbo line.\textsuperscript{58} Not too much is known about the life of this master: he was a successor of Huangbo Xiyun 黃檗希運, stayed for some time at the Longxing temple 龍興寺 in Muzhou, then left temple life to care for his old mother by making straw sandals, was reclusive, and was met by Yunmen.\textsuperscript{5} We can infer that he was already an old man when this meeting took place.\textsuperscript{6}

Accounts of Yunmen's encounter with Master Muzhou vary to a considerable degree,\textsuperscript{63} but most of the early and some of the later sources give a similar account of the words exchanged on this occasion. Yunmen possibly made several unsuccessful attempts to get Master Muzhou's guidance. When he knocked (again) at Muzhou's door and the Master asked, "Who's there?", Yunmen told his name. Master Muzhou asked Yunmen what he wanted, and Yunmen said, "The matter of my self is not clear."\textsuperscript{61} Muzhou pushed Yunmen and said, "Good for nothing!"\textsuperscript{62} That very moment Yunmen opened up understanding.\textsuperscript{63} (Yunmen's awakening was and is often linked to Muzhou's slamming the door on Yunmen's leg. No early source mentions this event; it first is described 160 years after Yunmen's death.\textsuperscript{63c} If the leg was indeed broken it must have healed well enough to support long years of pilgrimage.)

Yunmen stayed for several years with Master Muzhou and learned from him\textsuperscript{64} until the Master sent him away.\textsuperscript{65} Considering that the Master's records, the \textit{Records of Muzhou} (MZHL 睦州語錄 ZZ118),\textsuperscript{7} show a marked similarity of vocabulary and style to the \textit{Records of Yunmen}, we can assume that his influence on the young Yunmen was considerable and
lasting.

3. BEGINNING OF PILGRIMAGE: MASTER XUEFENG

Afterwards, Yunmen set out on a very long pilgrimage. If we rely on a remark in Yunmen's testament (YML 575a27) to the effect that he was on pilgrimage during 17 years, we may conclude that this journey took place in the year 894 at age 30 (i.e., 17 years before his pilgrimage ended in 911 with the visit at Caoqi).8

Probably on Master Muzhou's advice,[65] Yunmen first went to the neighboring Kingdom of Min 閩 where the famous Master Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存 taught a huge assembly on the Snowy Peak.[67] Though accounts of Yunmen's first meeting with Xuefeng vary, almost all of them include a demonstration by Yunmen of his ability. The most trustworthy version (given by S959 實性碑 and CC 祖堂集)[71] relates that when Yunmen reached Xuefeng's assembly and was about to perform the threefold salutation Master Xuefeng said, "How did you get like this?"[70] Yunmen did not budge and thus demonstrated his ability.

Yunmen passed a number of years among the many students[74] on Snowy Peak and had frequent interviews with Master Xuefeng.[75] The two are said to have been like two matching pieces of a tally.[75]. But Yunmen made no show of his accomplishment.[73,77]. The following anecdote is recorded from Yunmen's years on Snowy Peak:

When a monk asked [Xuefeng], "What about: 'Whatever I see, I do not see the Dao; [though] I move my feet, how would I know the road?'"[78] [Xuefeng] said, "Good heavens!"[78] The monk did not understand and asked Master [Yunmen] who said, "Two pounds of flax [make] one piece of cloth."[79] When the monk later related this to Xuefeng, Xuefeng said, "Ah! I've always had my doubts about this frock!"[80]

(8964 實性碑 [Tokiwa], p.117,5-6)

It is not known how many years Yunmen stayed with Master Xuefeng. Whether or not Yunmen received in person Xuefeng's Dharma transmission remains equally unclear.[63] If the account of Xuefeng's cryptic deathbed Dharma transmission[85,86] does not sound too convincing, it could at least suggest that Yunmen had already left Snowy Peak in the year 908 when Master Xuefeng died.
4. FURTHER PILGRIMAGE

As events that took place in the 17 years between the beginning (894, age 30) and the end of Yunmen’s pilgrimage (911, age 47) are not precisely dated, one can only guess when he left the assembly on Snowy Peak, and how long he stayed at other temples. He may have left Xuefeng’s assembly in his mid thirties around the turn of the century and spent the subsequent decade wandering "many thousands of miles" (YML 575a28) before settling down in China’s extreme south. Based on the Record of Pilgrimage which is included in the YML (573b4-575a20), one can identify the following way stations:

Yunmen joined the assembly of a certain Yun in the Zhejiang region. This man was probably Huanglong Yun. Then he went to the (now unknown) Master Gongxiang. While in the [Dayu] mountains he had a talk with Master Wolong. This master in all likelihood corresponds to Anguo Huiqiu (died 913) who was a disciple of Yunmen’s "Dharma brother" Xuansha Shibei. After Xuansha's death in 908, Huiqiu had on the request of Min’s ruler settled down in the Anguo temple on Mt. Wolong in the northern vicinity of Fuzhou city. The next exchanges in the record of the Master’s pilgrimage probably took place in Master Xuefeng’s temple; they are between Master Xuefeng and his two disciples Yunmen and Changqing Xiyuan (854-932). Then follows the account of a short conversation that took place at the temple of Dongyan between Yunmen and Dongyuan Kexiu, another of Xuefeng’s disciples. Next, Yunmen is said to have visited and had several repartees with Sushan, a successor of the famous Dongshan Liangjie who lived on Mt. Su. Yunmen also visited another, more famous successor of Dongshan, Caoshan Benji, who was living on a mountain of the same name in the northeast of modern Jiangxi province. He died in 901, and this visit may thus indicate that Yunmen left Xuefeng before this date. The next dialogue mentioned is between Yunmen and old Tao, who lived at the Anguo temple in Fuzhou. The next master to receive Yunmen’s visit was Tiantong, another disciple of Dongshan. This was
either Tiantong Yi 天童義 or Tiantong Xianqi 天童咸啟; both are mentioned as disciples of Dongshan in the CDL 景億傅燈錄 but otherwise hardly known. The next conversation took place in Xinzhou 信州 at the temple of Master Ehu Zhifu 蘇湖智孚 who was another disciple of Yunmen's own master Xuefeng. Then there is the record of a famous conversation between Yunmen and Ministry president Chen 陳尚書 who resided at the time in Jiangzhou 江州, a city on the northeastern extremity of Lake Poyang. According to the account of Yunmen's pilgrimage, the next way station was the place of Guizong Danquan 歸宗滄權. This master lived in the Guizong temple 歸宗寺 on Mt. Lu 庐山 which is about 20 km south of Jiangzhou. The next master visited was Ganfeng 乾峙, a dharma successor of Dongshan Liangjie 洞山良俯 with residence in Yuezhou 越州, a town in the southern vicinity of Hangzhou. There he worked as monastery cook. So Yunmen was again close to his home; Jiaxing 嘉興, his home town, was just across the Hangzhou bay.

Yunmen also called on a Master Guanxi 湛溪. It is possible that this encounter involved one of Guanxi Zhiqian's successors in Guanxi near Changsha 長沙 while Yunmen was on the way to China's deep south where he was to spend the rest of his life.

5. SETTLING DOWN IN GUANGDONG, TEACHING

In the year 911 Yunmen went to the southernmost part of China and visited the stupa of the Sixth Patriarch in Caoqi 曹溪. He then made a tour to the nearby town of Shaozhou 韶州 to see Master Zhisheng 知聖 who was teaching at a local temple called Lingshu 灵樹院. This man had a reputation for extraordinary psychic powers. Some sources say that he had known that Yunmen would eventually come and therefore had not appointed a head monk, and that he had intuited the exact time of Yunmen's arrival. Be this as it may, the two seem to have struck it off well, and Yunmen was immediately made head monk of the Lingshu temple.

In another display of his extraordinary powers, Master Zhisheng is said to have predicted in 917 to his assembled disciples that the Emperor was going to visit Lingshu temple after Zhisheng's own
death and that his majesty would arrange the funeral. He indeed died before Emperor Gaozu 高祖 visited Lingshu in 918. After the Emperor had arranged Zhisheng’s funeral, he honored Yunmen with the gift of a robe and probably ordered him to become Zhisheng’s successor. The Emperor may have been encouraged to this action by a letter from the late Master Zhisheng’s hand in which Yunmen was praised.

A petition by the official He Xifan 何希範 to the Emperor (YML 576a19-b6) also mentions such a word of request by the late Master Zhisheng; it furthermore eulogizes Yunmen and his brilliant, pearllike wisdom, his radiant, mirrorlike mind, etc., and recommends that he be allowed to hold his accession ceremony as abbot of Lingshu temple and to teach the Dharma. Though this petition is not dated, it appears to have been written between Zhisheng’s death (917 or 918) and Yunmen’s accession ceremony which was held in a public hall in the year 919.

Yunmen thus became abbot of the Lingshu temple at age 55, and he was to spend the next 30 years teaching in the Guangdong region of Southern China. This region had been more or less firmly in the hands of the Liu 刘 clan since 878, but tributes to the Tang imperial court were still paid. In 915, however, the ruling Liu Yan (刘巖; reigned from 912-941) discontinued payments, and in 917 he declared himself Emperor. This ruler, who had come to power around the time when Yunmen arrived in the Guangdong region and had elevated himself to the highest rank shortly before Master Zhisheng’s death, was to bestow honorary titles, gifts, and other signs of favor upon Master Yunmen.

After a few years as abbot of Lingshu temple, Master Yunmen wished to found a temple in some quieter spot. As soon as he received imperial permission for this project, construction of a big new temple was started on Mt. Yunmen in 923; this mountain name (“Gate of Clouds”) later came into use for referring to the Master himself. Five years later, in 928, the work on the temple was completed. The Emperor donated a door plate which featured the characters for “Chan Temple of Illumined Peace” and a vermilion seal.
Thus the 64-year-old master settled down in his own temple, and the stage was set for two more decades of teaching activity. Master Yunmen's fame spread widely,[109] and the number of disciples seems to have been great (a minimum of 500 or even over 1000 are mentioned.[107]) The temple was spacious and imposing, and the surrounding natural setting of great beauty.[106] Relations to the imperial court of Nanhan were very good, as the following passage shows:

In the 35th year (938) His Heavenly Majesty the Great Emperor Gaozu summoned Master [Yunmen] to the Imperial Palace (for an audience). The Emperor asked, "What is Chan all about?" Master [Yunmen] said, "Your Majesty has the question, and your servant the monk has the answer."[111] The Emperor said, "What answer?" Master [Yunmen] said, "I request Your Majesty to reflect upon the words your servant has just uttered." The Emperor was pleased and said: "I know your personal precept, and I have respected it early." He decreed that the office of Inspector of Temples of the Capital[111] be given to Master [Yunmen]. The Master remained silent and did not respond. Cosing to speak again of this decree, an imperial advisor said, "This Master has completed his training and knows the path;[111] he is not likely to enjoy rising to a high post." The Emperor then said, "Shall we let you return to your mountain?" Master [Yunmen] full of joy shouted thrice "Vivat!". The following day [Master Yunmen] was presented with goods from the treasury, incense, and medicinal herbs, and he received donations of salt and other goods. When [Master Yunmen] returned to his mountain [the Emperor] conferred along with all this the title "Genuine Truth"[114] upon the Master. Following this [His Majesty] gave donations several times every year; these donations were often not duly recorded.

(9599 當性碑 [Tokiwa], p.112.15-113.3)

What was recorded, however, were many exchanges between Master Yunmen and other masters or disciples. The stone inscriptions give a few samples, but many more (including a good number of formal instructions) are found in other sources, particularly in the Extended Records. While the exchanges probably date from the time between the early pilgrimage years and the Master's death, the formal sermons are very likely to stem from the teaching years in Guangdong. The Master's conversations and sermons became rapidly known in other regions; the fact that the Chodang chip 祖堂集, completed merely three years after Yunmen's death, contains a fair amount of Yunmen material lends further credence to the first stone inscription's statement that "there are quite a few words that became widely known in the world."

Good relations with the imperial court continued when, after the death of Emperor Gaozu (942) and the murder of his successor.
Emperor Zhongzong assumed power. He invited Master Yunmen to the Imperial Palace, had him stay for one month, and gave him many presents including a stupa inscription for future use on the Master's grave. It read "Stupa of Precious Splendor, Temple of the Auspicious Cloud." When he received this gift, Master Yunmen was already 79 years old. But he still had a few years left to help his disciples.

On May 10 of the year 949 the still active 85-year-old master showed lack of sleep and appetite. The two stone inscriptions give an almost identical account of the Master's death:

When his attendant offered him a hot [medica]l broth, the Master handed the bowl back and said, "First, I am fine; second, you are fine! Be sure to write a letter to request my leave from the Emperor." And then he wrote himself a document with his admonitions for posterity which went: "After my death I permit neither the wearing of mourning clothes in conformity with worldly custom nor wailing and holding a ceremony with a funeral carriage. This would be a violation of the Buddha's precepts and a source of trouble for the Chan school." He transmitted the Dharma to Zhixiang (who is) the Great Master Shixing of Mt. Baiyun. The Master's disciples had already organized the assembly accordingly.

At the hour of the rat of the tenth day of the fourth month of the 46th year [of the sexagesimal cycle] (between 11 p.m. and 1 a.m. of May 10, 949), the Master left this world.

In conformity with the Master's instructions the stupa was erected in the late Master's living quarters. Fifteen days after the Master's death, abbots from various temples performed the parting ceremony, and one thousand monks and laymen escorted his body (which according to looked as it used to when he was living) to the stupa.

On this day the drifting clouds stood respectfully still and the grave tree withered. The cry of the mountain's lone monkeys sharpened the pain of the loss, and invisible birds' voices that pierced the woods heightened the regret and sadness of separation. The mourners hid [their faces] in the collars and stood around crying.
C. MASTER YUNMEN'S GRAVE STELE

Master Yunmen's grave inscription was presented to the Ruler of the Nanhan Kingdom on June 6 of 951, i.e. about two years after the Master's death. The stele was erected some months before the tenth anniversary of his passing on Jan. 12 of 959. The text translated and annotated below is the most comprehensive and trustworthy biographical source available (see description on pp. 38-39). Text in parentheses does not form part of the translation but furnishes surveys of untranslated parts of the stele text or additional information which is not essential to the biography. Words in square brackets are added by the translator to clarify the text's meaning.

YUNMEN'S GRAVE INSCRIPTION

Dahān shaozhou yunmenshan guangtai chanyuan gu kuangzhen dashi shixingbei (bing xu) 大漢韶州雲門山光泰禪院故匡轟大師質性碑 (並序): True-nature Stele [for] the Late Great Master Kuangzhen from Guangtai Chan temple on Mt. Yunmen in the Great Han [Kingdom]'s Shaozhou [district].

This text was presented on the 29th day of the fourth month of the 48th year (June 6, 951) at the Hall of Martial Virtue, and imperial order was given [to carve it in stone].

Author: Lei Yue 雷嶽, Supervisor of Commissioners of the Inner Palace, Supervising Secretary of the Academy of Scholarly Worthies, Acting Palace Eunuch Attendant-in-ordinary, Supreme Pillar of State, Recipient of the Purple Robe and Golden Fish Pouch.

Calligrapher: Xue Chongyu 薛崇譽 (with numerous court titles).

(The biographical part is preceded by an initial passage in which some essentials of Buddhist doctrine mentioned, and the Master is said to expound nothing other than these truths. Then follows a brief account of the Buddha's life, teaching activity, and death. The transmission of his teaching is then traced from the Buddha's disciple Kasyapa 达摩 to Bodhidharma and the Sixth Patriarch, and a prophecy is mentioned that after 170 years, there would be a living bodhisattva of the supreme treasure of Buddhist teaching who would teach at Caoqi 曹溪 and have many students. Before coming to Yunmen's biography, Lei Yue mentions that since the Sixth Patriarch's awakening there were 109 living bodhisattvas in many regions, that countless persons have attained the Way and thus are descendants of the Sixth Patriarch, and that Yunmen is one of them.)
The Master's religious name 諱 was Wenyan 文悟, and his family name was Zhang 張. He was a descendant in the thirteenth generation of Han 翰, an Administrator of Services of the East 東曹參軍 of Lord Jiong of Qi 賁從五卿 from Jin 晉. Han knew that the [reigning] dynasty was about to come to an end, took the occasion to retire, and moved to the Jiangsu-Zhejiang region. Thus his descendants came to include my master Yunmen Wenyan who was born in the Jiaxing subprefecture 嘉興 of Suzhou 苏州.

The Master early aspired to monkhood. So he went to the Kongwang temple 空王寺 in Jiaxing and became a boy attendant under Vinaya master Zhi Cheng 志澄律師. Whenever he read the various canonical scriptures, [he proved to have such an outstanding memory] that there were not many he had to read again.

On reaching adulthood, he received tonsure and was ordained on the ordination platform at Changzhou 常州. Thereafter he assisted Cheng and held public lectures for several years. He had an inclination to investigate the purport of the Four-Section [Vinaya]. Subsequently he took leave of Cheng and called on Master Daozong of Muzhou who belonged to the Huangbo line. [Master Daozong's] one room was usually shut, and its four walls were bare. When he occasionally received people, he did not accept any considerations. When Master [Yunmen] could 'fold and unfold' at will, he went directly to knock at [Daozong's] door. Chan master [Daozong] asked, "Who's there?" Master [Yunmen Wenyan] said, "Wenyan." Chan master [Daozong] blocked the door and said, "What's your aim in coming again and again?" Master [Yunmen] said, "The matter of my self is not clarified." Chan master [Daozong] said, "Good-for-nothing!", pushed [Yunmen] out with his hand, and shut the door. Through this, Master [Yunmen] opened up understanding.

During several years, Chan master [Muzhou] made use of the secrets of spiritual devices and closed the lock of the barrier even more firmly. He knew that Master [Yunmen] would eventually become an important haven of the Dharma sea and would certainly form a bright moon in the sky of Chan. So he addressed Master [Yunmen] saying, "I am not your teacher; don't stay!" Master [Yunmen] accordingly went
Having just climbed [Mt.] Xianggu, he immediately proceeded to deploy his immense capability. When he reached Xuefeng’s assembly and the threefold salutation was about to be performed, Xuefeng said, "How could it come to this?" Master [Yunmen] did not move one hair’s breadth and impressively demonstrated his whole ability. But although he had cut through the stream [of deluded consciousness] he also carried horns like [the deluded ones]. Because of this not one of the more than 1000 students [of Xuefeng] knew for sure whether he was an ordinary or a holy man. At dusk and dawn, Master [Yunmen] went to question [Xuefeng], and the cold and hot seasons returned many times. When tucking up his robe he was in perfect correspondence with the empty mind. Having attained the fruit [of practice] he stored it, invisible [for others], in his full belly.

When a monk asked [Xuefeng], "What about: 'Though [it] strikes my eye, I do not see the Dao; though I move my feet, how would I know the road?'" [Xuefeng] said, "Good heavens!" The monk did not understand and asked Master [Yunmen] who said, "Two pounds of flax [make] one robe." When the monk later related this to Xuefeng, Xuefeng said, "Ah! I’ve always had my doubts about this frock."

In [Xuefeng’s] assembly, Master [Yunmen] was in intimate accord with the subtle function; thus he left the assembly, traveled, and visited the masters of temples all around; there are a lot of words [exchanged between Yunmen and others] which became widely known in the world.

Later, when Xuefeng was about to pass away, his disciples asked him to whom he would transmit the Buddha Dharma. [Xuefeng] said, "It is where the pine droops (yan). None of the disciples knew his intention; Yan in fact is Master [Yunmen Wenyan]’s name. Thus in compliance with Xuefeng’s last instructions, no successor has been established.

In the eighth year [of the sexagesimal cycle; 911] he paid his respects [to the Sixth Patriarch’s stupa] at Caoqi and made a tour to visit Lingshu’s late Great Master Zhisheng. Mutually disclosing their innermost thoughts, they formed an inseparable friendship.
One day, in the 14th year [of the sexagesimal cycle] (917), Zhisheng summoned Master [Yunmen] and his [other] disciples and said, "After my death it will surely come about that the supreme ruler will take care of my cremation." In the 15th year (918), when His Heavenly Majesty the Great Emperor Gaozu made a tour to the Rocks of Shao and went to Lingshu, [Master Lingshu] Zhisheng had died, and so it happened that he kept his promise. [His Majesty] ordered to cremate [Master Zhisheng], to get his ashes, and to fashion a statue for his living quarters. He then decreed that Master [Yunmen] be granted personal audience and as a special favor honored him with the purple robe. The following year (919) [the Emperor] ordered Master [Yunmen] to hold his accession ceremony in the public hall of the region.

After this, [Master Yunmen] occupied Zhisheng's seat and expounded the Dharma of Xuefeng; he is justly called 'fountainhead of the Chan river' and 'brilliant splendor of the Buddha sun'. Monks and lay people numbered one thousand, and questions and answers followed in rapid succession:

The prefect He Xifan bowed deeply and asked, "Your disciple requests your teaching." Master [Yunmen] said, "It's evident that there's no special grass." A student asked, "What about the original heart-mind?" Master [Yunmen] replied, "You present it clearly [right now]." There were other words; they were recorded and circulated in the world.

Later, the Great Master [Yunmen]'s heart turned utterly silent, and he approached the emperor with a petition to move his temple. He got the imperial permission, and in the twentieth year (923) he ordered his disciples to begin constructing on Mt. Yunmen. Five years later the work was completed. [There are many buildings, like] clouds forming on all sides. Like a palace, it has a penthouse, [huge] pillars, soaring eaves, upper and lower galleries, deep gutters, murmuring springs, and door and window openings which break the summer heat and let cool air enter. Big pine trees and tall bamboos emit fragrant air and mingle their sounds in harmony. In close to thirty years the assembly counted never less than half a thousand [monks]. Every year they received donations from other parties, and day after
day a great variety of odors filled their kitchen.\textsuperscript{105} [Though this assembly] was far away from the city of Sravasti, what difference was there from the [Buddha's] assembly on Vulture Peak?\textsuperscript{109}

The representative of the temple's patrons made a record of persons of merit and sent a report [about the completion] to the imperial court. [The emperor] deigned to donate a vermilion-sealed door plate [which read] "Chan Temple of Illumined Peace."\textsuperscript{110}

In the 35th year (938) His Heavenly Majesty the Great Emperor Gaozu summoned Master [Yunmen] to the Imperial Palace [for an audience]. The Emperor asked, "What is Chan all about?" Master [Yunmen] said, "Your Majesty has the question, and your servant the monk has the answer."\textsuperscript{111} The Emperor said, "What answer?" Master [Yunmen] said, "I request Your Majesty to reflect upon the words your servant has just uttered." The Emperor was pleased and said: "I know your personal precept, and I have respected it early." He decreed that the office of Inspector of the Monks of the Capital\textsuperscript{112} be given to Master [Yunmen]. The Master remained silent and did not respond. Coming to speak again of this decree, an imperial advisor said, "This Master has completed his training and knows the path;\textsuperscript{113} he is not likely to enjoy rising to a high post." The Emperor then said, "Shall we let you return to your mountain?" Master [Yunmen] full of joy shouted thrice "Vivat!". The following day [Master Yunmen] was presented with goods from the treasury, incense, and medicinal herbs, and he received donations of salt and other goods. When [Master Yunmen] returned to his mountain, [the Emperor] conferred along with all this the title "Genuine Truth"\textsuperscript{114} upon the Master. Following this [His Majesty] gave donations several times every year; these donations were often not duly recorded.\textsuperscript{115}

Praise be to our present August Emperor, the Great Sage with Sublime Virtues in Civil and Military Arts and Deep Understanding of the Ultimate Way, the Great Propagator of Filial Piety!\textsuperscript{116} In the year of the hare (943) His Majesty carried out an imperial plan and quelled internal troubles. Deploying his supernatural martial skills he forcefully accomplished the restoration of his rule.\textsuperscript{117} He graciously brought relief to the whole territory and promoted the
propagation of the Three Doctrines. Then His Majesty summoned Master [Yunmen] to the Imperial Palace to make offerings during one month. He presented [Master Yunmen] with a quarter ounce robe, incense, medicine, donations, etc., and let him return [to his temple] with a stupa inscription [written by] the Emperor for future use [on Master Yunmen’s stupa]. It read "Stupa of Precious Splendor, Temple of the Auspicious Cloud." Ever since Master [Yunmen] taught the assembly, he established his own style of Chan. Indeed, whenever he corresponded to an occasion, he proved to have singular qualities. Once he watched the assembly gather and said after a while, "If you don’t understand for thirty years, you must not say that you haven’t met a master." At the time three monks came forth simultaneously and bowed deeply. The Master said, "Three men, one warrant." When someone asked about Chan he replied, "Just the right discernment." To a question about the Way he responded, "Penetrate this one word completely!" In response to a question about the intention of the patriarch the Master said, "[It’s as evident as] seeing the mountain in the sunlight." [Once,] when someone had just passed through the gate [on arriving], he gave him a beating with his staff. Once he addressed the assembly saying, "[To say that] right now nothing is the matter is already misleading you. As long as the condition of delusion isn’t exhausted, it is never in vain." This brief mention of some principal facts aims at helping future virtuous generations. The Master considered separate entities (dharmas) to be without any set form, and learning without any fixed pattern. He always observed the anniversaries of the death of the master he succeeded to, and he applied himself to pay him back in double. For more than thirty years he headed a temple, and people in search of the Dharma treasure came like clouds from all four directions. Those who got his approval fell like petals on the various mountains. Thus the path of realizing awakening was promoted, and the fruits of the twin [sala] trees became plentiful. All passions were exhausted, and all separate entities (dharmas) proved to be empty. Even when he was obliged to stay in bed and be isolated, he
hardly prevented [people] from visiting and asking. After all, [the physical body] is an empty illusion; so he passed away in order to hide his light.\textsuperscript{137} When his attendant offered him a hot [medical] broth, the Master handed the bowl back and said, "First, I am fine; second, you are fine."\textsuperscript{138} Be sure to write a letter to request my leave from the Emperor." And then he made himself a document with his admonitions for posterity which went: "After my death I permit neither the wearing of mourning clothes in conformity with worldly custom nor wailing and holding a ceremony with a funeral carriage. This would be a violation of the Buddha's precepts and a source of trouble for the Chan school."\textsuperscript{139} He transmitted the Dharma to Zhixiang [who is] the Great Master Shixing\textsuperscript{140} of Mt. Baiyun.\textsuperscript{141} The Master's disciples had already organized the assembly accordingly.\textsuperscript{142}

At the hour of the rat of the tenth day of the fourth moon of the 46th year [of the sexagesimal cycle] (between 11 p.m. and 1 a.m. of May 10, 949), the Master left this world.\textsuperscript{143}

Oh! The boat of compassion having been destroyed
Samsara will not attain the shore of salvation.
The Dharma mountain having crumbled
What have flying and walking creatures to rely upon?

The blackrobed monks were moved by the sadness of the morning dirge,\textsuperscript{144} and the faithful were touched by the recitation of the Shiwei [poems].\textsuperscript{145} When Song Yun met [Bodhidharma], [Bodhidharma] held a single shoe [in his hand] and was never to return [to China].\textsuperscript{146} When Maitreya comes, [Yunmen] is likely to reappear, to establish a place of practice on the three peaks [in China], and to depart again.\textsuperscript{147}

On the 25th day of that month the masters of the various mountain [temples] performed a parting ceremony. One thousand monks and laypersons escorted the Master to the stupa. The countenance of the deceased was the same as it used to be [when he was living]. Following the Master's instructions, the stupa had been erected inside his living quarters\textsuperscript{148} at the temple. His age had been 86, and he had been
an ordained monk for 66 years.149

On this day the drifting clouds stood [respectfully] still and the grave tree withered. The cry of the mountain's lone monkeys sharpened the pain of the loss, and invisible birds' voices that pierced the woods heightened the regret and the sadness of separation. The mourners hid [their faces] in the collars and stood around crying.

(This biographical part of the grave inscription is followed by a long list [where the most distinguished monks are mentioned by name and sometimes court titles] of monks from Yunmen's monastery and from the capital Guangzhou who, like more than seventy persons from the imperial court, were faithful practitioners of the Way. The inscription closes with a series of six Buddhist poems, one verse, another list of monks, the date of the erection of the stele [Jan. 12, 959], and some more names of notable disciples of Yunmen.)
CHAPTER 2
STRUCTURE AND HISTORY OF THE
YUNMEN GUANGLU ¥UNMEN GUANGLU (A. INTRODUCTION; B. SURVEY OF THE STRUCTURE OF EXTANT YML TEXTS; C. TEXTUAL HISTORY; D. CONCLUSION)

A. INTRODUCTION

Several slightly different versions of the "Comprehensive Records of Chan Master Kuangzhen of Yunmen" 雲門匡真禪師廣錄 are in existence today. \(^{150}\) All include a preface by the Song official Su Xie 蘇轍 \(^{151}\) which was written in 1076; all feature the line "Collected by [Master Yunmen's] disciple, Recipient of the Purple [Robe] Shou Jian, [entitled] Grand Master Ming Shi" 門人明識大師賜紫守堅集; \(^{152}\) and all say that they are "collated by Yuanjue Zongyan, resident of Mt. Gu in Fuzhou" 住福州鼓山國覺宗演校勘. \(^{153}\) Differences between the various extant texts are very small (thus one abbreviation, YML, is considered sufficient) but by no means insignificant; their importance lies mainly in providing clues for the elucidation of the text's history. The oldest extant version of the complete text forms part of the Guzunsu yulu 古尊宿語錄 which was published in 1267, i.e. more than 300 years after the Master's death. This chapter tries, as far as this is possible now, to elucidate how this earliest and most complete text (referred to as Yunmenlu, Records of Yunmen, or YML) acquired its present structure and content.

Luckily we have, apart from the complete YML text, some stone inscriptions and other related texts that date from within half a century of the Master's death. The analysis of these sources will permit certain conclusions regarding the YML's early history. With regard to some early printed versions which are now lost we are lucky to have an informative commentary to one of them from the beginning of the 12th century. It even includes an early preface (dated 1053; see Appendix 1) to the Records. Furthermore, some collections of Chan texts feature parts of the Records which allow further conclusions about the content of early versions and their relation to the YML text.
B. THE STRUCTURE OF THE RECORDS

One objective of the investigation of textual history is the clarification of the structure and composition of the YML text that we now have. The following survey of the YML's structure and content should allow an overview of the whole text and provide some background for the textual history to unfold.

Chapter 1 (YML 544c25-553c18)

The first juan (巻) begins with a preface by the official Su Xie (蘇祿) which was written in 1076 for the occasion of the publication of an older, now lost text of the YML (text no.4).

The preface is followed by the main body of the first chapter, consisting of 320 "cases" (ze 則) of "Responses to Occasions" (duiji 對機; YML 545a16-553b10). Close to fifty of these are sermons of various length (21 sermons are five Taisho lines or longer). The rest are exchanges between students and Master Yunmen, usually in the form of short questions by students and pithy answers by Master Yunmen.

The first juan closes with Yunmen's "Songs of the twelve time periods [of the day]" (Shiershi ge 十二時歌; YML 553b11-18) and twelve religious verses (jiesong 僧頌; YML 553b19-c16).

Chapter 2 (YML 553c20-567b7)

Juan 2 contains two sections. The first is entitled "Essence of Words from Inside the Room" (Shizhong yuyao 室中語要; YML 553c24-561c4). In some of its 185 subsections ("cases"; ze 則) Master Yunmen teaches his monastic assembly in an informal setting at various occasions and places; such instruction is in general less long than his formal sermons in the Dharma Hall and frequently leads rather soon to a question-answer exchange. A great number of subsections in this chapter feature the Master citing words of, anecdotes about, or conversations involving earlier or contemporary Chan/Buddhist masters and monks, and sometimes Buddhist texts. These anecdotes or quotes are
usually followed by Yunmen’s comments, by questions, or by discussions with his students.

The second section, entitled "Statements and Substitute Answers" (chuishi daiyu 重示代語; YML 561c5-567b5) contains 290 cases of "statements" (chuishi 重示) by Master Yunmen. These statements have different forms and are of varying structure; some have the form of a formal sermon, others of informal instruction. However, they all are brought up with the aim of provoking some sort of reply; as the listeners usually turn out to be unable to ask back let alone respond, Yunmen gives one or several responses that either express his own understanding or that of other persons (substitute answers daiyu 代語).

Chapter 3 (YML 567b9-578c29)

This last juan consists of six sections and one appendix. The first and most voluminous is called "Critical Examinations" (Kanbian 勘辨; YML 567b16-573b3); this is a collection of Yunmen’s exchanges with many masters, monks, and disciples. Most often, Yunmen confronts them with questions or challenging statements and tries in this manner to provoke expressions of their Chan realization and understanding; this is then "critically examined" by the Master. These examinations can take various forms, but most of Yunmen’s partners fail this test; the master then often fuels their doubts by stinging remarks or by words and/or actions that either express his own realization and understanding or put (the lack of) that of the challenged person into sharper focus.

Section two consists of the "Record of Pilgrimages" (Yufang yilu 遊方遺錄; YML 573b4-575a20). This section may be of later origin.154 The related encounters show Chan pilgrim Yunmen in interaction not only with fellow monks but also with a number of famous masters of his time. Yunmen probably was on pilgrimage during 17 years155 of his life, from age 30 to age 47; these encounters portray him in this period.

The third section (YML 575a21-b11) contains "The Great Master’s Testament" (Dashi yibiao 大師遺表) and is followed by his "Last
Instructions" (Yijie 遺誨; YML 575b12-c2) to his followers.

Section five consists of Yunmen's "Biographical Record" (Yunmenshan guangtai chanyuan kuangzhen dashi xinglu 雲門山光泰禪院匡真大師行錄; YML 575c3-576a18) which is said to have been written by the official Lei Yue 雷嶽 on the day of the Master's burial.

The sixth and last section reproduces a "Petition" by court officials to the ruler of the Nanhan Kingdom to the effect that Yunmen became abbot of the Lingshu monastery (Qingshu 請疏; YML 576a19-b6) and the story of the opening of Yunmen's stupa 17 years after the Master's death (YML 576b7-16).

The appendix (YML 576b19-c27) consists of twelve verses by Yunmen's disciple Great Master Yuanming 圓明大師.

### TABLE 1: PROPORTIONAL STRUCTURE OF THE YUNMENLU

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>CH.</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.5% Preface 序</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25% Responses to Occasions 對機</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1% Songs &amp; Verse 十二時歌 / 偶頌</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24% Essence of Words from Room 室中話要</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18% Statements &amp; Substitute Answers 垂示代語</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20% Critical Examinations 勘辨</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6% Record of Pilgrimages 遊方遺錄</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1% Testament 請誌</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.5% Last Instructions 遺誨</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2% Biographical Record 行錄</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2% Petition 請誌 and Verse 頌雲門三句語</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CH.** indicates the chapter of the Yunmenlu where the section begins.

**Percentages** indicate the proportion of the total text covered by each section.
C. THE HISTORY OF THE YUNMENLU

The different versions of the YML text whose content was outlined above are remarkably similar. They are the last products of a process which involved repeated compilation, editing, and printing. This chapter aims at elucidating this historical process and thus at providing some basis for judgments regarding the configuration and authenticity of today's text. These issues are of some importance because they concern the transmission of the Master's words. The detailed analysis of the text's history will for instance allow the conclusion that the content of Master Yunmen's teaching as presented in the YML is so trustworthy that one can use it without hesitation as basis for the analysis of the Master's teaching.

Elements for the reconstruction of the YML's textual history were found through analysis of:
- Information from two stone inscriptions (dated 959 and 964)
- YML materials that already appear in Chan literature of the second half of the 10th century and around the turn of the millennium.
- the only commentary to the YML (beginning of 12th century)
- the 1053 preface contained in the same commentary
- the preface of the extant YML text (dated 1076)
- Comparison of the text of Chan text collections with corresponding passages of the YML
- the differences between extant texts of the YML
- general bibliographical information.

Appendix 5 allows an overview of the various lost and extant YML texts and their interrelations, and Appendix 6 depicts the historical development of the YML's structure and content. An article by Shiina has been of great help in studying the YML's textual history, particularly because of its comparative study of different YML texts that are found in Japanese libraries.

1. TAKING AND GATHERING NOTES

Each stone inscription features a passage which indicates that some of Master Yunmen's words were written down and widely
disseminated. After giving the first few examples of short exchanges between the Master and his disciples, the older inscription says that "there were other words; they were recorded and circulate in the world." The second stone inscription mentions a conversation with the official He Xifan and adds: "In those days the questioners [asking about Chan] followed each other without interruption; his (the Master's) answers were taken down and transmitted to the world. Later, Master [Yunmen] got tired of receiving people and wished to reside at a remote and pure place." Both passages follow some early examples of short exchanges between Master Yunmen and his disciples -- exchanges which took place before the Master's move to Mt. Yunmen. The "recorded" and "transmitted" words mentioned in these texts are thus likely to refer to short exchanges between the Master and his disciples which became widely known while the Master was living, rather than to a large collection of sermons and exchanges compiled after his death.

One may thus assume that notes of Master Yunmen's conversations were taken and disseminated, and that this practice probably started before the Master's move to Mt. Yunmen. There is earlier evidence of pilgrim monks scribbling conversations into notebooks which they carried all over the country, and it is presumably this kind of note that the authors of the stone inscriptions had in mind.

The compilation of a master's collected sermons and exchanges, however, is likely to presuppose some more systematic effort, probably by devoted students who stayed for longer periods of time with Master Yunmen. How and by whom were these notes taken? The only available answers to these questions are given by the Linjianlu 林間錄 and by the Biyanlu 碧巖錄. The Linjianlu in two juan (the preface dates from the year 1107) contains more than 300 talks by Juefan Huihong 覺範慧洪 (1071-1128), one of the editors of the YML. It features the following passage:

Chan Master Yunju Puyin said: When Reverend Yunmen expounded the Dharma, he was like a cloud. He decidedly did not like people to note down his words. Whenever he saw someone [doing this] he scolded him and chased him out with the words, 'Because your own mouth is not good for anything, you come to record my words. It is certain that some day you'll sell me!' Now, [concerning] the records "Responding to the Occasion (對偈)" and "From inside [the Master's]..."
It is difficult to judge how trustworthy this interesting bit of information is. Master Yunju probably uttered this more than 100 years after Yunmen’s death, but as a member of the Yunmen line he could have learned this from people who heard it from actual witnesses of this note-taking procedure. The fact that the two note-takers were the fathers of the two biggest branches of the Yunmen line (Yunju belonged to the branch originating with Xianglin) may play a role; the possibility cannot be ruled out that Yunju stressed this in order to emphasize the direct descent and legitimacy of his own branch.

The seventeenth case of the BYL 碧巌録 (T48{2003}157a28-b4) contains the following information about one of these note-takers, Yunmen’s disciple Xianglin (also called Yuan 遜):

[Xianglin] stayed at Yunmen’s side for eighteen years; time and again Yunmen would just call out to him, ‘Attendant Yuan!’ As soon as he responded, Yunmen would say, ‘What is it?’ At such times, no matter how much [Xianglin] spoke to present his understanding and gave play to his spirit, he never reached mutual accord [with Yunmen]. One day, though, he suddenly said, ‘I understand.’ Yunmen said, ‘Why don’t you say something above and beyond this?’ Xianglin stayed on for another three years. A great part of the verbal displays of great function which Yunmen accorded in his room were designed to make his attendant Yuan [able to] enter and function anywhere. Whenever Yunmen uttered a word or a phrase, they were all gathered at attendant Yuan’s.

While it is impossible to affirm the authenticity of such stories, one can at least state that in Chan literature only Yunmen’s disciples Xianglin and Mingjiao are mentioned in the function of note-takers. However, it is quite possible that other disciples of Yunmen were also involved in this undertaking, for instance the first recorded editor Shou Jian (see below). Be this as it may, notes were taken and gathered, and finally a single or several editors compiled the material and edited it.

2. THE FIRST MANUSCRIPTS (T1)

At the beginning of each of the three chapters of the YML, the following remark is found: “Collected by [Master Yunmen’s] disciple, Recipient of the Purple [Robe] Shou Jian, [entitled] Grand
Master Ming Shi" 門人明識大師賜紫守堅集. Unfortunately, very little is known about this man. He does not appear at all in Chan literature and thus became an object of speculation: Nukariya\textsuperscript{169} suspects that he corresponds to another disciple of Master Yunmen, Shou Xian 守賢, who has the advantage of having a biography in the SGSC 宋高僧傳.\textsuperscript{170}

Nukariya's guess did not take into account that a person with the name of Shou Jian does appear prominently in a passage on the earlier of the two stone inscriptions; thus a misspelling appears unlikely. The passage in question is the following:

"Among the assembled disciples\textsuperscript{171} was Shou Jian who had always assisted the Master and was in perfect accord with the Way (wuwei\textsuperscript{172}), and 36 monks in charge of temple affairs\textsuperscript{173} including Changbao the Great Master Jingben,\textsuperscript{174} etc., who had all deeply realized Buddha nature and had in distinguished ways attained to Master Yunmen's essence."

The fact that Shou Jian is said to have assisted the Master over a long period of time would make him an obvious candidate for taking charge of editing Yunmen's records. If the note taking took place as described in the \textit{Linjian lu} (林間錄; see above), his activity as editor could have consisted in overseeing the compilation of notes taken by other students of the Master. As the Master's personal assistant he was possibly also involved in taking notes.

These first manuscripts formed the raw material from which at some later point the \textit{Extensive Records of Yunmen} were fashioned. What did these first manuscripts contain? How much and which parts of today's \textit{Records of Yunmen} did exist in manuscript form at this early period? Analyses of a) the 1053 preface, b) Yunmen materials contained in the \textit{Chodang chip} (CC 祖堂集), and c) Yunmen materials in the \textit{Jingde chuandenglu} (CDL 景徳傳燈錄) will furnish some answers to these questions.

a) The 1053 preface on early manuscripts

This is the earlier of two extant prefaces to the \textit{Records of Yunmen}. It was written in 1053, i.e. a little more than 100 years after Master Yunmen's death, by Chan Master Tianyi Yihuai (天衣義幢; 993-1064) and includes the following passage:
He taught for more than fifty years, and [though] 130 years have passed since, there are words from formal instructions, from talks which took up old sayings or events, and from statements with substitute answers. But as there were indications that these words were getting dispersed in China's Chan communities, it is a fortunate event that they got collected and that printing blocks were made from them. 144

This passage suggests that notes of Yunmen's instructions existed already around 923, i.e., around the time of the beginning of construction of the new temple on Mt. Yunmen. Does Yihuai mean that note taking started around that time? In any case, the notes are said to have included the following parts:

- Formal instructions: these were probably the instructions of today's first chapter of the YML;
- Talks which take up old sayings or events: these talks probably correspond to the first part of today's chapter 2 ("Essence of Words from Inside the Master's Room", YML 553c24-561c4);
- Statements with substitute answers: these probably correspond to the second part of today's chapter 2 (YML 561c5-567b5).

Thus, according to Yihuai, chapters 1 and 2 of today's Extensive Records existed partly or entirely in manuscript form at an early stage. Yihuai justified his editing and printing effort by saying that these manuscripts got scattered and cut; it is thus likely that they were passed around and copied in parts rather than as one whole textual body. This tentative conclusion will be supported by our analysis of the CDL 晉德傳燈録 materials related to Yunmen.

b) Yunmen materials in the Chodang chip (CC 祖庭集; completed in 952)

By virtue of its completion three years after Master Yunmen's death, its origin in circles around Yunmen's teacher Xuefeng, and its extraordinary transmission which probably did not undergo any later editing efforts, the Chodang chip offers the unique opportunity to ascertain 1) what Chan monks in Fujian knew around the middle of the 10th century about Master Yunmen, 2) what written materials about him they had access to, and 3) how these materials relate to today's Ex-
tensive Records. The detailed list of Chodang chip passages and their YML counterparts presented in Appendix 8 yields the following conclusions:

There are too few similar or identical exchanges (in total less than 25 YML lines) to affirm any direct influence on the Chodang chip (CC) text by manuscripts -- such as those mentioned by Yihuai -- that later got incorporated into the Extensive Records. In particular, the absence of any of Yunmen's instructions in the CC is conspicuous. Additionally, the CC's biography does not betray any influence from YML material (see biography chapter). Though the authors of the CC probably had access to some scattered notes by students of Yunmen, they were almost certainly ignorant of the instructions and most other materials that the YML includes. The Chodang chip is thus of no great help in determining the content of early YML texts, but it shows that in all probability very little of that material was available outside of the Master's immediate surroundings while he was still alive and shortly after his death.

c) Yunmen materials in the Jingde chuandenglu (CDL 景德傳燈録; 1004)

When the Jingde chuandenglu (CDL) was completed 55 years after Master Yunmen's death, no printed edition of Yunmen's records existed yet. To what sort of manuscripts did the CDL's author Daoyuan have access? How do quoted portions of Daoyuan's sources relate to today's Extensive Records? The list presented in Appendix 9 aims at clarifying such questions. It shows that about 200 Taishô lines of today's YML are very similar to the CDL text, and that there are only a few short CDL passages which are substantially different from the YML text or for which no equivalent be found in the YML. With the exception of only three CDL lines that appear in today's chapter three of the YML, all located CDL text stems from chapter 1 of today's YML. The contrast between the mass of cited instructions and exchanges and the paucity of biographical information is striking and indicates that Daoyuan did not yet know the biographical sections in the Extensive Record's third chapter. The order of the instructions and exchanges of the CDL is
interesting: about the first half is (with one exception) nicely arranged in the sequence of the first chapter of the YML, but the second half (from 358b26) shows no such order.

We can conclude that the manuscript(s) available to Daoyuan probably did not contain more than chapter 1 of today's Extensive Records, i.e., the "Responses to Occasions" (對機; YML 545a16-553b10) and some of Yunmen's poems (YML 553b20-c18). This is less than one third of today's YML text. It cannot be chance that an entire part of Daoyuan's text follows almost perfectly the order of the YML. This fact and the surprising number of almost identical instructions and exchanges suggest that Daoyuan had access to a manuscript or parts of a manuscript which was not too different from the extant first chapter of the YML.

It is quite possible that the "Responses to Occasions" of the YML's first chapter originally existed as one or several separate manuscript(s). Support for this hypothesis is found in ZTSY 祖庭事苑 6c5-7 where Muan cites some words from poems (now found at the end of the third YML chapter) which were "appended at the end of the Record(s) of Yunmen's Responses to Occasions" 雲門對機錄後附. Further support comes from the listing of two book titles in the monograph (Ide 略) section of Zheng Qiao's 鄭樵 Tongzhi 洞(1149):176 one is the Yunmen heshang yu 雲門和尚語 in one juan 卷, the other the Yunmen zhengzhen dasi duiji yulu 雲門正真大師對機語錄 in two juan 卷. That the "Responses to Occasions" were not the only part to be published separately was pointed out by Yanagida: in 1170 the Yunmen shizhong yao 雲門室中要 was prefaced and published together with the Huangbo xinyao 黃檗心要 by Lanan Daochu 謀庵道樞.117

Some of the differences that exist between CDL and YML texts could be due to editing of either text. In some instances where the YML text is terse, the CDL text adds a clarifying character or expression. It is possible that such reading aids stem from Daoyuan's hand.

Whether the few lines of the CDL which are not (or very differently) found in the YML, and the three lines from the YML's third chapter, formed part of the early manuscript(s) available to
Daoyuan remains an open question. They could also have come into his hands in the form of notes scribbled down by disciples of Yunmen, or as anecdotes current in the Chan circles of his day. Thus, around the turn of the millennium, (parts of?) a manuscript which contained essential parts of the first YML chapter must have been available as manuscripts.

3. THE EARLIEST PRINTED EDITION (T 3)

When did the first printed edition appear? In the preface written in 1053, author Tianyi Yihuai implies that his own 1053 text was the first printed text of the YML. The whole of this preface is cited in Appendix 1; here, just the parts which are relevant to textual history are quoted:

[Master Yunmen] taught for more than fifty years, and [though] 120 have passed since, there are words from formal instructions 餘堂, from [talks which] took up old [sayings or events] 集古, and from statements with substitute [answers] 垂代. But as there were indications that [these words] were getting dispersed in China's Chan communities, it is a fortunate event that they got collected and that printing blocks were made from them. They will be of help to many; when Chan adepts enter [the Master's] room and ask for guidance, some will see the errors in words and the mistakes in happenings. Alas! We are far from the time of the sages! Fish eyes are mistaken for gold of Yan and jewels of Chu, and dust and sand (worldly defilements) are prevalent. Hearing that [Yunmen's words] got cut [like] autumn chrysanthemums and spring orchids and bamboos, I constantly thought about their elimination and disappearance but did not yet take measures to fulfill my long cherished wish. [But] this summer, when staying at the Qiupu temple, I took care to stay away from the community and was able to open and read this text. Then I took the brush to correct it by condensing and by adding what was lacking. Afterwards I established its order. Most of those who apply themselves to the Confucian path and are bound to be excluded from [Buddhism's] profound meaning, [but also] those turned toward the Great Way get lost in confusion among many useless rhetorical flowers and empty absurdities. This text of one who is not confused describes facts as they are and has a firm grasp of reality. For this reason this verbose preface is to a sage an accumulation of useless letters.

(2997 祖庭事苑 ZZ113:26f5-14)

In short, this preface gives us the following information about the first printed edition: Tianyi Yihuai, the man who wrote the above preface, was also the one who collected scattered old Yunmen records, edited and arranged them, had printing blocks carved, and had the text printed together with the preface. To judge from the titles of old records that are mentioned, Yihuai must have had most or all of the
first two chapters of today's Extensive Records at his disposition. He did not simply copy those collected manuscripts on woodblocks but edited the available materials by condensing (shanfan 剪繁), complementing (buque 補闕), and arranging (chengzhi 成秩) them. Unfortunately the result of these efforts is now lost; the preface together with some remarks by Muan (chapter 1 of ZTSY) is all there is left.

Muan thought very highly of "The Old Text of Tianyi"; most corrections and criticisms of another printed text end with "see the Old Text of Tianyi" (Tianyi guben 天衣古本). Muan also calls it "Text of Reverend [Tianyi Yihuai] (Huai heshang ben 儒和和尚本) or simply "Old Text" (Guben 古本). As Muan esteemed this edition so highly and referred to it eight times to support his own judgment, it would indeed be odd if he let important discrepancies of content go unmentioned. Thus we can assume that the content of Yihuai's 1053 text was similar to that of the text upon which the ZTSY commented, i.e., that it contained the first (except preface) and second chapters of today's Extensive Records plus some poems and fragments from the third.

4. THE TEXT COMMENTED BY MUAN SHANQING 警庵善卿 (T4)

A. Texts at the disposal of Muan Shanqing

The commentary in chapter 1 of the ZTSY 祖庭事苑 includes a number of references to different texts. When writing this commentary at the beginning of the 12th century, Muan Shanqing 警庵善卿 had the following texts at his disposal:

a) An "Old Record of Yunmen" (Yunmen gulu 雲門古錄). This text apparently differed from the ZTSY's basic text (cf. ZTSY 3d11-13) as well as from today's YML. As no plate or line numbers are given, this might be a reference to a manuscript of an early compilation.

The only reference to this text is found in ZTSY 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113:3d11. It cannot be excluded that this text is identical with the "Old Text of Yihuai" (see c. below).
b) The "Record of Yunmen's Responses to Occasions" (*Yunmen duiji lu* 雲門對機錄).

This record is only mentioned in *ZTSY* 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113:6c5. It probably corresponded to the first chapter of today's YML; however, Muan states that some poems were appended to this record. These poems are now found at the very end of the YML's chapter three.

c) The "Old Text of Tianyi". Muan seems to regard this text as trustworthy. When pointing out imperfections of the text upon which he commented, Muan often refers to Yihuai's text for support (*Tianyi guben* 天衣古本), also called "Text of Reverend Hui" (*Hui heshang ben* 禦和尚本) or simply "Old Text" (*Guben* 古本).

Such references appear in *ZTSY* 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113: 5c16, 5d8, 8d11, 8d13, 9b12, 9c9, 9d9, and 10a18.

d) The text commented upon in the *ZTSY* (T4). Muan did not himself edit and publish a text of Yunmen. He simply took an already printed text and commented upon it. When he found important imperfections in this text, he pointed them out in great detail with indication of plate number, segment, and line number. Such imperfections usually consisted in a number of omitted characters; Muan supplied them and referred the reader to the sources of his information (a. to c. above). What is the relation of this printed text to the YML?

B. The text commented in the *ZTSY* 祖庭事苑 (T 4)

The *ZTSY*’s commentary on the YML is of particular importance for the reconstruction of the YML’s history. It is a running commentary on certain expressions from a lost YML text. The entries of this commentary can be compared with today’s YML text, and divergences of content or order permit conclusions about the old, lost text as well as about the history of our YML text. The result of our investigation is shown in Appendix 10.

With relation to the available texts of the YML, the analysis of the data in Appendix 10 yields the following conclusions:
- Preface
The preface of the text commented by Muan was different from both the 1053 and the 1076 prefaces.
- Rest of the first chapter of the commented text: nearly identical with today's first chapter
The ZTSY commentary takes up items which appear in the same sequence in the first juan of the extant YML. For every page of the extant text there are some items in the commentary. However, the first chapter of the text upon which the ZTSY commented also included some verses in praise of Yunmen; these verses appear at the very end of the extant YML text. Thus one can conclude that the first chapter of the extant YML (with the exception of the preface and the mentioned verses) is very likely to be identical with the text on which the ZTSY commented.
- Second chapter of the commented text: differently arranged but otherwise similar to the second chapter of today's YML
The ZTSY's entries to the second chapter (雲門録下) correspond to the YML's "Statements and Substitute Answers" section (垂示代語), while the ZTSY comments to the Record from Yunmen's Room (雲門室中録) are with few exceptions found in the YML's "Essence of Words from Inside [the Master's] Room" (室中語要). Both of these sections are found in chapter 2 of the extant YML text.
- The text commented by Muan shows hardly a trace of the YML's third chapter
Apart from the verses mentioned above, only a scattered handful of ZTSY's entries can be traced to the extant YML's third chapter. As these entries are, unlike the ones corresponding to chapters 1 and 2 of the extant YML, extremely few and not sequential in relation to the YML text, one can conclude that no more than some short fragments of the extant third chapter were included in the text upon which the ZTSY's author based his commentary.

If Muan, who had various early manuscripts and printed editions on his desk when writing his commentary, chose a text to comment upon which appears to have virtually the same content as the extant text's two first chapters, we can assume that these two chapters must be
rather similar in content to the most trustworthy material available about 100 years after the Master's death. The comparison of Jingde chuangenglu passages with the YML (see Appendix 9) also supports the conclusion that today's first chapter must be very similar to the original manuscript(s). Since the extant YML texts remarkably follow the ZTSY's suggestions for correction, we can assume that later editors relied on the ZTSY commentary.

5. **THE SU XIE EDITION OF THE YEAR 1076 (T 5)**

The preface which appears at the beginning of the extant YML text (YML 544c28-545a12) was written by the official Su Xie for a new printed edition of the YML. It dates from the year 1076; thus this edition appeared almost a quarter century after Yihuai's of 1053. This preface is translated in Appendix 1; what follows here is only one portion of this preface which is of interest for the YML's history:

His transmission to posterity comprises responses to occasions 對機, records from [the teacher's] room 室錄, statements and substitute [answers] 峙代, critical examinations 勘辨, and the biographical record 行錄. Now, as the text was dated and contained some errors, I 祕考 it and had the correct and unique new printing blocks carved so that [the text] may be eternally disseminated and help making the forging and tempering 伺桐 of one's very own matter 伺桐 the alpha and omega. 伺桐

Though one cannot say with certainty how much and what sort of text was contained in the chapters that are mentioned in Su Xie's preface, it appears that it featured not only the whole or parts of our YML's first and second chapters but also much of the third:
- The same preface : YML 544c26-545a12
- Responses to Occasions 對機 : YML 545a16-553b10
- Records from [the Teacher's] Room 室錄 : YML 553c24-561c04
- Statements and Substitute [Answers] 峙代 : YML 561c05-567b05
- Critical Examinations 勘辨 : YML 567b16-573b03
- The Biographical Record 行錄 : YML 575c03-576a16

The 1076 text was possibly the first to include the Biographical Record and the whole of the Critical Examinations. Only seven out of about 500 lines of the YML's "Critical Examinations" are found in
earlier texts (five in the CC 祖堂集 and three in the CDL 景德傳燈錄). In the case of the Biographical Record, there is no earlier evidence. It is quite possible that Su Xie's "collation" effort included adding these parts; thus his text probably was the first "extensive record" 廣錄 of Master Yunmen's sayings and doings.

The contrast with the content of other early texts is striking. For example, the text commented by ZTSY (see Appendix 10) contained hardly anything of the YML's third chapter, i.e. its total volume probably amounted at most to about two thirds of today's text. Su Xie's text, on the other hand, appears to have had at least nine tenths of the volume of today's YML text. The only parts that are included in today's Extensive Records but are not mentioned in Su Xie's preface are some poems (YML I: 553b11-c16; III: 576b19-c29), the "Record of Pilgrimages" (III: 573b4-575a20), the "Master's Testament" (III: 575a21-b11), his "Last Instructions" (III: 575b12-c2), and the "Petition" (III: 576a19-b6). These unmentioned parts amount to less than ten percent of today's YML.

Was Muan familiar with Su Xie's text when he wrote his commentary at the beginning of the 12th century? Probably not. One can assume that, had he known about it, Muan would at least have mentioned Su Xie, his preface, textual differences, or parts of the 1076 text which did not appear in the text which he himself commented. On the other hand it appears odd, to say the least, that someone as interested in Chan texts as Muan would not be aware of a large and comprehensive printed edition of Yunmen's records that appeared more than 25 years before he set about writing his commentary. Still, similar things happen even in modern times....

The lack of data forces us to admit that this riddle can at present not be solved. However, the possibility cannot be excluded that the 1076 preface was tampered with at some later date. After all, it was this preface which became the standard one, and some later editor may have wanted to adopt its listing of contents to suit newly included materials. The preface would not be the only part which suffered this fate: as was pointed out in the analysis of Yunmen's biographical sources (Appendix 5, nr. 1), there is reason to suspect
that someone rewrote part of the "Biographical Record". Short of discovering old texts in China's or Japan's libraries there simply is no way to know what the 1076 text actually contained.

6. THE YUANJUE ZONGYAN EDITION FROM AROUND 1144 (T 6)

The very last line of the YML's oldest extant complete text, the Guzunsu yulu 古尊宿語錄 text of Taiwan National Central Library 台湾国立中央图书馆, says: "Collated by Yuanjue Zongyan on Mt. Gu in Fuzhou 住福州鼓山圆觉宗演校勘." The YML's Taisho text features this line not just once but at the end of each chapter. Furthermore, at the end of chapter three, the Taisho text adds: "Printing blocks engraved by Wang Yi on Mt. Gu in Fuzhou 板在福州鼓山王溢刊." Unfortunately, Zongyan's edition is no more extant. However, the colophons mentioned above indicate that the oldest extant complete text of the YML (T7; see also Appendix 6) is nothing other than a republication of the 1144 Zongyan text. Zongyan may therefore have played an important role in the history of our text, and a closer look at this man and his working methods is needed.

Not much is known about the man Yuanjue Zongyan 圆觉宗演. He was a master of the eighth generation of the Yunmen line, i.e. four "Chan generations" after the editor of the 1053 text, Tianyi Yihuai. Shiina thinks that Zongyan lived from 1074 until 1146. Scholarly opinion is divided as to when he edited the YML; Yanagida favors a date around 1120, but Shiina has good evidence to support the theory that this took place between 1143 and 1145, shortly before Zongyan's death.

The YML was not the only text Yuanjue Zongyan collated. He was also the man who collated and printed the Records of Linji (Linjilu, jap. Rinzairoku 臨濟錄). Zongyan's text is also the oldest extant complete text of the Records of Linji. In the 1120 preface to this text, the official Ma Fang 马防 writes: "Old Yan of Yuanjue has now undertaken to circulate this text. He examined and corrected it; thus it contains no error or confusion." Both Demievile and Yanagida point out that it was probably Zongyan who divided the Records of Linji into five parts. Further investigation of Zongyan's collation of
the *Linjilu* which also takes the *Guzunsu yulu* 古尊宿語錄 and *Sijia yulu* / *Wujia yulu* 四家語錄/五家語錄 texts into account may indicate that Zongyuan's collations of the records of Linji and Yunmen show a similar pattern. It is probable that Zongyuan added parts of the *YML* which contain biographical information (biographical record, record of pilgrimages, the Master's testament, his last instructions, and the petition with the dream account. These additions are noted in the chart of Appendix 7; this appendix shows the sequence inside a particular text in comparison to earlier texts. This chart makes it clear that and how Zongyuan rearranged the text and which parts he added to the third chapter.

We do not know how many and which texts Zongyuan used while editing the *YML*, but he must have had access to the ZTSY and to the text on which Muan commented because most of Muan's suggestions for correction of the text are followed.

7. **THE XUKAI GUZUNSU YUYAO EXCERPTS XGYY; 續開古尊宿語要**

This text (ZZ vol. 118) was published in 1238 by Hushi Shiming 昭室師明 from Mt. Gu 敲山 as an addition to the *Guzunsu yuyao* 古尊宿語要. With the exception of the *Records of Linji*, all records in this supplement only give excerpts of larger bodies of text. Appendix 11 shows in detail how the XGYY's portion on Yunmen relates to the extant *YML* text.

The analysis of the correspondences between the *YML* and the XGYY Text yields the following conclusions:

- The XGYY text includes only excerpts of the *YML*; in total, its text devoted to Yunmen amounts only to approximately 250 Taishō lines, which is just about ten percent of the *YML*’s total volume.

- The XGYY editor chose bits and pieces from a basic text that certainly included the *YML*’s first and second chapter plus the "Record of Pilgrimages" of chapter three. There are practically no textual discrepancies, and the sequence of XGYY is totally congruent with that of the *YML*; one can thus assume that, for the parts they used, the editors of the XGYY and those of the earliest complete version (T7) relied on the same basic text.
More interesting than what is in the XGYY text, however, is what is lacking in it: there is no trace of the voluminous first part ("Critical examinations") and of the last few sections of the YML's third chapter. Was this simply a decision by the editor of the XGYY, or did he have a text which did not include the "Critical Examinations"? In view of the eclectic attitude of the editor towards the first two chapters and the Record of Pilgrimages, one would expect that, had he used Yuanjue Zongyan's text of 1076 (Text nr. 6), he would have included at least some lines from the Critical Examinations. Shiina concludes that the editor Hushi Shiming must have left out the "Critical Examinations" material on purpose, but the reasons for this omission remain unclear.

8. THE EXTANT TEXTS (T 7 - T 13)

The earliest complete extant text of the Extensive Records of Yunnmen 雲門廣錄 (T7) is contained in the Giusuno yulu 古尊宿語錄, the oldest edition of which is found at the Taiwan National Central Library 台灣國立中央圖書館. The content of this edition was outlined above (section II of this chapter), and Appendix 7 shows its configuration in relation to earlier texts. The GZY Y was collated at the beginning of the 12th century on Mt. Gu 鼓山 by Yuanjue Zongyan 圓覺宗演; its original publisher was Layman Juexin 覺心居士 of Hangzhou 杭州. At the time it did not yet include the YML; it was first inserted in the 1267 edition which was engraved in printing blocks by Wang Yi 王溢; this 1267 edition of the XGYY is the oldest extant complete YML text found at Taiwan's National Central Library. Shiina located another Song-time text of the YML at the Ryōokusin 両足院 in Kyoto; its comparison with T7 showed the two texts to be absolutely identical.

At the same temple there exists a Gozan version 五山版 from late Kamakura times (14th century) of the YML in three juan 卷 (T8) which is no copy of the Taiwan National Library text (T7); though text, text format, and line format are identical, there are some differences in print; most importantly, however, it bears the colophon...
"Collated by Yuanjue Zongyan on Mt. Gu in Fuzhou 住福州鼓山圆觉宗演校勘" -- which in T7 appears only once at the end of the third juan -- at the end of each chapter. Furthermore, T8 and features the line "Printing blocks engraved by Wang Yi on Mt. Gu in Fuzhou 板在福州鼓山王溢刊" which is also not found in T7. This makes it likely -- given that Gozan versions are usually faithful copies -- that the Gozan text (T8) was not based on T7 but rather on T6.200

The text of later Japanese versions of the YML is in general identical with T7 and T8 except for the typeface of Su Xie's 蘇潔 preface; in the movable type version 古活字版 published by the Rinzai monk Sōtetsu 宗鐵 in 1613201 (T9), Su Xie's preface is printed in half-cursive style (xingshu 行書). The same is true for T11, a version printed in 1640 with corrected plates of T9 by Tsurugaya Kyūbei 敦賀屋久兵衛. This latter version is, again according to Shiina,202 based on the Ming edition 明版 of the GZYL (T10) which appeared in 1615 and was reprinted (T12) by Nagamura Hanhyōe 長村半兵衛 in the Edo period. The Ming GZYL text forms not only the basis of the Yunmen parts of the Wujia yulu 五家語錄 (published in 1630) but is also a source of the Taisho version of the YML (T13).

The Taisho text of the YML (T13) features the same colophons as the Gozan text (T8);203 it was established by comparing the Gozan version (T8) with the Ming GZYL (T10) and Tsurugaya text (T11).204
CONCLUSION

Although the oldest extant version of the YML stems from the year 1267 -- i.e. more than three centuries after Master Yunmen's death -- we can say in summary that the fragments of and commentaries on earlier texts indicate that the YML text which we now have is surprisingly good. In particular, we have early evidence that the first chapter and part of second chapter -- which contain most of the Master's instructions -- existed probably in the same form as today. Concerning other parts, especially the "Critical Examinations" and some of the biographical sections, we also have a fair amount of early evidence of their existence even if they were at the time not included in the collected sayings of the Master. Though it is impossible to judge the early stages of note taking and compilation, it appears that the text, once written down, changed comparatively little. Of course the text went through several rearrangements and was corrected and sometimes augmented by various editors, but on the whole it nevertheless appears to be quite a trustworthy record whose history is fairly clear. Thus the analysis of Master Yunmen's teaching can base itself on this text.

Extant complete texts show very few differences. These differences are not insignificant, but this significance is almost exclusively limited to the investigation of the text's history. The meaning of the text is hardly affected at all. Comparison of the oldest extant version with the Taisho text shows that, apart from the often mistaken punctuation of the Taisho text, the only places where small differences can be noticed are the colophons, the chapter headings, and in a few instances different characters which are mostly printing errors. Though the missing punctuation of the Taiwan text is to be preferred to the questionable one of the Taisho text, the latter contains so few other errors that the places where the Taiwan version should be consulted can be listed on less than two lines: YML 549b15, 553c15, 560b13, 561a23, 562c13, 563a13, 563a19, 565c17, 568a3, 569c2, 571a29, 571c4, 572b29-c1, and 575c14. Because of this, all quotes from and references to the YML in the following chapters are made to the standard Taisho text which should be available in every major library.
CHAPTER III

FACETS OF MASTER YUNMEN'S TEACHING
A. APPROACH; B. TEACHING SITUATIONS & PATTERNS; C. STUDENTS' QUESTIONS; D. CENTRAL CONCERN;
E. OVERCOMING SUFFERING; F. THE CHAN TEACHER AND HIS TASK; G. YUNMEN'S TEACHING METHOD;
H. KOAN AND DOUBT; I. BREAKING THROUGH DUALITY; J. NONDUALITY

雲門聳峭白雲低
水急遊魚不敢棲

Steeply Mt. Yunmen rises, leaving the white clouds down below!
Its streams rush ever so swiftly; no fish will dare to linger.

(YML 550b20)

A. APPROACH

The analysis of Master Yunmen's teaching is, as the poem above indicates, no easy matter. The bulk of the main source text for this analysis, the Extensive Records of Yunmen 雲門廣錄 (YML), is no systematic exposition of the master's teaching but rather a series of glimpses of Master Yunmen in teaching action. This collection of student's notes, probably taken at random and later arranged primarily according to teaching patterns, conveys a vivid picture of a master who devoted himself with the utmost intensity to the guidance of his students. Yunmen's teaching lives in and through the dynamic interaction between master and students, the guide and the guided.

The objective of this chapter is to document this interaction in a structured fashion. The structure, i.e. the overall view of this teaching and the choice of relevant facets, is based on an inductive process of repeated readings of the entire YML over a number of years during which certain themes came into focus. In a concurrent effort, a number of important Chan records were studied in order to find both similarities and differences from Yunmen's teaching. Though only very few quotes from other texts (with the exception of the Blue Cliff
Record) were used in our analysis, these texts nevertheless played an important role in crystallizing themes and sharpening the eye for some characteristic traits of Yunmen's teaching. This in turn informed and facilitated the choice of examples from the Records of Yunmen. Rather than charging this investigation with much material from other Chan texts and secondary literature, it is our aim to provide many illustrative examples from the Records of Yunmen and thus to let the Master speak for himself.

Of course, the chosen interpretative framework is not the only possible one; nor can such a framework ever take all possible aspects into account. Furthermore, the choice of examples is informed by the interests of the writer, and their interpretation poses -- as mentioned in the introduction to this dissertation -- a great many problems. In view of all this it is no wonder that over the centuries so few people have ventured to interpret and analyze the Chan masters' teaching and its significance, modes, methods, and motives. This attempt does of course not presume to be the final word on Yunmen, but rather one of the first; it is to be hopes that it will function as a source of material and a stimulus for further discussion and research -- research which will uncover and describe facets of the Master's teaching that are not dealt with in this chapter.

B. TEACHING SITUATIONS AND PATTERNS

It was already mentioned in chapter II above that the editor(s) of the Records of Yunmen arranged the notes of Yunmen's instructions and conversations primarily according to teaching situations and patterns. 'Situation' refers here to the place and setting of teaching activity, while the term 'pattern' is used to characterize the teaching activity itself. Combined analysis of these two elements yielded six most conspicuous categories into which most teachings by Master Yunmen fit. However, one must not overlook the occurrence of combinations of these patterns and situations. The following table must thus be consumed cum grano salis. The parts of the YML which contain substantial teachings by the Master are underlined, and less used teach-
ing patterns are indicated by a smaller font.

TABLE 2: Distribution of teaching patterns in the YML

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YML Chapter</th>
<th>Part of YML</th>
<th>Teaching Pattern</th>
<th>Nr.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First juan 卷</td>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>formal public</td>
<td>(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>monk asking Master</td>
<td>(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Responses to Occasions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Songs and verse</td>
<td>verse</td>
<td>(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second juan 卷</td>
<td>Words from Inside the Room</td>
<td>ord. informal</td>
<td>(4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>informal &amp; quote</td>
<td>(5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>substitute answers</td>
<td>(6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Statements/Subst. Answers</td>
<td>substitute answers</td>
<td>(6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ord. informal</td>
<td>(4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>formal public</td>
<td>(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third juan 卷</td>
<td>Critical Examinations</td>
<td>substitute answers</td>
<td>(6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Record of Pilgrimages</td>
<td>monk asking Master</td>
<td>(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Formal public instruction by the Master in the Dharma Hall

Such public instructions begin with the expression *shangtang* 上堂; this means that the talk was held by the master from the teacher's chair in the Dharma Hall in front of the assembled monastic community (which occasionally included some invited laypersons). Most but not all of these talks were collected by the editors under the heading 'Responses to Occasions' (*duiji* 對機) in the first chapter of the Records. They are held in a very forceful style and are characterized by constant questioning, challenge, provocation, abuse, admonition, and critique of the listeners. Rather than being conventional presentations of Buddhist doctrine, they point in a direct manner to the core of the listening individual, put his very being into question, and confront him ceaselessly with the very problem which made him be-
come a monk and go on pilgrimage (see sections D and F of this chapter. The formal instructions also exhibit an acute consciousness on the side of the teacher of the limits of his role: ultimately, all he can do is pushing the listeners toward their own realization (see section F of this chapter). Thus the Master's instructions include admonitions, sometimes in quite crude terms, to not accept any teachings at face value and to inquire oneself. The Master provokes such inquiry by many questions to the audience (see section G of this chapter). The formal talks often end with a question or with some other doubt-provoking words or actions. The following is an example of a shorter public instruction; a number of longer ones are translated in the next chapter.

In the [Dharma] Hall, [Master Yunmen] said: 'With you, the cards are on the table.' When I meet someone, I know him. In spite of such old women's talk, you don't understand. You gorge yourself every day, and after your meals you go up and down [from Monks' Hall to Dharma Hall] -- what bowl is it that you're looking for? You pack of wild foxes! What the hell are you doing in [this temple] here? At once [the Master] chased [the monks] out with his staff. (YHL 550c1-4)

2. Exchanges initiated by someone's question(s) to the master

This type of exchange is frequently encountered in the Records; most of the time it is embedded in many other short exchanges of the same type, but occasionally the monk's question is triggered by a sermon of the master or by an answer to a previous question. As with the Master's formal instructions, the editors of the Records arranged most of these exchanges under the title "Responses to Occasions" (duiji 對機) in the first chapter. The following are examples of the simple and more complex types:

[Someone] asked, "What is the original tradition [of Chan]?" The Master said, "[If you] don't ask, [I] don't answer." (YHL 546a24-25)

An official asked, "Is it true that the Buddhist teaching is like the moon in the water?" The Master replied, "The pure wave is without any road that leads through to it."

[The official] pressed on, "By what way have you attained [it]?" The Master answered, "Where does this second question come from?"

[The official] went on, "How about the time when it's just this way?" The Master said, "Over and over again blocking the mountain path." (YHL 545b2-5)
3. Verse

The first chapter of the YML closes with Yunmen's "Song of [all] twelve time periods [of the day]" (Shiershi ge 十二時歌) and twelve Religious Verses (jiesong 偈頌). It is unknown when and how these originated and what function they had in Yunmen's teaching.

4. Ordinary informal instruction

Unlike formal public instructions, these informal instructions are usually rather short and were held at various occasions and places, for instance while eating, drinking tea, working, etc. They usually begin with the words "[the Master] addressed the assembly" (shizhong 昭衆) or "the Master once said" or "the Master said". At times the Master also starts out with some action (holding up a bowl, etc.). The Master's actions and/or words at the outset of these informal addresses are usually meant to be or reinforce a challenge to the witnesses; they are in general followed by remarks or questions by the master or a question-answer exchange. Most informal talks of this kind are found in the first section of the second chapter under the heading "Essentials from inside the room" (shizhong yuyao 室中話要). Two examples:

One day the Master opened his frock and said, "I'm shaking off the Dharma body." No one answered. The Master said, "You may ask me." So a monk asked, "What does your shaking off the Dharma body mean?" The Master replied, "I also know that you're attached to it."

(TML 560a15-17)

Addressing the assembly, [Master Yunmen] said: "[Though] I let you talk any way you like, you're not yet a descendant of our [Chan] school. If you'd obtain descendence of our school, it would be [nothing but] noise made by a hot bowl. The three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings are sleep talking, and so is Bodhidharma's coming from the West. If there are masters who open temples to explain the Buddhist teaching for the benefit of other people: what fault would there be if someone took a sharp sword and killed a hundred, a thousand, ten thousand of them. What would his fault be?" He added, "And I used to think that there must be some sense in such kind of talk!"

(TML 559a3-7)

5. Informal instruction based on a quote

The Master cites statements or discussions/exchanges by some master(s) or monk(s) and provokes his audience by some comment(s), ad-
ditional remark(s), question(s), or action(s). Occasionally, Yunmen also quotes a conversation without adding any comment. The quote itself and the following words or actions by the master were meant as a challenge and test for the audience which sometimes (as in 554c17) seems to have consisted of a single person. The Master usually brings the import of the quotes home to his audience through an action, remark, question, or combinations of some or all of these. There are also quite a few instances where this kind of informal instruction ends with one or several substitute answer(s) by the Master. With the systematization of koan use, this teaching pattern became very important in the Chan movement. Most teaching of this kind is found in the first section (entitled "Essentials from inside the room" shizhong yuyao 室中語要) of the Record's second chapter. Two examples:

[Master Yunmen] cited the words of the Overnight Enlightened One: "The miraculous function of the six senses is empty without being empty; the perfect light of the singular [sacred jewel] is form without form." The Master held up his fly-whisk and said, "This is the perfect light, it is form without form. What do you call form? Come on, try taking that up with me!"

[Master Yunmen] quoted Dharma teacher [Seng] Zhao's words: "The dharmas (separate entities) are not different. One must not stretch the duck's [legs] and shorten the crane's, level the peaks and fill up the valleys, and then think that they are no different!" Master [Yunmen] said, "The long is by nature long, the short by nature short." Again, the Master said: "Each entity is settled in its position; the mundane aspect is permanent." Then he held up his staff and said, "The staff isn't a permanent entity."

6. Substitute answers

There are two major kinds of substitute answers: in the first the Master expresses his own view, usually adopting the roles of one or several persons and putting in their mouths what he would have said or would say himself. In the second he speaks in place of the listener who was not able to say anything. Both kinds can be followed by one or more additional remarks or answers. The first kind of "substitute answer" which expresses the Master's own view is sometimes marked by the phrase zidai yun 自代云 and is almost exclusively encountered in

3B: Patterns 45 YUNMEN'S TEACHING
the second chapter, as is the following example (substitute answers are in italics):

[Haster Yunmen] mentioned [the following episode]:
The Buddha asked an adherent of another religion: "What do you in your view regard as the essential?"

[Haster Yunmen] answered in place of the adherent: "Old monk, I'm capable of knowing you!"
The other religion's adherent answered: "We regard as essential not to be taken in by anything."

[Haster Yunmen] said in place of the Buddha: "I'll give you a go!"
The Buddha said: "You regard it as essential not to be taken in by anything, do you?"

[Haster Yunmen] answered in place of the adherent: "Hey, Gautama, don't make me lose the question!"

YML 558b11-14

Instances when Yunmen prods the listener who is unable to answer ("Ask me, I'll tell you!") usually belong also to this first type of substitute answer:

In the hall, [Master Yunmen] said, "The old buddhas hit it off well with the pillars. What level of function is this?" There was no answer.
The Master said, "You ask me, and I'll tell you!" So a monk asked [what level of function it was], and the Master answered, "One silk belt: thirty cents." In place of the first words [about the buddhas and pillars], [the Master] said, "When clouds gather on South Mountain, rain falls on North Mountain."

YML 561c18-21

The second kind of substitute answer, namely, that in which the master expresses the understanding and thoughts of the audience, is frequently met with in the second section ("Statements and Substitute Answers") of the second YML chapter and in the first section ("Critical Examinations") of the third chapter. This pattern occurs in many different settings and serves various purposes. It is a favorite teaching technique of Master Yunmen. It is characteristic of this form that the master drives his listeners to a point where they are blocked and cannot respond any more. At that moment, the master exposes the dilemma of the silent listener(s) in the form of a substitute answer (usually marked by the phrase dai yun 代云).

Many encounters with monks that are recorded under the heading 'Critical Examinations' (kanbian 勘辨) at the beginning of the Record's third chapter follow this pattern. The Master usually asks a student a seemingly trivial question such as where he is from, whom he
has met, where he will go to, etc. Using the student's answer(s), a quote from a scripture, or some other words or action, the Master drives the student to an impasse. Then, sometimes after suggesting to the student that he direct the same question to the Master, Yunmen concludes the exchange by providing one or more answers of his own.

He asked a monk, "Where are you coming from?" The monk replied, "From picking tea." The Master asked, "Do people pick tea or does tea pick people?" [The monk] had no answer. In his place, [Master Yunmen] answered, "The Master (Yunmen) said it all; I cannot add anything."

(TML 567c5-7)

Yunmen manages in this manner to express for example the values and thoughts of a student who is mainly concerned about food or one who struggles to no avail:

At some point, the Master said, "How are you doing?" In place of asked monk] he said, "I ate too little." [TML 562a13-14]

While picking tea, the Master said, "Picking tea is tiring. Come on, ask me a question!" When nobody responded, he continued, "If you can't say anything, recite the ABC. If you're not up to that either, trace the red letters of the ABC written by the writing instructor." Instead of the speechless listeners] he said, "The effort is not wasted." With regard to the first words ['picking tea is tiring'], he said in place of his audience, "I toil yet there is no result." (YML 562a27-b1)

Occasionally, the Master uses his answers to discourage false hopes or to provide encouragement or advice to a determined monk:

[Master Yunmen took his seat] in the [Dharana Hall], and when the assembly had gathered and was quiet, he said, "It's a severe affliction; examine it most thoroughly!" He said in place of the monks, "[For this] you don't employ anyone else." (YML 562a5-7)

Substitute answers of both types sometimes occur in the same episode, and there are times when it is better not to distinguish them too sharply because they can be seen (and possibly were intended to be seen) either way. The first of the following examples can be taken as an answer and/or an ironic comment on the monks' silence, while the second and third examples feature a substitute answer for the monk as well as a comment by the master.
In the hall, [the Master] said, "Heaven and earth are cramped; the sun, moon, and stars all at once go dark. What do you say?
In place of his listeners, Yunmen] said, "A good thing is not as good as nothing."

(YML 562c10-11)

Once [the Master] said, "The Buddhist teaching does not apply itself to express in words what is most valuable in the world."
In place of his listeners, Yunmen] said: "Don't tell me this is cheap!"
He added, "A dry piece of crap!"

(YML 562c17-18)

When [Master Yunmen] saw the characters for 'dragon hideout' he asked a monk, "What is it that can come out of a dragon hideout?" [The monk] had no answer. The Master said, "Ask me, I'll tell you!" So the monk asked, and the Master replied, "What comes out is a dead frog." On behalf of [the monk] he said, "Shit stinks." Again, he said, "Steambreads and steamcookies."

(YML 568b2-5)
C. THE STUDENTS’ QUESTIONS

The questions of hundreds of Yunmen’s students are recorded in the Records of Yunmen; most of them are found in the first chapter. These questions are a mirror of many things, for instance of the students’ preoccupations, their doubts, their knowledge of and stance towards Buddhist and Chan doctrine and lore, their interaction with the teacher, their themes of discussion, their modes of practice, their problems, their aspirations, etc.

Any classification of questions must limit itself to one or to a small number of possible viewpoints. With regard to the different types of questions, we have a classification that is attributed to Chan Master Fenyang Shanzhao (947-1024); it is found in the well-known 12th-century compendium entitled Rentian yanmu 人天眼目. Though it is by no means exhaustive, could be considerably enlarged or altered, and has even been criticized as "somewhat confused", it is here used as a device to elucidate some of the major types of question. At the same time, this earliest typology of Chan questions will serve as an occasion to present a number of examples from the Records of Yunmen. Our description of Fenyang Shanzhao’s question types is tentative because on one hand (apart from the sometimes unclear -- title) no further explanations are available from the author and on the other hand the single example that is given for each type of question is neither sufficient for extrapolation nor traceable to Fenyang himself. These examples were probably added by some later writer, possibly by the redactor of the source text of this classification, Huiyan Zhizhao 晦嚴智昭. Here, a number of monk-master exchanges from the Records of Yunmen are added in a similar manner. Their typological distribution can of course be no less tentative than the type description itself.

In the following pages, the presentation of each of Fenyang’s eighteen types of question is followed by the example given in the Rentian yanmu 人天眼目 and, when available, by some typical examples from the Records of Yunmen. Then follows an enumeration of major question themes. The distinction between 'question type' and 'question
theme' -- 'type' addressing why, how, and to what end a question is posed, and 'theme' referring to a question's content --, is somewhat artificial. Nevertheless, it shows that Fenyang's list is predominantly concerned with question type rather than thematic content. For this reason, Fenyang's catalogue of questions will be supplemented by an enumeration of major question themes in the YMY.

1. **Types of students' questions according to Fenyang Shanzhao**

   *with examples from the Renshan yanyu and the Records of Yunmen*

Type 1: **請益 qingyi Questions that ask for instruction.** In this type of question, a master is directly asked for instruction about some element of Buddhist teaching. It often has the simple form of 'what is ...?'. "This is what is generally asked by a novice of the master, wishing to be enlightened on such subjects as the Buddha, the significance of Bodhidharma's visit to China, the essence of the Buddhist teaching, the Dharma, etc." 235

A monk asked Mazu, "What is Buddha?" Mazu said, "Just mind is Buddha." Zhaozhou said, "The one in the shrine." (YMY 天眼目 48[2006]307c8-9)

```
[Someone asked [Yunmen], "What is Shakya's body?" The Master said, "A dry piece of shit." (YMY 550b15)]
```

```
[Someone] asked, "What is the eye (= essence) of the true [Buddhist] teaching?" Master [Yunmen] said, "The vapor of gruel and rice." (YMY 545c17)
```

Type 2: **呈解 chengjie Questions that present one's understanding, point of view, or condition.** In this type of question, the student expresses his condition or point of view and wants to hear the teacher's opinion about it.

A monk asked Longya, "How is it when 'sky cannot cover, earth cannot hold'?" Longya said, "People of the Way have to be like this." (YMY 天眼目 48[2006]307c10-11)

```
[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about when all possibilities are gone?" The Master said, "Pick up the Buddha Hall for me, and I'll discuss this with you!" (YMY 549c1-2)
```

30: Students' questions  

50  Yunmen's Teaching
Type 3: 察辨 chabian Questions that investigate [the Master's] discernment. The student presents a difficult problem and seeks to see where the Master stands.

[Someone] asked Linji, "I have a question: how is it when one is in your position / when it is on the part of the teacher?" Linji said, "Say it quickly, say it quickly!" As the student hesitated, the Master struck him.

(YUNMEN'S TEACHING 48(2006)1307c12-13)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "Was Vimalakirti's silence equal to speech or not?" The Master said, "Extremely good question!" [The questioner] went on, "In that case it was equal to talk." The Master replied, "What did you say before?"

(YML 552c26-27)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "What is 'the shallow within the profound'?" The Master said, "Mountain, river, world."

"What is 'the profound within the shallow'?" The Master replied, "World, mountain, river."

[The questioner] continued, "What is the profound?" The Master said, "Going to India in the morning, returning to China in the evening."

(YML 556a4-7)

Type 4: 投機 touji Questions that take advantage of an occasion. Questions "in which the questioner shows that he still has a doubt as to his attainment and expresses his desire for confirmation."

A monk asked Tianhuang, "How about when the feeling of doubt has not subsided?" Tianhuang said, "Even oneness, when held on to, is not the real thing."

(YUNMEN'S TEACHING 48(2006)1307c14-15)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "If a man who has penetrated to the profound hidden bottom would come, how would you help him?" The Master replied, "Two gongen 公案 are taken care of by one indictment."

(YML 551c28-29)

Type 5: 偏僻 pianpi One-sided questions. A partial or one-sided understanding is presented to the teacher as or with a question.

A monk asked Bajiao, "The whole world is an eyeball. I'm asking for your guidance." Bajiao said, "A poor chap came upon a feast."

(YUNMEN'S TEACHING 48(2006)1307c16-17)
Type 6: 心行 xinxing Questions about one's practice of heart-mind. The teacher is asked for advice about matters of religious practice.

A monk asked Xinghua, "I can not yet distinguish black from white and ask for your fangbian." Hua hit him as he spoke. [YUNMEN'S TEACHING 48[2006]307c18-19]

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about when watching my own body there is no self, and watching outside there is none either?" The Master said, "What happens when you catch a fever?" (YML 550a17-18)

Type 7: 探拔 tanba Questions that seek to probe [into the Master's attainment]. The student asks in order to test the depth of a master's understanding. This question type is also known as "examining the host".²³⁹

[Someone] asked Fengxue, "Why does someone who does not understand not doubt?" Fengxue said, "When the sacred tortoise crawls overland, how can it avoid leaving tracks in the mud?" (YML 549a29-b2)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "What about the roar of the clay or on the snow peak?" The Master replied, "Mountains and rivers are running."
[The questioner] went on, "And how about the neighing of Yunmen's wooden horse?" The Master said, "Heaven and earth are black." (YML 546b20-22)

---

³²³ Yunmen's Teaching, translated by Thomas Cleary. The text is an excerpt from the collection of questions and answers between students and the famous monk and philosopher, Yunmen. The questions explore various aspects of religious practice and heart-mind, testing the depth of understanding and the ability to probe into the master's attainment.
Type 8: 不會 〈buhui 〉Questions out of ignorance. One asks because one does not understand; simple request of instruction without specific topic.

A monk asked Xuansha, "I have just entered the monastery and ask you for your guidance." Xuansha said, "Do you hear the sound of the valley stream?" The monk affirmed. Xuansha said, "Enter from there." (YTM 人天目目 578[2006]107c22-24)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "Since I have come to your Dharma seat, Master, I have not understood [anything]. Please give me your instruction!" The Master said, "Is it okay if I lop off your head?" (YML 551c10-11)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "I request your instruction, Master." The Master said, "A B C D E F..." [The questioner] said, "I don't understand." The Master continued, "G H I J K L..." (YML 552b5-7)

Type 9: 採 〈qindan 〉Questions that pick up. A topic is taken up by someone who has his own view of Chan; this is then criticized or made fun of.

[Someone] asked an old master, "'No need at all to bring out worldly wisdom and discriminating intelligence' -- return the words to me!" The master immediately hit him. (YTM 人天目目 578[2006]108a1-2)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "Leaving aside the 'transcending of Vairocana': may I ask you, Master, to leave me a little emptiness?" The Master said, "I'm holding your throat in a tight grip. What do you say?" (YML 548a4-6)

Type 10: 置 〈zhi 〉Questions that place [a quote]. Questions in which words or conversations of old masters are cited.

Someone asked Yunmen, "What about 'when you look straight yet don't see any boundaries'?" Yunmen said, "Look!" (YTM 人天目目 578[2006]108a2-3)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "What about 'the host in the guest'?" The Master said, "Straddle this question!" [The questioner] asked on, "And what about 'the host in the host'?" The Master replied, "Fold your hands!" [the questioner] continued, "What is the distance between guest and host?" The Master said, "Like eyeball and eye." [The questioner] said, "What in the world are you talking about?" The Master said, "Three times nine is twenty seven." (YML 551c7-10)
Type 11: 故 *gu* Questions that take up [saying from Buddhist scriptures]. A passage from sutras or commentaries is used in the question.

Someone asked Shoushan, "All sentient beings have the Buddha nature. Why don't they know it?" Shoushan said, "[They] know." (RYMY 人天眼目 148[2006]308a5-6)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about [the Heart Sutra's saying] 'Form is nothing other than emptiness'?" The Master said, "This stick hits your nose." (YML 549c10-11)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "The teaching I received from you includes the word 'purity of all-embracing wisdom.' How about the time [when this is present]?" The Master spit at him. (YML 549c23-24)

Type 12: 借 *jie* Questions that borrow. Questions which make use of metaphors and examples and refer to facts. Also called "questions that use facts".  

Someone asked Fengxue, "The great sea harbors a pearl. How can I get it?" Fengxue said, "When Wangxiang arrives the light shines bright; where Lilou walks, the waves flood the sky." (RYMY 人天眼目 148[2006]308a7-8)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "What is the sword (so sharp that it cuts apart) a hair [blown over the blade]?" The Master said, "Dry bone." He added, "Bone with flesh." (YML 545a27-28)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about the pearl in your pocket?" The Master said, "Can you tell?" (YML 550c20-21)

Type 13: 實 *shi* Questions based on immediate facts of observation

[Someone] asked Sansheng, "Oh, I see that you are a monk. What is the Buddha and what is his teaching?" Sansheng said, "This is the Buddha and the Dharma. Do you know them?" (RYMY 人天眼目 148[2006]308a9-10)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "I am an excellent archer. I entreat you, Master, to point out the target." The Master said, "You're on the way to answer your question!" (YML 548c26-27)

Type 14: 假 *jia* Questions containing a hypothetical case.
[Someone] asked Qingshan, "If this is the one in the shrine, what is the Buddha?" Qingshan said, "This is the one in the shrine."  

(RYT) 人天眼目 T48[2006]308a11-12

------------

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about when I'd clear away everything in one sweep?" The Master said, "What would you do about me?" [The questioner] replied, "That's up to you!" The Master exclaimed, "Windbag!"

(YML 551a7-9)

Type 15: 畢 shen  Ascertain questions. A problem "embodying a real doubt" regarding some teaching is brought forth as a question.

[Someone] asked an ancestral teacher, "All separate things are fundamentally existent. What is nonexistent?" The Patriarch said, "Your question is quite clear. Why bother to ask further of me?"

(RYT) 人天眼目 T48[2006]308a13-14

-------------

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "Which of the three bodies expounds the Buddhist teaching?" The Master said, "The essential."

(YML 550b14)

-------------

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about 'applying [enlightenment] on the road'?" The Master said, "Six times nine is sixty three." [The questioner] went on, "And how about 'conventional truth pervades everywhere'?" The Master replied, "Jiangxi and Henan [provinces], Korea, the sea of Bchai."

(YML 549c18-20)

Type 16: 徵 zheng Questions with aggressive intent. Questions which imply a criticism or challenge.

Someone asked Mushou, "What did the patriarch [Bodhidharma] come from the West [to China] for?" Mushou said, "You tell me what for [he came]!" The monk did not reply, and Mushou hit him.

(RYT) 人天眼目 T48[2006]308a15-16

-------------

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "What is the meaning of [Bodhidharma's] coming from the West?" The Master said, "The mountains, the rivers, the world." The monk insisted, "Is there again something which goes beyond this?" The Master said, "There is." [The questioner] continued, "What is this thing beyond?" The Master said, "Old Shakymuni stayed in India, and the Bodhisattva Manjusrj in China."

(YML 551c22-25)

-------------

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "I request you, Master, to present the essence of the [Chan] school." The Master said, "In the South, there's [Master] Xuefeng, in the North, there's Zhaozhou."

(YML 550b16-17)

Type 17: 明 ming  Clarified questions. A question is clarified by con-
A non-believer asked the Buddha, "I do not ask about the speakable nor about the unspeakable." The Buddha remained silent for a long time. The non-believer said, "The World-honored One's great kindness and great compassion have opened up my clouds of illusion and let me gain entry." (RTYØ 人天1m目 T4 (2006)308a17-18)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "The myriad objects return to the one. [Now] I don't ask about the one, [but]: What are the myriad objects?" The Master said, "You came in here to bandy words and to cheat me!" (YML 547c18-19)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "I don't ask about the scriptural doctrine. What is the central matter of your [Chan] school?" The Master replied, "Since there is one who came to ask, quickly bow thrice in reverence!" (YML 548c21-22)

Type 18: 默 mo Questions that are not expressed in words.

A non-believer came to the Buddha and stood there silently. The Buddha said, "Quite a load, outsider!" The non-believer said, "World Honored One, your mercy and compassion have allowed me to enter." (RTYØ 人天目 T48(2006)308a19-20)

2. Major themes of students' questions in the Records of Yunmen

The themes of students' questions in the YML are quite similar to those in some other Chan records of the 10th and 11th centuries, for instance the records of Yunmen's master Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存, of his co-disciple Xuansha Shibe 玄沙師備, or of the great Zhaozhou Congshen 趙州從谂. The thematic analysis of question content in the YML yielded some major themes which will be listed below together with some typical examples. It goes without saying that most of these themes are intimately connected; one can rightly assert that all questions address one of the Four Noble Truths of Buddhism, i.e. 1) suffering, 2) its origin, 3) its cessation, and 4) the way to overcome suffering. The following list of themes will provide no more than a superficial impression of some of the forms in which the students expressed their concern -- and an opportunity to translate a fair number of questions that were posed to Master Yunmen. All examples are cited from the YML; it is to be noted that questions by students are
with few exceptions found in the first chapter of this text.

- Questions about Buddhist teaching, its essence, the Buddha
  "What is the eye of the correct [Buddhist] teaching?"; 245 "What is the meaning of the [Buddhist scriptural] teachings?"; 246 "What is the place where all Buddhhas show themselves?"; 247 "What is the body of Shakyamuni?", 248 etc.

- Questions about religious practice, overcoming suffering
  "What is a spiritual adept's practice?"; 249 "What is the patchrobed monk's essential point?"; 250 "What is the practice of the Great Vehicle?"; 251 "What is the one road to breakthrough?"; 252 "How can I stay untroubled by the various objects during all hours of the day?"; 253 "What is perfect concentration (samādhi)?"; 254 "How am I to get rid of life-and-death once it has come?", 255 etc.

- Questions about oneself and one's present situation
  "What is my self?"; 256 "What is my very own affair?"; 257 "What is the place to turn myself around?"; 258 "How about when the six senses are not pacified?"; 259 "How about when all possibilities are gone?"; 260 "How does one heal the Buddha-patriarch-illness?", 256 etc.

- Questions about teaching
  "If a man comes who has penetrated through to the profound sublime bottom, how do you teach him?"; 262 "People from the whole world are coming; how do you receive them?"; 263 "For whom is it that you're expounding the teachings?"; 264 "The thousand kinds of expedient means [used in teaching] lead to and originate from a source. I wonder what the central matter of this source is."; 265 etc.

- Questions about the specific teaching of Yunmen
  "What is the one song of Yunmen?"; 266 "What is the style of Yunmen's house?"; 267 "What is your one phrase to teach people?"; 268 "What is Yunmen's one road?"; 269 "What is Yunmen's sword?"; 270 "What is your Chan?"; 271 etc.
- Questions concerning the verbal expression of awakening
"Ordinarily, to have words and phrases is to be mistaken. How about not being mistaken?"; "What is a statement that transcends the Buddha and goes beyond the patriarchs?"; "What is a phrase that is transmitted separately outside the doctrinal teachings?"; "What is a single phrase outside the three vehicles of [Buddhist] doctrine?"; "What is the one phrase?"; "What is the phrase that penetrates the Dharma Body?"; "What is the single word that says it all?", etc.

- Questions about breaking through / going beyond
"What is the occasion of breaking in and breaking out?"; "How about when one breaks through the wall and unveils the light?"; "How about when the dark room obtains brightness?"; "How about when one clears off everything in one sweep?"; "How about when one attains the Way at the appearance of the morning star?"; "What is 'going beyond'?"; "What is the single road beyond [duality]?", etc.

- Questions about enlightened man, his situation, and his activities
"What is the form of a great man?"; "What did the old worthies attain that brought them high esteem?"; "How about the pearl in the robe pocket?"; "What is the true eye of the patchrobed monk?"; "How about when omniscience prevails and there is no hindrance?"; "How about applying [enlightenment] on the road?", etc.

- Questions about Chan and the Way
"What is the original school?"; "What is the central matter of the [Chan] school?"; "What is Chan?"; "Master, please show me the significance of the Sixth Patriarch!"; "What is the central intention of the Sixth Patriarch?"; "What is the meaning of Bodhidharma's coming from the West?"; "What is the Way?", etc.

- Questions about well-known Chan / Buddhist themes
"What is the purity of omniscient wisdom?"; "What is the pure..."
As mentioned above, the ultimate concern of all of these questions can be said to be suffering and its origin, its cessation and the way to bring it about.
D. THE CENTRAL CONCERN

When young Yunmen knocked at Master Muzhou's gate and was asked why he had come, Yunmen expressed his central concern with the words "The matter of my self is not clarified". In the YML, several monks are mentioned who formulate their problem in an identical or similar manner: "What is my self?" The Master also addresses this in the following anecdote:

Once [Master Yunmen] said, "What's wrong with someone who is in the dark about himself?" He answered on behalf [of the silent monks], "A great man ought not to be this way."

(YML 584e17-18)

It is exactly this concern which is addressed by Chan Buddhism; in the often quoted verses on the essence of Chan that became famous during the Song periods 不长 after Yunmen's death, the aim of Chan is characterized as "directly pointing to man's heart-mind, letting him see [his own true] nature and [thus] attaining Buddhahood." This description implies that ordinary man does not see his nature, i.e. that man does not truly know himself. "A great man ought not to be this way" also means that the problem to be addressed is not simply one of knowing but one of being: man is not his true self and thus does not know himself.

Not knowing oneself is thus a symptom of an illness which affects all human beings; in the Master's instructions, answers, pieces of advice, etc., but also in questions to and by the Master, we find descriptions or indications of a many other symptoms of this dis-ease: anxiety, attachment, restlessness, suffering, evasion, etc. Their common denominator is duality; this -- and of course its overcoming -- is the raison d'être of Buddhism. The ground of suffering is that a subject is facing objects and is attached both to itself and objects:

[Though] in the Dharma there are no individual things, they deludedly get attached to themselves.

(YML 永嘉證道歌 48(2014)457b9)

Yunmen described this problem in the following way:

"When the light has not broken through, there are two kinds of disease: the first is
when nothing is clarified\textsuperscript{113} and there are objects facing you. The second is when, having been able to pierce through to the emptiness of all separate entities (dharmas), it is as if that were in a hidden way some object. This, too, happens when the light has not broken through. (YML 558a20-22)\textsuperscript{114}

The 'I' which is not just a subject but also an object for itself\textsuperscript{313} can neither know itself nor external objects fully.

[Master Yunmen] cited Panshan's\textsuperscript{314} words: "When the light [of the knowing subject] is not one that confronts objects\textsuperscript{315} and the objects are not existing things either, when both the [subject's] light and the object are forgotten, what further thing is there?"

Master [Yunmen] said: "If the whole world is the [subject's] light, what do you take to be your 'self'? If you'd manage to know the [subject's] light, you'd be unable to grasp any objects. What shitty [subject's] light and objects you've got! [Since] neither the [subject's] light nor any object can be grasped, what further thing could there be?" (YML 555c15-18)

The unenlightened person who does not know his or her self is, in the words of Yunmen's co-disciple Xuansha, like "a fellow who sits in the rice basket and starves to death, is up to his head in the water yet dies of thirst."\textsuperscript{316} In Chan literature, the image of radiant light is often used for man's true self.\textsuperscript{317} Getting on the teacher's chair in order to instruct his students in the Dharma Hall, Yunmen once simply said the following words before leaving the hall: "Every person naturally\textsuperscript{316} has a radiant light.\textsuperscript{319} When you look at it, you don't see it and it's dark and obscure."\textsuperscript{320} Another time, he taught:

"Each and every person has the radiant light. When you look at it, you don't see it and it's dark and obscure. 'What is the radiant light?"

On behalf of the silent audience he said, "The kitchen pantry, the main gate." He added, "A good thing isn't as good as nothing." (YML 553b22-24)

Yunmen uses such expressions to bring home the nature of man's dualistic predicament:

[Master Yunmen] cited Xuefeng's words: "The whole world is you. I always thought that there are further beings apart from that."

Master [Yunmen] said: "Haven't you read that the Surangama sutra\textsuperscript{311} says, 'Sentient beings are perverted;\textsuperscript{311} they delude themselves and chase after things. If they can change into things, they are identical to the Buddha.'\textsuperscript{313}"

\textsuperscript{113} Central concern

\textsuperscript{314} Yunmen's Teaching
Master quoted, "All objects (dharmas) are no-objects; just this is called 'all objects'."114 Then he held up his fan and said, "You call this a fan. [Though] this word is mentioned,115 where is [it]? What use is it to be overwhelmed by delusive thoughts from morning till night?" (YML 572257-c1)

In spite and because of its deep ignorance about itself, the deluded 'I' is attached to itself, to its own views, to high esteem by others, etc. Yunmen's concluding statement of the following conversation states the problem in a nutshell:

The Master asked a monk who was reading a Buddhist scripture, "What's the title on the cover?" The monk held up the scripture. The Master said, "I've got that, too!" The monk said, "Since you've got it, why do you ask?" The Master replied, "How can I help [it]?" The monk inquired, "What's the problem?" The Master said, "You don't notice the stench of your own shit!" (YML 570c2-5)

This self attachment is also the source of arrogance and pretense:

When someone invites you monks to a donated feast you [arrogantly] say: 'I am satisfied with the food I eat, [but] what topic of conversation can [the donor] handle?' Some day you'll be facing the King [of Hell] Yama,116 and he won't accept your glib talk. My brothers, if there is one who has attained it, he passes his days in conformity with the ordinary. If one hasn't yet attained it, one must at any price avoid to pretend. (YML 547a17-20)

"These old shavepates everywhere! They sit on the round [teacher's] chairs117 and meditation platforms,118 wanting to acquire fame and profit. Asked about Buddha, they answer 'Buddha', and asked about patriarch they answer 'patriarch', and they shit and piss. [What they say] is just like [hearsay] information passed around among boondock grannies.119 They don't know [anything, not even] good from bad! You're all exactly like these [shavepates]; you ought to have trouble consuming even water [with a good conscience]."120 (YML 553a4-7)

Another, related attachment which Yunmen denounces in particularly harsh terms is that of students to teachers and their teaching as well as discussions and pretentious questions about them:

If a bunch of windbags121 gulp down other people's pus and slobber, recall heaps and loads of rubbish, and run all over the place, stretching their [big] donkey lips and horse mouths,122 boasting: 'I can ask questions in five or ten alternative ways!' will they in eternity see [what they talk about] even in a dream, even if they ask questions from morning till evening with the answers taking them into the night? Where will they [ever] apply their strength for the benefit of others? You resemble people of this kind. (YML 547a13-17)

----------

The instant you see an old monk open his mouth you tend to stuff those big rocks right into
yours. You're exactly like those green flies on shit that struggle back to back to gobble it up and take it away! In groups of three and five you stick your heads together and deliberate. Shame on you, brothers!

What holds true for the subject in its relation to itself of course also applies to its relation to any other object: many of the Master's questions aim at exposing the inability of the ordinary 'I' to fully grasp any object. Yunmen asks for instance: "What perceptive faculty is there to hinder you? What object of perception is there that can be clearly grasped by you?"; "What is it that you call 'Buddha' and 'patriarch', and what is it that you call 'mountain', 'river', 'earth', 'sun', 'moon', and 'stars'?"; "What thing is there in the whole universe that is an object for you or stands in relation to you?" In a longer passage, he says to the same effect:

[Master Yunmen] cited the words of Mr. Bao: "Just as I myself am empty, all entities (dharmas) are empty. With all thousand categories and myriad kinds [of objects], it is entirely the same."

Master [Yunmen] said: "When you stand, [I] don't see standing; when you walk, [I] don't see walking. The four great elements [which constitute the physical universe] and the five components [of living beings] cannot be grasped. Come on, where do you see the mountains and rivers and the world exist? You, just you who every day take the bowl and eat rice; what do you call 'rice'? Where is there a single grain of rice?"  

As in the following two examples, Yunmen often challenges his students with questions about objects that expose the student’s central concern in poignant form:

Yunmen held up his staff and said, "What is this? If you say it is a staff, you go to hell. If it isn't a staff, what is it?"

-----------------

[Master Yunmen] quoted: "All sounds are the Buddha's sound; all forms are the Buddha's form."

The Master picked up the fly-whisk and said: "What is this? If you say it is a fly-whisk, you won't even understand [the exceedingly kind] Chan of a granny from a three-house hamlet."

The deluded 'I' is said to be attached, without being able to get hold of them, to the three realms of sensuous desire, form, and formlessness; these realms include all possible objects (including the
unenlightened individual's ideas and actions) after which the 'I' cannot but ceaselessly chase:

Master [Yunmen] once seized his staff, banged it down on the chair, and said, 'All sounds are the Buddha's sounds, and all forms are the Buddha's forms. [But] when you hold your bowl and eat your food, you hold a 'bowl-view'; when you walk, you hold a 'walk-view'; and when you sit you have a 'sit-view'. You all act like this!' And [the Master] took his staff and chased them away at once.\[YML 555c24-28\]

\[A monk\] asked, "What is mind?" The Master said, "Mind." The monk went on, "[I] don't understand." The Master said, "[You] don't understand." The monk said: "So what is it after all?" The Master replied, "In quiet places, [it is] wandering here and there." \[YML 549c14-16\]

Attachment to activities (including pilgrimage) and to the pleasant aspects of monastic life (such as regular free food) are also harshly criticized:

You must without fail be cautious! Don't idle away your time burning around in the provinces and loitering in the districts, wandering thousands of miles with your staff across your shoulders, spending a winter here and a summer there, [enjoying] the beautiful mountains and waters and doing what you want, provided with plenty of donated food and easily obtaining worldly possessions. What a disgrace, what an enormous disgrace! 'Wanting to get himself one peck of rice, he ends up losing six month's provisions'. What's the use of such pilgrimages? How dare you consume the believing almsgiver's bunch of vegetables and grain of rice? \[YML 547b6-11\]

In the [Dharma] Hall, [Master Yunmen] said: "With you, the cards are on the table." When I meet someone, I know him. In spite of such old women's talk, you don't understand. You gorge yourself every day, and after your meals you go up and down [from monk's hall to Dharma hall] -- what bowl is it that you are looking for? You pack of wild foxes! What the hell are you doing in [this temple] here? At once [the Master] chased [the monks] out with his staff. \[YML 550c1-4\]

Sometimes, Yunmen exposes and criticizes the monks' attachments simply by expressing their thoughts in place of them:

Once the Master asked a monk, "How are you doing?" He answered in place of the [silent] monk, "I ate too little." \[YML 562a(4-15)\]

When the Master heard drum sound at a meal, he said, "Old Buddha is bawling!" There was a monk who asked, "I wonder why old Buddha is bawling." The Master said, "[If you are] this way, will you ever see it even in a dream?" In place of the dumbfounded monk he said,
In the following anecdote, a monk’s professed central concern is contrasted with his actual self-attached preoccupations:

[Master Yunmen] related [the following story]: A monk asked Xuansha, "What is my self?" Xuansha answered, "Exactly your self!" Master [Yunmen] remarked, "Immeasurably great men get whirled around in the stream of words."

A monk asked [Yunmen], "What is my self?" The Master said, "Unexpectedly there’s a man in the street who invites you monks to a donated meal. If you join the queue, you’ll get to eat some food!"

But even when one has "been able to pierce through to the emptiness of all separate things (dharmas)" that state may itself become like an object to which one is attached like a monkey to a post:

The Master asked a monk, "Do you see the lantern?" The monk replied, "I can’t see it anymore." The Master said, "The monkey is attached to the pillar." He replied in place of the monk, "I’m deeply obliged to receive the profound heart of your Buddhist teaching, Master." To the first question (‘do you see the lantern?’) he replied on behalf of the monk, "A good thing isn’t as good as nothing."

In order to warn against the simple rejection of one pole of a duality while getting attached to the other one (such as 'emptiness' versus 'entities'),[349] Yunmen states several times: "One will not do, and two is not it."[350] This is one way of expressing the dilemma of dualism. In a classic but hitherto little noticed passage in the Records of Mazu, Chan master Shitou Xiqian[351] defined the essence of Chan teaching in terms of this dilemma in the following general way:

When Chan Master Yaoshan Weiyan[352] first visited Shitou, he asked: "I have a superficial knowledge of the Three [Buddhist] Vehicles' [entire] twelve divisions of teachings. Now I keep hearing of Southern [Chan’s characterization as] 'directly pointing to man’s heart-mind, letting him see [his own true] nature and [thus] attaining Buddhahood.’[353] This is something I really haven’t yet understood, and I humbly request your compassionate instruction."

Shitou said: "This way will not do. Not this way will not do either. No way, neither this way nor not this way will do. What do you do?"[354] Yaoshan was at a loss.

The importance of this passage can hardly be overestimated; the quotation in Yaoshan’s question defines the central concern of Chan Bud-
dhism in a concise manner, and Shitou’s answer is the basic Chan challenge which both exposes the human dilemma in a masterly way and points out a way to overcome it. A modern conversation between the founder of Temple University’s Religion Department, Bernard Phillips, and H.S. Hisamatsu 久松真三 makes the same point and may serve to elucidate the pedagogical intention of Shitou’s challenge:

Phillis: "If you follow any way, you will never get there."
Hisamatsu: "That is correct."
Phillis: "If you don't follow any way, you will never get there."
Hisamatsu: "That's right."
Phillis: "So one faces a dilemma."
Hisamatsu: "Let that dilemma be your way!" 355

Yunmen exposes the same dilemma in a more concise manner than Shitou:

When a monk stood waiting, the Master said: "I'm neither asking for words nor for no words. What do you say?" The monk was dumbfounded. 355

The person in this dilemma is suffering, and this suffering drives it to seek some way of overcoming its problematic state. Both Master and monks describe the torments of the unenlightened in various ways: "In the heart-mind of the 'I' there is all-encompassing, utter darkness"; 357 his "agony is profound"; 358 he cannot pinpoint what his problem is and what he is lacking; 359 nor does he know what he is looking for. 360 He knows no answer to the Master’s constant question: "What is the matter?" 361 and is not even able to tell what the purpose of his stay at the monastery is. 362 He is ignorant of the essence of Buddhist teaching 363 and full of doubt about Chan. 364 Unsure about the way to overcome his problematic state 365 and the goal of this way, 366 he exhausts all possibilities 367 and still does not come any further. Never at ease 368 and full of unrest, 369 he seeks security in holding on to pet schemes, 370 in learning expressions, 371 and in asking learned questions. 372 In the course of seeking to settle the problem of life-and-death, 373 he gets entangled in all sorts of activity:

Again, there's a bunch [of people] who in their vulgar manner stick the heads together, manage to quote some saying of the ancients, have their intellect memorize and their
delusive thoughts evaluate it, and say: 'I've understood the Buddhist teaching!' They busy themselves with nothing but discussions and pass the time following their whim. In turn, they come to feel that this is not what they want; [they travel] to thousands of places over myriads of miles and abandon their parents as well as their teachers. What frantic urge is it that drives the clamorous crowd that behaves this way to go on pilgrimage?

[People who] go on such pilgrimages, though styled 'mendicant monks', just squander the alms of the faithful. What a pity! What a pity! When asked, they turn out to be completely ignorant; they just busy themselves with passing their days at their own whim. If there are two or three who, by frantically learning and informing themselves widely, manage to absorb some current sayings, they look everywhere for similar words and get approved as masters.

Though "the Chan teaching keeps banging away at the thousand differences and myriad distinctions", the deluded heart-mind is caught up in these dualistic distinctions in one wink of an eye. When caught in such distinctions, one cannot understand expressions of non-duality and is tormented by doubts.

The prisoner of duality seeks to overcome his sorry state in some way or other, and in his search he turns to the Chan master, expecting him to indicate a method to uproot the entire dualistic structure and to break through to a new mode of being that is utterly free of dualism, attachment, and unease.
E. OVERCOMING SUFFERING

1. NO WAY WILL DO

Shitou's classic description of the dilemma which typifies human suffering is, as mentioned above, also an indication of the Chan way to overcome this dilemma.

Shitou said: "This way will not do. Not this way will not do either. No way, neither this way nor not this way will do. What do you do?"  

The dilemma becomes manifest in a variety of forms, but it always is a fundamental and existential question which each student himself is rather than some question he just has. Yunmen has the following to say about the latter type of question:

If a bunch of windbags gulp down other people's pus and slobber, recall heaps and loads of rubbish, and run all over the place, stretching their [big] donkey lips and horse mouths, boasting: 'I can ask questions in five or ten alternative ways!': will they in eternity see [what they talk about] even in a dream, even if they ask questions from morning till evening with the answers taking them into the night? Where will they [ever] apply their strength for the benefit of others? You resemble people of this kind.

In contrast, the question which is existential in the proper sense of the word concerns every person as his or her "very own matter". It cannot be faced and answered by anyone else.

This matter does not allow anyone to substitute for you; it is nothing but the very own mission of each person. If the old masters appear in the world, it is just to act as witness for you.

The basic dilemma, which in the following passage is labeled 'affliction' and 'offense', concerns every person equally. Master Yunmen does not cease to encourage and challenge his students to face it:

[Master Yunmen took his seat] in the [Dharma] Hall, and when the assembly had gathered and was quiet, he said, "It's a severe affliction; examine it most thoroughly!"
In place of the monks he said, "[For this,] you don't employ anyone else."
[The Master] asked a monk, "In the whole world, whose offense is the most serious?"
In place of [the silent monk] he said, "[They/you] come out even."

A Chan master immediately sees through everybody; Yunmen thus says at
the beginning of a short talk:384 "With you, the cards are on the table:385 When I meet someone, I know him."386 Some of the Master's favorite Chan anecdotes illustrate the same theme:

The instant Deshan147 saw a monk enter the gate, he drew his stick and drove him away. Mushou,148 seeing a monk come in through the gate, said: 'Though your case of criminal offense is perfectly manifest,149 I release you of the thirty blows [you deserve].'

(YML 547a10-12)

The offense is committed by all unawakened persons in that they each are an "I"; this is perfectly clear. Yunmen can be even rougher with his students than Deshan:

In the Hall for a formal talk, [Master Yunmen] said:

"Today I shall, for the benefit of everybody, bring up a case [from the Chan tradition]."
The assembly listened attentively. After a long silence, a monk stepped forth and bowed. When he was about to ask a question, Master [Yunmen] went after him with his staff, crying:

'You resemble those exterminators of Buddhism,150 those teachers receiving donated food on the meditation platform.151 What conversation would you be worthy of, you noisemaker?!'152 With his staff, [Master Yunmen] chased him out of the hall at once. (YML 548a8-11)

-------------

Now is there anyone to ask about the essence of Chan?153 Let me reply with one turn [of phrase]154 and [then] go wherever I like!155 Just when some monk was about to ask, the Master hit him with his staff full on the mouth. Then he left his seat. (YML 552c5-8)

Reliance on any person, any thing, any way, or any method is harshly criticized by the Master. For instance, anything learnt on the meditation platform is called "secondary"156 and rejected outright:

The Master said: "This [kind of answer] is what you can learn on the meditation platform. There's no need for [people] who, when something is, say 'it is', and when something isn't, say 'it isn't.'" (YML 551a7-18)

Similarly, Yunmen warns his students of (or reproaches them for) reliance on the study of texts and commentaries,157 on pilgrimage,158 on teachers and their teachings,159 on words of wisdom,160 on discussions,161 on intellectual understanding,162 etc. The following is just one typical example:

You must neither fall for the tricks of others nor accept their directives. The instant you see an old monk open his mouth, you tend to stuff those big stones right into yours. You're
exactly like those green flies on shit that struggle back to back to gobble it up and take it away! In groups of three and five you stick your heads together and deliberate. Shame on you, brothers! [Though] the old masters' whole lifetime is used up for you, you are not helped. So they leave a few words to communicate the entrance. While being aware of this sort of thing, you must put it aside and make some effort for yourself, and you'll certainly become familiar with it. Hurry up! Hurry up! Time does not wait for man, and breathing out is no guarantee for breathing in [again]! Do you have some spare body and mind to fritter away? You must absolutely pay attention. Take care! 

This passage shows that Yunmen does not advocate any specific method; he simply advises his students to put aside anything coming from outside, to "make an effort" by themselves, and to "pay attention". However, just the absence of any possible way may turn out to be a way.

2. NO-WAY AS WAY

In the description of the human dilemma that was quoted at the beginning of this section, Master Shitou does not simply state the problem ("No way, neither this way nor not this way will do"), but he adds the question and challenge: "What do you do?" It is characteristic of Yunmen's teaching that no recipe to salvation is offered other than that very salvation or self-realization itself; as long as there is a means to bridge a gap, there is no immediacy. This certainly is one meaning of the famous term dun 聲 which served to characterize Southern Chan. The Master neither advocates meditation nor study of sutras or any other method. On the contrary, Chan masters usually take great care to cut off all possible avenues and to bring the student face to face with his dilemma. The pointer to case 3 of the Blue Cliff Record is a case in point:

A device, an object, a word, a phrase: the intent is that you have a place to enter. [Nevertheless,] this is gouging a wound in healthy flesh, and it can become a nest or a den. The Great Function appears without abiding by fixed principles; the intent is that you realize that there is something beyond [duality]. It covers sky and earth, yet it cannot be grasped.

This way will do, and not this way will do, too: this is too narrow. This way will not do, and not this way will not do either: this is too unapproachable and dangerous. Without treading these two paths, what is right? 

It is therefore not surprising that Shitou's "No way, neither this way
nor not this way will do. What do you do?" is offered as a characterization of the Chan movement as a whole. Referring to the Lankavatara Sutra, the great Chan master Mazu Daoyi 馬祖道一 characterizes Bodhidharma's Chan in a very similar fashion as "taking the heart-mind of which the Buddha spoke as foundation and no-way as way of teaching." Yunmen says to the same effect:

\[Someone\] asked [Yunmen], "Though I exert myself to the utmost all the time, I cannot find any way in. Please, Master, show me some way in!" The Master said, "Just in this occasion [of searching yet not being able to find a way in] there is a way." (YHL 550b17-19)

This advice is in effect the same as the one given by Hisamatsu to Bernard Phillips, namely, "Let that dilemma be your way." As a consequence, Yunmen insists on questions rather than answers. He tries to deepen and focus the student's awareness of and preoccupation with his existential plight in various ways. Instead of giving his students answers to hold on to, he bombards them with hundreds of questions. Instead of simply accepting the students' inability to answer, he exposes what the students are thinking but do not say, or sometimes what they would or could say if they were awakened. Instead of pointing out specific ways to overcome suffering, he asks his students whether they lack anything (545b18-19, 546c8) and what they intend to do about their plight:

How should you go about applying yourselves to the above-mentioned matter [of the source of all Buddhist teaching]? Did you so far attain it by talking in [this Dharma Hall] here about 'perfect' and 'sudden'? Did you get it [by being] here or there? You had better not misunderstand! You must not hear me talk this way and then choose and evaluate by turning toward 'not perfect' and 'not sudden'. (YML 546a23-25)

Instead of telling his students that they ought to realize this or that, Yunmen asks them:

If even a worldly man said, 'Should I hear about the Way in the morning, I will die content in the evening', then what about us monks? What is it that we ought to realize? You must make a great effort! Take care of yourself! (YML 547b15-17)

In this way, Yunmen forces his students to face themselves and thus realize their 'no-way' situation existentially.
After having stood up to his hip in the snow and cut off his arm to come to grips with his problem, Bodhidharma is finally allowed to tell Bodhidharma about his concern:

"Please, Master, pacify my heart-mind!" Bodhidharma replied. "Present me your heart-mind, and I will pacify it for you!" [Huike] went on, "I have searched for my heart-mind, but I could not find it." Master [Bodhidharma] said, "How could it be your very own heart-mind if you could search for it? And how could I after all pacify it for you?" Then Bodhidharma said to Huike, 'I have once and for all pacified the heart-mind for you. Do you now see it?' At these words, Huike was greatly awakened.

Is Bodhidharma in this version of the story saying that there is no way, no means other the total immediacy of self-realization? Be this as it may, Bodhidharma’s challenge to Huike to bring forth his very own heart-mind has a parallel in many of Yunmen’s questions and demands, for example:

[Someone] asked [Yumen], "When life-and-death has come, how am I to get rid of it?" The Master said, "Where is it?" (YML 547c4-5)

As to the 'escape from the three realms' [of sensuous desire, form, and formlessness] which you seek about: Come on, get hold of these three realms! (YML 548b10)

If there is [even the smallest thing such as] a needle-tip that forms an obstacle or constriction for you, come seize it for me! (YML 551b27-28)

Yumen’s favorite question, "What is the matter?", pursues the same goal: to help the student become aware of, face, and come to grips with his own problem.

What is the matter right now? Try settling this, face to the assembly! (YML 545a27-b1)
Yunmen furnishes questions instead of answers; using numerous methods, he constantly drives his students to find their own question and to hold on to it, to inquire about their core problem and to try to get hold of it. In other words, he urges his disciples to occupy themselves with their 'very own matter'.

The Master once said, "Wherever you are, you like to answer. Now is there some phrase that you're unable to penetrate?" Instead of the listeners, Yunmen said, "Come on!" (YML 55b3-4)

----------

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "What is the patchrobed monk's very own matter?" The Master said, "In the South, there's [Master] Xuefeng; in the North, there's [Master] Zhaozhou." [The questioner] continued, "Please, Master, don't dodge [the issue]!" The Master said, "You must not lose the question!" The student said, "Yes." The Master hit him. (YML 55b20-22)

----------

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is a successor of the patriarchal school?" The Master said, "Good question!" (YML 55c21-22)

Exchanges such as the following one may sound rather cryptic if the reader does not keep in mind that Yunmen's answers often simply confirm the quality of a question and push the student to pursue it thoroughly by himself:

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is Ch'an?" The Master replied, "That's it!" [The questioner] went on, "What is the Way?" The Master said, "Okay!" (YML 54c27-28)

While the Master's answers in the following exchange can be understood as simply referring to the grammatical form of the student's utterances, one can also take them as one more statement about the importance of the student's questioning and doubt, and even as a concise exposition of the Master's teaching method:

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "Since antiquity, the old worthies have transmitted mind by mind. Today I ask you, Master: What methods do you adopt?" The Master said, "[When] there's a question, there's an answer." [The questioner] went on, "If so, you've not cleared away methods." The Master replied, "Without asking there's no answer." (YML 54b10-11)
3. **YOU MUST DO IT YOURSELF**

When Yunmen encourages his students to face their existential question ("Just you, each and every one of you, must make the effort!")

he insists that everybody is able to overcome suffering. Every person is "a full-fledged fellow" who has "got his share."

The following conversation makes the same point:

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the WAY (dao)?" The Master said, "Go!"

[The questioner] went on, "I don't understand. Please, Master, tell me!" [Yunmen] said, "Monk, your passport is in order. Why should I check it once more?" (YML 552c24-26)

By quoting the saying "what enters by the gate is not the [family] treasure", Yunmen points to the fact that for overcoming the kind of suffering which concerns a person's core, one cannot rely on anybody or anything. Every person must strive for himself.

Now what should you do? Every one of you must strive for himself to obtain [a better] rebirth. (YML 552a8-7)

Facing the question which the unawakened person is to itself and finding the answer to this question is what Chan is all about:

His Imperial Majesty asked, "What is Chan?" The master replied, "Your Imperial Majesty has the question, your servant the monk has the answer." Then the emperor went on asking, "How do you respond?" The Master said, "I request your Majesty to reflect upon the words your servant has just said." (8959,112.16)

If the only way advocated by Yunmen is to face and dig without any compromise into one's central "no-way" dilemma, i.e., if one ought to "thoroughly investigate the ground under one's own feet", one will only hindered by reliance on other persons or things. The student should hold on to nothing except his own question, his doubt, his inability to understand:

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the monk's practice?" The Master replied, "[The monk's] '[I cannot understand]' [The questioner] carried on, "Why is there that '[I] cannot understand'?" The Master said, "Just hold on to the '[I] cannot understand'!" (TML 545c10-11)

-------------------

**3E: OVERCOMING SUFFERING** 74

**YUNMEN'S TEACHING**
Yunmen related that Changqing had asked a scholar, "The Buddhist teachings say that sentient beings use [it] daily yet do not know [it]. The Confucian texts also say that one uses [it] daily yet does not know [it]. What is it that one does not know?" The scholar said, "One does not know the Great Way." The Master said, "Exactly, one does not know!"

(YML 561a3-5)

Yunmen denounces any sort of reliance, be it on teachers, their words, scriptures, or anything else.

Don't rely on your master's words, words that resemble his, or rules! Wherever you go, you show what's inside of you. [So far, you wrongly took this to be self-understanding. Don't get me wrong! What's the matter right now? Try settling this, face to the assembly!]

(YML 545a16-61)

Whether you are an innocent beginner or late learner, you must raise your spirits! Don't vainly memorize [other people's sayings] -- a little bit of reality is better than a lot of illusion -- for later on you'll just deceive yourself. What is the matter?

(YML 548c14-16)

To find out about and settle this matter is each suffering person's most pressing concern. Yunmen knows exactly that dealing with this is extremely difficult:

Once he said, "Where's the problem? To get there is so difficult!" On behalf of the monks he said, "Find out!"

(YML 555b7-8)

He keeps urging his students not to waste time and to go all out in this pursuit.

If you have not yet found any clue but have met an undisguised helper (i.e., a master) who is [as fierce] as a dog biting boars, and [so compassionate that he] does not care about his life nor shy away from entering mud and water in order to give you guidance, and if he has something good for chewing: [then] blink your eyes and raise your eyebrows, hang your bowl bag high [on the wall], and for ten or twenty years exert yourself to the utmost! Don't worry about not bringing your effort to completion: should it happen that you do not yet achieve it in this lifetime, you will not fail to get a human body in the next one, and then it will turn out that you have saved labor with regard to this teaching. Thus you will not idly squander your whole life, and you will also not let down the patrons of Buddhism, your teachers, and your parents.

(YML 547b1-6)

They should not expect the teacher's efforts to do the job for them:

If in reality you haven't yet attained it, then don't expect the Master's allotment of expedient means to do the job. My brothers, you who all in the same way wear out your straw sandals on pilgrimages and abandon teachers and parents -- you absolutely must fix
 Though everybody must make his own effort, a teacher can still be of
some help: 417

[Though] the old masters' whole lifetime is used up for you, you are not helped. So they
leave a few words to communicate the entrance.418 While being aware of this sort of thing,
you must put it aside and make some effort for yourself, and you'll certainly be in close
connection with it. Hurry up! Hurry up! Time does not wait for man, and breathing out is no
guarantee for breathing in [again]! Do you have some spare body and mind to fritter away?
You must absolutely pay attention. Take care!

(AML 546c12-17)

4. YOU MUST BE THE SOLUTION

If one cannot overcome suffering unless one gets to the bottom
of "one's very own matter" through one's own doubt-driven intensive
investigation and constant inquiry, the unquestioning acceptance of
any teaching, be it from Buddhist scriptures and commentaries or from
the mouth of one's teacher, can only be a severe hindrance. Thus Yun-
men constantly warns his students, sometimes in quite vulgar terms to
make this perfectly clear, of simply accepting teachings:

Anyway, what do all of you lack? Who of you full-fledged fellows hasn't got his share?
Though you may accept [this] for yourself, you're still out of luck. You must neither fall for the tricks of others nor accept their directives.

(AML 546c8-10)

---------------

In a formal discourse [Master Yunmen] said: "If, in bringing up a case I cause you to accept my words instantly, I am already dropping shit on top of your heads."

(AML 546b28-29)

---------------

During [your pilgrimages] you cheat the master in your own house. Do you see what I mean? When you manage to find a little slime behind my ass, you lick it off, take it to be your own self, and say: 'I understand Chan, I understand the Way!' Even if you manage to read the whole Buddhist canon -- so what?!

(AML 553a16-18)

Accepting some teaching is but one more bond, one more attachment; but
overcoming suffering means exactly breaking loose of all bonds, letting go (see section I of this chapter). From this perspective, even an advanced understanding must be given up:

Instructing the assembly, Master [Yunmen] said: "The twenty eight Indian and six Chinese patriarchs as well as the empire's teachers are all on the tip of this staff. Even though
you may be able to understand this and distinguish it with extraordinary clarity, you're only at the halfway stage. If you don't let go, you're nothing but wild fox spirits!"  
(YML 554a1-3)

For the same reason, the study and discussion of interpretations and the memorization of sayings are criticized by the Master:

If you want to make progress and seek understanding by looking for words and chasing after phrases, and if you set up a broad array of questions and inquiries by means of a thousand differences and myriad distinctions, you'll [just] get tired and gain a glib tongue while you deviate further and further from the Way. What rest could you find [in this pursuit]?  
(YML 545a20-24)

If there are some who, by frantically learning and informing themselves widely, manage to absorb some current sayings, they look everywhere for similar words and get approved of as masters. They lightly dismiss superior men, [thus] creating karma of misfortune. Don't say, when some day the king [of hell] Yama pins you down, that nobody warned you! Whether you are an innocent beginner or late learner, you must raise your spirits! Don't vainly memorize [other people's] sayings -- a little bit of reality is better than a lot of illusion -- for later on you'll just deceive yourself.  
(YML 548c11-15)

Instead of accepting some teaching, the Master exhorts his students to be extremely critical:

When at some later point you go to various places and see old masters lift a finger or hold up a fly-whisk and say 'this is Chan' and 'this is the Way', draw your staff, smash their heads, and go away! Otherwise you'll end up among the followers of [the demon king] Deva Mara and ruin our [Chan] teaching.  
(YML 550a23-25)

Instead of memorizing sayings and using them in vain discussions, the student ought to get rid of all learnt phrases and express what he himself realized rather than what he just understood intellectually.

At a donated meal the Master asked a monk, "All phrases that you've ever learnt in the monasteries are gotten rid of; now tell me, how does the food taste?" On behalf of the silent monk he said, "There's too little salt and vinegar on the vegetables."  
(YML 563b25-27)

You're making pilgrimages all over the place, studying Chan and asking about the Way. Let me ask you: how about that which you could learn in all those places? Try presenting that!  
(YML 553a14-16)

What is accepted, studied, discussed, etc. may increase one's knowledge and intellectual understanding; but the only thing that ul-
timately counts is to realize "one's very own matter" existentially, to become oneself the solution.

Nevertheless, these [paradoxical expressions of resolution] are still but verbal explanations of our tradition. You must in reality become like this!  
(YML 546a2-3)

------------

You make your living in a shit pit! That's why I say: You must grasp the whole universe, the world, the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings, all the Buddhas of the three periods, and the verbal teachings of the whole empire's masters at once right on your eyelashes!  
(YML 550c23-551a1)

Someone who is the solution does not hesitate when tested but is able to respond immediately and fully. This is very rarely the case; Yunmen as well faltered when first challenged by his teacher Muzhou:

The Master [Yunmen Wenyan] first called on Chan master Muzhou Song. The moment Muzhou saw Yunmen come, he shut the door. Yunmen thereupon knocked at the door, and Muzhou asked, "Who is it?" Yunmen said, "It's me." Muzhou said, "What's the matter?" Yunmen replied, "The matter or my self is not clarified, and I implore you to give me guidance." Muzhou opened the door, cast one glance, shut it, and withdrew. In this manner, Yunmen went on three consecutive days to knock at the door. On the third day, when Muzhou started to open the door, Yunmen forced his entrance. Muzhou seized him, saying, "Speak! Speak!" Yunmen hesitated. Muzhou pushed him out, saying: "Good-for-nothing!"  
(YFTL 遊方過錄, YML 573b5-10)

Those who have not yet become their own solution should further investigate and avoid pretending to have a realization which they in reality don't have. People who fall into that trap are fooling both themselves and others and are harshly criticized by the Master:

"When I was on pilgrimage some time ago, there was a bunch of people who gave me explanations. They didn't have bad intentions, but one day I saw through them [and realized] that they are laughingstocks. If I won't die in the next four or five years, I'll hack off and shatter the legs of these exterminators of Buddhism one by one. Right now there are plenty of temple priests everywhere who fake it: why don't you go and join them? What dry piece of shit are you looking for in [this temple] here?" The master stepped [from his chair] down on the floor, and with his staff he hit and chased [the monks] out [of the hall] at once.  
(YML 553a23-28)

------------

You must actually get to this level of realization. If you have not yet [attained it] you must not pretend [that you have]. Rather, you must step back, investigate underneath your feet, and see what there is to it!

(YML 546c1-3)
Rather than going on pilgrimage, discussing actions and sayings of the masters, pretending to understand them, etc., such students should try to find out why they engage in all these activities and face what they do not understand:

There's a bunch [of people] who in a vulgar manner stick their heads together in order to bring up some saying of the ancients, apply themselves to memorize it, evaluate it with their deluded mind, and say: 'I've understood the Buddhist teaching!' They busy themselves with nothing but entangling discussions and pass the time following their whim. In turn, they come to feel that this is not what they want; [they travel] to thousands of places over myriads of miles and abandon their parents as well as their teachers. What frantic urge is it that drives the clamorous crowd that behaves this way to go on pilgrimage?'

(YML 546b17-22)

In a formal sermon the Master said: "My brothers, you certainly visited and questioned masters in all regions to settle [the problem] of life-and-death. Everywhere you went there must have been masters who accorded you expedient words of compassion. Now is there any phrase that you could not penetrate? Come forward and try bringing it up so that this old fellow may discuss it with all of you! Anything? Anything?"

(YML 546b11-14)
F. THE CHAN TEACHER AND HIS TASK

1. THE TEACHER’S HANDICAP

A Chan master is expected to teach about Chan and the Way (Dao); however, in attempting to do this, he encounters the difficulty which has its most famous formulation at the very beginning of the Daodejing 道徳經:

A dao that can be told of (dao) is not the Permanent Dao (chang dao).
A name that can be named is not the Permanent Name (chang ming).

Max Kaltenmark who translated the above sentences comments:

Hence the first two sentences set up an opposition, on the one hand, between the forms of Tao -- i.e., teachings, prescripts, etc. -- that can be communicated (dao) to others, that can be expressed in words, and the Permanent Dao (chang dao), i.e., the Supreme Principle that is not subject to the changes of the phenomenal world. On the other hand, these sentences oppose the names that are used for naming -- i.e., those that make beings (including spirits and gods) accessible -- to the Permanent Name, i.e., the Name that would adequately represent the transcendent eternity of the Dao.

In Zhuangzi 莊子 there is a story about a wheelwright which illustrates the teacher’s handicap very well. After the wheelwright has called the books which his lord the Duke Huan was reading "nothing but the chaff and dregs of the men of old," he has to justify himself or lose his life. The wheelwright then says:

I look at it from the point of view of my own work. When I chisel a wheel, if the blows of the mallet are too gentle, the chisel slides and won’t take hold. But if they're too hard, it bites in and won’t budge. Not too gentle, not too hard -- you can get it in your hand and feel it in your mind. You can’t put it into words, and yet there’s a knack to it somehow. I can’t teach it to my son, and he can’t learn it from me. So I've gone along for seventy years and at my age I'm still chiseling wheels. When the men of old died, they took with them the things that could not be handed down. So what you are reading must be nothing but the chaff and dregs of the men of old.

At the beginning of the first formal address in his Records, Master Yunmen reflects upon the very same problem:

In the [Dharma] Hall [for a formal instruction], the Master remained silent for a long time (and then) said: "The occasion of giving voice to the Dao is without any doubt difficult to live up to and to elucidate. If even a perfect match in a single word is gone too far,
Master Yuanwu expresses the same idea by saying, "Even the buddhas of the three periods can only know it for themselves; the successive generations of patriarchs have not been able to bring it up in its entirety." The words "in its entirety" are not to be overlooked. Master Yunmen is so acutely aware of this basic handicap of the Chan teacher that he begins a great number of public instructions with some reference to it:

Don't say that I'm deceiving you today! I simply cannot get around provoking confusion in front of you. If by chance I should be observed by a clear-sighted man, what a laughing-stock I'd be! But right now this cannot be avoided.

Kneeling to take your case, I cause you to accept my words instantly, I am already dropping crap on top of your heads. Even a feat of teaching such as illuminating the whole world at once by holding up a single hair would still be inflicting a wound by cutting out [healthy] flesh.

Knowing that his teaching is likely to become one more avenue of evasion, one more object of attachment for his listeners, the Master sometimes prefers to say little or nothing:

In the [Dharma] Hall [for formal instruction], [Master Yunmen] said: "I ought not to put frost on top of snow. Take care!" Then he left the teacher's seat.

In the hall [for formal instruction], [Master Yunmen] was silent for a long time and then said: "Just this implicates people hopelessly!" And he stepped down from his chair.

The tension between the impossibility of conveying the absolute as such and the need to do so for the sake of deluded beings is a recurrent theme of religious literature and religiously inspired art. In Buddhism, it found its most important expression in the idea of the "two truths". The so-called "absolute truth", i.e. the standpoint of awakening, cannot be conveyed as such; this may be one reason why Chan is characterized as being "separately transmitted outside doctrinal teachings" and as "not establishing words and
letters."430 As soon as it is expressed in some way, this expression falls into the realm of "worldly" or "conventional truth",431 i.e. it is only relatively "true" in the world of delusion. This is why Yunmen speaks of "guilt" in this context:

One day [the Master] said, "I don't ask you about when the Buddhist teaching is gotten rid of.431 Is there a teaching which knows worldly/conventional truth?"439 In place [of his audience] he said, "If I say there is [such a teaching] I'll be found guilty44 by Reverend [Yunmen]."

(YML 663a19-21)

When the expression is verbal, conventional terms are borrowed to point towards or express the absolute:

[A monk] asked [Master Yungai Zhiyuan], "The Ancients said that the Dao is beyond words. But if the Dao is beyond words, who is able to establish this?" The Master said, "Borrowed words give voice to the Dao; the Dao does not verbalize itself." (CC 祖堂集 3.23, 7-8)

The 'borrowed words' of conventional truth are, to use a famous Chan simile, like a finger pointing to the moon. Though for the awakened master the moon is the finger (yet moon is moon, and finger is finger),435 the unawakened ones need the finger pointing towards the moon as guidance. But the masters are well aware that many students will mistake the finger for the moon and get attached to expedient devices436 instead of realizing the nonduality of finger and moon for themselves. This danger is one reason why verbal expression and discussion in general and koan in particular are sometimes called "creepers" (geteng 葛藤), a word which in Chinese also means "complications". For the masters, they are no complications at all, but when used as expedient devices for the unawakened, they can be valuable signposts or additional objects of attachment which entwine and entangle.

The Master once said, "[Actions of Chan masters such as] snapping one's fingers, chuckling, raising one's eyebrows, winking one's eye, picking up the mallet, holding up the whisk, and sometimes [drawing] a circle: that's all taking a hook and fixing it on a rope. What is called "Buddha Dharma" ("Buddhist teaching") has never yet been verbally conveyed."441 To convey it verbally is dropping shit and spraying piss. (YML 556a24-26)

-------------

One day [Master Yunmen] cited the words of a man of old, "A phrase which is completely to
In spite of such reservations and the danger of attachment, the Chan masters make use of expedient devices for the sake of their suffering disciples; hoping to make a big catch in triggering someone's awakening, they "take a hook and fix it on a rope". However, more often than not they do not catch what they would like to:

In the [Dharma] Hall [for formal instruction, Master Yunmen] said: "Is there anybody who is able to pose a question? Come on, ask one! A monk stepped forth, bowed, and said: "I request you, Master, to examine." The master replied: "I threw in a hook to catch a giant fish, but all I managed to catch is a frog." (YML 551b14-15)

Yunmen is very much aware of the inadequacy of his words from the point of view of absolute truth:

When I talk this way, I call it 'talk by a granny from a three-house hamlet'. If I'd suddenly happen to come across a real pilgrim and he'd hear me talk like this, he couldn't be reproached if he grabbed my leg and threw me down the steps [of the teacher's platform]. (YML 552b29-c2)

Once, when the Master had finished talking, he stood up, banged his staff down on his chair, and said, "With so many words up to now, what place will I be banished to? Intelligent chaps will understand, but stupid ones will be completely fooled by me. In place (of his listeners,) [the Master] said, "You add frost on top of snow." (YML 562c11-14)

This awareness is one reason for the Master's critical appraisal of his own teaching effort:

Reverend monks! Though [I] say 'what [on earth] is the matter?', it still amounts to putting a head on top of a head, adding frost on top of snow, winking an eye in the coffin, and burning moxa on a moxa burn scar. This is quite a mess! (YML 552a4-6)

In the hall [for formal instruction], [Master Yunmen] said: "I cannot help giving medicine to dead horses." [So] I say to you: What is it? Is it east or west, north or south, being or nonbeing, seeing or hearing, going up (beyond duality) or down (in duality), so or not-so? This [sort of talk] is called 'talk by a boondock granny'. How many of you [think when they hear such words] that they have reached this realm? If you're in accordance with it, you're in accordance with it. If you're not, may it come about at a quiet place. Amen! Then the master left his seat. (YML 562c13-17)

Nevertheless, he and other Chan Masters compassionately try to guide
students through their words and actions; like kind grannies, they do everything to help them.

Because of compassion, all the old masters held since olden days conversations which fell into the weeds. One knows people through their words, and one could not do this if they had held talks that were outside the weeds. And if there are such conversations which fall into the weeds and allow knowing people through their words, there will also be words that are repeated and conversations that are held.

Though the compassionate efforts by the teacher necessarily descend into the realm of the "weeds" (i.e., of conventional "truth"), they are still designed to be of some help:

Master [Yunmen] once said: "The manifold explanations about enlightened wisdom and final deliverance, about truthness and Buddha nature are all discussions that descend [into the realm of the relative]. Even when one picks up the mallet and raises the whisk, there are again endless explanations. As to the first ones (i.e., the discussions descending into the realm of the relative): They nevertheless amount to something.

The first public instruction by Master Linji also speaks about what we call here "the teacher's handicap":

The Master took the high seat in the Dharma Hall and said: "Today, I, this mountain monk, have perforce yielded to customary etiquette and taken this seat. If I were to demonstrate the Great Matter in strict keeping with the teaching of the Patriarchal School, I simply couldn't open my mouth and there wouldn't be any place for you to find footing. But since I've been so earnestly entreated today by the Counselor, why should I conceal the essential doctrine of our School?"  

Just as no word or gesture will ever convey the fragrance of a flower, the color of a lake, or the sadness of parting as such, no explanation or expression can convey awakening as such. However, this does neither deny their possibility nor their value. After all, the frequent question-answer exchanges (wenda 問答, jap. mondō) of the Chan tradition consist in principle of a master's self-expression which poses a challenge to a monk to express his own realization, often followed by a test or judgment of the monk's expression. For the Master, this matter is clearly exposed, and he cannot help but express it. In this sense, the "teacher's handicap" is only a handicap insofar as there are unawakened ones that ought to be guided.
2. **ENLIGHTENED EXPRESSION AND PARADOX**

Aware of the "handicap" described above, the Chan masters express their awakened self in various ways. Indeed, their whole teaching activity can be regarded as one form of self-expression; hence some important forms of Yunmen's self-expression will be described in the next section on his teaching method. Here, some more general remarks about the motivation, aim, and forms of the teacher's self-expression are made, followed by a discussion of one particular pattern of awakened self-expression that is characteristic not only of Yunmen but also of other Chan masters: the paradox.

Chan masters have no need to be recognized as someone special, on the contrary. Hence Yunmen said: "My brothers, if there is one who has attained it, he passes his days in conformity with the crowd." Humbly involved in helping others, they may be much less known than some of their pretentious followers:

The dark valley does not speak -- who appreciates it! But who doesn't know the narrow-minded disciples of teachers? (YML 553b22-23)

When a Chan teacher expresses himself in words or deeds, it is not for his own sake but for that of his deluded brothers and sisters:

(Though) the old masters' whole lifetime is used up for you, you are [still] not helped. So they leave a few words to communicate the entrance. (YML 546c13-14)

There are many different kinds of "words to communicate the entrance", from sharp criticisms to kind admonitions and from anecdotes to probing questions. By adopting various means, the masters do what they can to give guidance to their students:

If you have not yet found any clue but have met an undisguised helper (i.e., a master) who is [as fierce] as a dog biting boars, and [so compassionate that he] does not care about his life nor shy away from entering mud and water in order to give you guidance, and if he has something good for chewing: [then] blink your eyes and raise your eyebrows, hang your bowl bag high [on the wall], and for ten or twenty years exert yourself to the utmost! (YML 547b1-4)

For the students "who haven't yet found any clue", the master's expression of his awakened self often is "something good for chewing",
i.e., a Chan challenge (see section H of this chapter). By expressing their realization of non-dualism in various forms and situations, the masters challenge the students, test them, focus and direct their quest, inspire faith or doubt, expose their dualistic predicament, drive them to a greater effort, etc. The overall aim of the masters' self-expression is to provide compassionate help; typical for Chan teaching, this help usually does not take the form of teachings which one has to believe in, formulas to recite, figures to worship, etc. On the contrary, the student is faced with expressions of non-dualism which cannot simply be accepted and swallowed but are profoundly unsettling, doubt-provoking, and thus "good for chewing". The Chan records are full of such things which cannot simply be swallowed, and the fact that just such episodes and statements found their way into the famous koan collections and were central to the development of Chan in the Song period speaks for their importance. As will be shown in sections G and H of this chapter, Yunmen devised and applied various ways of giving his students something to chew on; one of his favorite devices was to use the self-expressions of other masters for the same purpose -- a method which was to become the dominant way of Chan teaching with the systematization of koan use:

The old men have very much tried to give guidance through words. For instance Xuefeng said: 'The whole great earth is nothing but you.' Jiashan said: 'Get hold of me on the tips of the various grasses, and recognize the Emperor in the bustling marketplace.' Luopu said, 'The moment a single grain of dust arises, the whole world is contained in it. A full-maned lion, all of it, is this very you.' (YML 547a21-24)

Any situation is said to be an expression of Buddhist teaching:

Once the master said: "Of all situations, there is none that does not expose the Buddhist teaching. When one strikes the bell or beats the drum, it cannot be but IT." (YML 559b5-6)

Consequently, a Chan master who is a living source of this teaching also expresses it in many ways. Yanagida has pointed out that one typical feature of Chan after Mazu is that -- instead of emphasizing the importance of Buddhist scriptures and attributing all possible words and actions to the Buddha himself -- it is the living awakened
Chan master himself who speaks, and his words and actions are just as enlightened as the Buddha's.

One form of self-expression is particularly frequently met with in Chan literature: the paradox. Suzuki pointed out that "all mystics are fond of paradoxes" but remarked that the Chan paradoxes are characterized by their "concreteness and vividness of expression".\textsuperscript{460} Yummen is a particularly good example for this form of expression, as the \textit{Records of Yunmen} contain many famous paradoxical statements.

Once, Master [Yummen] struck one blow with his staff on a pillar and said, "Do the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teaching manage to say [it]?

\textit{[The Master] answered himself, "They don't." He added, "Bah! Wild fox spirits!

A monk asked, "How about an idea of yours, for instance?" The Master said, "Mr. Zhang drinks wine, Mr. Li gets drunk."} [YML 558c8-11]

The great number of examples of paradoxical statements which occur in expressions of religious truths in various ages, places, and cultures suggests that paradox is not simply used by chance. Rather, it seems to be an appropriate method for expressing an absolute truth in conventional terms. As the Greek root of the term shows, a paradox presents something which is opposed (\textit{para}) to existing notions and belief (\textit{doxa}), something which is seemingly alogical, absurd, or self-contradictory but is -- on closer inspection -- found to point to a higher truth. In its seeming self-contradiction or absurdity, the paradox conflicts with the basic notions of dualism; at the same time, these notions are used to point beyond dualism and express non-dualism. This accounts for the frequent use of paradoxical statements in Buddhism in general (for instance in the Vimalakirti and Diamond Scriptures) and by Chan masters in particular. Suzuki formulated the underlying logical structure of paradoxical statements as follows: "'A is at once A and not-A.' If so, I am I and yet you are I."\textsuperscript{461} In the \textit{Records of Yunmen}, we find many statements which have this structure, for instance:

\textquote[Master Yunmen] cited [Master Chuyuan of Shishuang's words: You must know that there is a phrase of special transmission outside the scriptural tradition. A monk asked: What is this phrase of special transmission outside the scriptural tradition? [Master Chuyuan of Shishuang replied: A non-phrase.\textsuperscript{463} Master [Yunmen] said: Just a non-phrase is a phrase.\textsuperscript{464} (YML 558a5-7)
Of course, paradox is also employed for the description of the awakened person:

However, when someone got it, speaking fire cannot burn his mouth. [Though] he is discussing the matter all day long, it has never yet touched his lips and teeth, and [though speaking] he has never uttered a single word. [Though] he wears a robe all day long and eats, he never touches a single grain of rice nor does he get in contact with a single thread.

(YML 545c28-546a2)

As will be shown in greater detail in the following sections of this chapter, Yunmen often uses such paradoxical expressions of nonduality in order to challenge the listeners and provoke doubt in them:

[Masten Yunmen] said, "Come, come, I will bandy words with you: Hiding itself in a mosquito net, the fish in the Eastern Sea jumps up to the thirty third heaven [on top of Mt. Sumeru]. How about that?" A monk said, "If you say it like this, Master, it's okay!" The Master said, "You numskull!" (YML 572b11-13)

Often, the Master furnishes very concrete expressions of his view that contradict ordinary experience:

Instructing his assembly, [Master Yunmen] said, "Look, look! The Buddha Hall has entered the monk's hall!" In place of [his audience], he said, "[Mt.] Luofu**beats the drum, and the Shao district***dances." (YML 562b12-13)

----------

In the hall [for formal instruction, the Master] raised his staff and said, "Look, look! The great chiliocosm****is shaking!" Then he descended from his seat. In place of the silent audience he said, "Hold on!" (YML 562b14-15)

Though the Master says certain things as if they were most normal, expressions such as the following must startle any audience accustomed to ordinary logic and arithmetic:

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "How old are you, Master?" The Master replied, "Seven times nine is sixty eight." [The questioner] asked, "Why would seven times nine be sixty eight?" The Master said, "I subtracted (sic) five years for you." (YML 552a1-3)

Just the fact that such paradoxical statements are hard or even impossible to understand is important: as expressions of non-dualism
3. YUNMEN'S VIEW OF THE CHAN TEACHER'S ROLE

Through his presence and his activities, the Chan teacher expresses awakening. Expression of and guidance towards awakening -- which is the core and raison d'être of Buddhism -- is the common objective of Buddhist scriptures and the Chan teacher's activities.

Though each of the vehicles of [Buddhist] teaching has its specific sphere -- the Vinaya [collection] pertains to the study of monastic discipline, the Sutra [collection] to the study of meditative concentration, and the Treatise [collection] to the study of Wisdom -- the Five Vehicles of the Tripitaka and the Eight Teachings of the Five Periods all have a common source, namely, the One Vehicle. perfect and sudden. It is extremely difficult to realize.

It is the teacher's task to help the student realize that which "the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings explain at great length and the whole empire's masters expound in every conceivable way." When students "visit and question masters everywhere to settle [the problem of] life-and-death", the masters accord them "expedient words of compassion". Since the main objective of the teacher's guidance is each disciple's own overcoming of his problem of life-and-death, his efforts are focused on guiding the disciples towards their own breakthrough. To borrow the words of Su Xie about the Records of Yunmen: it is the teacher's task to help the student "making the forging and tempering of his very own matter the beginning and end." This forging and tempering has to be done by the student himself; hence the master keeps saying: "Just you, each and every one of you, must make the effort by yourself." Still, by making use of various expedient means, the teacher can at least "communicate the entrance" and direct each student toward his own "family treasure".

[Though] the old masters' whole lifetime is used up for you, you are not helped. So they leave a few words to communicate the entrance. While being aware of this sort of thing, you must put it aside and make some effort for yourself, and you'll certainly become familiar with it.
[Though] they go all out in working for the benefit of beings, the old sages cannot help you:477 what they say -- 'everything is real', and 'all things as they are are true' -- cannot be attained. [Likewise,] when I say to you: 'Right now, is anything the matter?', I have already misled you. If you in actuality have not yet got a clue,478 then for a time go into yourself and investigate thoroughly on your own: What, besides wearing a robe, eating, moving bowels and urinating, is the matter? (YML 540b12-17)

Yunmen's disciple Dongshan476 describes his view of the teacher's task in the following way which met Yunmen's approval:

Another day I'll go to a place where there are no human hearths and build myself a hut; I won't store even a single grain of rice or plant any vegetables. There I'll receive and wait upon the great sages coming and going from the ten directions; I'll pull out all the nails and pegs for them, I'll pull off their greasy caps and strip them of their stinking shirts. I'll make them all clean and free, so they can be unconcerned people. (YML 廣嗣  case 12, YML(2003)553b12-14)

"Pulling out the nails and pegs" refers to the overcoming of man's dualistic cleavage and its concomitant attachments and unease. The Chan teacher wants to make his students free of dualistic distinctions: "The Chan teaching keeps banging away at the thousand differentiations and myriad distinctions."480 Only if the student can overcome dualism with all its distinctions and differentiations can he be "clean and free" and without concern.

However, this liberation -- which is the source and goal of Buddhist teaching -- is not easily achieved because of unawakened man's fundamental attachment to himself and to various objects.

The Master once said, "I'm not asking you for verbal teachings of our tradition. This is heaven. That is earth." Pointing to himself he said, "This is me." Pointing to the pillar he said, "That's a pillar. What is the Buddhist teaching?" On behalf [of his audience] he said, "That's very difficult, too." (YML 585c6-9)

Facing this difficulty puts man's "I" in question and is thus a most existential affair, a matter of life and death. Thus, when Nanquan asked Mazu about the essence of Buddhism, the latter replied: "It consists exactly in your letting go of your life."481 Yunmen's instruction in the following conversation is a telling simile of the Chan master's task:
In his endeavor to help the unawakened liberate themselves, the teacher sometimes has to take resort to drastic measures. Yunmen thus characterized the teacher as an "undisguised helper" who is not only so compassionately devoted to the assistance of his students that "he doesn't care about his life nor shy away from entering mud and water" but who is also fierce like "a dog who bites boars." The following passages give a certain measure of such a teacher's fierceness:

If there is a master who opens a temple to explain the Buddhist teaching for the benefit of other people and takes a sharp sword to kill a hundred, a thousand, ten thousand of them: what fault would there be?

If the ground on which you stand gets examined by me, and, being cornered, you get your legs broken: could I be reproached for that?

The Chan master's examination and cornering of the student is of utmost importance; since this activity of the teacher forms a typical and central aspect of Yunmen's teaching method, it will receive more detailed discussion in the next section of this chapter. The exposure of the student's deepest wound and the constant pressure applied on it are among the Chan master's foremost tasks. Though he knows that it hurts, he must in the interest of the student constantly point to and press on man's most painful spot. Many of the teacher's questions, statements, and actions have to be seen in this light. Expedient devices like repeated questions ("What on earth is your problem? What do you lack?", or "What are you, who come and go without the slightest reason, looking for in here?"); provocations (for instance demanding that a monk ask a question and hitting him full on the mouth as soon as he proceeds to do just that), paradoxical statements, etc. all serve this purpose. The Chan teacher's frequent demand of spontaneous expression of the student's realization -- for instance Muzhou's "Speak, speak!" when Yunmen finally managed to squeeze
through the gate also exposes the student's fundamental problem.

A monk asked, "What is my self?" Master [Yunmen] said, "I, the old monk, enter mud and water." The monk exclaimed, "I'm crushing my bones and tearing my body to pieces!" Master [Yunmen] shouted and said, "The water of the ocean is on your head. Quickly, speak! Quickly, speak!" The monk did not say anything. In his place, the Master said: "I know too that you, Reverend [Yunmen], fear that I'm a phoney."

Yunmen's "entering mud and water" is, according to Mujaku Dōchū, a simile for teaching people by expedient words and for not resting at the pure place where the fundamental problem is overcome. The master "applies his strength for the benefit of others" and does whatever he can to help his students. Guided by the principle that the medicine must correspond to the disease, he uses different methods on different occasions:

Like other Chan masters, Yunmen knows someone the moment he meets him. In his choice of means, he is free to make use of whatever method he considers efficient. Thus Yunmen can say, "In our school, there is complete freedom to kill or to give life as the occasion requires." Since the master's words are carefully chosen for a particular person and occasion, he often admonishes the students to consider them carefully; when this is not done, he occasionally even asks the student to give back the words of guidance:

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about when all is swallowed in one gulp?" The Master said, "I am in your belly." [The questioner] continued, "Why would you, Master, be in my belly?" The Master said, "Come on, return my words to me!" (YML 549a23-24)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "I come after having exhausted all possibilities. Will you accept me as student?" The Master said, "[To have] one question is no mistake." [The questioner] carried on, "Leaving the one question apart: will you accept me or not?" The Master said, "Consider carefully what was said before!" (YML 548a2-4)

The Chan master is a sharp-eyed and sharp-tongued witness of the
student's realization: whether there is some realization or not, he never hesitates to expose what he sees.

This matter does not allow anyone to substitute for you: it is nothing but the very own mission of each person. If the old masters appear in the world, it is just to act as witness for you. If you have found some entrance or some clue, he wouldn't hide it from you. If in reality you haven't yet attained it, then don't expect his allotment of expedient means to you to do the job.

As long as the student has not come to any realization, the master admonishes him, drives him on in his quest, fosters doubt in him, provokes him, encourages his effort, and challenges him. On the other hand, when the student has arrived at some realization, the master usually wants to hear or see an expression of it and tests it carefully:

"Even if a word, the very instant it is brought up, puts the thousand differences into a single rut and includes the minutest particles, it is still but an expression of expedient teaching. What then is an accomplished patched monk supposed to do? If he discusses in [the Dharma Hall] here what the patriarchs and the Buddha meant, the Sixth Patriarch's unique way will go down with all flags flying. Well, is there anyone who can put it right? If there is, he may come forward!"

---

[Master Yunmen] asked a monk, "Where do you come from?" The monk replied, "From Chen district [in Hunan]."

The Master asked, "Where did you spend your summer [period of monastic practice]?" The monk: "At Xichan's." Yunmen inquired, "What teaching does he expound?"

The monk opened his hands and let them dangle on both sides. The Master struck him. The monk said, "I'm speaking!" The Master opened his hands. [The monk] had no answer. The Master struck him and chased him out. In place of the monk he said, "Well, I'm off!"

---

The master does not hold back his opinion when he sees that the students are on a wrong path; in Yunmen's case, large parts of his public instructions are devoted to the criticism of wrong practice and to admonishments to avoid such practice.

There's also a bunch [of people] who, as soon as they hear talk about rest, shut their eyes [while being] in hell, make their living in a rathole, and sit under a dark mountain where ghosts roam, thinking "this is it", and saying, "I found some way in." Do they see it even in a dream? What crime would it be to beat ten thousand [people] of this kind to death?
Now what should you do? Every one of you must strive for himself to obtain [a better] rebirth. Don't futilely tramp around, simply wanting to get hold of some idle words, waiting for some master's mouth to move, then asking about Chan and Dao, transcendence and immanence, this and that, and stuffing [the words] which you noted down on big rolls of copying paper into the bags of skin [that you are]. You devour [these words], and when you have gobbled [them] down, you do nothing but talk in your sleep, saying "I have understood the Buddha Dharma". It's clear that by such pilgrimages you'll never ever attain rest. (YML 552a6-10; 13-15)

As mentioned above, Chan masters rarely mention specific methods of spiritual practice such as sitting meditation; instead, they provoke the students to find out themselves what they lack -- if they lack anything at all -- and what there is to realize. Hence they encourage them to stop wasting their time and to inquire with all their might:

This inquiry is the opposite of obedient and faithful acceptance of someone's teaching; the masters encourage their students to doubt and to adopt a very critical attitude toward any kind of teaching.

Though you may accept [what I just said] for yourself, you're still out of luck. You must neither fall for the tricks of others nor accept their directives. (YML 546c9-10)

If you were such a[n accomplished] man you would, upon hearing me talk about a Chan master's activity somewhere, at once turn toward me, spit at me, and offend my eyes and ears. If you are not a man of such action, [then] as soon as you hear someone bring up [a statement], you'll instantly be ready to accept it. (YML 547a8-10)

For the same reason, the masters seek to sharpen the students' eyes for false teachers. On one hand, they do this by expressing their own viewpoint and promoting the student's understanding and realization of it; on the other hand, they sharply criticise people who act as teachers but in fact are themselves deluded:

**3F: The Chan Teacher**

**Yunmen's Teaching**
Old masters everywhere say, "You must know that there is the single thing¹⁴⁷ which can neither be heard nor seen." With such words they fool children of good families. Alone inside their three-room temples, they delude themselves: not even in a dream have they ever seen the significance of [the teaching] of our original teacher's¹⁴⁸ school! For what purpose do they consume the alms of the faithful? On the last day of their life,¹⁴⁹ every one of them will have to reimburse those [almsgivers]! (YKL 552c18-22)

"These old shavepates everywhere! They sit on the round [teacher's] chairs¹⁴⁴ and meditation platforms,¹⁴¹ wanting to acquire fame and profit. Asked about Buddha, they answer 'Buddha', and asked about patriarch they answer 'patriarch', and they shit and piss. [What they say] in just like information passed around among boondock grannies.¹⁴¹ They don't know [anything, not even] good from bad! (YHL 553a4-7)

Depending on the student and the situation, an awakened teacher's presence and self-expression can thus have many different functions and various effects on the student — promoting faith and doubt, encouraging the student's efforts, discouraging reliance on others, exposing his existential dilemma, pointing out wrong practices, etc. — but the teacher's effort always addresses the student's central concern. It is the principal task of the teacher to help each person realize the one thing which matters:

In reality, there is not the slightest thing which could cause you to understand or doubt.¹⁴¹ It goes without saying that you, each and every one of you, has the one thing;¹⁴¹ its great function manifests itself without costing you the slightest effort. You don't differ from the patriarchs and buddhas!¹⁴¹ (YML 553c4-6)
G. YUNMEN'S TEACHING METHOD

1. INTRODUCTION

In one of the first publications on Zen in the West, Nukariya Kaiten described three important elements of Zen: practice, doctrine, and "Zen Activity". Of these three, he regarded the last as the most distinctive: "The third is the Zen Activity, or the mode of expression of Zen in action, which is entirely absent in any other faith." Though Nukariya certainly went too far in this assertion, it is nevertheless true that Chan/Zen has a "peculiar mode of expressing profound religious insight". When speaking of "Zen Activity", Nukariya thought only of non-verbal expressions such as lifting the fly-whisk or shouting. However, it is appropriate to regard speech as another form of activity; thus, to find out about a particular master's character and distinctive ways of teaching (i.e., his "house style" jiafeng 家風), one ought to examine both the verbal and non-verbal expressions of his religious insight. Such "Zen Activity" in a broader sense usually took place in a monastic setting of interaction between master and disciples. This interaction had an obvious purpose, namely, the awakening of the disciples. A discussion of a Zen master's teaching method will thus at the same time provide a view of his characteristic modes of "Zen Activity", i.e., of the ways in which he expresses his religious insight.

2. PREVIOUS CHARACTERIZATIONS OF YUNMEN AND HIS 'HOUSE STYLE'

a) Views of the authors of the Blue Cliff Record 碧巖錄

The Blue Cliff Record, published in 1128, includes relatively early judgments about Yunmen's teaching. Unlike most other early sources, it does not only present the Master's biography and quote his instructions and dialogues. Rather, its authors Xuedou Chongxian 雪竇重顒 (980-1052; collector of the cases and author of the poems) and Yuanwu Keqin 圓悟克勤 (1063-1135; author of comments to cases and poems) express their opinion about various Chan teachers and their teaching. Of course, one must look at these two masters' opinions with an eye on their pedagogical motives. Furthermore, an investigation of
their position in the contemporary historical and doctrinal situation of Chan would be needed for a better assessment of the Blue Cliff Record’s poems and comments. Xuedou was a master in the fourth generation of the Yunmen school and exerted considerable influence on the development of Chan literature, particularly koan collections. Yuanwu also played a crucial role in the development of koan usage: he was the teacher of China’s most important promoter of koan practice, Dahui Zonggao 大慧宗杲 (1089-1163), and he certainly played an important role in the evolution (or even revolution) of Chan teaching and practice which took place in Yunmen’s wake. Although our present discussion does not take such important historical and doctrinal issues into consideration, it should nevertheless provide a first impression of how two Chan masters who lived not long after Yunmen -- they were born 16 and 99 years respectively after Yunmen’s death -- regarded Yunmen’s teaching.

No other Chan master is the protagonist in so many cases of the Blue Cliff Record as Yunmen. His sayings form the subject of fourteen cases out of 100, and his words appear in four more cases. Additionally, there are quite a number of anecdotes involving Yunmen and quotes of Yunmen’s words in Yuanwu’s commentaries as well as a number of references to Yunmen and his influence on or connection with other masters. Even in famous koan collections that have no direct connection with Yunmen’s line of successors, Yunmen is the predominant figure.

Master Yunmen is mentioned and cited so frequently by the authors of the Blue Cliff Records because they esteemed him so highly. There are numerous passages which praise him and his teaching methods. Yuanwu portrayed him in the following manner:

Yunmen was not the same as other people. At times he held still and stood like a wall ten thousand fathoms high, with no place for you to moor. At times he opened up the single path-way for you, dying with you and getting born with you."

There are many more descriptions in this text of Yunmen’s exceptional ability as a teacher. This ability was, as Yuanwu points out in the
next passage, due to Yunmen's having thoroughly broken through duality:

If [Yunmen] were not a man who has broken through with his whole capacity and attained great freedom, how could he die with you and be born with you? Why [can he do this]? Because he is free from the many [dualistic] leaking points of gain and loss, of 'is' and 'is not'.

This freedom is both the source and the goal of his activity; it is the aim of Chan teaching to free people of the restrictions of dualistic attachment. Such attachment is symbolized by "nails" and "pegs". Yuanwu says about Yunmen:

In Yunmen's usual instruction of people, he generally used the methods of Mu Zhou; he just was hard to approach. He had the hammer and tongs to pull out nails and wrench out pegs. Xuedou said of him: "I like the newly established devices of Shao Yang (= Yunmen); all his life, he pulled out nails and wrenched out pegs for people."

In this passage, Yuanwu notes the similarity of Yunmen's teaching methods to those of Yunmen's teacher Mu Zhou. The essential method of Mu Zhou is in turn described as follows: "Mu Zhou employed devices that turned like lightning; he simply was difficult to get hold of." However, in repeatedly quoting Xuedou's remark, he also emphasizes the innovative quality of Yunmen's teaching activity. At another place, Yuanwu says that "if Yunmen established his own "house style", this was necessary for the people's sake." In his translation of this passage, Gundert inserts in square brackets: "And what was necessary, in the opinion of Yuanwu, consisted exactly in leading them beyond differentiation, beyond everything separate and particular."

Though the Blue Cliff Records do not include a list of such innovative devices, Yuanwu gives us a number of clues:

Yunmen usually liked to teach three-word Chan: "Watch!" "Examine!" "Aha!" He also taught one-word Chan: A monk asked, "When one kills father and mother, one repents before the Buddha. But if one kills Buddhas and patriarchs, where does one repent?" Yunmen said, "Exposed." Again [someone] asked, "What is the treasury of the eye of the true teaching?" Yunmen said, "Universal." It just doesn't allow for any hesitation. Even in most ordinary circumstances he would swear at people, and when he uttered a phrase, it was like an iron spike.

3G2:Characterizations of Yunmen

98

TEACHING METHOD
Yuanwu compares such words also to "hammerheads with no hole",\(^5\)\(^1\)\(^7\) to "an overhanging cliff",\(^5\)\(^1\)\(^8\) etc. Common to many such characterizations of Yunmen's words is the impossibility of approaching or getting hold of them:

Xuedou cannot praise [Yunmen] enough. Yunmen's words are independent and free, unique and lofty, prior to light and after annihilation. They are like an overhanging cliff ten thousand fathoms high. Then, too, they are like a million man battle line; there is no place for you to get in.

Teaching devices such as 'three-word Chan' or 'one-word Chan' are essentially means to provoke doubt and to focus and promote the student's own inquiry. Thus Yuanwu remarks:

Whether [Yunmen] lets go or gathers in: he is naturally extraordinary. It's as if he were cutting nails and shearing through iron. He makes people who interpret meanings to figure him out.

This statement is made in connection with the discussion of the third of the so-called "three sentences of Yunmen".\(^5\)\(^2\)\(^0\) These sentences do not appear in the body of the Records of Yunmen, but a disciple of Yunmen\(^5\)\(^2\)\(^1\) wrote three laudatory poems on them which are appended to the YML's last chapter (576b19-29). However, they seem to have played a considerable role in the interpretation of Yunmen's teaching and teaching method. Yuanwu describes them as follows:

As usual for Yunmen, in one sentence three sentences had to be included; they are called "the sentence that contains heaven and earth", "the sentence that follows the waves", and "the sentence that cuts off the myriad streams".\(^5\)\(^2\)\(^3\)\(^8\)\(^4\)\(^2\)\(^1\)\(^2\)

The interpretation of these sentences is difficult.\(^5\)\(^2\)\(^3\) It could well be that they show expression of the absolute from three sides: the first sentence speaks of the teacher's standpoint of nonduality where a single word or action expresses the absolute; the second sentence shows the teacher adapting his expression to the needs and capacities of his audience; and the third sentence portrays the effect of such expression on the side of the audience: all streams of speculation and feelings are radically cut off. Yuanwu's statement that Yunmen "makes people who interpret meanings to figure him out founder" would thus
apply to the third sentence. Be this as it may, the authors of the
Blue Cliff Records repeatedly use descriptions of Yunmen's words which
are employed to illustrate these three functions of verbal
expression. For the first one might cite:

A monk asked Yunmen, "What is talk that goes beyond Buddhas and patriarchs?" Yunmen said,
"Sesame bun." Do you feel your hairs standing on end with chill?

For the second:

Yunmen's answers have often provoked people's intellectual interpretations. So in every
phrase of Yunmen, three phrases must be included. He does not turn his back on your ques­
tions: responding to the time, adapting to the season, with one word, one phrase, one dot,
one line, he indeed has a place to show himself.

For the third:

Sometimes [Yunmen] held still and stood like a wall ten miles high, with no place for you
to draw near.

"In his words, [Yunmen] unstopably seizes and cuts off the essential bridge and doesn't
let ordinary or saintly through. You must understand how Yunmen raises one and illuminates
three, raises three and illuminates one."

Whether these remarks by Yuanwu are taken in connection with the
'three sentences' or not, they illustrate Yuanwu's view of Yunmen and
his teaching method. Naturally, as a principal promoter of koan
practice, he must have felt much admiration and a close kinship with
Yunmen who "has shattered affective discernment, intellectual ideas,
gain and loss, 'is' and 'is not' all at once for you" and produced
sayings that both provoked interpretation and at the same time
blocked off any such attempt. Expressions of such power are the
ideal stuff for koan practice since they have the potential to
provoke, direct, and focus doubt. Yuanwu hence praises Yunmen:

[Yunmen] holds the world fast without the slightest leak; he cuts off the myriad flows
without keeping a drop. Open your mouth and you're wrong; hesitate in thought and you miss.

The field of his vision had been bright and clear, his mentality and perspective swift. All
his instructions, alternative remarks, and words spoken on behalf of others were direct,
Though this is not clearly stated in this text, such teaching methods as 'alternative remarks' and 'words spoken on behalf of others' were probably among Yunmen's 'newly established devices' of which Xuedou spoke. Yuanwu also mentions Yunmen's characteristic use of the staff:

The moment [Yunmen] raises his staff, one sees his unconfined marvelous activity. (...) Every time Yunmen turned to his staff, he produced the great function of his whole capacity and helped people in ways that are leaping with life.

This is *grosso modo* what the authors of the Blue Cliff Records tell us directly and specifically about Yunmen and his teaching methods. However, numerous more general observations and comments about Chan teaching contained in this book will prove helpful in our subsequent analysis of Yunmen's teaching method -- an analysis which will be based not just on a few *koan* but on material from the whole *Records of Yunmen*. To conclude, here is one last passage about Yunmen from the Blue Cliff Records:

Yunmen has the ability to handle snakes, and he doesn't run afoul of the sharp point. He strikes home in light, and he strikes home in darkness too. As he helps people it's always like doing a sword dance; sometimes he flies onto people's eyebrows and eyelashes, sometimes he flies three thousand miles away and snatches people's heads. His throwing down his staff and making a gesture of fright -- isn't this giving play to his spirit? Doesn't he lose his body and life too? Expert teaching masters never go to a word or phrase to make a living.

b) Views of modern authors

The views presented below are not an exhaustive review of everything written about Yunmen in modern times. Rather, this is a selection of some distinctive or influential views of the Master. Though the importance of founding father Yunmen and his "school" -- one of the so-called "five houses" (五家) of Chan -- is recognized, surprisingly few authors have hitherto attempted to characterize the Master and his teaching in ways that go beyond the comments of *koan* collections. The difficulties involved in reading the original text and the scarcity of translated materials are the most
obvious reasons for this phenomenon; apart from a few parts of the *Records of Yunmen* that appeared in *koan* collections and Chan compendia, hardly any translated materials are available. Thus not even Japanese authors -- who are certainly not known for their reluctance to produce secondary literature of this kind -- wrote much about this Master. Most original observations about the master were hence made by authors who translated some of Yunmen's exchanges or instructions. Other authors often did little more than rehash the opinions of *koan* collection compilers/commentators and translators.

D.T. Suzuki, who called Yunmen "one of the greatest masters of China", wrote an interesting essay on the "Practical Methods of Zen Instruction" in which Yunmen is mentioned several times. His sayings are used to illustrate the teaching methods characterized as 'denial of opposites' and 'exclamatory utterance'. The first consists in a challenge to escape the "dilemma of life" as expressed in the so-called "four propositions (1. 'It is A'; 2. 'It is not-A'; 3. 'It is both A and not-A'; and 4. 'It is neither A nor not-A')"; the second consists of a simple shout and has its most noted adepts in Yunmen and Linji.

In another essay by Suzuki, Yunmen is said to be the foremost adept of monosyllabic answers which by virtue of their vagueness are "a most powerful weapon in the hand of the master." He is far from wanting to be obscure and misleading, but a well chosen monosyllable grows when it falls from his lips into a most pregnant word loaded with the whole system of Zen. Yunmen is regarded as the foremost adept in this direction.

Furthermore, Yunmen is mentioned by Suzuki as a user of truisms such as "nine times nine are eighty one" and silence.

R.H. Blyth devotes three chapters to Yunmen about whom he says,
These chapters illustrate both the difficulties the translator of Yunmen faces and the hazards of interpreting Yunmen on the basis of some *kōan* while ignoring the coherent discourses contained in the *Records of Yunmen*. Apart from short descriptions of well-known features of Yunmen's teaching method (for instance of his "one-syllable Zen,"542) and statements which apply to other masters as well (such as "his words have not a dictionary meaning, but point to the absolute, the timeless and placeless,"543), Blyth mentions just a few particularities of Yunmen's teaching method that are noteworthy: Yunmen quite often "says the opposite, or rather the obverse of what he said before,"544 puts emphasis on the monk's being troubled by a question,545 often answers in an "enigmatic and laconic way"546, shows disrespect for the other party's question by telling an obvious lie,547 and deals with pretense and hypocrisy with a (physical or verbal) smack, though he was "not a very pugilistic teacher."548 Yunmen is described as "a man of great courage, who would put any statement to the test of practical experience, and any practical experience into a statement"549, a man "mad to teach" with "a mind that in ordinary persons and in ordinary cases would be called frenzied"550 who was "fond of talking, and not, apparently, of listening."551 When characterizing Yunmen, Blyth draws number of daring and sometimes amusing parallels: "Christ and Socrates seem to have been similar in character [to Yunmen], and similarly unlucky with their disciples."552 Yunmen, "like Wordsworth, does not leave us with this animism"553 and knew, "like Dr. Johnson, that man is a social animal"554. But "his specialty" was "his pure nonsense, like that of Lear and Lewis Carroll"555. Blyth praises Yunmen most effusively as "perhaps the greatest man China produced", "a mixture of Selden, Swift, Sidney Smith, and Oscar Wilde" who "has his superstitions, it is true, Buddhist and Taoist"; but "for boldness, succinctness, profundity, universality, transcendentality, only Eckhart and Thoreau come near him."556

John C.H. Wu557 is not much less enthusiastic in his praise,
but he is both more reliable in his translations and more informative in characterizing Yunmen than Blyth. He describes Yunmen as "a fast-breather" who breathes even faster than Linji. Linji's "Blitzkrieg" is terrible, but Yunmen's is even more terrible:

Linji only kills those whom he happens to encounter. Yunmen's massacre is universal. He does away with all people even before they are born. To him the 'True Man of No Title' is already the second moon, therefore a phantom not worth the trouble of killing. Yunmen seldom if ever resorts to shouts or beatings. Like a sorcerer he kills by cursing. His tongue is inconceivably venomous, and, what makes the case worse, he is the most eloquent of the Chan masters.518

He is "a radical iconoclast" who seemed to have "no respect for any person" but was not more polite with himself than with others.559 He "was interested in nothing else than the Eternal Tao". The "great paradox" about him is "that, on the one hand, he had an extraordinary gift of eloquence, while on the other hand he had a phobia for the word, as if every word were an intruder into the sacred ground of the inexpressible Tao."560 His mind was keen to "an agonizing degree"; he "seemed to be sensitive to every motion of his own mind, and his self-knowledge enabled him to discern the thoughts and feelings of others."561 Yunmen is said to have "appealed only to the highly intelligent", and "his house has been characterized by all students of Chan as steep and abrupt."562 But Wu also points out another side of Yunmen:

The striking thing about Yunmen is that in soaring to the transcendent sphere he shoots like a rocket straight up without making any circles like the eagle, and yet when he comes down to the earth, he wants us to veer with the wind and to follow the waves, tides, currents, eddies, swingings back and forth of the river of life.142

With regard to Yunmen's teaching method, Wu makes the following observations:

Time and time again, Yunmen asked his assembly, 'Are you lacking in anything?' Time and time again, he reminded them that only one thing is essential, that all other things are of no concern to them, that in this vital matter they must rely on themselves, for no one else can take their place. All his sermons were like the signs of a dumb person trying to hint at what is in his mind.144

Yunmen's "one-word pass" is "merely one of his tactics in rousing the
dormant potentiality of his disciples, and should not be regarded as an essential element of his vision." Such one-word answers were "spontaneous reactions to the questions" which were both occasioned by them and "directed to the questioner, whose spiritual state and needs the master had sensed intuitively from the very question he had raised."565 Regarding Yunmen's use of the staff, Wu writes: "As another means of his teaching, Yunmen used his staff as a pointer to "This One or the true Self, who is identical with the Absolute."566

In his recent history of Zen Buddhism, Dumoulin calls Yunmen "the outstanding figure of the Chan movement of his time"567 whose house "made a remarkable contribution to Chinese culture."568 However, in the few pages which he devotes to this "outstanding figure", Dumoulin fails to show why Yunmen deserved such acclaim and what it was that made his contribution so remarkable. Like Blyth, he interprets a number of well-known koan while leaving aside the abundant source material found in the instructions of the Records of Yunmen.

Chang Chung-Yuan put Yunmen together with his teacher Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存 and his disciple Dongshan Shouchu 洞山守初 under the heading "Swiftness and Steepness".569 He characterizes Yunmen's teaching style as follows:

The height and steepness of Yunmen's mountain give us a feeling of solitude and freedom. The swift movement of the stream keeps it pure. This swiftness and steepness are characteristic of Yunmen's style and were forceful attributes in bringing about his disciple's enlightenment. When a monk asked him, "Who is the Buddha?" his answer was, "Excrement." Yunmen was not making disparaging remarks about the great spiritual leader here. Rather, he was making a dramatic attempt to nullify all religious dogma, which is only a hindrance to the total realization of one's own Buddha nature.179

Of Yunmen's rich repertory of teaching methods to achieve this aim, Chang mentions only the one-word answers: "This single word pierced like a sword to the heart of reality, unobstructed by the usual dichotomy of thesis and antithesis."571 Additionally, he points out similarities between Yunmen and Linji which suggest that "the better we understand one of these masters, the better we will understand the other."572 Chang's explanations do not help us much in this endeavor.

Miura and Sasaki say that Yunmen "taught a highly individual
style of Zen to the hundreds of students who crowded around him" and note that he was "known for his short and clear answers to his disciples' questions. Many of these were answers of one syllable only, and came to be known as Yunmen's 'One Word Barriers'."\(^{573}\)

Miura and Sasaki also point out two teaching methods which are said to have originated with Yunmen, namely, daiyu 代語 ("offered in place of another") and bieyu 別語 ("offered as a different opinion"): 

In the former case a master offers a reply of his own to a mondo which had concluded with the monk engaged in the exchange unable to answer his master's final statement, thus answering 'in place of' the original monk. In the latter case, the master, not being in agreement with the final answer to a koan or mondo, offers a different answer conveying his own view. These methods of handling old koans originated with Yunmen Wenyan 雲門文偃 (Umon Bun'en, 852-4/949), founder of the Yunmen (Umon) School of Zen, and koans with both types of appended answers will be found scattered throughout his record, the Yunmen guanglu.\(^{14}\)

These assertions of Miura and Sasaki will be examined below.

Though they do not mention Miura and Sasaki, the Cleary brothers build on their ideas in the following comments on Yunmen's teaching devices and their historical role:

The practice of reciting and investigating sayings of earlier Chan masters seems to have been growing over a long period of time, but Yunmen was one of the first classical masters to make extensive use of the words of Chan ancients in guiding his own disciples. He is said to have originated the form of daiyu, or 'substitute sayings,' in which he answers a question posed by himself, in behalf of his audience, or else supplies an answer to a question or saying of an earlier master, substituting for a speechless monk in a story; he also originated bieyu, or 'alternative saying,' a reply or remark given as an alternate to another in a story, or an alternate reply to one of his self-posed self-answered questions. Other members of Xuefeng's congregation were known to have discussed ancient and contemporary Chan sayings and doings extensively; the Linji school of Chan became well known for its use of sanhuo chan, or 'meditation contemplating sayings,' during the Song dynasty, but the overt recommendation of this practice is in early evidence in Yunmen's sayings.\(^{171}\)

In general, Japanese authors concentrate on the interpretation of koan and do not present larger perspectives of Yunmen's teaching and its role in Chan history. Though Yunmen is usually hailed as one of the greatest Zen masters or even "one of the four figures with particular philosophical significance"\(^{576}\), such statements are in general only backed up by interpretations of some well-known koan featuring Yunmen. Notable exceptions are D.T. Suzuki (see above) and Iriya. Iriya spent as many as four years on reading the first chapter of the
Records of Yunmen in a seminar. In this seminar, it was Iriya's endeavor to read the text with philological accuracy and trying to understand it on a literal level by examining materials from the Records of Yunmen as well as related Chan texts. Thus, the ground was prepared for future interpretation. The philologist Iriya rarely tried to present overall interpretations of Yunmen's teaching, but one such attempt appeared in his publications: a three-stage theory of Yunmen's teaching. According to this theory, one can distinguish three different stages in Yunmen's teaching career: an early, a middle, and a late stage. Iriya sees a three-stage "change and deepening of Yunmen's view of the Dharma body" which was "totally overlooked in the Blue Cliff Records and [the source of its cases,] Xuedou's Verse Comments." Since this theory touches on an important theme of Yunmen's teaching, it will be discussed below in section I of this chapter.

3. DISTRIBUTION AND TYPES OF YUNMEN'S QUESTIONS

No Chan master before Yunmen has used questions with such skill, and it may not even be an exaggeration to say that no other master has surpassed Yunmen in this respect ever since. In most Chan records of Yunmen's time and before, the monks pose the questions and the masters answer them. Questions by the masters were, as in the case of Yunmen's teacher Mu-zhou, often limited to "where are you from?", "where did you spend the summer?", and the like. Though there are some exceptions, and though one must not overlook the depth of such seemingly simple everyday questions, one is struck when reading the Records of Yunmen both by the number and the variety of questions which the Master poses to his students.

Master Yunmen's use of questions is an exceedingly important and characteristic feature of his teaching method. In this section, the focus will be on the presentation and illustration of some of the major types and themes of the Master's questions. The questions' aims and their role in the context of Chan teaching and practice will be discussed in later sections of this chapter. Though actual questions usually do not fit neatly into a single category and no list of this
kind can possibly be complete, the following remarks and translations may nevertheless provide an overall view of the types and distribution of Yunmen’s questions.

Thanks to the editors of the Records of Yunmen who paid special attention to the Master’s teaching methods, the distribution of different types of questions inside the YML is quite clear-cut, especially in the second and third chapters. The first chapter of the YML contains in its public instructions a number of questions which focus either on the central concern of the individual listener (“What is the matter with you?”, “What are you lacking?”, “What hinders you?”, “Do you know your native place?”, “Who hasn’t got his share?” etc.) or on his attempts to handle this problem (“What good is your being here?”, “What are you looking for in here?” etc.).

If you in actuality have not yet attained entry, then for a time go into yourself and investigate thoroughly on your own: What, besides wearing a robe, eating, moving bowels, and urinating is the matter? (TML 5468b15-17)

If you in actuality have not yet attained entry, then for a time go into yourself and investigate thoroughly on your own: What, besides wearing a robe, eating, moving bowels, and urinating is the matter? (TML 5468b15-17)

How should you go about applying yourselves to the above-mentioned matter (of the source of all Buddhist teachings)? Did you so far attain it by talking in (this Dharma Hall) here about 'perfect' and 'sudden'? Did you get it (by being) here or there? (TML 545a23-24)

Some questions urge the listeners to probe and express their understanding or the lack thereof: "Do you understand?", "Is there a phrase that you could not penetrate?", "What do you say?", "Is there anyone who can put it right?" Of course, some of these questions have a more or less rhetorical character, i.e., they are not primarily posed to elicit an immediate response but rather to increase the power of the Master’s argument and hence of its impact on the audience.

Is there any blood under your skin? What good is it to willfully victimize yourself everywhere? You bunch of exterminators of Buddhas! You’re no more than a pack of wild foxes! What good is your being here? (TML 552a22-24)

Most of Yunmen’s questions in the first chapter are typical for Chan public instructions. Such questions are also found in public instructions by other masters, for instance those of Linji or Xuefeng. However, there are also some questions of different types in this
chapter. Yunmen sometimes simply throws back a question to the one who asked it:

At the time a monk asked, "How about a statement that transcends the Buddha and goes beyond the patriarchs?" The Master said, "Sesame bun". The monk went on: "What connection does this have with [my question]? The Master said, "Exactly! What connection has this?"

Someone asked, "What is inner and outer brightness?" Master [Yunmen] said, "In which direction are you asking?" The questioner said, "How about arriving at clarity?" The Master said, "If all of a sudden someone would ask you [this], what would you say?" (YML 546a28-b1)

Another characteristic type of question which is found in the first chapter is given in response to someone's question:

A monk asked, "How about when I see that mountain is mountain and river is river?" The Master said, "Why does the triple [temple] gate pass through [this hall] here?" (The monk) continued, "If that's so I won't think falsely." The Master said, "Give me back my words!" (YML 547c13)

[Someone] asked, "When life-and-death has come, how am I to get rid of it?" The Master said, "Where is it?" (YML 547c4-5)

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is Chan?" The Master said, "Is it all right if we get rid of this one word?" (YML 549b10)

The two sections of the second chapter feature not only by far the greatest number of questions by Yunmen but also some question types that are typical for Yunmen. The first section (Essentials from inside the [teacher's] room) contains many questions which refer to conversations between monks and well-known Chan masters. The connection of such questions with the koan method and their aim of provoking doubt will be discussed in section H of this chapter.

The Master mentioned a monk who said to Zhaozhou, "I have just joined the monastery and ask for your teaching." Zhaozhou asked: "Have you already eaten your [breakfast] gruel?" When the monk affirmed, Zhaozhou said: "Go wash your bowl!" Master [Yunmen] said: "Well, tell me: was [what Zhaozhou said] a teaching or not? If you say that it was, what is it that [Zhaozhou] told the monk? If you say that it wasn't, why did the monk in question attain awakening?" (YML 554b16-19)
[Master Yunmen] mentioned a monk who had asked Xuefeng for instruction. Xuefeng had asked him: "What is it?", and at these words the monk was greatly awakened. Master [Yunmen] said: "What was it that Xuefeng had told him?"

(YML 554b20-21)

It is a common characteristic of this type of question that some words or events are related and then brought home to the listeners in an often unconventional manner. Quotes of well-known sayings from the Chan tradition are also a frequent subject of this type of question:

[Master Yunmen] quoted a saying by the Third Patriarch: "When mind does not arise, the myriad things have no fault." Master [Yunmen] said: "Just in this [lies] awakening."

Then he raised his staff and added: "What fault is there in the whole universe?" (YML 554c23-24)

[Master Yunmen] cited the words of the Overnight Enlightened One: "The miraculous function of the six senses is empty without being empty; the perfect light of the singular [man] jewel is form without form." The Master held up his fly-whisk and said, "This is the perfect light, it is form without form. What do you call form? Come on, try picking that up with me!"

(YML 555a7-9)

When mentioning words from the Chan tradition, Yunmen sometimes gets no answer and adds further questions or comments:

[Master Yunmen] mentioned the [following saying] of an old [master]: "The moment one word is brought up, the world is wholly contained in it." The Master said, "Well, tell me, what word is it?" He answered himself, "When in spring the birds sing, it's on the western mountain range." Then [Master Yunmen] ordered a monk to ask him. So the monk asked, "What word is it?" The Master said, "Oh!"

(YML 560a27-29)

After citing an old [master] who spoke of 'being awakened to the Way upon hearing a sound and getting clear about one's mind upon seeing a form', [Master Yunmen] said: "How about 'being awakened to the Way upon hearing a sound and getting clear about one's mind upon seeing a form'?" Then he said: "Avalokitesvara Bodhisattva takes a coin and comes to buy a sesame bun." Lowering his hand, he added: "I see! It's only a dumpling!"

(YML 554a13-15)

A few times, Yunmen poses a question and answers it himself.

Once, Master [Yunmen] struck one blow with his staff on a pillar and said, "Have the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teaching managed to say it?" [The Master] answered himself, "They haven't." Again, he said, "Bah! Wild for spirit!"

(YML 550c8-10)

Passages from Buddhist scriptures are also brought home to the
audience in a striking way: lofty doctrine is put to the test in very
concrete terms.

Citing the Prajña Scripture, Yunmen said, "[It's] due to non-duality, non-
bifurcation, non-differentiation, and non-separation." He pointed to a pillar and said, "How much has this to do with the Prajña Scripture?" (YML 556a15-16)

The Master also expresses his realization without reference to tradition directly through his own words and actions. Such (often paradoxical) expressions which are also frequently followed by questions to his students are found in both parts of the YML's second chapter.

Once, when the Master had finished drinking tea, he held up the cup and said: "All the Buddhas of the three periods have finished listening to the [Buddhist] teaching; they have completely pierced the bottom of this cup and are going away. Do you see? Do you see? If you don't understand [now], you may understand one day in many years." (YML 555c12-14)

At a donated meal, the Master took one bite of a sesame bun and said, "I bit in Indra's nose. Indra is in agony!" Then he pointed with his staff [to the monks' feet] and said: "[Indra] is under your feet, transformed into old Shakyamuni! Do you see? Do you see? The king [of hell] Yama hears my talk, laughs out loud, and says: 'This monk is quite up to it! [But] there's nothing that can be done about you -- if you're not up to it, you're all in my hand!'" (YML 556b8-12)

Addressing the assembly, Master [Yunmen] said, "Look, look! I got killed!" He gave the appearance of collapsing and said, "Do you understand?" (YML 563a1)

Though Yunmen's statements quite often do not have the grammatical form of a question, they nevertheless function as such since an answer is expected. The same can be said of some of his actions which obviously have the aim of provoking a response. This kind of 'question' is found throughout the YML's second and third chapters.

[Master Yunmen] asked a monk, "Are you a Northerner?" The monk affirmed. The Master gave him a whack. [The monk] didn't respond. The Master said, "You ask me!" So the monk asked, "Where are you from, Reverend?" The Master gave him another whack. [The monk] didn't respond. As substitute [answer] to the first question ('Are you a Northerner?'), [Yunmen] gave him a whack. As a substitute response to the second question ('Where are you from?'), he said, "On the path of humanity and righteousness." (YML 569c22-25)
One day the Master opened his frock and said, "I'm shaking off the Dharma body." Nobody answered. The Master said, "You ask me!" So a monk asked, "What does your shaking off the Dharma body mean?" The Master replied, "I know too that you're attached to it."  
(YKL 560a15-17)

In the second section of the second chapter (Statements and Substitute Answers 墨示代語), one finds again different types of questions by the Master. Provocative statements which are to be taken as questions, straightforward questions, or quotes (sometimes followed by questions about them) are brought forward by the Master. When no answer is given by the audience, the Master usually either expresses his own view or the unexpressed one of members of the audience.

One day [Master Yunmen] said, "When you discuss and cite, what is it that you realize?"  
In place of the monks, Master Yunmen answered, "[That] salt is expensive and rice is cheap."  
(YML 561c21-22)

Once [Master Yunmen] said, "What is a phrase that does not fool people?" In place of his listeners he said, "Don't say that this is one that does!"  
(YML 562b16-17)

Quite often, Master Yunmen provokes his students by some question to express their understanding in words, but they very rarely are able to do so. Rather than leaving it at that, the Master usually provides his own answers in place of the asked students.

Once [the Master] said, "What is a word that, the very instant it is brought up, puts the thousand differences into a the same rut?" On behalf of the audience he said, "Thus I have heard." He added, "You need to speak. What's difficult about that?"  
(YML 563c4-6)

Once he said, "Just you, all of you, have practiced and must know that there is a way in. Now is there anyone able to express it in words? Come forward and try saying it!" On behalf of the silent audience he said, "One shouldn't either let the Reverend [Yunmen] down."  
(YML 563c13-15)

One day [the Master] said, "Emptiness is not different from form. What do you say?" In place of the monks he said, "The head gardener is very much needed."  
(YML 562b22-23)

The first and longest section of the third chapter (Critical
Examinations features again several characteristic types of questions. These questions usually have the aim of testing the depth of realization and the degree of understanding of the audience. Ordinary everyday questions, sayings by other masters, provocative words or actions, or quotes from Buddhist scriptures all serve this aim. Ordinary questions such as "where are you from?" or "where are you going?" were very frequently used by Yunmen's teachers Muzhou and Xuefeng. In the YML such questions are not so numerous, and the Master usually adds further questions or remarks.

He asked a monk, "Where are you coming from?" The monk said, "From tea picking." The Master asked, "Do the people pick tea or does the tea pick people?" [The monk] had no answer. In his place, [Master Yunmen] answered, "The Master [Yunmen] said it all; I cannot add anything." (YML 567c5-7)

The Master asked a monk, "Where do you come from?" The monk replied, "I paid reverence to [the Sixth Patriarch's] stupa." The Master inquired, "What does the patriarch say?" The monk asked back, "What do you say, Master?" Master [Yunmen] said, "And I used to think that you're a clever lad!" [The monk] had no answer. [Master Yunmen] answered on the monk's behalf, "I just acted in conformity with humanity and righteousness!" (YML 567c14-17)

Usually such test questions are directed to someone who studied under Yunmen, but in the second section of the third chapter of the YML ("Record of Pilgrimages" 遊方遺錄), the pilgrim monk Yunmen addresses them also to other masters. When Yunmen questioned monks in this manner, they frequently were unable to answer, and the Master answered in place of the asked person(s) or of himself:

Master [Yunmen] asked a monk, "Are you the monastery's repairman?" The monk affirmed. The Master said, "The whole universe is this house. How about the master of the house?" [The monk] had no answer. The Master said, "Ask me. I'll tell you." The monk asked and the Master replied, "[He's] dead." On behalf [of the monk] he replied to the first question ('are you the monastery repairman?'), "How many people have you deceived?" (YML 567c7-10)

When the Master saw a newly arrived monk he said, "Master Xuefeng said, '[I] have opened the road, and Bodhidharma came. I ask you: What do you think about that [statement]?" The monk replied, "Pierced the master's nose." Master Yunmen said, "The earth spirit makes an evil appearance, seizes Mt. Sumeru, gives you a whack, suddenly jumps up to the Brahma Heaven, and crushes Indra's nose. Why do you hide yourself in Japan?" The monk answered, "Master, don't deceive other people!" Master [Yunmen] said, "You've pierced my nose. So what?" The monk had no reply. The Master said, 'I always knew that you're just one of those
who learn words." Then he answered [his own question] on behalf of the speechless monk: "Master [Yunmen], you're just afraid that I'm not for real!" He added: "Humbling in Luoluo language." 583

The following example from the "Record of Pilgrimages" shows how the itinerant monk Yunmen tested another accomplished Chan master:

When Master [Yunmen] was on pilgrimage in the mountains, he asked Reverend Wolong, 584 "Does a man who is clear about the self see that there is a self?" [W]long said, "Just when one doesn't see that there is a self, one has attained clarity about the self." [Yunmen] continued asking, "Of what degree of potential is that which one manages to learn on the long [meditation] bench?" [Master Wol]ong replied, "That's secondary potential." Master [Yunmen] asked, "What is primary potential?" [W]long said, "Tightly bound straw sandals." 585

A number of the Master's questions refer to Buddhist scriptures. Like other Chan masters, Yunmen was not always very faithful to Buddhist texts; sometimes the "quotes" from Buddhist literature are simply concise formulations of some doctrine which they contain.

[Master Yunmen] asked a monk, "What scripture are you reading?" "The Treatise of the Lamp of Wisdom." The Master asked, "Who is expounding the Dharma on the Indian Diamond Seat?" The monk replied, "You ought to know, Reverend!" The Master said, "Do you [even] see it in a dream?" No answer. The Master said in place of the monk, "Not only me!" For the monk, he replied to the former question ("Who is expounding the Dharma on the Indian Diamond Seat?") , "It's jumping out of a dead frog." Again, he said, "And I thought that India didn't exist!" Again, he said, "Fallen." (YHL 573c11-15)

------------------

[Master Yunmen] asked a monk, "What scripture are you reading?" The monk said, "The Wisdom Sutra." The Master asked: "What is 'purity'?" The monk replied, "I've finished discussing that with you, Reverend!" Master [Yunmen] said, "In the [nonexisting] year of the donkey you'll see it in a dream!" He added, "Come, come, I'll bandy some words with you: 'Hiding its body in a mosquito net, the fish in the Eastern Sea jumps to the thirty third heaven.' How about that?" The monk said, "If you say it like that, it's okay." The Master said, "Blockhead!" (YML 572b6-13)
4. TYPES OF YUNMEN'S ANSWERS

In an essay on "The Secret Message of Bodhidharma", D.T. Suzuki presented various types of answers given by different masters to a single question, namely, the question about the meaning of Bodhidharma's coming to the West. Though Suzuki collected examples from many different Chan sources and masters, his typology of Chan masters' answers is so general that it can be used as a basis for the examination of the answers given by Yunmen. Suzuki found fourteen answer types and illustrated them with examples from various texts. We will not reproduce his explanations here; the sometimes slightly altered type descriptions and our illustrations from the YML should be more or less self-explanatory.

Yunmen was not only a virtuoso of questioning but also of creative responses. He not only used all the answer types mentioned by Suzuki but also additional types which were rarely used by other masters before or after him. These types (15 to 20) were added with illustrations from the YML.

Type 1: An object nearby is made use of in answering the question.

The Master once said: "True emptiness does not destroy being, and true emptiness does not differ from form." A monk asked: "How about true emptiness?" The Master answered: "Do you hear the sound of the bell?" The monk replied: "That's the sound of the bell." The Master cried: "You'll never see it even in a dream!" (YML 554a21-23)

----------

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the samadhi [comprising] every particle of dust?" The Master replied, "Water in the bucket, food in the bowl." (YML 546a10-11)

----------

One day he said, "How can one be able to express [it] verbally and not fall into a second question?" [As no one answered] he said for [the monks], "Shoes from Hongzhou." (YML 564a9-10)

Type 2: The answer judges the question or the questioner. Many of Yunmen's answers have this function, including a good number of his substitute answers:

[Someone] asked, "The myriad things return to the one. Now I do not ask about the one; what
are the myriad things?" Master [Yunmen] said, "You came in here to bandy words and to cheat me!"

(Someone) asked, "What is the style of your house, Master?" Master [Yunmen] replied, "You received ordination much too early!"

(Someone) asked, "What is the original school [of Buddhism]?" Master [Yunmen] said, "If you don't ask, I don't answer."

Type 3: The answer consists of a direct action. Though Yunmen uses his staff quite frequently to hit students and chase them out of the room, he is not as well known as other masters for shouting, spitting, etc. However, when the need arises, he does not shy away from such drastic teaching methods. Like the most accomplished warrior in the film maker Akira Kurosawa's movie "The Seven Samurai", Yunmen has the knack of seeing through a situation and to react even before the other person sets out to act.

In the Hall for a formal instruction, [Master Yunmen] said: "Today I shall, for the benefit of everybody, bring up a case [from the Chan tradition]... The assembly listened attentively. After a long silence a monk stepped forth and bowed. When he was about to ask a question, Master [Yunmen] went after him with his staff, crying: "You resemble those ex-terminators of Buddhism," those teachers receiving donated food on the meditation platform. What conversation would you be worthy of, you noisemaker!" Using his staff, [Master Yunmen] chased him out of the hall at once.

(Someone) asked, "I heard a teaching which speaks of the purity of all-encompassing wisdom. How about when [one has this]?" Master [Yunmen] spat at him. [the questioner] continued, "How about [using] some expedient means of the old masters [to teach me]?" The Master said, "Come here! I'll cut off your feet, replace your eyeballs, take the spoon and chopsticks from your bowl, and seize your nose!" [The monk] asked, "Where would there be so many such [expedient means]?" The Master said, "You windbag!" And he hit him.

In the hall, [Master Yunmen] said: "The Buddha attained the Way when the morning star appeared." A monk asked: "How about when one attains the Way at the appearance of the morning star?" Master [Yunmen] said: "Come closer, come closer!" The monk went closer [to the Master]. Master [Yunmen] hit him with his staff and chased him out of the [Dharma] Hall.

Type 4: The answer involves some gesture by the master or the monk.
When Master [Yunmen] saw a monk come, he raised his fist and made the gesture of hitting. The monk came closer and made a gesture of parrying. Yunmen gave him a whack. [The monk had] no response. [Yunmen] said in place of [the monk], "I better get out!" He added, "Two dice, the same number of dots." [Yunmen] spoke once more in place of the monk, "My demeanor attracts bad luck" and added, "Thank you for helping me again and again!" (YML 570b5-9)

Master [Yunmen] asked a monk, "Who made this sesame bread?" The monk held it up. The Master said, "This [gesture] neglects one side; it's something you've learnt on the meditation platform. Who made this sesame bread?" The monk said, "Master, you had better not mislead me!" The Master said, "You numskull!" (YML 572c12-15)

Type 5: The answer refers to things impossible in this relative world of causation. Many koan which found their way from the YML into collections belong to this type of (often paradoxical) answer which Yunmen used with skill.

Once, Master [Yunmen] struck one blow with his staff on a pillar and said, "Have the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teaching managed to say [it]?

They haven't." Again, he said, "Bah! Wild fox spirit!" A monk asked, "How about an idea of yours, for instance?" The Master said, "Mr. Zhang drinks wine, Mr. Li gets drunk." (YML 558c8-11)

Master [Yunmen] said, "The staff goes to India and comes back to Korea." Then he hit the platform and said, "This is your nose!" (YML 557a18-20)

[Someone] asked, "What is the place where all Buddhas appear?" Master [Yunmen] said, "[Where] the East Mountain walks on the water." (YML 545c18-19)

Sometimes, such impossible things are asked of the questioner:

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "How about when all possibilities are gone?" The Master said, "Bring me the Buddha Hall, and I will discuss it with you." [The questioner] asked, "What has this to do with the matter [I asked about]?" The Master cried out, "You windbag!" (YML 548c1-2)

Type 6: The answer consists of a truism. This is again an answer form which Yunmen was fond of. In the YML we find a number of examples involving numbers; Suzuki also quotes and interprets one of them to illustrate this type of answer.607

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "From very far away [I've come] to seek refuge with you,
Master. What is your view?” The Master said, “Seven times nine is sixty three.”


**Type 7: Answers by silence:** The "Record of Pilgrimages" contains the following story:

When Yunmen was in the assembly of the great Master Zhisheng of Lingshu, he occupied the position of head monk. At the time a monk asked Zhisheng, "What is the meaning of the Patriarch's coming from the West?" Zhisheng remained silent. Then he asked the monk, "If you'd unexpectedly have to put this on [my grave-] stele, what words could you use?" At the time there were numerous monks present but none could provide a matching comment. Zhisheng said, "Go and ask the head monk [Yunmen] to come. When [Yunmen] came, Zhisheng told him what had happened and asked him [the same question]. Yunmen said, "No problem!" Zhisheng asked, "What words could you enter?" Yunmen replied, "A monk asked about the meaning of the Patriarch's coming from the West. [He] just said, "Teacher!" Zhisheng deeply approved of this.”

Yunmen also held several public instructions where he just stayed silent:

In the hall for a formal sermon, [Master Yunmen] was silent for a long time and then said: "Just this [preaching of mine] implicates people hopelessly!" And he stepped down from his seat.


**Type 8: Answers using meaningless, rationally incomprehensible**
This type resembles type 5, but here it is less the paradoxical nature of the answers than the utter incomprehensibility to the rational mind which is emphasized.

Someone asked [Master Yunmen], "How old are you, Master?" The Master replied, "Seven times nine is sixty eight." [The questioner] asked, "Why would seven times nine be sixty eight?" The Master said, "I subtracted (sic) five years for you." [TML 552a1-3]

Once the Master said, "Ouch, ouch! In Korea they forge iron, and the planet Mars has burnt my finger!" He said in place of himself, "Not just my finger!" [TML 563c19-20]

Someone asked [Master Yunmen], "I request your instruction, Master!" The Master said, "ABCDEFGHIJKLMNOPQRSTUVWXYZ" [The questioner] said, "I don't understand." The Master said, "HIJKLMNOPQRSTUVWXYZ" [TML 552b5-7]

Type 9: Answers using conventional self-evident statements.

Once the Master drew a line with his staff and said, "All the Buddhas, [numberless] as specks of dust, are entirely in [this line] here. Can you discern them all?" Instead of his audience, Yunmen said, "The sun rises in the east, and in the evening it sets in the west." [TML 553a28-61]

One day Master [Yunmen] said, "When discussing and citing, what is it that you realize?" He answered in place of the audience, "[That] salt is expensive and rice is cheap." [TML 561c21-22]

Type 10: Answers using poetical description of the surroundings.

[Masten Yunmen] mentioned the following ancient saying: "The moment one word is brought up, the world is completely contained in it." The Master said, "Well, tell me, what word is it?" He answered himself, "When the birds sing in springtime, they do so on the Western mountain range." Then Yunmen told a monk to ask him. So the monk asked, "What is the word that contains the whole world?" The Master said, "Alas!" [TML 550a27-29]

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the pure Dharma body?" The Master said, "A peony hedge." [The questioner] continued, "How about when it is understood just like this?" The Master said, "A golden-maned lion." [TML 552c27-29]

Type 11: Giving no answer.

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "How about 'The Triple World is but mind, and the myriad things
are but [products of] consciousness?" The Master said, "Today I don't answer questions."
[The questioner] insisted, "Why don't you answer questions?" The Master said, "Will you ever understand?"

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "When the great monastic assembly gathers [from all sides] like clouds, what should it talk about?" The Master said, "The text that follows will be long. Let's postpone it till tomorrow!"

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the essential point of a robed monk?" The Master said, "I give you one go!" [The questioner] insisted, "Please, Master, tell me!" The Master said, "That would be playing the harp for an ox!"

Type 12: Answers where the questioner is made to perform an act.

[A monk] asked [Master Yunmen], "For whom is it that you are teaching?" The Master said, "Come closer and ask louder!" The monk stepped forth and asked. The Master hit him.

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "How about the single phrase that is separately transmitted outside the [scriptural] teachings?" The Master said, "Come on, put this question to the assembly!"

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "I don't ask about the scriptural teachings. What is the central matter of the [Chan] school?" The Master said, "Since it is present and came to ask, bow quickly three times in reverence!"

Type 13: Answers that merely indicate but do not definitely settle a point. Suzuki indicates that most answers given by Zen masters belong to this type and uses it for types that "do not properly fall in with any of the other cases." One would think that for instance Yunmen's one-word answers could belong to this type, but since Suzuki does not mention them here, we prefer to add them as a specific answer type.

Type 14: Answers concerned with Buddhas and patriarchs.

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the great significance of the Buddhist teaching?"
The Master said, "One Buddha, two bodhisattvas."

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is my self?" The Master said, "One Buddha, two bodhisattvas."
The following answer types are not mentioned in Suzuki's list but merit special attention since they are typical of Yunmen. This does not in all cases mean that they appear more frequently in the YML than previously mentioned answer types, but rather that they are rarely found in other Chan records. The fact that several of these characteristic answer types emphasize the question rather than the answer lends further weight to our observations about the importance which Yunmen attributed to questions.

**Type 15: Answers that have the form of a question.** Many of Yunmen's answers have the form of questions and are only recognizable as answers because they are given in response to monks' questions. Further examples for this type are found on p. 109.

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "How about when the two worthies [Buddha and Manjusri] meet each other?" The Master said, "It's not by chance." (YML 551c12-13)

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "How is it when the dark room attains brightness?" The Master replied, "How far is it to Langzhou (lit. 'Brilliant province')?" (YML 548c28-30)

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the original source?" The Master said, "Whose donations do you receive?" (YML 549b14-15)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "Since I have come to your Dharma seat, Master, I did not understand [anything]. Please give me your instruction!" The Master said, "Is it okay if Ilop off your head?" (YML 551c10-11)

**Type 16: Answers that emphasize the question.** Unlike the first of Suzuki's answer types, these answers do not judge the question or the questioner but give weight to the question by various means. These include simple repetition and returning of the question. Yunmen was an expert at making the questioner take his own question seriously.

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is mind?" The Master said, "Mind." The questioner went on, "I don't understand." The Master said, "I don't understand." (YML 549c15)
[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the genuine pearl in the cloth bag?" The Master said, "Can you tell?"  
(No. 550c20-21)

[Someone] asked [Yunmen], "I came after having exhausted all possibilities. Will you accept me [as student]?" The Master said, "A single question is no mistake."
[The questioner] went on, "Apart from the single question, will you accept me or not?" The Master said, "Watch carefully what was said before!"  
(No. 548a2-4)

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "I definitely am on the wrong path. Please, Master, give me some instruction!" The Master said, "What are you saying?"  
(No. 548c16-17)

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the meaning of [Buddhist] teaching?" The Master said, "The answer is not yet over." [The questioner] asked, "What did your answer consist in, Master?" The Master said, "And I regarded you as a bright fellow!"  
(No. 548c17-18)

**Type 17: Substitute answers (daiyu 代語).** These answers of which Yunmen is the champion (both in the sense of most skilled exponent and promoter) were already described and illustrated in section B of this chapter (Teaching Situations and Patterns, p. 45 ff.). Sometimes after citing another master or, more often, after some provocative action, statement, or question of his own, Yunmen answers in behalf of himself, (most often) the audience, or some person that figured in the initial remark or story. Though Yunmen was, contrary to scholarly opinion, not the originator of this teaching method, he certainly is its principal exponent and promoter. The YML features hundreds of answers of this type.

One day [the Master] said, "When you exert your whole strength, what do you say?" Instead [of the monks, Yunmen] said, "Five sesame buns and three bowls of tea!"  
(No. 552b20-21)

Once [the Master] said, "What is the single question which exposes it flatly?" As a substitute [for the asked monk, Yunmen] answered, "Give the monk next to me a whack!"  
(No. 552b21-22)

Once the Master said, "How do you say the primary phrase?" If you're clear about that, the Iron Or of Shenshi swallows the universe." On behalf [of the audience] he said, "Thank you, Reverend, for your continual help."  
(No. 564c24-26)
Once the Master hit a pillar with his staff and said, "How do you go about not speaking of Chan?" He added, "[You're] misleading the children of other people's families!" There was no reply. He answered himself, "Wearing a cagoule is evidence of one's crime." To the first question (How do you go about not speaking of Chan?) he replied himself instead of the audience, "How could I be surprised about other people?"  

Type 18: Alternative answers (biyeu 別語). These are additional answers given by the Master; they follow either his own answers (most often of the substitute answer type) or those of other persons.

One day [Master Yunmen] said, "The ancient ones faced the wall and shut the gate. But could they break through to HBB?" In place of his audience, Yunmen said, "What a dry piece of shit HBB is!" Again, he said, "One."  

Type 19: One word answers. Suzuki pointed out that the monosyllabic nature of the Chinese language makes it "terse and vigorous" and that "a single word is made to convey so much meaning in it." But it is not only this quality which makes this language such an excellent medium for Chan Buddhism but also the "vagueness of sense" which could be seen as a shortcoming yet turns out to be a powerful weapon when used by Chan masters.

Indeed, there are dozens of examples in the YML that illustrate how
right Suzuki was. Yunmen's one-word answers invite never ending discussions and unlimited interpretations, but at the same time they "simply do not allow any attempts to explain."629 This quality accounts for their later popularity as koan.

The attempts of translators to render this word show that even in this best of all cases, when the character in question has comparatively few possible meanings (Ricci gives only 1. Vast, great and 2. General, universal; all, everything, everywhere), Yunmen's answer unfolds its power. Suzuki renders pu as "Everywhere!",630 Luk as "Universality",631 Wu as "All-comprehensive!",632 Cleary as "Universal",633 and Gundert as "Common! [i.e., everybody has it though it is the most unfathomable mystery]".634 In some cases, it is the sheer number of possible meanings of a character which may pose problems:

In the Ricci dictionary, we find -- apart from the most probable meaning of "to eat/drink/swallow" -- many different meanings for chi, for example "to undergo", "to endure", "to absorb", "to take (a card in a game)", "demand (strength)", "to hide", etc. If I had to, I would probably translate Yunmen's answer as "Eat!" However, there is no indication of whether or not chi is an imperative here. This openness in the case of characters that usually function as verbs allows vastly different interpretations:

Luk translates qu as "Go",635 and Wu most sensibly as "Go!"636 But Chang chooses an option which is equally possible: "Go away!"637 Which possibility is to be preferred?

Master Yunmen was famous for his one-word answers; it is prob-
able that the Master used such answers as a means of self-expression which challenges the listener's dualistic understanding. It is therefore not surprising that such one-word answers and other short answers by the Masters were later included with preference in kōan collections such as the Blue Cliff Records (Biyanlu 碧巖錄), the Gateless Pass (Wumenguan 無門關), and the Congrong lu 從容錄.
5. CHALLENGE AND TESTING

Several possible meanings of the word "challenge" apply in describing some of the most striking qualities of Master Yunmen's teaching method: "a demanding or stimulating situation"; "a call to engage in a fight, argument or contest"; "a questioning of a statement or fact"; and "a demand for justification or explanation". For the sake of his students, Yunmen constantly creates challenging situations which provoke them in many ways; by this, he calls each person with its views and beliefs into question and unsettles it profoundly. He challenges his listeners to express their realization and understanding and proceeds to judge and test them. Through all sorts of nonverbal and verbal actions and reactions, he provokes doubt and thus effectively drives his listeners on in their very own quest.

Creating challenging situations is one of the Master's foremost tasks in teaching; unlike some lecturers of Buddhist doctrine, his concern is not to explain scriptures and doctrines but to promote each student's quest for self-awakening. In pursuit of this aim he does not shy away from using all sorts of means, conventional and unconventional. Be it in public instructions or private interviews, in the refectory or out in the fields: any place and occasion is suitable for challenging the students. The Master's constant provocation of the audience is evident throughout the YML. Of course he does not provoke for the sake of provocation; rather, he focuses on the students' central concern, exposes his profound ignorance and unease, and stimulates his will and strength to break through. Though Yunmen's provocations are often as sharp, precisely aimed, and as deadly threatening as a razor blade set against one's throat, permitting no movement whatsoever, they are by no means meant to discourage the student. On the contrary, by unsettling and shocking the student, by calling his very self into question, by exposing his dilemma and his inability to extricate himself from it, and by letting him get into ever deeper doubt and despair, the Master mobilizes the student's deepest resources and directs them toward this quest. Sometimes, after provoking the student's expression of his realization and understanding, the Master judges and tests him in various ways.
In Chan Buddhism in general, challenge and testing are extremely important. Not only Yunmen but also other great Chan masters such as Zhaozhou and Linji were skilled adepts of these teaching methods. It is no surprise that in his particularly significant opening public instruction which took place in the presence of the prefectural governor, Master Linji did not present a long exposition of Buddhist doctrine but only a challenge and a test. After saying that he couldn't conceal the essential doctrine of Chan after being so earnestly entreated, Linji utters only the following challenge: "Now is there any adept warrior who forthwith can array his battle-line and unfurl his banners here before me? Let him try proving himself before the assembly!" When a monk accepted the challenge by asking the Master about the cardinal principle of the Buddhist teaching, Linji gave a shout. When the monk responded to this test by bowing low, the Master said: "As an opponent in argument this young reverend is rather good." The Chan records are full of such episodes. To mention just one more classic encounter from the Records of Linji:

One day Linji went to Hefu. Counselor Wang the Prefectural Governor requested the Master to take the high seat. At that time Mayu came forward and asked, "The Great Compassionate One has a thousand hands and a thousand eyes. Which is the true eye?" The Master said, "The Great Compassionate One has a thousand hands and eyes. Which is the true eye? Speak, speak!" Mayu pulled the Master down off the high seat and sat on it himself. Coming up to him, the Master said: "How do you do?" Mayu hesitated. The Master, in his turn, pulled Mayu off the high seat and sat upon it himself. Mayu went out. The Master stepped down.

In Master Yunmen's teaching method, too, challenge and testing are of utmost importance. The Blue Cliff Record relates what pertinacity he applied these teaching devices when he challenged his personal attendant Xianglin Dengyuan (香林澄遠; 908-987) incessantly during many years with one single question: "What is it?" This question was a favorite of Yunmen's teacher Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存 and is used as a koan to this day.

[Xianglin] stayed at Yunmen's side for eighteen years; time and again Yunmen would just call out to him, 'Attendant Yuan!' As soon as he responded, Yunmen would say, 'What is it?' At such times, no matter how much [Xianglin] spoke to present his understanding and give play to his spirit, he never reached mutual accord [with Yunmen]. One day, though, he suddenly said, 'I understand.' Yunmen said, 'Why don't you say something above and beyond
Yunmen's challenges and tests abound in all major teaching patterns. Many public instructions begin or end with a challenge, and some of them are nothing but a challenge or test:

In the [Dharma] Hall [for a public instruction, Yunmen] said, "Fellow monks, you ought to clearly grasp the nose of a patchrobed monk. Well, what is the nose of a patchrobed monk?" Then he said, "Great Perfection of Wisdom! Today there is great communal labor." And he stepped down from his seat. (YHL 551c20-22)

Confronted with pronouncements such as the last one which defy the rules of ordinary logic, we are probably as baffled as Yunmen's audience at the time, and that reflects the Master's intention. The Master used such expressions of nondualism with the aim of provoking and challenging the students; they thus conform to DeMartino's definition of a koan (see section H of this chapter). The Master's public instructions are full of various challenges. For instance, he was fond of ending public instructions with provocations and challenges that aimed at deepening the students' doubt:

The Master suddenly seized his staff, drew a line on the ground, and said: "All is in here". He again drew a line and said, "All has gone out of here. Take care!" (YHL 550b3-5)

Another public instruction ends with the following challenge:

You carry your staff across your shoulders and say 'I practice Chan' and 'I study the Way'; so you're searching for some meaning of 'to go beyond the buddhas and transcend the patriarchs'. Here's my question to you: is there, in [all actions] during the twelve periods of the day -- walking, standing, sitting, lying, sitting, pissing -- [and everywhere including] the vermin's market in the privy and the lined-up mutton traded at market stalls, a sense of 'transcending buddhas and going beyond patriarchs'? Those who are able to tell me, come forward! If there's nobody [who can], don't prevent me from going [wherever I please] in east or west!" With this [Master Yunmen] left his teacher's seat. (YHL 551a23-24)
In short exchanges, the Master also uses various means to have the listener(s) face his challenge. For example, when a monk asks him something, he says to him: "Pick up the Buddha Hall for me, and I will discuss this [question of yours] with you!" (548c1-2) To a question about the one phrase which has never been transmitted, he replies with "May I shock you, brother?" (549a19). Sometimes his challenge takes the form of a simple call or reprimand:

[Master Yunmen] was in the [Dharma] Hall [for teaching]. A monk stepped forth, bowed, and said: "I request you, master, to reply." Master [Yunmen] called the assembly. All of the assembly raised their heads. The master left the teacher's seat. (YML 551b10-11)

[Master Yunmen] was in the [Dharma] Hall [for teaching]. After a long silence a monk stepped forth and bowed. The master said: "Too late!" The monk consented: "Yes". The master said: "You lacquer bucket!" (YKL 551b12-13)

Saying one thing in a sentence and exactly the opposite in the next sentence is another kind of provocation:

Once he said, "A man of old used to say: 'Sound, odor, taste, and touch: permanent perfect concentration (samadhi).' Yet I bandy words with you." Then he held up his staff and said, "This staff here is perfect concentration. If you can perceive this staff, you're able to know all masters under heaven." He added, "If you can perceive this staff, you don't even in a dream see the tiniest bit of what's under the feet of the masters under heaven."

[As no one of the audience reacted,] he replied for them: "The Reverend [Yunmen] does not leave it to other people." (YML 554a3-7)

Similarly, the Master sometimes asks a monk to do something and then punishes him for executing the order:

[Master Yunmen asked,] "Is there now anyone to ask about the essence of Chan? Let me reply with one turn [of phrase]; [then you may] go wherever you like!" Just when some monk was about to ask, the Master hit him with his staff full on the mouth. Then he left his seat. (YML 552c5-6)

Blasphemous statements are also a characteristic trait of several Chan masters' provocations. The two following examples show that Yunmen goes further in this respect than most others.

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the body of [the Buddha] Shakyamuni?" The Master said, "A dry piece of shit!" (YML 550b15)
[Master Yunmen] related [the legend according to which] the Buddha, immediately after his birth, pointed with one hand to heaven and with the other to earth, walked a circle in seven steps, looked at the four quarters, and said, "Above heaven and under heaven, I alone am the Honored One." The Master said, "If I had witnessed this at the time, I'd have knocked him dead with one stroke and fed him to the dogs -- a noble attempt to bring about peace on earth." (YML 560b16-19)  

The examples which were translated above illustrate some ways in which Yunmen uses challenge and provocation as teaching methods. Numerous other kinds of challenge and provocation (for instance giving a flimsy excuse for not answering, hitting a student without any apparent cause, or returning the student's question) are found among translations from the YML in this dissertation, particularly in the preceding section about Yunmen's answers, the next section about koan and doubt, and chapter IV. The following are two examples to show how skilled the Master was at provoking his audience.

At a donated meal, the Master held up a sesame bun and said: "I only offer food to [Southern Chinese] people from Jiangxi and the regions East and West of the Zhe river. I don't offer any food to people from the North." A monk asked, "Why do you only offer food to the [Southern Chinese] people from Jiangxi and the regions East and West of the Zhe River but not to people from the North?" The Master answered, "[In North China] the weather is cold and the days short, and two people share one bowl." (YML 556c9-12)  

At a donated meal, the Master held up his spoon and chopsticks and said: "I don't offer any food to monks from the South. I only offer it to monks from the North." At the time there was a monk who asked, "Why don't you offer food to monks from the South?" The Master replied, "I want to make fools of them!" The monk inquired, "And why do you offer food to monks from the North?" The Master answered, "Two targets [hit with] one arrow!" (YML 558c3-6)  

Many examples indicate that the target of such provocations and challenges is not simply an ability or skill of the student; rather, it is the student himself as a person who is called in question. This can be achieved by asking a monk some simple question such as "How are you?" (562a14) as well as by other inquiries:

[Master Yunmen] addressed the assembly saying, "I don't want [to hear] any words from our tradition. [Now tell me in your own words:] What is 'self' in the teaching of our patriarchal school?" In their place he simply extended both hands. (YML 564a24-25)
The Master's challenge points to the very dilemma in which every unawakened person finds itself; Mazu formulated this by "this way will not do, not this way will not do, and neither this nor not this way will do" and immediately added the challenge: "What do you do?" 649

Master [Yunmen] asked a monk, "What are you doing?" The monk replied, "I am in charge of the mortuary." The Master said, "Is there anyone who is not ill?" The monk said, "I don't understand." The Master said, "This way you don't understand, and not this way you don't understand." The monk was left without words. The Master said, "Ask me!" The monk asked him [: "Is there anyone who is not ill?]. The Master pointed to the neighboring monk.

When the Master asserts from his awakened point of view that his students do not lack anything, he is very aware that for his students this is not the case. By challenging them to find out what the matter is, he intends to incite his students to find out by themselves and to come to grips with their own central problem.

Now let me ask you all: What has so far been the matter with you? What do you lack? If I say to you that nothing is the matter, I have already misled you. You have to attain this level of realization!

----------

When Master [Yunmen] closed his door, a monk squeezed in. The Master at once seized him at his chest and said, "What's the matter?" The monk said, "What's the matter?" The Master gave him a whack. The monk had no response.

At the end of his opening public instruction, the Master says to the same effect:

In [this Dharma Hall] here there must be some [able] man! Don't rely on your master's words, words that resemble his, or rules! Wherever you go, you show what's inside of you. [So far,] you [wrongly] took this to be self-understanding. Don't misunderstand. What's the matter right now? Try settling this, face to the assembly!

Just this ultimate personal challenge is a characteristic of late Tang Chan in comparison with some other Chinese Buddhist movements which were more focused on reading, reciting, and commenting Buddhist scriptures or simply having faith in the Buddha's teachings. Yunmen is not interested in hearing someone cite such scriptures; he wants an authentic presentation of what these teachings mean:
The Master said, "The [whole Buddhist canon's] three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings explain it at great length, and the whole empire's masters expound it in every conceivable way; now come on, present me the import of [such] a teaching, be it even as tiny as the tip of the needle I hold here!"  

(YML 546a19-20)

You're making pilgrimages all over the place, studying Chan and asking about the Way. Let me ask you: how about that which you could learn in all those places? Try presenting that!" Again, he said: "During [your pilgrimages] you cheat the master in your own house. Do you see what I mean? When you manage to find a little slime behind my ass, you lick it off, take it to be your own self, and say: 'I understand Chan, I understand the Way!' Even if you manage to read the whole Buddhist canon -- so what?!  

(YML 553a14-18)

Yunmen challenges his audience many times to present the import of Buddhist doctrine or of some specific Chan master's teaching.

[Master Yunmen related that Master] Liang sui said, "What everybody knows, I know it all; but nobody knows what I know." Master [Yunmen] asked [the audience], "What is it that Liang sui knows?"  

(YML 557c13-15)

Such passages illustrate one more aim of Yunmen's challenge, namely, to provoke some expression of the monk's realization.

Well, is there anybody who has managed to get enlightened? [If there is,] step forth and try speaking about it!"  

(YML 562a20-21)

If there really is something you see, come and show it to me; I'll discuss it with you!"  

(YML 552a19-20)

"Is there anybody who can put it right? May the one who can step forward!"  

(YML 54tc16 and 54tb4-5)

Many of the Master's questions\(^{650}\) contain such a challenge. Since most students prove unable to live up to it and cannot respond, the Master often produces one answer or several alternative responses in their place, sometimes after having told them to pose the same question to him.\(^{651}\) When a student responds, the Master often immediately adds further challenges and tests until the student is caught in an impasse. The following episode shows how the Master challenges and tests a newly arrived monk:
The Master asked a newly arrived monk, "Where are you from?" The monk replied, "From Korea." The Master went on, "With what did you cross the sea?" The monk answered, "The robber in the grass is very much defeated." Master [Yunmen] asked, "Why are you in my hand?" The monk replied, "Exactly!" The Master said, "Jump at once!" [The monk] had no answer. [Yunmen] replied on behalf of the monk to the first question ('With what did you cross the sea?'), "I usually take advantage of such an opportunity." He added, "You're free to jump at once." (YHL 567b23-27)

Since it is not some piece of knowledge but the person itself which is challenged and tested, the Master does not tolerate any hesitation and aims at provoking an immediate response, i.e. a response which genuinely and spontaneously expresses where the student is at. No pondering and hesitation is tolerated:

One day [Master Yunmen] said, "If you sit [in the Meditation Hall] under [the shelf with] your robe and bowl, I1 shake you to death. If you come running [to the Dharma Hall] here, I wake you run to death. What is a phrase that gets you out of the fix?" He said [on the students'] behalf, "Quick!" (YHL 564c20-22)

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "The thousand expedient means are at once brought back to the source. I wonder what the matter in that source is." The Master said, "When there is a question, there is an answer. Come on, say it quickly!" The monk said, "Yes." The Master remarked, "Far from it!" (YHL 550a10-12)

Tests by Yunmen can also take the form of an action such as hitting (552c7), etc.

When the Master had finished discussing some matter he stood up and said, "Tonight you'll all get suddenly enlightened, and [tomorrow morning] you'll get up early, seize a sword, cut off my head, and that will be the end of my talking." Then he picked up a patched monk's robe, shook it, and said, "How about it?" In place (of his audience) he said, "I, your student, must not let you down, Reverend [Yunmen]." (YHL 553b5-8)

But also the Master's silence (551b12), his order to pose a question or produce a phrase, and many other actions and situations are used as test for the students.

One day [the Master] said, "[Though] I engage in verbal exchanges with you every day, you're not able to make it to the night. Come on, ask me a question right now and here!" In place (of his listeners, Master Yunnen] said, "I'm just afraid Reverend [Yunmen] will still not answer." (YHL 563a3-5)

Once [the Master] said, "What is the one phrase under your own feet?" Instead (of his
These last examples also illustrate that the "substitute answers" which the Master gives in place of the challenged monks are often a critical appraisal of the thoughts of the audience which can again constitute a challenge.

A whole range of the Master’s challenges and tests is based on words from scriptures or other masters and monks which Yunmen cites. In the first part of the YML’s second chapter (553c20-561c4) alone, about 140 such challenges are found. Additional examples are among the Critical Examinations at the beginning of the third chapter. There are several patterns. In the majority of cases, Yunmen first quotes an old master or scripture and then challenges his students by some question, comment, or action to produce a response. When they are unable to respond, the Master sometimes answers in their stead.

[Master Yunmen] mentioned that [his master] Xuefeng had told a monk to come closer. When the monk went closer, Xuefeng said: "Go!" When Master [Yunmen] finished this account he asked a monk: "How can you say a phrase [of gratitude] with folded hands? If you can say a phrase [of gratitude], you meet Xuefeng."

Once [the Master] said: "A man of old said, 'The one word is without a second one.' What is the one word?" [As no one answered] be replied for them, "Tea after the breakfast gruel."

In some cases, Yunmen reinforces the challenge by crystallizing the point of the quote in a concrete question or demonstrating it in a provocative statement by which the other person’s understanding is put to the test.

[Mastert Yunmen] cited [the phrase]: "Any true reality contains everything." The Master said, "What do you call mountains, rivers, and the great earth?" He further remarked, "All entities as such are characterized by emptiness. They neither arise nor disappear and are neither defiled nor pure."

[Yunmen] asked a master who lectures on scriptures, "On what scripture do you lecture?" The
The lecture master said, "The Nirvana Sutra." Yunmen inquired, "Nirvana comprises four virtues, doesn't it?" The lecture master affirmed. Yunmen held up a bowl and said, "How many virtues does this [bowl] comprise?" The lecture master replied, "Not even a single one." Yunmen asked, "Why did the ancients speak as they did?" The lecture master said, "How about the old masters' speaking like this?" Yunmen hit the bowl and said, "Do you understand?" The lecture master said, "No, I don't." Yunmen remarked, "And you're lecturing on sutras!"

(YML 573a25-b1)

In conclusion, one can say that Yunmen hardly omits an occasion to provoke, challenge, and test his students.
CRITICISM, ADMONITION, AND ENCOURAGEMENT

Many sermons and conversations of the Master are held in a tone of extreme urgency and with an intensity that was rarely matched in Chan history. Wu's characterization of Yunmen's style of speech is quite adequate:

He kills his foes in the heat of the battle. He utters shouts under fire. When the lion roars, all other animals take cover. No one can encounter him without his head being chopped off by him. (...) Like a sorcerer he kills by cursing. His tongue is inconceivably venomous, and, what makes the case worse, he is the most eloquent of the Chan masters.

It is quite likely that some of the Master's remarks and questions which were translated above were shouted at the top of his voice and accompanied by threatening postures and gestures. This impression is even stronger when Yunmen scolds and threatens his students or criticizes other masters.

The instant you see an old monk open his mouth, you tend to stuff those big stones right into yours. You're exactly like those green flies on shit that struggle back to back to gobble it up and take it away! In groups of three and five you stick your heads together and deliberate. Shame on you, brothers!

"Is there any blood under your skin? What good is it to willfully victimize yourself everywhere? You bunch of exterminators of Buddhism! You're no more than a pack of wild foxes! What good is your being here?" Using his staff, [Master Yunmen] at once chased [the monks] out.

Any word or question by the student can trigger abuse by the Master:

The Master once said, "The lantern is your self. [Yet] when you hold your bowl and eat your food, the food is not your self." A monk asked: "How about when food is my self?" The Master cried: "You wild fox spirit! Country bumpkin!" Again, he said: "Come, come! Isn't it you who said that the food is your self?" The monk affirmed. The Master exclaimed: "In the [nonexistent] year of the donkey you'll see it in a dream, you yokel!"

The Master's violent tone and harsh words are in reality only part and parcel of his compassionate effort to incite the students to make a greater and better effort to come to their own realization.

"When I was on pilgrimage some time ago, there was a bunch of people who gave me explanations. They didn't have bad intentions, but one day I saw through them [and
realized] that they are laughingstocks. If I won't die in the next four or five years, I'll back off and shatter the legs of these exterminators of Buddhism one by one. Right now there are plenty of temple priests everywhere who fake it: why don't you go and join them? What dry piece of shit are you looking for in [this temple] here?" The master stepped [from his chair] down on the floor, and with his staff he hit and chased [the monks] out [of the hall] at once.

These old shavepates everywhere! They sit on the round [teacher's] chairs and meditation platforms, wanting to acquire fame and profit. Asked about Buddha, they answer 'Buddha', and asked about patriarch they answer 'patriarch', and they shit and piss. [What they say] is just like information passed around among boondock grannies. They don't know [anything, not even] good from bad!

Quite a few of the Master's substitute answers express the thoughts of the silent monks; they often contain implicit or explicit criticism and expose the monks' preoccupations (for instance with food) and their excuses for their lack of effort. Such criticism can also be viewed as a form of encouragement to better practice.

One day [the Master] said, "When you exert your whole strength, what do you say?" On behalf [of the monks, Yunmen] said, "Five sesame buns and three bowls of tea!"

Yunmen's scathing criticism, sarcastic abuse, and brutal threats are often followed by challenges to his students or by urgent appeals and admonishments which either warn them of wrong ways of practice and bad teachers or advise and encourage them in positive terms.

Now what should you do? Every one of you must strive for himself to obtain [a better] rebirth. Don't futilely tramp around, simply wanting to get hold of some idle words, waiting for some master's mouth to move, then asking about Chan and Dao, transcendence and immortality, this and that, and stuffing [the words] which you noted down on big rolls of copying paper into the bags of skin [that you are].

You must make some effort for yourself, and you'll certainly become familiar with it. Hurry up! Hurry up! Time does not wait for man, and breathing out is no guarantee for breathing in [again]! Do you have some spare body and mind to fritter away? You must absolutely pay attention. Take care!
7. **ONE PUBLIC INSTRUCTION AS ILLUSTRATION OF YUNMEN'S TEACHING METHOD**

In the following, an entire public instruction by the Master is translated in sequence, only interrupted by some comments about teaching techniques. More than the many short conversations and fragments of public instructions adduced above, this longest instruction (YML 547a4 - b17) of the Master should serve as a coherent illustration of some aspects of teaching method which were mentioned above. Additionally, another important aspect of Yunmen's teaching method should become more apparent, namely, his typical rhetoric and tone. Because of the popularity of koan collections, some of Yunmen's short exchanges became very famous and were subject to many commentaries. His public instructions remained much less known, but they can provide a much more concrete impression of the teacher's style and tone of instruction.

In this public instruction, the Master starts out with a typical challenge, followed by a sarcastic remark about the audience's inability to take this challenge seriously and to give an appropriate response. Then comes an admonition to take their doubts about the master's opening words seriously and to inquire about their meaning:

> In [a public instruction in] the Dharma Hall, [Master Yunmen] said: "I put the entire universe at once on top of your eyelashes." All of you hear me talk like this, [but] I don't dare to hope that you come forth and [in the manner of a sharp one] give me a whack. Take your time and examine in detail whether you have [the entire universe on your eyelashes] or not!

The Master now increases the pressure of the challenge by asking his students what his initial words really mean and by reprimanding them for simply accepting words by masters without arriving at their own realization. He points out how two other masters immediately saw through and treated such people:

> As to this [statement I made at the outset]: what does it mean? Even though you may, in facing up to this, attain some understanding, you'll get beaten up and your legs will be broken as soon as you come to an accomplished Chan master's assembly. If you were such a [particularly accomplished] man you would, upon hearing me talk about a Chan master's activity somewhere, at once turn toward me, spit at me, and offend my eyes and ears. If you are not a man of such action, [then] as soon as you hear someone bring up [a statement], you'll
In his typical caustic manner, the Master proceeds to describe such deluded people and accuses his listeners to be exactly like them:

How about those other fellows [who deserve the same treatment]? If a bunch of windbags gulp down other people's pus and slobber, recall heaps and loads of rubbish, and run all over the place, stretching their [big] donkey lips and horse mouths, boasting: 'I can ask questions in five or ten alternative ways!' will they in eternity see [what they talk about] even in a dream, even if they ask questions from morning till evening with the answers taking them into the night? Where will they [ever] apply their strength for the benefit of others? You resemble people of this kind.

Yummen intensifies his onslaught by reminding his students of their mortality and of the ridiculous nature of their arrogance and pretense in the face of death:

When someone invites you monks to a donated feast you [arrogantly] say: 'I am satisfied with the food I eat, [but] what topic of conversation can [the donator] handle? Some day you'll be facing the King [of Hell] Yama, and he won't accept your glib talk.

After the lack of pretense and arrogance of an awakened person is pointed out, Yummen emphasizes the need to take one’s lack of understanding seriously:

My brothers, if there is one who has attained it, he passes his days in conformity with the ordinary. If he hasn't yet attained it, he must at any price avoid to pretend [that he has]. You must not pass your time so easily. You are much in need of minute attention.

Next comes a part of this instruction in which the Master gives concrete advice as to the way in which the ignorance described above can be overcome. Yummen presents three koan and advises his students on how they should use them in their practice:

The old men have very much tried to give guidance through words. For instance [my teacher] Xuefeng said: 'The whole great earth is nothing but you.' [Master] Jiashan said: 'Get hold of me on the tips of the various grasses, and recognize the Emperor in the bustling marketplace.' [Master] Luopu said, 'The moment a single grain of dust arises, the whole world is contained in it. A full-manned lion, all of it, is this very you.' Try to get a firm hold on [the meaning of these sayings], reflecting upon them from all angles --
after days or years an entrance will by itself open up.

The Master emphasizes that such koan are by no means without connection to the members of the audience; rather, they constitute the central concern of each listener, and getting some hold on them is one's very own mission. The teacher's role can thus only be ancillary.

This matter does not allow anyone to substitute for you; it is nothing but the very own mission of each person. If the old masters appear in the world, it is just to act as witness for you. If you have found some entrance or some clue, he wouldn't hide it from you. If in reality you haven't yet attained it, then don't expect his all-purpose of expedient means to you to do the job. My brothers, you who all in the same way wear out your straw sandals on pilgrimages and abandon teachers and parents -- you absolutely must fix your eyeballs directly on this!

After this advice, the Master seeks to encourage his students to make a sustained, strong effort:

If you have not yet found any clue but have met an undisguised helper (i.e., a master) who is [as fierce] as a dog biting boars, and [as compassionate that he] does not care about his life nor shy away from entering mud and water in order to give you guidance, and if he has something good for chewing: [then] blink your eyes and raise your eyebrows, bang your bowl bag high [on the wall], and for ten or twenty years exert yourself to the utmost! Don't worry about not bringing your effort to completion: should it happen that you do not yet achieve it in this lifetime, you will not fail to get a human body in the next one, and then it will turn out that you have saved labor with regard to this teaching. Thus you will not idly squander your whole life, and you will also not let down the patron of Buddhism, your teachers, and your parents.

This encouragement and advice is followed by warnings about wrong attitudes to religious practice and reproaches to the ones who hold them:

You must without fail be cautious! Don't idle away your time running around in the provinces and loitering in the districts, wandering thousands of miles with your staff across your shoulders, spending a winter here and a summer there, [enjoying] the beautiful mountains and waters and doing what you want, provided with plenty of donated food and easily obtaining worldly possessions. What a disgrace, what an enormous disgrace! 'Wanting to get himself one peck of rice he ends up losing six month's provisions'. What's the use of such pilgrimages? How dare you consume the believing almsgiver's bunch of vegetables and grain of rice?

The Master emphasizes once more the very personal nature and the urgency of this task in the face of approaching death:
You must see for yourself -- there is nobody to substitute for you. Time does not wait for man. One day you'll be about to die and your gaze will fall on the earth. How will you manage from then on? You must not resemble a crab that, dropped into hot water, flails about its legs in a frenzy! That won't be the time for pretending and bragging.

This public instruction closes with another appeal to take advantage of this very rare chance and to find out oneself. The listeners are left not with an answer but with a question and a last encouragement to make a total effort to find their very own solution:

Don't carelessly trifle away your time. Once you lose your human body you don't regain one for a myriad world ages. This is no small matter! Don't occupy yourself with [whatever happens to be] in front of your eyes. If even a worldly man said, 'Should I hear about the Way in the morning, I will die content in the evening', then what about us monks? What is it that we ought to realize? You must make a great effort! Take care of yourself!
H. KOAN AND DOUBT

1. INTRODUCTION

The importance of koan use in Chan history has been pointed out by many authors. At the beginning of his famous essay on the koan exercise, D.T. Suzuki states:

In fact, the koan system has effected a special development in Zen Buddhism, and is a unique contribution Zen has made to the history of the religious consciousness. When the importance of the koan is understood, we may say that more than the half of Zen is understood.

Much has been written on the nature, significance, and historical development of the koan. It is not our aim here to address these complex themes; this would necessitate much further research and will form the subject of a future publication. Rather, this section has the purpose of throwing some light on a very important aspect of Yunmen's teaching and teaching method -- namely, the use of his own and other Chan masters' awakened self-expression as a challenge -- and on the promotion of doubt which is the preliminary objective of this method. The most concise and precise definition of the term koan was advanced by DeMartino: "[A koan is a] Zen presentation offered as a Zen challenge." This definition eliminates much of the confusion surrounding the koan:

In contradistinction to the widespread misconception, a Zen koan is neither a nonsensical conundrum, an incomprehensible riddle, an unanswerable question, nor an otherwise unsolvable -- or meaningless -- problem. Indeed, from the side of its origination, a genuine koan is not a problem at all, but it is a direct self-expression of the Buddha -- or of the dharma. With regard to the one to whom the koan is directed or 'communicated', insofar as it is a challenge demanding a response, it may be a problem. However, even when it is a problem, it is neither senseless nor insoluble.

DeMartino's definition has several additional advantages. It does not link the koan exclusively to any specific pattern of teaching such as the so-called wenda 間答 ("questions and answers", jap. mondō) yet serves to elucidate their nature:

When there is, to a Zen koan challenge, a specifically intended or proffered response, whether acceptable or not, the entire exchange becomes a Zen mondō -- that is, a kind of
Additionally, it not only applies to the consciously organized and systematized koan system that flourished during the Song dynasties and was further developed in Japan but also creates a link to earlier forms of Chan teaching since it focuses on the dynamics of the koan which "as a method were, in fact, always in actual operation even from the very beginning of Zen -- at least according to the legendary historical accounts."664

2. KOAN

In the preceding section (3G) on Yunmen's teaching method it was pointed out that the Master's challenges are omnipresent in the YML. Yunmen was, as many of the examples translated above show, an adept at turning almost any situation and utterance into a Chan challenge. His expression, be it in his own words and actions or in those of other masters and monks which he cited, very often had the "hidden sting" (YML 546a23) of challenge and thus conforms to DeMartino's definition of koan.

In distinction to other forms of challenge, the Chan challenge aims at the very core of the human being and exposes its most fundamental problem, namely, the basic diremption which pervades human existence and which Buddhism calls 'duality'.665 When meeting another person, a Chan master sees this problem immediately:

The instant Deshan saw a monk enter the gate, he drew his stick and drove him away. Muchoho, seeing a monk come in through the gate, said: 'You have already made your case [of penal offense] apparent, [but] I release you of the thirty blows [you deserve].'

(YML 547a11-13)

Though this is not the place to go into details about the history and meaning of the word koan (chin. gongan 公案) and of related expressions such as yinyuan 因緣 and huatou 話頭, it is of interest to note that the earliest passages in Chan texts where the word koan is used are attributed to Yunmen and his teacher Muzhou.690 It merits attention that all three occurrences in the YML (the one cited above which
is attributed to Muzhou, and particularly the two examples by Yunmen) occur in the juridical context of a penal offense which is subject to indictment (YML 551c29) and severe punishment (547a12-13) and which cannot be settled (570c9-10). The offense which the Chan masters immediately detect and which they expose through their challenge in the form of awakened self-expression is none other that which made the disciples and bodhisattvas so hesitant to visit Vimalakirti: duality.691

The most basic and radical form of the Chan challenge -- i.e., what Hisamatsu Shin'ichi (1889-1980) called the "fundamental koan"692 which forms the heart of every koan -- focuses exactly on the human root-contradiction of dualism (which, as in DeMartino's essay quoted below, can also be called 'subject-object structure of the ego'). Hisamatsu's "fundamental koan" is: "If no way will do: what do you do?" Though in somewhat different words, the same has been said by other Chan masters. Shitou 石頭希遷 (700-790) for instance said, "This way will not do. Not this way will not do either. No way, neither this way nor not this way will do. What do you do?"693 Deshan 德山宣鑑 (782-865) stated, "Thirty blows if you can speak, thirty blows if you cannot speak."694 And Master Yunmen challenged a student: "I neither want words from you nor no words. What do you say?"695 DeMartino explains what Yunmen and the other masters aim at:

[As long as the ego as subject continues to be or cling to an object, its inner contradiction and predicament as ego remain. The aim is, therefore, to remove all available object-constituents -- including the body itself -- toward the end of baring and exposing in its naked contradiction the very subject-object structure of the ego as such. Without an object, the ego, unable to be a subject, becomes itself untenable. Yet, it is just to this radical and fundamental moment that Zen wishes to drive, and there to challenge, in the words of a contemporary teacher: "Without using your mouth, without using your mind, without using your body, express yourself!"696

The challenge by Hisamatsu is thus no different from the one by Yunmen quoted above; it forms the heart of the koan. Not every koan shows its core as openly as the four examples above, but the YML contains several other examples which conform to the same pattern.

The Master seized his staff and pointed at the lantern, saying: "Well, do you see [it]? If
you say you see [it], you're stressing what is evident. If you say that you don't see: you've got a pair of eyes, have you?! How do you understand [this]?” (YML 555c21-22)

When a monk came for instruction, the Master lifted his robe and said, “If you can speak, you fall into the trap of my robe. If you cannot speak, you're additionally sitting in the demon's cave. What do you do?” (YML 564c15-17)

But even when a koan takes a very different form, its challenge still aims at the problem of duality and exposes the cul-de-sac in which the unawakened person finds itself; this is what Yuanwu refers to when he states that the Chan master "uses the grip of a patchrobed monk to pull out the painful spot for the other and breaks up his nest". At the same time, this challenge is -- by virtue of being a self-expression of an awakened teacher -- an "embodiment of the ultimate fulfillment of the agonizing ego":

The master's insistence upon a response to the koan does not issue in any sense from an external, strange, or heteronomous authority. Quite the contrary. A genuine teacher is an embodiment of the ultimate fulfillment of the agonizing ego itself. His demand for a resolution of the koan, natural or given, is, in reality, the longing and questing critical mandate of the ego for its own resolution.

The double nature of the koan -- as self-expression of an awakened person and challenge to an unawakened one -- can also be seen in terms of the Buddhist "two-truths" theory (see sections F and I of this chapter) and the connected "downward-upward" polarity of Chan. From the teacher's point of view, the koan is an expression of absolute (i.e. awakened, nondenial) truth with a specific pedagogical aim; both as expression and as pedagogical tool, it is a kind of expedient means (fangbian 方便), that is, a method which makes use of appropriate conventional "truth" in order to express the absolute truth of awakening and to guide the unawakened towards it. This corresponds to the Buddha's coming down from the mountain in order to help the unawakened ones by preaching in conventional terms; in Chan Buddhism, this is often expressed by the word "downward" (向下; chin. xiang xia, jap. köge).

Master Yunnan once said, "The manifold explanations about enlightened wisdom, final..."
deliverance, thusness, and Buddha-nature are all 'downward' discussions.\footnote{\textcopyright{} 2016} For the student, on the other hand, the teacher's use of conventional truth in the form of expedient means is a challenge through which his problematic nature as well as his lack of understanding and freedom are made evident. At the same time, this challenge stirs the student's longing to awaken, provokes and intensifies his doubt, and helps him to go beyond duality -- and thus to realize that from the beginning nothing whatsoever was the matter. In Chan Buddhism, this way "beyond duality" is often simply called "upward" or "up beyond" (向上; chin. \textit{xiang shang}, jap. \textit{kôjô}).\footnote{\textcopyright{} 2016} In being a "downward" expression of awakening which exposes the ordinary person's dualistic impasse, in challenging it to go "up beyond" duality, and in serving (by virtue of being an awakened self-expression used as a Chan challenge) as a "gateless barrier"\footnote{\textcopyright{} 2016} to achieve this breakthrough, the \textit{koan} represents the Chan teaching and practicing effort in a nutshell.

The Chan teacher is quite aware of the fact that by teaching his students, he conjures up the danger of playing into the hands of the very problem he wants to combat, namely, dualistic attachment. Because the students tend to have faith in the teacher and accept his words at face value, the teacher seeks to prevent or remedy this attachment by promoting doubt. Doubt functions as a destabilizing factor, a motor of sustained inquiry, and -- in its ultimate concentration as great doubt -- as chance and condition of breakthrough. Obviously, a device such as the \textit{koan} -- whose preliminary aim consists, according to DeMartino, in the provocation of 'great doubt'\footnote{\textcopyright{} 2016} -- is perfectly suited to the Chan teacher and student's needs. This is certainly a major reason why it acquired such a central role in Chan teaching and practice. According to DeMartino, the \textit{koan} serves a twofold function:

\begin{quote}
The first is to penetrate to the depths and quicken at its source the deeply buried or deceptively concealed basic underlying concern of the ego in ego-consciousness. The second is, while stirring this fundamental longing and its quest, to keep them properly rooted and directed.\footnote{\textcopyright{} 2016}
\end{quote}

An unawakened person trying to get hold of a \textit{koan} is, to use
the image of the *Blue Cliff Records*, like "a mosquito trying to bite
an ox."\(^704\) Any attempt is bound to fail -- yet one cannot but try and
search. Bernard Phillips expressed this predicament in his two remarks
to Hisamatsu: "If I follow some way and pursue some practice, it will
not do", and "If I don't follow any way and engage in no practice, it
will not do either".\(^705\) It is this predicament which Chan Buddhism
seeks to free people from, and the *koan* as embodiment of Hisamatsu's
"there is no way; what do you do?" as well as his "no-way is the
way"\(^706\) became one of Chan's most characteristic traits.

The ultimate objective of Chan remains the same: to know and appreciate who one is beyond
'the fold of reason,' that is, beyond the [dualistic] subject-object structure of
intellection. Toward this end the *koan*, a kind of question, problem, challenge, or demand
presented by and upon the initiative of the master, is intended to serve a twofold
function. The first is to penetrate to the depths and quicken at its source the deeply
buried or deceptively concealed basic underlying concern of the ego in ego-consciousness.
The second is, while stirring this fundamental longing and its quest, to keep them properly
rooted and directed. For it is not sufficient that they simply be aroused. They must, in
order to avoid the many deceptive and delusive pitfalls in which they may become attenuated
or go astray, also be carefully guided and even fostered.\(^7^{10}\)

3. DOUBT AND FAITH

If breaking through man's dualistic impasse is the final end of
*koan* use, its preliminary objective is, in DeMartino's words, "to im­
pel and incite not merely noetically, but affectively and physically
as well, what in the terminology of Zen Buddhism is called the 'great
doubt'."\(^709\) Doubt is initially generated in the field of tension be­
tween the absolute truth of awakening and the conventional truth of
the unawakened -- which is just the domain that the *koan* addresses.
The doubt which haunted the famous Japanese monk Dōgen 道元 (1200–
1253) is a case in point:

[Dōgen's] doubt concerned the passage on the Buddha-nature in the *Mahāparinirvāṇa sutra*
that was customarily read as: 'Sakymuni Buddha said: 'All sentient beings everywhere
possess the Buddha-nature; the Tathāgata exists eternally and is without change.' If all
sentient beings originally possess the Buddha-nature, Dōgen wondered, why do we still
develop the mind for enlightenment and engage in ascetic practices in pursuit of it?"\(^7^{11}\)

The same kind of doubt was nurtured in the disciples of Zhaozhou 趙州
when he denied that a dog -- which is also a sentient being -- had
Buddha-nature, and in the monks of Linji's assembly who had undergone all kinds of hardships in the course of their religious practice yet heard their master say:

Followers of the Way, as to the Buddha-dharma no effort is necessary. You have only to be ordinary with nothing to do -- defecating, urinating, putting on clothes, eating food, and lying down when tired. (YML 547-548)

Yunmen seeks to generate and intensify this gnawing doubt in his students by similar means. He keeps asking questions like "What is it that you all are lacking? Who of you full-fledged fellows hasn't got his share?" (546c8-9), or "What besides wearing a robe, eating, moving bowels, and urinating is the matter?" (548b16-17) Such questions are koan; on the one hand, they express the Master's realization that nothing is lacking and nothing is the matter, and on the other hand they serve as provocation and challenge to the monks who had travelled thousands of miles on foot just to be taught by Yunmen. How must they have felt when told by the Master:

All of you who come and go without the slightest reason: what are you looking for in [this temple] here? I only know how to eat, drink, and shit. What else would I be capable of doing? (YML 553a13-14)

Since they make use of the tension between non-dual absolute truth and dualistic conventions, such provocative statements of the Master did not -- and do not -- fail to generate doubt.

[Yunmen] mentioned that Changqing had seized his staff and said, "If you know this [staff], your life's study is finished." Master [Yunmen] said, "You know this [staff]. Why don't you rest?" (TML 551a8-9)

Of course, Yunmen is fully aware that from the students' point of view the life's study is far from finished since they have not yet broken through duality and are seeking peace of mind.

When I say to you: 'Right now, is anything the matter?', I have already misled you. If in actuality you have not yet attained entry, then for a time go into yourself and investigate thoroughly on your own: What, besides wearing a robe, eating, moving bowels and urinating, is the matter? (TML 548b14-17)

YUNMEN'S TEACHING
The student's doubt is intimately linked to his faith in Buddhist teaching, in his teacher, and in himself. Without faith in this teaching with its affirmation of the possibility of awakening, trust that a particular master is an awakened one, and at least some hope or confidence that he can become like him, the student would hardly seek awakening. But just the fact that this faith is always incomplete -- and thus that doubt is present -- is a symptom of the problem which besets him.

As to you: your faith is insufficient, and that's why I'm bandying words today. [...] "What!" shouted the Master, and then said, "For those whose root of faith is insufficient a final day will never come. Take care of yourselves!"  

Students today can't get anywhere: what ails you? Lack of faith in yourself is what ails you. If you lack faith in yourself, you'll keep on tumbling along, bewilderedly following after all kinds of circumstances, be taken by these myriad circumstances through transformation after transformation, and never be yourself.  

While the student ought to have faith in the Master's "Nothing whatsoever is the matter", he knows very well that he undertakes religious practice only because for him something is the matter. And why else would the Master teach him in the first place? Like Bernard Phillips, the student cannot help having faith; at the same time, he cannot help lacking faith. Thus, when a student is challenged through the awakened self-expression of a master, both faith and its lack (i.e. doubt) play a role; both are symptoms of man's problematic nature, and both must be broken through in his ultimate self-realization.

In contrast to other Chinese Buddhist schools, Chan Buddhism emphasizes the student's doubt rather than his faith. The most typical product of this emphasis is the koan: unlike Buddhist treatises and commentaries of other schools which seek to nurture faith and diminish doubt by carefully explaining Buddhist doctrine, the koan of the Chan masters is designed to increase doubt; unapproachable "like a mile-high wall" and impenetrable "like a silver mountain", a koan is quite useless as an object of faith, thought, or even discussion; rather, it confronts the student directly with awakened self-
expression and thus intensifies his doubt and lack of orientation and challenges him to break through duality.

[8] By its very nature the koan does not permit itself to be fitted into any dualistic subject-object scheme of the ego in ego-consciousness. It can never even be meaningful, much less be 'solved' or satisfied, and remain an object external to the ego as subject.119

4. PROMOTING DOUBT

When an unawakened 'I' endeavors to be himself and thus to attain ease, it seeks a way; but seeking means, for the unawakened 'I', to be once again looking for some object and to be attached to it. Unable to know itself and the objects it faces, the 'I' is involved in an endless search. This is man's restless condition -- superbly described in James Joyce's "Ulysses" -- in which man's mind "chases about searching from thought to thought"720 and grasps, like a monkey, any object it encounters.

Objects of faith such as the teaching of a master, the words of the Buddha, or a Buddhist scripture are tempting targets on this restless search. The Master knows how easy it is to get attached to such objects; hence he often warns his students of developing such attachment, compares them to "a bunch of windbags who gulp down other people's pus and slobber and recall heaps and loads of rubbish" (547a13), and encourages them to meet the words of masters and scriptures with irreverence and doubt rather than piety and faithful acceptance:

If you were an accomplished man you would, upon hearing me talk about a Chan master's activity somewhere, at once turn toward me, spit at me, and offend my eyes and ears. If you are not a man of such action112, [then] as soon as you hear someone bring up [a statement], you'll instantly be ready to accept it.113 (YML 547a8-10)

During your pilgrimages you cheat the master114 in your own house. Do you see what I mean? When you manage to find a little slime behind my ass, you lick it off, take it to be
your own self, and say: 'I understand Chan, I understand the Way!' Even if you manage to read the whole Buddhist canon -- so what?!! (YML 553a16-18)

In order to destroy or prevent the students' attachment to his teaching, Yunmen also uses various other means such as self-deprecation, warnings, etc., and he does not shy away from making statements that shock the pious and can be seen as blasphemous.

Yunmen and other Chan masters harshly condemn all attempts to simply accept and believe their (and the Buddha's) words. The Chan masters' use of koan must be seen in the context of their strategy to free the students from all attachments, ordinary or holy. Of course, the promotion of doubt is a most potent means to destroy such reliance, and the koan which cannot be nailed down yet needles the student through its challenge is an excellent method of intensifying doubt. Consequently, Yunmen does not encourage his students to hold on to what they understand but on the contrary urges them to value their inability to understand:

A monk asked [Master Yunmen], "How about a statement that transcends the Buddha and goes beyond the patriarchs?" The Master said, "Sesame bun." The monk went on: "What connection does this have with [my question]? The Master said, "Exactly!!" What connection has
The monk's question and Yunmen's answer ("Sesame bun") of the last example became famous as koan number 77 of the Blue Cliff Record. Though Yuanwu's comments are more verbose than Yunmen's dry answer ("Exactly! What connection has this?!") to the student's second question, they have exactly the same aim, namely, to drive the challenged person to take the challenge seriously and investigate on his own:

Followers of Chan these days just go to "Cake" to understand, or else they go to "beyond Buddhas and Patriarchs" to make up theories. Since it's not in these two places, in the end, where is it? Thirty years from now, when I've exchanged my bones, I'll tell you.

(YML 碧巖錄 case 77, T48[2003]204c27-205a1)

Just like later commentators of koan collections, Yunmen often asks his students whether they understand, warns them that they should not pretend to possess understanding when they in reality do not (555a6, 550a29), and urges them to take their doubt seriously. Like Yuanwu, he asks instead of explaining, and instead of analyzing the students' problem and trying to make the students believe him, he provokes, challenges, and encourages them to find out by themselves what their problem is and how they can go about it. Just this is an aim of his favourite question "What is the matter?" which addresses man's central concern and forms a typical koan:

Don't vainly memorize [other people's] sayings -- a little bit of reality is better than a lot of illusion -- for later on you'll just deceive yourself. What is the matter?

(YML 548c15-16)

Don't occupy yourself with [whatever happens to be] in front of your eyes. If even a worldly man said, 'Should I hear about the Way in the morning, I will die content in the evening', then what about us monks? What is it that we ought to realize? You must make a great effort! Take care of yourself!

(YML 547b15-17)

The Master's constant questioning and needling ("What's the problem?" [557c18], "What is it?" [552c13], etc.) are characteristic not only of Yunmen's teaching method, but also of that of later champions of koan use such as Yuanwu and Dahui. The following passages from the YML could well stem from Yuanwu or Dahui:
I put the entire universe at once on top of your eyelashes. All of you hear me talk like this, [but] I don't dare to hope that you come forth and [in the manner of a sharp one] give me a whack. Take your time and examine in detail whether you have [the entire universe on your eyelashes] or not! As to this [statement I made at the outset]: what does it mean? (YML 547a4-7)

The ancients have very much tried to give guidance through words. For instance Xuefeng said: 'The whole great earth is nothing but you.' Jiashan said: 'Get hold of me on the tips of the various grasses, and recognize the Emperor in the bustling marketplace.' Luopu said, 'The moment a single grain of dust arises, the whole world is contained in it. A full-maned lion, all of it, is this very you.' Try to get a firm hold on [the meaning of these sayings], reflecting upon them from all angles -- after days or years an entrance will by itself open up. This matter does not allow anyone to substitute for you; it is nothing but the very own mission of each person. (YML 547a21-26)

Rather than explaining to his students what Buddhism is all about and commenting upon scriptures and other people's words, he keeps asking them what such words really mean (547a7, 554b19-20), what the Chan masters know (557c14), whether there is any statement that the students could not penetrate (546b13, 563b4), etc. Instead of inspiring faith, providing security, and fostering attachment, the Master's questions and challenges systematically intensify the students' unease and doubt.

If today I bandy around words with you, [you will still] not know good from bad when shit turns to ash, piss burns, and [when in a future life you'll be] a dirty pig or a scabious dog. You make your living in a shit pit! That's why I say: You must grasp the whole universe, the world, the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings, all the Buddhas of the three periods, and the verbal teachings of the whole empire's masters at once right on your eyelashes! (YML 550c27-551a1)

Obviously, the Master wants his listeners to arrive at their own realization, and this can neither be brought about by accepting and believing in someone's teaching nor by superficial doubt and questions concerning some object. Such questions are immediately cut down by the Master's "If [you] don't ask, [I] don't answer" (545b10, 546a25). Instead, Yunmen encourages and values the student's existential question and doubt: "You must not lose your question!" (552b22). Of course, the Master knows very well what he is after:

For the student, the given koan, also, is now, like the natural koan, a mode or expression...
of the actual "question" or quandary of the ego itself, and the struggle for its "solution" an equally torturing life-and-death struggle. The koan thus comes to be, as regards the student, a living crisis, taking over as the central and exclusive concern of his entire being. His confronting it is, indeed, his confronting his own predicament in all of its immediate and burning urgency."

Constantly urged on by the Master who stands before him as the living proof of a possible solution and challenged by his koan -- which constitute the essence of his teaching method --, the student is driven to realize that he is "in an existential quandary which [he] can neither compose, endure, abandon, or escape"; he is "unable to retreat" and "unable to stand fixed." This is nothing other than the ultimate existential realization of the "fundamental koan" mentioned above. The preliminary objective of the Master's teaching, as exemplified by his koan, is to make the student "become wholly and authentically the living contradiction" which he himself is. In contrast to the initial doubt which a student feels when "hearing someone speak about Buddhist teaching" (545b24) and which drives him to seek the Master's instruction (547c3, 549b20), this is the "great doubt" which "is no other than the intrinsic predicament of the ego in ego-consciousness totally and exhaustively exacerbated."

5. YUNMEN'S KOAN

Many earlier and contemporary Chan masters used their own or other masters' awakened self-expression as a Chan challenge. Though they did not call them "koan", these masters were of course very aware of the challenging and doubt-provoking quality of awakened expression and used it expertly.

When someone brings forward a phrase or comes forth from within the concealed or the revealed, you are at once beset by doubt, appeal to heaven, appeal to earth, run to question your neighbors, and are utterly bewildered.  

When you join an accomplished monk's assembly and he manifests his ability in a phrase, you'll ponder completely in vain.  

Some of these expressions became famous and circulated in Chan circles
well before the term *koan* came into use to designate this sort of challenge. They were used by various masters who cited them, discussed them among themselves (573c28), and sometimes linked them to their own challenges and tests. The following story is told of Master Linji:

Master [Linji] heard that Deshan of the second generation had said, "Thirty blows if you can speak; thirty blows if you can't." The Master told Luopu to go and ask Deshan: "Why thirty blows to one who can speak?" Wait until he hits at you, then grab his stick and give him a jab. See what he does then." When Luopu reached Deshan's place he questioned him as instructed. Deshan hit at him. Luopu seized the stick and gave Deshan a jab with it. Deshan went back to his quarters. Luopu returned and told Linji what had taken place. "I've always held wonder for that fellow," Master [Linji] said. "Be that as it may, do you understand Deshan?" Luopu hesitated. The Master hit him. [LJL 临济录 1985:503c19-25]"14

However, in contrast to most earlier and contemporary Chan masters -- who most of the time challenged their students either with their own favourite devices (such as Muzhou's "Where are you from" or Xuefeng's "What is it?") or set questions ("What is the meaning of Bodhidharma's coming from the West?") and only occasionally used words by other masters (or from scriptures) and questions about them -- Yunmen used all of these devices and additional ones in very creative ways. The previous sections of this chapter described and illustrated some of the major teaching devices which the Master used in order to bring the challenge home to his students. These include his enigmatic one-word answers, substitute answers, alternative answers, questions about old sayings and events, incomprehensible actions, irrational and paradoxical statements, blasphemy, abuse, commonplace answers, etc.

Some of the Master's challenges do not make use of old sayings, events from the Chan tradition, quotes from scriptures, and the like; they originated with Yunmen and occasionally became the stuff of later *koan* when other masters used them for their purposes. A famous example is the following conversation between Yunmen and a monk; about two centuries after it was held, the man who was to become the most famous Chinese propagator of *koan*, Dahui Zonggao (大慧宗杲; 1089-1163), was given this as a *koan* by his teacher Yuanwu Keqin (圆悟克勤; 1063-1135).

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "What is the point of origin of all buddhas?" The Master said, "Rash Mountain walks on the water." [YML 545c19]
Dahui is said to have offered forty-nine replies, but Yuanwu did not approve. The following are some typical examples of challenges by Yunmen which do not make use of words by other masters or scriptures:

If you really do not understand, turn for the time being to some verbal teachings. For instance, I keep telling you that all the Buddhas of past, present, and future from lands like specks of dust, the twenty-eight Indian, and the six Chinese patriarchs are all on top of this staff where they expound the Buddhist teaching, manifest themselves by spiritual powers in different forms, and have their voices respond in the ten directions as they like and without the slightest hindrance. Do you understand? If you don't understand, do not pretend that you do. Even if you don't pretend: have you closely examined and do you really see [what I just spoke of]? (YHL 550a26-b2)

In the [Dharma] Hall, the Master said: "Without any reason, Vasubandhu Bodhisattva is transformed into a wooden stick." Then he took his staff, drew a line on the earth, and said: "All ye Buddhas, countless like grains of sand: get involved in discussions in here!" Then the Master left his seat. (YHL 550b27-29)

In the hall, the Master said: "Your eyelashes stretch out horizontally in all ten directions, and your eyebrows penetrate heaven and earth above and the yellow springs below. But Mt. Sumeru has blocked your throat. Now is there something [in what I said] that you understand?" If you can understand, pick up Vietnam and hang it against Korea! (YHL 552b10-12)

The Master once held up his staff and showed it to the assembly with the words: "This staff has turned into a dragon and has swallowed the whole universe. Mountains, rivers, and the great earth -- where are they to be found?" (YHL 558b23-25)

On the other hand, many koan by Yunmen use words by other masters or from scriptures; this type of koan became increasingly popular in the Master’s wake and forms the material of systematic koan use which developed mainly in the 11th and 12th centuries. Often, Yunmen sharpens and focuses the challenge inherent in an anecdote or passage from a scripture. His questions and remarks bring home the challenge and direct the student’s search much in the manner of Yuanwu’s comments in the Blue Cliff Record.

[Master Yunmen] mentioned a monk who had asked Xuefeng for instruction. Xuefeng had asked him: "What is it?", and at those words the monk was greatly awakened. Master [Yunmen] said: "What is it that Xuefeng had told him?" (YML 554b20-21)
[Master Yunmen] quoted a saying by Mazu: "All words belong to the school of Kanadeva! it considers just this to be the principal." [Master Yunmen] said, "An excellent saying! Only, nobody asks [me about it]." A monk then asked, "What about the school of Kanadeva?" Master [Yunmen] replied, "You belong to the lowest of all ninety-six kinds [of heretics] in India!"

---

[Master Yunmen] quoted the Heart Sutra: "There is no eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, nor mind." The Master said, "For you, there's some eyes that see; thus to say that there's none is impossible. Right now when you look, it cannot be said that there isn't any [eye]. Nevertheless, you see everything. What problem is there? What sense-object is there?"

Along with the systematization of its use in Chan teaching and practice, the koan challenges came to consist increasingly of sayings and anecdotes of masters who had died long ago. It appears that Yunmen was the first Chan master to make extensive, creative, and systematic use of such anecdotes, dicta, and conversations by earlier masters in order to challenge his students; his records contain hundreds of examples. This fact alone should secure him a prominent spot in the history of Chan and of koan use.

However, as mentioned and illustrated in the preceding section about the Master's teaching method, he used several interesting devices to bring home the point of such challenges and increase the listener's doubt. For instance, when the students are unable to come up with a response to the Master's challenge consisting of a saying and a question about it, he often intensifies their confusion and doubt by one or several substitute answer(s) which are even less approachable and permit no hold:

One day [Master Yunmen] said, "A man of old said, 'A phrase which is completely to the point is a stake to tether a donkey to for myriads of world-ages.' How can you know [how] to avoid this mistake?" In place of his listeners, Yunmen] said, "The bridge of Zhaozhou," the great [Maitreya] statue of Jiazhou.

Many of the Master's answers to questions by his students, particularly his famous "one-word answers" and other short answers, were so enigmatic and doubt-provoking that their later use in koan collections is not surprising.
[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen], "How about when the tree withers and the leaves fall?" The Master said, "The essence is manifest: 'golden (autumn) wind.'" (YML 550c20)

Apart from challenging his students in many ways, Yunmen also gave them interesting guidance as to how they should handle such challenges. One notices that instructions in koan collections by later masters have very similar forms.

If in your heart-mind there is all-encompassing, utter darkness64, then tomorrow morning and in the coming days you definitely will have some business to attend to. If you're of slow and wavering nature64, then turn for the time being to the teachings64 established by the old teachers, inquire East and inquire West,64 and see what there is to them. (YML 545b20-23)

---

Master [Yunmen] said, "The occasions64 of picking up the mallet, raising the whisk, or snapping the fingers -- come on, scrutinize them all! They too are not yet without any trace." (YML 558c15-16)

After citing some well-known koan, Yunmen says:

Try to get a firm hold on [the meaning of these sayings], reflecting upon them from all angles -- after days or years an entrance will by itself open up. This matter does not allow anyone to substitute for you; it is nothing but the very own mission of each person. If the old masters appear in the world, it is just to act as witness for you. (YML 547a24-27)

Much in the manner of later masters who made systematic use of koan, Yunmen not only challenges his students with awakened self-expressions of other masters but seeks to make them face their inability of producing a response, to intensify their concern, and to strengthen their doubt. Yuanwu also clearly saw such effects of the koan when he cited Yunmen’s words: "When it is brought up and you don’t fix your attention on it, we’re misleading each other; if you try to assess it by thinking, in what aeon will you awaken?"768 Occasionally, the hearer’s doubt is stimulated -- as in Zhaozhou’s famous negative answer to a monk’s question about the presence of Buddha-nature in a dog which is upheld by Buddhist doctrine769 -- by statements which contradict accepted doctrine:

[Master Yunmen] cited the verse of a patriarch:768 "Each separate entity (dharma) is originally a separate entity (dharma)." Master [Yunmen] said: "Walking, standing, sitting, and reclining are not originally a separate entity (dharma). Nothing whatsoever -- for example mountains, rivers, the great earth and your dressing and eating day and night -- is
originally a separate entity (dharma). What mistake is there?" Again, [Master Yunmen] said: "'A dharma is at root a dharma without dharma.'

He held up his staff and said: "This isn't 'original dharmalessness'."

(YML 555b5-6)

Numerous parts of Yunmen's question-answer exchanges were later used as koan in collections, for instance the following initial question by the Master which addresses man's central concern frontally:

[Master Yunmen] quoted [the words]: 'Medicine and disease condition each other. The whole great earth is medicine; what is your self?' Master [Yunmen] said, "When the cheap is faced, it is valuable." A monk said, "I request your teaching, Master." The Master clapped his hands once, held up his staff, and said: "Take this staff!" The monk received it and broke it in two. The Master remarked, "Though [you act] like this, you still deserve thirty blows."

(YML 557b25-28)

Yunmen's use of the koan and stress on doubt thus appear to have played a considerable role in the historical development of methods of Chan teaching and practice; however, their immediate intent was to lead his actual students to throw off the bonds of dualistic attachment and attain absolute freedom.
1. **BREAKING THROUGH DUALITY**

1. **JIJANG'S THREE LEVELS OF THE TWO TRUTHS**

   In his *Madhyamaka Kārikā* Nāgārjuna says:

   The Buddhas teach *dharma* (the doctrine) by resorting to two truths: One is the conventional or provisional truth, the other is the ultimate truth.

   Those who do not comprehend the distinction between these two truths do not comprehend the deep significance in the Buddha's teachings.

Murtri defines conventional truth (skt. *sāmrṛti satya*) as "truth so called; truth as conventionally believed in in common parlance." From the absolute standpoint, this truth is "totally false". According to Candrakīrti, *sāmrṛti* can be defined in three ways:

1. It is "that which covers up entirely the real nature of things and makes them appear otherwise. In this sense it is identical with *avidya*.

2. "It may also mean the mutual dependence of things -- their relativity. In this sense it is equated with phenomena, and is in direct contrast with the absolute which is by itself, unrelated."

3. Thirdly, it may mean "that which is of conventional nature [...], depending as it does on what is usually accepted by the common folk."

Ultimate truth (paramārtha satya), on the other hand, is "the knowledge of the real as it is without any distortion"; it is "beyond the scope of discursive thought, language and empirical activity" and is said to be 'the unutterable [...], the unthinkable, unteachable, etc.' In ultimate truth, both the difference of the subject (cognizing agent) and that of its objects is absent; it is "the unutterable ultimate experience wherein the real and the intellect cognizing it are non-different (advaya)." However, one should not mistake this for a simple identity:

For the Madhyamika not only difference but identity too is *avidya*; the real is neither one nor many, neither permanent nor momentary; neither subject (viṣṇā) nor object. These are relative to each other and are equally unreal.

This is certainly not the place for a broad discussion of the
complicated issues surrounding the two truths or of a philosophical description of nonduality. However, mention of one particular development in Chinese Buddhist thought may not only help in clarifying what the Chan masters had realized and tried to have their disciples realize; it may also advance a central argument for the view that the heart of Chan, nonduality, is no different from that of Buddhism in general. This development is Jizang's scheme of three levels of two truths.

In his *Essay on the Two Truths* (*Erđi yi* 二諦義) and in a chapter of his *Dacheng xuanlun* 大乘玄論 which discusses the two truths, Jizang presents his thought on the three levels of these truths which may be schematized as follows:

### Table 11: Schema of Jizang's three levels of two truths

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Truth so-called (conventional truth)</th>
<th>Argument:</th>
<th>Ultimate truth (genuine truth)</th>
<th>Argument:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First level:</strong></td>
<td>Ordinary people say that the truth is that things exist.</td>
<td>The Buddhas say that things are really empty; when they are said to exist, it is only in the mundane sense.</td>
<td>Separate entities (dharma) exist.</td>
<td>That is just conventional truth; in reality they are empty.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(simple 'realism' and its denial)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument:</td>
<td>Separate entities (dharma) exist.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Second level:</strong></td>
<td>Duality is adhered to: being and non-being, permanency and impermanence, life-death and nirvana, conventional and genuine, etc.</td>
<td>Acceptance of any duality is only truth so-called, while denial of both extremes constitutes the Middle Path.</td>
<td>Well, so there is illusion and reality, life-death and nirvana.</td>
<td>This still falls into the two extremes; in truth there is neither life-death nor nirvana, neither existence nor non-existence, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(simple duality and its denial)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument:</td>
<td>Well, so there is illusion and reality, life-death and nirvana.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Third level:</strong></td>
<td>Affirms that the two extremes either are or are not; either the duality of the second conventional level or the simple nonduality of the second absolute level are adhered to. This is a dualism of duality and nonduality.</td>
<td>Denies both duality (extremes) and simple nonduality (centrality); accepting or discarding the two extremes constitutes another dualism and thus belongs to conventional truth.</td>
<td>Okay. So there is duality for the deluded and nonduality for the sage.</td>
<td>Not so; this is still attachment to a dualism. True nonduality is non-dualistic duality; it is neither attached to two nor not-two.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(dualism of duality and nonduality and its denial)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument:</td>
<td>Okay. So there is duality for the deluded and nonduality for the sage.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This classification aims, just like Jizang's "three kinds of Middle Way", essentially at a clarification of the meaning of nonduality. It constitutes a dialectical process; each higher level of conventional truth seeks to subsume the theses and antitheses of the lower level into a synthetic argument, but from the standpoint of ultimate truth this argument is just another dualistic thesis. The side of ultimate truth is antithetical and functions like a medicine given in correspondence to a specific disease. In this sense, the arguments given on the side of paramārtha satya are not absolute but relative. This is not only due to the way in which Jizang's three levels are set up but also to the impossibility of conveying ultimate truth as such (see section F of this chapter).

Ultimate truth must, according to Jizang, be beyond the duality of 'ultimate' and 'conventional'; thus he speaks of the "Middle Way which clarifies the merging of the two truths". This "Middle" is neither genuine nor conventional. It is nothing other than nonduality in its proper sense, i.e. nonduality which is beyond duality and its opposite. As Master Yuanwu says:

That the ultimate [truth] and the conventional [truth] are not-two: just this is the highest meaning of the holy truths. (BYL 碧秀錄 case 1, T48[2003]140815)

Buddhist scriptures use many paradoxical expressions to describe this Middle Way, and modern authors also resort to paradox; DeMartino for instance calls it appropriately "nondualistic-dualism." Ultimate truth should thus not be regarded as an absolute which stands opposed to something relative. Rather, it must be beyond absoluteness and relativity. Mimaki and May noted that this "vanishing of the absolute" is "the very motor of the dialectic of the Prajñā-pāramitā and the Mādhyamika". A similar concern is apparent in so-called "philosophical" Daoism, particularly in Zhuangzi's second chapter. Could it be that the heart of the often-noted similarity of Chan Buddhism and these movements consist just in this "vanishing of the absolute", i.e., in going beyond any duality?
2. THE THREE LEVELS OF BAIZHANG

Countless passages in Chan literature document that nonduality forms the heart of Chan. As in Mādhyaṃkika, dialectical explanations are often used to explain its nature. The first pages of the Extensive Records of Baizhang (Baizhang guanglu 百丈廣錄) are a good example of this. They advance the central argument of the whole book in the form of a three-level progression.

On the first level, asceticism is seen as antidote to the diseases of greed and aversion (BZGL 百丈廣錄 ZZ119:82d13 ff.). However, though the monks may have gotten rid of greed and aversion they now rely on and dwell in the absence of greed and consider that correct (82d14-15). "If one no longer selfishly loves and grasps yet abides in not loving and not grasping and considers that correct, it is [but] the elementary good." On this first level, one pole of a duality is renounced in favor of the other; this is "weeding out the profane" (82d5) in favor of the holy and "abiding in the subdued mind" (83a2); but the holy and the subdued mind again constitute objects of attachment for a subject. This form of attachment is said to be a "result of meditation" 僧那果 (83a3). Such monks still hold on to some thing, method, or form; they are "fond of the raft and will not give it up" (83a2).

On the second level, this attachment to the "higher" or "better" pole of duality must be given up. However, another danger lurks right there: attachment to non-attachment. One must not only overcome selfish love and grasping but also attachment to the cessation of such love and grasping. "Once one does not [selfishly] love and grasp yet does not abide in not loving and grasping, it is the intermediate good" (83a3). But even this is still "half-word teaching" (83a4); though one avoids attachment to either the Buddha or his antagonist Mara (83a4) — and thus to one pole of a duality in favor of the other — one still harbors a subtle form of attachment which Baizhang calls "meditation disease" 僧那病 and "the bondage of bodhisattvas" (83a5). While monks on the first level still harbor attachment to some form, those on the second level cannot overcome their attachment to formlessness; they "fall into the realm of formlessness" (83b2).
They are, in other words, attached to nonduality and are proudly aware of their achievement.

On the third and last level, even these most subtle bonds are thrown off. "Once one does not abide in not loving and not grasping and additionally does not form an awareness of not abiding, it is the final good" (83a5-6). Here, one "avoids falling into the realm of formlessness, avoids succumbing to the meditation disease, and avoids falling for the vehicle of the bodhisattva or the state of the king of demons" (83a6-7). As all barriers of knowledge, station, and practice fall, one sees one's awakened nature (83a7-8). Awakening or Buddhahood thus cuts off both the folly of subtle knowledge (first stage) and that of extremely subtle knowledge (second stage). The person who manages to reach the third stage is likened to "a deer which leaps three times and gets out of the net" (83a10); he is called "an enlightened one beyond confinement who cannot be captured or bound by anything" (83a11).

In life he is not stayed by life, in death he is not obstructed by death, and though he is within the five components of living beings [which are matter, sensation, perception, volition, and discrimination], it is as if a door had opened; he is not obstructed by these components. He is free to go or to stay, going out and entering without any difficulty. If one can be like this, there is no question of stages or steps and of superior or inferior. Down to the bodies of ants -- if one can just be like this -- all is the land of pure marvel.

3. GOING BEYOND DUALITY

The instructions and exchanges of other great Chan masters such as Huangbo, Linji, Zhaozhou, Yunmen, Xuedou, or Yuanwu usually do not contain expositions of such a systematic kind, but even just a few quotes of their words will leave no doubt that the essence of their teaching is identical with that of Baizhang:

The profane attaches himself to objects; the practitioner attaches himself to mind. When both objects and mind are both forgotten: this is the genuine Buddhist teaching.

Understanding and not understanding are both wrong. I say this straight out. Anyone in the world is free to denounce me as he will.

---

31: Breaking through 164  YUNMEN'S TEACHING
For a follower of the Way with a clear eye, Mara and Buddha are both to battle.\(^4^0^4\) If you love the sacred and hate the secular, you float and sink in the sea of life-and-death.\(^4^1^4\)

Buddhas are born from non-dependence. If you awaken to non-dependence, there is no Buddha to be obtained, either. Insight such as this is true insight.\(^4^2^4\)

[Someone] asked [Master Zhaozhou], "How about when I have not brought anything with me?" The Master replied, "Put that down, too!" \(^4^3^4\)


[Master Yuanwu said,] "Though you be clean and naked, bare and purified, and totally without fault or worry, this is not yet the ultimate. In the end though, what is it? Look carefully at the following quote [by Xuedou in a poetic comment on words by Master Yunmen]: 'I snap my fingers: how lamentable is emptiness (sunyata)!" \(^4^5^4\)

One could continue to cite Chan literature ad libitum; it also contains various stories and topics which illustrate Baizhang's three-stage progression. We will cite just one famous story which uses formulations that are similar to Yunmen's:

Chan Master Qingyuan Weixin of Jizhou\(^4^6^4\) [said in a public instruction] in the [Dharma] Hall: "Thirty years ago, when I did not yet practice Chan, when I saw a mountain it was a mountain, and when I saw a river it was a river. As time went on I gained more familiarity with knowledge and found an entry; [at this stage,] when I saw a mountain, it wasn't a mountain, and when I saw a river, it wasn't a river. And right now, having some place to rest, like before when seeing a mountain it just is a mountain, and when seeing a river it just is a river. You all of the assembly [tell me]: are these three kinds of view identical or different?" \(^4^7^4\)

Yunmen's records feature some passages where similar phrases occur:

You monks must not think falsely; heaven is heaven, earth is earth, mountain is mountain, river is river, monk is monk, and layperson is layperson. \(^4^8^4\)

---

31: Breaking through
I used to say: "All sounds are the Buddha's voice, all forms are the Buddha's form, and the whole great earth is the Dharma body." It's completely in vain to see in Dharma any view. Now, when I see a staff I just call it 'staff', and when I see a house, I just call it 'house'.

(YML 559a15-17)

It is in this context of a dialectical progression beyond duality that Yunmen's and other masters' teaching will unfold its deep meaning. The movement "upward" (xiangshang 向上) aims at nothing other than the thorough realization of nonduality. Though Chan masters adopt different skillful means (fangbian 方便) depending on the requirements of their disciples, and though their character may favor harsh and demanding or lenient and understanding ways of dealing with people, the goal they pursue remains the same: to free their disciples from dualistic attachment of any kind. The movement "upward" or "beyond" duality may thus be said to be at the heart not only of Yunmen's teaching but of Chan teaching in general.

Iriya regarded this "upward" movement as a central characteristic of Yunmen's teaching and devoted a stimulating article to this theme. In contrast to the present writer who sees the last two quotes from the YML in the context of a movement beyond duality that can be observed in Chinese Buddhism in general and is very pronounced and radical in Chan Buddhism, Iriya tried to interpret these two passages and similar ones by Yunmen's co-disciple Xuansha in terms of biographical stages that reflect changes and developments of opinion; according to this view (Iriya speaks of a hypothesis), Yunmen taught different things in three successive stages of his teaching career and at times criticized views which he had held at earlier stages. While this is quite possible, the given passages hardly warrant such farreaching conclusions. Indeed, Chan masters often emphasized that they provide the medicine that suits their disciple's disease. Thus Master Linji said, "All that I teach is just temporary medicine to cure a corresponding illness. Indeed, no real Dharma exists?" Master Yunmen expressed the same view in more concrete terms:

The old masters couldn't help it: when they saw you run about wildly, they spoke to you of...
'supreme wisdom and nirvana' [and thus] were misleading you -- they drove in a stake and tied you to it. Again, when they saw that you didn't understand, they said to you: 'It's not supreme wisdom and nirvana.'

On the same line, Yuanwu comments Yunmen's statement that "medicine and disease correspond to each other" as follows:

"Medicine and disease correspond to each other." This is just an ordinary proposition. If you cling to 'being,' he speaks for you of 'nonbeing;' if you are attached to 'nonbeing,' he speaks for you of 'being.' If you are attached to 'neither being nor nonbeing,' he manifests the sixteen-foot golden body for you in a pile of crap, appearing and disappearing.

Additionally, there are numerous examples where a master gives contrary answers to identical questions. Such pronouncements suggest, as does Yunmen's public instruction number 17, that the context of the nature of nonduality may, in conjunction with dialectical schemes such as the ones mentioned above, prove to be more helpful for the understanding and analysis of such teaching than biographical hypotheses.

The following passage from the YML exemplifies the movement "upward" in a neat dialectical progression which is similar to Baizhang's three levels:

An "accomplished monk" such as Yunmen who when seeing a staff simply calls it a staff is one who has broken through duality:

The man without concern thus embodies the third stage of Baizhang; he has once and for all realized nonduality and thus attained imperturb-
able tranquillity.

If one can penetrate these two lines [by Xuedou: "In one there are many kinds; in two there is no duality"], [one realizes] the basis of the ancient saying, "Fused into one whole, as of old you see that mountains are mountains, rivers are rivers, long is long, short is short, heaven is heaven, and earth is earth." (BYL 录芳錄 case 2, T48 [2002] 142a16-19)

This "one whole" refers, as Xuedou's words clearly show, not to some unity which stands opposed to diversity but -- to use DeMartino's words again -- to nondualistic duality. Hence Yuanwu could say: "The myriad things return to one, but one is not needed either."816

If going beyond duality and realizing genuine nonduality is the ultimate goal of Chan, the drive beyond duality must express itself both in the content and method of teaching. In the Records of Yunmen we find a profusion of examples; indeed, the Master's constant exhortations to go beyond, to do one more step, to topple the ultimate, etc. are one of the most striking characteristics of his teaching. Several entire instructions are devoted to this theme,817 and many of the Master's his statements show the pattern of 'even if you got to some point, this is nothing yet and you must press on and on until duality is conclusively broken through'.

If you don't understand, do not pretend that you do. Even if you don't [pretend]: have you closely examined and do you really see? [But] even if you reached this stage you could still not even dream of a true monk. You wouldn't even meet one in a three-house hamlet!" (YML 550b1-3)

---------------

Even if you'd be able at once to distinguish [the whole universe, the world, the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings, all the Buddhas of the three periods, and the verbal teachings of the whole empire's masters] clearly right there [on your eyelashes], you'd still be a fellow out of luck, one who jumps into the shit pit without the slightest reason. If [such a chap] should ever visit my assembly of patched monks, I'd break his legs! (YML 551a1-3)

---------------

[Master Yunmen] mentioned the following words by Panshan: "When the light (subject) and the [illuminated] region (object) are both forgotten, what other thing could there be?" Master [Yunmen] said: "Even though he speaks like this, he's still only at the halfway stage. This is not yet the one road to breakthrough." A monk then asked: "What is the one road to breakthrough?" Master [Yunmen] said: "The Flower Peak of Tiantai, the stone bridge of Zhaozhou." (YML 554c12-14)
Caught in duality, one is unable to extricate oneself from "I" and "you", "this" and "that", "life" and "death", "suffering" and "awakening", "Buddha" and "Mara", etc. The thorough exposure of this predicament and the testing of claims to have overcome it have been called "the tooth and nail of the [Chan] school since time immemorial". Going beyond the predicament of duality is, according to Yunmen, Chan's "single most crucial point":

Even if you have attained freedom from being obstructed by anything you encounter and have managed to reach the emptiness of words, phrases, and all entities -- [the realization] that mountains, rivers, and the world are [but] words, and that words cannot be grasped either --, and [even if] you're wholly equipped with the so-called 'saṃdhī' and the 'sea of [original] nature', [your state] is still nothing but waves turning round and round without any wind. Even if you forget [dualistic] knowledge in awakening -- awakening is nothing other than Buddha-nature -- and are called 'a man without concern', you still must realize that there is a single most crucial point: going beyond!

This instruction brings out the radical nature of this movement "beyond" which is nothing other than the thorough realization of nonduality. As long as there is duality, everyone and everything is exposed to the Master's relentless attack. Yunmen even says he would "knock the Buddha dead with a single stroke and feed his body to the dogs" (560b18), and he calls this "a noble attempt to bring about peace on earth" (560b18-19) because a Buddha as antipode to a deluded being is just another object for a clinging subject. Chan master Zhaozhou says the same thing in a less offensive way:

Addressing the assembly, Master [Zhaozhou] said, "I don't like to hear the word 'Buddha'."

Breakthrough cannot be achieved by shifting inside this duality but solely by breaking through duality as such; this can only happen when, to say it in Yunmen's words, "the whole thing is brought up":

The Master once said: "Even if you realize directly that 'there is not the slightest trouble or affliction in the whole universe', this is still but a turning phrase. When you do not see any form, it is only half the issue. You must further realize that there is a time when the whole thing is brought up."
4. LETTING GO

Yunmen's words -- and of course also his teaching method\textsuperscript{827} -- emphasize that breaking through duality is not just an intellectual exercise but a total and existential affair. Duality must be radically and conclusively broken through. This means that any attachment whatsoever must be gotten rid of; one must "let go".

The twenty-eight Indian and six Chinese patriarchs as well as the empire's teachers are all on the tip of this staff. Even though you may be able to understand this and distinguish it with extraordinary clarity, you're only at the halfway stage. If you don't let go, you're nothing but wild fox spirits! (YKL 554a1-3)

"Letting go" means cutting the root of all attachment. According to the Vimalakirti Sutra,\textsuperscript{828} attachment \textit{(you ai 有愛)} is the source of the disease of sentient beings. In particular, "attachment to oneself is the exclusive source of this disease".\textsuperscript{829} The elimination of this root-attachment is the central objective of Buddhism:

Baizhang asked [Mazu], "What is the essential meaning of Buddhism?" [Master Mazu] said, "It consists exactly in your letting go of yourself and your life." (YKL 554a1-3)

Yunmen knows very well that it is most difficult to let go:

Once [Master Yunmen] said, "Bodhidharma came from the West. Why does he have trouble getting successors?" In place [of the silent audience] he said, "[Because of] letting go." (YKL 554b4-5)

The objective of the Chan path is the radical and ultimate overcoming of dualism, the dualism which consists of a restless subject both attached to itself and to other objects; this attachment can only be overcome in a radical way by letting go. In this context, letting go applies to the object-dependent and self-attached subject as well as to its objects; in other words, both subject and object must be let go of.

All worlds in the ten directions, the whole universe, and the great earth are [shattered to] a hundred pieces\textsuperscript{830} by one line [drawn] by a staff.\textsuperscript{831} [Even] if the Three Vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings and the coming of Bodhidharma from the West are let go of, it won't do. As long as you don't let go, you're not worth a single shout. (YKL 554c25-27)
Like any other object characterized by form and designation, even "Buddhahood" must be overcome:

[Master Yunmen] mentioned that [Master Liangjie of Dongshan] had said: "You must know that there is something which goes beyond Buddha." When a monk had asked: "What is it that goes beyond Buddha?", [Master Liangjie of Dongshan] had replied: "Non-Buddha." Master [Yunmen] said: "This is beyond any designation or form; that's why it is called 'Non-'." (YHL 558a8-10)

But not only Buddha but also the absence of Buddha can form an object of attachment; thus Yuanwu says:

Where there is Buddha, do not stay; if you stay there, your head will sprout horns. Where there is no Buddha, quickly run past; if you don't run past, the weeds [of ignorance] will grow ten foot high. (BYL Blue Cliff case 95, T48 218a19-20)

Letting go of "Buddha" and "no Buddha", of "is" and "is not", of "this" and "that", of subject and object is the ultimate objective of Chan. Because of the radical and irreversible nature of this breakthrough, Chan literature often resorts to the images of death and birth when discussing it. Yunmen's characterization of the Chan school is a case in point: "This [Chan] school is utterly free; it kills or gives life as the occasion requires." And Yunmen's fellow disciple under Master Xuefeng, Xuansha Shibei, remarked:

In the whole Chinese empire I have not yet seen a single person present the central matter of our religion. If there would have been someone who presented it, the people of the whole earth would have lost their lives. (YSL 2212b:207d3-4)

In a comment to a Yunmen-case of the Blue Cliff Records, Master Yuanwu describes the nondual view of one who has died the great death yet lives:

If only you do not see that there are buddhas above and sentient beings below, mountains, rivers, and a world outside, and seeing, hearing, sensation, and knowledge inside: then you are like one who has died the great death and is alive. (BYL Blue Cliff case 6, T48 214c8-10)

To create opportunities for their students to die the "great
death" which consists of "smashing the net [of duality]" by "at once abandoning gain and loss, 'is' and 'is not!'" and for the birth of man who is "completely free and at ease". The Chan masters use many means; foremost among them is the promotion of doubt. The teacher can only help the student to come to his own immediate and existential realization that inside the net of duality there is no way of escape; no method or practice can be held on to, and no object of faith can bring about release.

Attainment is attained instantly, with no time required, no practice, no realizing, no gain, no loss; throughout all time there is nothing other. (LJL 临济录 T47(1985)498b6-7)

Only smashing duality as such can break the vicious circle of attachment and repulsion, gain and loss, being and nonbeing, etc.

What are you seeking? Everywhere you're saying, 'There's something to practice, something to prove.' Make no mistake! Even if there were something to be obtained by practice, it would be nothing but birth-and-death karmas. You are saying, 'The six paramitas and the ten thousand [virtuous] actions are equally to be practices.' As I see it, all this is just making karma. Seeking Buddha and seeking Dharma is only making hell-karma. Seeking bodhisattvahood is also making karma, reading the sutras and studying the teachings is also making karma.

(LJL 临济录 T47(1985)499b8-11)
1. AUTHENTIC NONDUALITY

As mentioned before, Jizang's scheme of three levels of two truths is a dialectical exposition of nonduality; in essence, Jizang uses this device to show that genuine nonduality is beyond any duality, including second-level or meta-dualism. In his excellent analysis of the nature of authentic nondualism, DeMartino explains:

[Almong the many possible forms of dualism, there is also to be included the dichotomy between 'dualism-and-nondualism.' This latter form of duality has here been designated as second-level or "meta-" dualism. Any supposed nondualism which remained in such a meta-dualistic contrast to dualism would not, obviously, be a true nondualism.]

One of Jizang's foremost concerns was, as Hirai indicates, a sound conceptual exposition of true nondualism which consequently takes both the dual aspect of the non-dual (buer er 不二 and the non-dual aspect of the dual (er buer 二不) into account. Again, DeMartino makes essentially the same point:

Zen's authentic non-dualism even includes -- as it must, in order for it to be authentic -- the very "self-identity" or non-duality of 'nondualism-and-dualism.' Genuine non-dualism, consequently, is neither a simple non-dualism nor, of course, a simple dualism, but it is always what is here being called a nondualistic-dualism. (... The nondualistic-dualism of Zen Buddhism may thus be said to contain within it both the components of nondualism and dualism in what may be designated either as a "self-identity" or a mutual "negation-fulfilment" of the two.

According to DeMartino, the nonduality actualized in Zen Buddhism on the one hand negates both components of any dualism; from this point of view, it advances a double negation ("neither dualism nor nondualism"). On the other hand, it affirms both components of any dualism; from this perspective, it appears as a double affirmation ("both dualism and nondualism"). DeMartino's "negative" mode in which "non-dualism affirms itself by non-dualistically denying all dualism" can be seen as corresponding to Jizang's "nonduality of the dual" (er buer 二不), and DeMartino's "positive" mode where "non-dualism affirms itself by non-dualistically affirming all dualism" has its parallel in Jizang's "duality of the nondual"
Both of these aspects must be present in genuine nondualism; hence Chan Master Yuanwu says:

Though this matter has no gain and loss, the gain and loss are tremendous. Though there is no picking and choosing, when one gets here, one nonetheless needs to be equipped with the eye to pick and choose.

When Yunmen repeatedly says that "one will not do and two is not either", he makes the same point as the authors quoted above. To discard one pole of a duality and to choose the other one is but another form of dualism: "If you take up one and let one go, you're not yet an adept." Even bodhi and nirvana are "hitching posts for asses", and attachment to some simple identity is no lesser delusion than attachment to its opposite:

If you say 'this very mind is Buddha', you provisionally accept the slave as master and life-death (samsara) as nirvana. This is precisely like cutting off one's head in pursuit of life.

In an interesting public instruction, Yunmen describes man's dualistic delusion on two levels. On each of these two levels, the disease of dualism manifests itself in two forms; the similarity to the first two levels of Jizang's and Baizhang's schemes (see above, p. 160 ff.) is noteworthy. Yunmen's diseases of the first level are the following:

When the light has not broken through, there are two kinds of disease: the first is when nothing is clarified and there are objects (things) facing you. The second is when, having been able to pierce through to the emptiness of all separate entities (dharmas), it seems as if it were in a hidden way an object (thing). This, too, happens when the light has not broken through.

These first two diseases may form the "disease of sentient beings" which Yunmen mentions in another short public instruction. On the second level, there are again two kinds of disease:

The first is when, while having been able to reach the Dharma body, one has not forgotten subjective views due to one's attachment to separate things (dharmas, objects), and one still stagnates at the Dharma body's borderline. The second is when, though one has managed to penetrate through to the Dharma body, letting go of it is not possible.
These diseases of the second degree could correspond to what Yunmen calls "the disease of the wisdom-learning bodhisattva." Though these four diseases may be interpreted in various ways, it is clear that in all of them dualistic attachment is still present. They are all within the problematic state where the "I" is attached to itself as opposed to the "other", where "mine" is set against "yours", "is" against "is not", "this" against "that", "life" against "death", etc. Yuanwu says in his introduction to a famous Yunmen case of the Blue Cliff Records:

Buddhas and sentient beings: fundamentally they are not different. Mountains, rivers, and one's own self: how could there be any distinction? Why then is it all divided into two sides?

(ETYL 158b2-31 case 60, T48(2003)192b2-3)

Only when the whole dualistic matrix -- where mind is set against and attached to objects (including itself) -- is broken through can genuine nondualistic-duality obtain.

[Master Yunmen] quoted a saying by the Third Patriarch: "When mind does not arise, the myriad things have no fault." Master [Yunmen] said: "Just in this [lies] awakening."

(ETYL 556c23-24)

The so-called "Great Death" and the "Great Rebirth" are two aspects of this breakthrough:

Accordingly, since genuine nondualistic-duality is the negation-fulfillment (or Great Death-Great Rebirth) both of simple dualism and of simple nondualism, its Self-affirmation, once again, is its Self-negation; its Self-negation is its Self-affirmation. For this reason it can be expressed either "negatively" as the 'Great Death' or "positively" as the 'Great Rebirth'.

With the "Great Death" of the ordinary "I" and its object-world and their "Great Rebirth", Buddhahood is actualized:

[Master Yunmen] cited Xuefeng's words: "The whole world is you. I always thought that there is further being apart from that." Master [Yunmen] said: "Haven't you read that the Surangama sutra says, "Sentient beings are perverted; they delude themselves and chase after things. If they can turn into things, they are identical with the Buddha."

(ETYL 558b15-17)
Obviously, Yunmen does not propagate a simple identity or unity which denies any differentiation; rather, genuine nonduality is characterized by not being separate from duality. Nondualistic-duality stands both outside and inside duality:

[F]rom the "positive" -- or Great Re-Birth -- perspective of nondualistic-dualism, nonduality is to be found right in duality -- and not dualistically separated from duality.

After contrasting man's ordinary dualistic "I" with his awakened nondualistic Self, DeMartino furnishes a concise description of genuine nondualism:

W]hereas for the ordinary self duality is a strictly dualistic duality in which one form always remains finally differentiated from the other form, for man's True Self, duality is a free-flowing, non-dualistic-duality in which there is no obstruction between one form and another form. [...] Accordingly, in the nondualistic-duality of man's true Self-affirmation, self is self and other is other, and yet other is self and self is other. [...] [In thoroughgoing non-dualism it is not alone sufficient that A is B and B is A. Rather, A is B and B is A, and yet A is A and B is B.]

This view of nonduality is supported and illustrated by many passages in Chan literature and other Buddhist texts. A classic formulation from the Diamond Scripture is quoted in an exchange of Yunmen with one of his disciples:

Master [Yunmen] asked a monk, "Are you reading the Diamond Scripture?" The monk affirmed. [Quoting this scripture] the Master said, "All things (dharmas) are no-things (no-dharmas), and just these are called all things." (YHL 572b28-29)

In a final comment to a conversation between a fellow Chan master and a disciple, Yunmen uses words which have exactly the same pattern:

[Master Yunmen] cited [Master Chuyuan of] Shihuang's words: "You must know that there is a phrase of special transmission outside the scriptural tradition." A monk asked: "What is this phrase of special transmission outside the scriptural tradition?" [Master Chuyuan of Shihuang replied: "A non-phrase."] Master [Yunmen] said: "Just a non-phrase is a phrase." (YHL 558a5-7)

The Records of Yunmen contain a profusion of pertinent examples; the following expressions of nondualism are but a choice of passages which have the Master's staff as subject. Taking the staff as "A", these passages ought to illustrate the essence of genuine nondualism, i.e.,
that "A is B and B is A, and yet A is A and B is B."  

Once the Master held up his staff and said: "The whole universe, the world, killing and giving life: all is in [this staff] here."  

(YML 558c17)

Once the Master said, "I used to say that "all sounds are the Buddha's voice, all forms are the Buddha's forms, and the whole world is the Dharma body." It's completely useless to produce any views in Buddhist teaching. Now, when I see a staff, I just call it 'staff'; when I see a house, I just call it 'house'.  

(YML 559a15-17)

The Master brought up [the saying]: "All worthies without exception make use of the teaching of wuwei, yet they do have differentiation." The Master said, "This staff is not the teaching of wuwei; nothing whatsoever is the teaching of wuwei."

(YML 559a22-23)

The Master once held up his staff and mentioned the [Buddhist teaching which says: "The ordinary person in all sincerity says that this exists, [those of] the two Vehicles say in their explanations that it doesn't exist, the pratyekabuddhas say it exists as an illusion, and the bodhisattvas realize that its very essence is emptiness." Then [Master Yunmen] said: "When an accomplished monk sees this staff, he just calls it a staff; when he walks, he just walks, and when he sits he just sits. In all of this he cannot be stirred."  

(YML 555c3-6)

[Master Yunmen] quoted Dharma teacher [Seng] Zhao's words: "The dharmas (separate entities) are not different. One must not stretch the duck's [legs] and shorten the crane's, level the peaks and fill up the valleys, and then think that they are no different!" Master [Yunmen] said, "The long is by nature long, the short by nature short." Again, the Master said: "Each entity is settled in its position; the mundane aspect is permanent." Then he held up his staff and said, "The staff isn't a permanent entity."

(YML 560b4-7)

The Master once held up his staff and showed it to the assembly with the words: "This staff has turned into a dragon and has swallowed the whole universe. Mountains, rivers, and the whole world -- where are they to be found?"

(YML 558c23-25)

When Master [Yunmen] once saw a monk reading a scripture he said, "To read scriptures, one must be equipped with the scripture-reading-eye. The lantern, the pillar, and the entire Buddhist canon lack nothing." Holding up his staff, he continued, "The entire Buddhist canon is on the tip of this staff."

(YML 572c3-5)

Since the Master was an accomplished man who could freely express the nondualistic-duality which he had realized, we find many other expressions of nonduality in the Master's records. Instead of turning once more to the various modes of verbal and nonverbal
expression, two major modes of verbal expression which were described by DeMartino\(^{676}\) will serve as illustration of how the structure of genuine nondualism is reflected in its expression. These two modes of verbal expression, the "negative" and the "positive", are often found in Chan texts. As mentioned above, these modes reflect the essence of nondualism either in the form of a double negation ("neither dualism nor nondualism") or in the form of a double affirmation ("both dualism and nondualism").\(^{677}\) Yunmen's saying "One will not do, and two is not it either"\(^{678}\) may serve as an example of the "negative" mode, and the "positive" mode can be exemplified by a statement cited by Yunmen: "An old man said, 'In the realm of nondualism there is not the slightest obstacle between self and other.'"\(^{679}\) In the following passage both modes appear side by side:

\[\text{Master Yunmen} \] cited [the phrase]: "Any true reality contains everything." The Master said, "What do you call mountains, rivers, and the world?" He further remarked, "All entities as such are characterised by emptiness. They neither arise nor disappear and are neither defiled nor pure."\(^{YHL 558b21-22}\)

Though their grammatical form is negative, pronouncements such as "True emptiness does not destroy being: true emptiness does not differ from form" (YML 554a21) also belong to the "positive" mode. The last statement is congruent with the general Buddhist assertion that "Nirvana [or non-dualism] is samsara [or dualism] and samsara is nirvana."\(^{680}\) DeMartino cautions:

\[\text{This does not mean that duality as a simple, unresolved duality is nirvana. Nirvana is not that dualism in which each component is always only itself and never the other. It rather means that dualism "is nirvana" only when it is a resolved, non-dualistic dualism, in which each component, while it is itself, is also the other.}\(^{681}\)

The context of both sentences quoted above shows that the Master is very aware of this:

\[\text{The Master once said:}^{681} \text{"True emptiness does not destroy being, and true emptiness does not differ from form." A monk asked: "What is true emptiness?" The Master answered: "Do you hear the sound of the bell?" The monk replied: "That's the sound of the bell." The Master cried: "You'll never see it even in a dream!"}\(^{681}\)\(^{YML 554a21-23}\)

33: Nonduality

178

YUNMEN'S TEACHING
[Yunmen] asked a monk, "An old man said, 'In the realm of nondualism there is not the slightest obstacle between self and other.' What about Japan and Korea in this context?"

The monk said, "They are not different." The Master remarked, "You go to hell." (YML 570c26-27)

Many of the Master's instructions and conversations make the same point. To quote just one more example:

The Master once said: "The lantern is your self. [Yet] when you hold your bowl and eat your food, the food is not your self." Some monk asked: "How about when food is my self?" The Master cried: "You wild fox spirit! Country bumpkin!" He added: "Come, come! Isn't it you who said that the food is your self?" The monk affirmed. The Master exclaimed: "In the [nonexistent] year of the donkey you'll see it in a dream, you yoke!" (YML 554a16-20)

These passages make it even clearer that one must thoroughly realize nonduality; short of this actualization, nondualism is not genuine. In other words, genuine nondualism can only be actualized nondualism; thus it is said, "A picture of a cake cannot satisfy hunger." Mere intellectual understanding and philosophical eloquence are unmasked and criticized by the Master:

The twenty-eight Indian and six Chinese patriarchs as well as the empire's teachers are all on the tip of this staff. Even though you may be able to understand this and distinguish it with extraordinary clarity, you're only at the halfway stage. If you don't let go, you're nothing but wild fox spirits! (YML 554a1-3)

Just like the entire Buddhist canon and all Chan patriarchs are on the tip of the Master's staff, one of his gestures or words or even the absence of these are embodiments and expressions of genuine nondualism. The Master does not tire to test his disciples for their realization of nondualism; the accomplished one ought to be able to produce a spontaneous, non-mediated expression. This kind of immediacy is grounded in the thorough actualization of nondualism.

According to my view there is no Buddha, no sentient being, no past, no present. Attainment is attained instantly, with no time required, no practice, no realizing, no gain, no loss; throughout all time there is no other Dharma. Even though there were a Dharma that surpassed this, I say to you that it would be like a dream, like a phantom. This is all I teach. (LJL 571b17)

Genuine nondualism is characterized by this kind of immediacy; in this
sense, immediacy is but another word for the realization described by Huayan Buddhism 華嚴宗 where there is neither any hindrance between phenomenon and phenomenon nor between noumenon and phenomenon.889 Or, to use another formulation by DeMartino:

[In the authentic non-duality or nondualistic-duality of man's True Self, the seemingly dualistic components are never merely dualistic: the "I" is never simply "I", the other never simply "other".888]

This is where "Mr. Zhang drinks wine and Mr. Li gets drunk."891 To conclude, here is Master Yuanwu's appraisal of the realization needed in order to understand Master Yunmen's intention:

But tell me, what was Yunmen's intention? Just make mind and objects a single thusness; then good and bad, right and wrong, won't be able to shake you. Then it will be all right whether you say "there is" or "there isn't"; then it will be alright whether you have mental activity or you don't. When you get here, each and every clap of the hands is a decree.

(BVL 碧巖録 case 83, T48[2003]209a13-15)892

2. THE TRUE SELF

When the dualistic matrix is broken through, the root of attachment is cut and for the first time freedom prevails. Yuanwu introduces the case on "Vimalakirti's Gate of Nonduality" with the following words:

Though you say "It is," there is nothing which "is" can affirm. Though you say "It is not," there is nothing that "is not" can negate. When "is" and "is not" are left behind, and gain and loss are forgotten, then you are clean and naked, free and at ease.

(BVL 碧巖録 case 84, T48[2003]209b16-17)893

The "subject" enjoying this freedom is man's true or formless self. Hisamatsu characterizes it as follows:

This Self is liberated precisely from the ordinary self that stands in dualistic opposition to the "other." For although this Self is called Self, it is no longer discriminated from the other self; it is a Self which is beyond the dualism of self-and-other.894

This true or formless self is described as follows in the Diamond Sutra:

This person has no form of "I," of "other," of "sentient being," or of "accomplished one." Why? The form of "I" is no-form, and so are the forms of "other," "sentient being," and
"accomplished one." How come? [Those who] have left behind each and every form are called "buddhas" (awakened ones).

Since the formless Self is "free from all forms," it is "free to take on all forms." Being genuinely non-dual, man's True Self "inherently includes its own negation of itself as one dimension of its affirmation of itself." Hence it is often referred to by expressions that combine negation and affirmation, for example "Selfless-Self," "Mindless-Mind," or "Formless-Form." Chan masters see this awakened self also in those who have not yet awakened to it; they often point it out with an intensity that leaves no doubt that this is their central concern. Master Linji is one of the most eloquent proponents:

The Master took the high seat in the Hall. He said: "On your lump of red flesh is a true man without rank who is always going in and out of the face of every one of you. Those who have not yet proved him, look, look!"

This physical body of yours composed of the four great elements can neither expound the Dharma nor listen to it; your spleen and stomach, liver and gallbladder can neither expound the Dharma nor listen to it; the empty sky can neither expound the Dharma nor listen to it. Then just what can expound the Dharma and listen to it? This very you standing distinctly before me without any form, shining alone -- this can expound the Dharma and listen to it! Understand it this way, and you are not different from the Patriarch-Buddha.

If you want to freely live or die, go or stay, to take off or put on [your clothes], then right now recognize the man who is listening to my discourse. He is without form, without characteristics, without root, without source, and without any dwelling place, yet is brisk and lively. As for all his manifold responsive activities, the place where they are carried on is, in fact, no-place. Therefore, when you look for him, he retreats farther and farther; when you seek him, he turns more and more the other way: this is called the 'Mystery'.

When Yunmen says: "Each and every person originally has the radiant light, but when you look at it, you don’t see it: dark and obscure!", he also points to the True Self. Yuanwu says about this:

What is it that the six senses [of the human being] are brimming with? It's just this one, empty and bright, solid and quiescent. No need to go to heaven to look for it, and no need to seek it from someone else. Its spontaneous and perpetual light is perfectly manifest: right here it towers up, a mile-high wall, beyond verbal appellation and mental sense.
This is the treasure of which Yunmen says: "Within there is a treasure, hidden inside a mountain of form." In his comment on Yunmen's word, Yuanwu cites an old statement:

The spiritual light shines alone, far transcending the senses; its essence is manifest, real and eternal. It is not captured in letters. The nature of mind has no defilement; it is originally of itself perfect and complete. Just rid yourself of the bonds of delusion and you are a Buddha who has awakened to suchness.

(BYL 碧巖錄 case 62, T48(20031194b25-27)

Though it is his most intimate treasure and all-pervading light, ordinary man is ignorant of it; in his delusion, he chases after objects, base and lofty. But true intimacy can only be achieved when the matrix of seeking subject and sought object is radically overcome.

Master [Yunmen] went to Caoshan. [Cao]shan addressed the assembly saying, "Wherever you are, you do nothing but hold on to schemes and rules. Why don't you, [Yunmen], say a turning word for them so as to make them free of doubt?"
Master [Yunmen] asked, "Regarding the most intimate: why is it that one does not know of its existence?" [Cao]shan replied, "Just because it is the most intimate." Master [Yunmen] said, "How can one be truly intimate with this man?" [Cao]shan answered, "By not turning towards the most intimate." Master [Yunmen] asked, "If one doesn't turn towards the most intimate, can one attain true intimacy?" [Cao]shan said, "Just then one is truly intimate." Master [Yunmen] agreed, "Yes! Yes!"

However, speaking about the True Self is one thing, and actually realizing it another. Master Yunmen leaves no doubt as to what is important:

"Old masters everywhere say, 'You must know that there is the single thing which can neither be heard nor seen.' With such words they fool children of good families. Alone inside their three-room temples, they delude themselves; not even in a dream have they ever seen the significance of [the teaching] of our original teacher's school! For what purpose do they consume the alms of the faithful? On the last day of their life, every one of them will have to reimburse those [almagivers]? [As to you:] However much you jump around: just you, each and every one of you, must make the effort by yourself! Take care!"

(YHL 574a21-25)

With the Great Death of subject and object, the awakening to the True Self is realized.
The Master said, "The whole universe is this house. How about the master of the house?"
[The monk] had no answer. The Master said, "Ask me, I'll tell you." The monk asked, and the Master replied, "He's dead." (YML 567c7-9)

With this death, the True Self unfolds its original freedom; this freedom was expressed in a concise manner by Linji:

Sometimes I take away the subject without taking away the objects; sometimes I take away the objects without taking away the subject; sometimes I take away both subject and object; and sometimes I take away neither subject nor object. (LJL 713c7-8)

In commenting this passage, DeMartino explains:

Herein it is to be observed once more that genuine non-dualism may either deny both components of dualism, e.g., 'neither subject nor object,' or it may affirm both components of dualism, e.g. 'both subject and object.' Moreover, whether it be the non-dualistic double negation or double affirmation of dualism, neither component of the dualism is ever reduced to the other. Subject remains subject ('I deny the object but do not deny the subject'); and object remains object ('I deny the subject but do not deny the object'). To present this in schematic form, given a dualism, "A and B," nondualistic-duality may freely assert either "A and not B," "B and not A," "neither A nor B," or "both A and B." Thus one can say about the True Self that "self is self and other is other, and yet other is self and self is other." This is the freedom of the True Self or True Man whose actualization forms the heart of Chan.

Zen is a religion of Self-liberation in which man by awakening to his Formless Self, which is the true nature of himself, thereby attains emancipation from all forms and all things.

3. FREEDOM

Since Zen is a religion of Self-liberation, it is not the Master who can give freedom to his disciples; rather, they must realize it for and by themselves.

[Someone] asked [Master Yunmen]: "What is utter freedom?" The Master said, "You may have a go!" (YML 546b27)

Only the man who has broken through all dualistic bonds and has avoided falling into the "deep pit of liberation" is truly free. He "has gone all the way, has attained great emancipation, and neces-
sarily leads a life apart [from 'is' and 'is not']."' Dependent upon nothing," he is the "mother of all buddhas." Such an awakened one has "gained true insight; he is not affected by birth-and-death but freely goes or stays." This last statement by Linji is an expression of both the negative "freedom from" and the positive "freedom to." Hisamatsu explains this double freedom as follows:

Zen may thus be said to have two aspects: one is the aspect of the genuine emptiness of the True Self which, unbounded by any form, is completely free of all forms; the other is the aspect of the wondrous working of the True Self, which, unbound by any form, is completely free to actualize all forms.

Absolutely free, this man is no more bound to anything, not even to Buddha and Dharma. His insight is described as follows:

I make no choice between the secular and the sacred without, nor do I stay in the absolute state within; I see penetratingly, and am free of all doubt.

Compared to this man, even "a bodhisattva who's attained the completed mind of the tenth stage will be like a mere hireling." Master Linji characterizes such a free man as follows:

Merely according with circumstances as they are [the True Man of the Way] makes use of his past karma; accepting things as they come he puts on his clothes; when he wants to walk he walks, when he wants to sit he sits; he never has a single thought of seeking Buddhabood.

Instead of being turned around by objects he uses them freely; he is no more "stuck in duality." Having attained "great freedom" and having found the "great gate of emancipation," he has thrown off all shackles. Neither subjective mind nor any objects shackle him any more, and all problems of dualism cease to trouble him:

[Master Yunmen] quoted a saying by the Third Patriarch: "When mind does not arise, the myriad things have no fault." Master [Yunmen] said: "Just in this [lies] awakening." Then he raised his staff and added: "What fault is there in the whole universe?"

The absolute freedom of the nondualistic Self has its root in this awakening. In the context of self and other, this freedom means:
Accordingly, in the nondualistic-duality of man's true Self-affirmation, self is self and other is other, and yet other is self and self is other. So it is that man's True Self may freely assert in total affirmation of itself, "I am I" and "You are you," and yet "You are I and I am you."*

With the awakening of the True Self, all dualistic barriers fall:

One of the heretics asked [Kanadeva], "Who is in the tower ringing the bell?" Kanadeva said, "A heavenly being (deva)." The heretic inquired, "Who is the heavenly being?" Kanadeva said, "I." The heretic asked, "Who is 'I'?" Kanadeva said, "I am you." The heretic said, "Who is 'you'?" Kanadeva said, "You are a dog." The heretic said, "Who is the dog?" Kanadeva said, "The dog is you." [YML 572b23-25]

When there are no more dualistic barriers, one can see the entire Buddhist teaching in a piece of wood or realize everything through knowing a staff:

Master [Yunmen] asked a monk, "Are you going to gather firewood today?" The monk said, "Yes." The master said, "An ancient said, 'When it doesn't see a single object, it's your very eyeball.' Then, when [the monks] were gathering firewood, [Master Yunmen] threw down a piece of wood and said, 'The whole Buddhist canon explains just this.'" [YML 572b23-25]

An Ancient said, "If you know this staff, your life's study is finished." [YML 572b23-25]

Those who realize this freedom can produce expressions of genuine nondualism such as:

At a donated meal, the Master took one bite of a sesame-bun and said, "I bit in Indra's nose. Indra is in agony!" Then he pointed with his staff [to the monks' feet] and said: "[Indra] is under your feet, transformed into old Shakyamuni! Do you see? Do you see?" [YML 556a8-10]

Master [Yunmen] held up his fly-whisk and said, "This is the perfect light, it is form without form." [YML 556a8]


Naturally, in such a man there is no trace of holiness to be found: Thus Yunmen said: "My brothers, if there is one who has attained it,
he passes his days in conformity with the ordinary." However, "conformity with the ordinary" is not opposed to holiness; rather, "at this point there is not even the slightest trace of the ordinary nor is there the slightest trace of the holy." Consequently, this freedom ought to show itself regardless of the circumstances; thus Yunmen’s challenge to his students:

Here’s my question to you: is there, [in all actions] during the twelve periods [of the day] -- walking, standing, sitting, lying, shitting, pissing -- [and everywhere including] the vermin’s market in the privy and the lined-up mutton traded at market stalls, a sense of 'transcending buddhas and going beyond patriarchs'? Those who are able to tell me, come forward!

(YHL 551a19-23)

Describing awakened man, Yunmen says, "When an accomplished monk sees this staff, he just calls it a staff; when he walks, he just walks, and when he sits he just sits. In all of this he cannot be stirred." For such a man, "heaven is heaven, earth is earth, mountain is mountain, river is river, monk is monk, and layperson is layperson." Yuanwu’s explanation of this is one of the most beautiful descriptions of an accomplished man:

An adept like this can’t be fooled at all -- as before, mountains are mountains and rivers are rivers. He is without artifice and without clinging thoughts. He is like the sun and moon moving through the sky without ever stopping and without saying, "I have so many names and forms." He is like the sky everywhere covering, like the earth everywhere supporting: since they have no mind, they bring up nurture myriad beings without saying, "I have so many accomplishments." Since sky and earth are mindless, they last forever -- what has mind has limits. A person who has attained the Path is like this too. In the midst of no activity, he carries out his activities, accepting all unfavorable and favorable circumstances with a compassionate heart. (BYL 碧巖錄 case 80, T4 日 [20031206b26-c4])

Yunmen’s paradoxical characterization of awakened man ought to be seen in this context:

However, when someone gets it, he speaks fire yet cannot burn his mouth. He can discuss the matter all day long without it ever touching his lips and teeth and without uttering a single word. [Though] he wears a robe all day long and eats, he never touches a single grain of rice nor does he get in contact with a single thread. (YHL 545c23-546a2)

Rather than being apart from phenomena, this man is "free in the midst of phenomena; whatever he picks up, there’s nothing that’s not it."
Or, in the words of Linji:

Just make yourself master of every situation, and wherever you stand is the true place. No matter what circumstances come they cannot dislodge you. Even though you bear the remaining influences of past delusions or the karmas from having committed the five heinous crimes, these of themselves become the ocean of emancipation.

Genuine "going beyond" does of course not stop, in the imagery of one version of the Ten Oxherding Pictures, at the emptiness of "Ox and man both gone out of sight" (title of the eighth picture) nor even at "Returning to the origin, back to the source" (ninth picture) but goes on to "Entering the city with bliss-bestowing hands." Suzuki translates a poem on this ultimate stage as follows:

Even beyond the ultimate limits there extends a passageway, Whereby he comes back among the six realms of existence; Every worldly affair is a Buddhist work, And wherever he goes he finds his home; Like a gem he stands out even in the mud, Like pure gold he shines even in the furnace; Along the endless road [of birth and death] he walks sufficient unto himself, In whatever associations he is found he moves leisurely unattached.

Case forty-four of the Blue Cliff Record takes up the same theme:

Heshan imparted some words, saying, "Cultivating study is called 'learning.' Cutting off study is called 'nearness.' Going beyond these two is to be considered real going beyond." A monk came forward and asked, "What is 'real going beyond'?" Shan said, "Knowing how to beat the drum." Again [the monk] asked, "What is the ultimate truth?" Shan said, "Knowing how to beat the drum." [The monk] went on asking, "I'm not asking about 'Just mind is Buddha.' What is 'Neither mind nor Buddha'?" Shan said, "Knowing how to beat the drum."

Again, [the monk] asked, "When a man who has gone beyond comes, how do you receive him?" Shan said, "Knowing how to beat the drum." (BLC 碧巖錄 case 44, T48[2003]183c1-183a1)

Master Yunmen took this ultimate step back into the practical and ordinary world of objects, and the following passage is one last example of an expression of the absolute freedom which he had realized:

When [Master] [Yunmen] went to see Tiantong, [Tian]tong said, "Have you managed to settle it?" Master [Yunmen] asked back, "What are you saying, Reverend?" [Tian]tong said, "If you don't understand, you're involved in all that is in front of you. Master [Yunmen] said, "If you do understand, you're involved in all that is in front of you." (BLC 碧巖錄 case 44, T48[2003]183c1-183a1)
CHAPTER IV
SELECTED INSTRUCTIONS

INTRODUCTION

In this chapter, annotated translations of twenty formal and informal instructions by the Master are presented in the order in which they appear in the Records of Yunmen. Bits and pieces of some of these instructions were already presented in a more interpretive and descriptive context in the previous chapter; in this chapter, they are integrally translated to facilitate a more coherent view of the style and content of Master Yunmen’s public instructions. Since most longer instructions by the Master consist of coherent and uninterrupted discourse, they are important sources of insight into his teaching; they permit a much broader view of Yunmen’s teaching and teaching method than the short and enigmatic question-answer exchanges for which Yunmen was rightly famous and which abound in Chinese koan collections.

The great number of the Master’s formal and informal instructions necessitated selection; in principle, long and coherent instructions were preferred to short and interrupted ones. Except for the longest instruction whose entire translation was included in the previous chapter, this chapter contains translations of all long instructions by the Master; additionally, a number of interesting shorter instructions are included. Some other shorter instructions were already translated in chapter III.

The numbers of the instructions do of course not appear in the original text. The location of the original text is indicated for each instruction by page number, page section, and line number of the Taishō edition. The translation is kept as literal as possible; when for the sake of readability this principle was temporarily suspended, a literal version is included in the footnotes. The footnotes do in general not seek to interpret the content of the Master’s words but should primarily furnish the concrete philological information on which the translation is based. Most notes to these translations aim at making the reasons for choosing a certain rendering transparent.
Having taken the teacher's seat [for a formal discourse] the Master remained silent for a long time [and then] said:

"The occasion of teaching is without any doubt difficult to live up to and to elucidate. If even a perfect match in a single word is gone too far, how much more so is loquaciousness? What could be added to this?

Though each of the vehicles of [Buddhist] teaching has its specific sphere -- the Vinaya [collection] pertains to the study of monastic discipline, the Sutra [collection] to the study of meditative concentration, and the Treatise [collection] to the study of Wisdom -- the Five Vehicles of the Tripitaka and the Eight Teachings of the Five Periods all have a common source, namely, the One Vehicle, perfect and sudden. It is extremely difficult to understand. [Even if] you would right now understand, you'd still be as different from an accomplished monk as earth is from heaven.

When you join an accomplished monk's assembly and he manifests his ability in a phrase, you'll ponder in vain. The Chan teaching keeps banging away at the thousand differences and myriad distinctions. Wishing to progress, you've up to now gone astray. You were searching for other people's tongues and lost your way. How should you go about applying yourselves to the above-mentioned matter [of the source of all Buddhist teaching]? Did you so far attain it by talking in [this Dharma Hall] here about 'perfect' and 'sudden'? Did you get it [by being] here or there? You had better not misunderstand! You must not hear me talk this way and then choose and evaluate by turning toward 'not perfect' and 'not sudden'.

In [this Dharma Hall] here there must be some [able] man! Don't rely on your master's words, words that resemble his, or rules! Wherever you go, you show what's inside of you. [So far,] you [wrongly] took this to be self-understanding. Don't get me wrong! What's the matter right now? Try settling this, face to the assembly!
The Master said, "Don’t say that I’m deceiving you today! I simply cannot get around provoking confusion in front of you. If by chance I should be observed by a clear-sighted man, what a laughingstock I’d be! But right now this cannot be avoided.

Now let me ask you all: What has so far been the matter with you? What do you lack? If I say to you that nothing’s the matter, I have already misled you. You have to attain this level of realization! And don’t take advantage of your mouth for haphazard questioning. If in your heart-mind there is all-encompassing, utter darkness, then tomorrow morning and in the coming days you definitely will have some business to attend to. If you’re of slow and wavering nature, then turn for the time being to the teachings established by the old teachers, inquire East and inquire West, and see what there is to them.

Do you want to attain understanding? All conditions and your very form since innumerable aeons a thick mass of illusion. In one lifetime you hear someone talk about [the Dharma]; you give rise to a doubting heart-mind, ask about Buddha and about Dharma, about transcendence and immanence, seek understanding, and turn towards [things which] have no connection. If [even] directing one’s heart-mind [towards something] is an error, how much more is talking [about it]? Would, by any chance, the unintended heart-mind be it? Why, is anything the matter? Take care of yourselves!

The Master said, "I have no choice in this matter; if I say to you that right now nothing is the matter, I am already misleading you. Moreover, if you want to make progress and seek understanding by looking for words and chasing after phrases, and if you set up a broad array of questions and inquiries by means of a thousand differences and myriad distinctions, you’ll [just] get tired and gain
a glib tongue while deviating further and further from the Way. What rest could you find [in this pursuit]?

If this matter could simply be found in words -- and the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings certainly do not lack words, do they? -- then why would one speak of a 'transmission outside the [scriptural] teachings'? If wisdom were to result from the activity of studying interpretations, it would merely be like that of the saints of the ten stages who, though explaining the Dharma like clouds and rain, were still severely reprimanded [by the Buddha] because they saw their self-nature as if separated [from it] by a veil of gauze.

Hence we know that any kind of 'having heart-mind' is as far away [from this matter] as the sky from the earth.

However, when someone got it, he speaks fire yet cannot burn his mouth. He can discuss the matter all day long without it ever touching his lips and teeth and without uttering a single word. [Though] he wears a robe all day long and eats, he never touches a single grain of rice nor does he get in contact with a single thread. Anyway, these are still but porch-words. You must in reality become like this! If you become a member of some accomplished master's assembly and he manifests his ability in one phrase, you'll ponder completely in vain. Even if you can accept a phrase as you hear it, you're still a dope.

**INSTRUCTION 4: 546a19-24**

The Master said, "The three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings explain it at great length, and the whole empire's masters expound it in every conceivable way; now come on, present me the import of [such] a teaching, be it even as tiny as the tip of the needle I hold here!

Such talk is already [administering] medicine to a dead horse. Though [I talk] like this, how many are there who reach this realization? I wouldn't even dare to hope that there could be an echo [of awakening] in your words and a hidden sharp point in your
sentences. One wink of an eye -- a thousand differences. When the wind is still, the waves are calm. I humbly pray that my offering by accepted."

**INSTRUCTION 5: 546b28-c17**

In the hall [Master Yunmen] said:

"If, in bringing up a case I cause you to accept my [words] instantly, I am already dropping crap on top of your heads. Even [a feat of teaching such as] illuminating the whole world at once by holding up a single hair would still be cutting out flesh and inflicting a wound. All the same, you must actually get to this level of realization. If you have not yet [attained it] you must not pretend [that you have]. Rather, you must step back, investigate underneath your feet, and see what there is to it!

In reality, there is not the slightest thing which could cause you to understand or doubt. It goes without saying that you, each and every one of you, has the one thing; its great function manifests itself without costing you the slightest effort. You don't differ from the patriarch-buddhas! It's obvious that the root of faith of all of you is shallow and your evil karma thick. Suddenly, you find yourself wearing a lot of horns and carry your bowl bag all over the place. What's the point in victimizing yourself?

Anyway, what do all of you lack? Who of you full-fledged fellows hasn't got his share? Though you may accept [this] for yourself, you're still out of luck. You must neither fall for the tricks of others nor accept their directives. The instant you see an old monk open his mouth, you tend to stuff those big stones right into yours. You're exactly like those green flies on shit that struggle back to back to gobble it up and take it away! In groups of three or five you stick your heads together and deliberate. Shame on you, brothers!

[Though] the old masters' whole lifetime is used up for you,
you are not helped. So they leave a few words to communicate the entrance. While being aware of this sort of thing, you must put it aside and make some effort for yourself, and you'll certainly become familiar with it. Hurry up! Hurry up! Time does not wait for man, and breathing out is no guarantee for breathing in [again]! Do you have some spare body and mind to fritter away? You must absolutely pay attention. Take care!

**INSTRUCTION 6: 547c11-15**

In the hall [the Master] said,

"You monks must not think falsely; heaven is heaven, earth is earth, mountain is mountain, river is river, monk is monk, and layperson is layperson. After a long pause he said, "Come on, try picking up that hill for me!"

Then a monk asked, "How about when I see that mountain is mountain and river is river?" The Master said, "Why does the triple [temple] gate pass through [this hall] here?"

[The monk] continued, "If that's so I won't think falsely." The Master said, "Give me back my words!"

**INSTRUCTION 7: 548b2-22**

In the hall [the Master] said:

"Even if a word, the very instant it is brought up, puts the thousand differences into a single rut and includes the minutest particles, it still is but an expression of expedient teaching. What then is an [accomplished] patchrobed monk supposed to do? If he discusses in [the Dharma Hall] here what the patriarchs and the Buddha meant, the Sixth Patriarch's unique way will go down with all flags flying. Well then, is there anyone who can put it right? If there is, he may come forward!"

At the time a monk asked, "How about a statement that
transcends the Buddha and goes beyond the patriarchs?" The Master said, "Sesame bun".1010 The monk went on: "What connection does this have with [my question]? The Master said, "Exactly!1011 What connection has this?!

The Master thereupon said, "When you hear people talk about the intent of the patriarchal teachers, don't fake it by asking about [theories of]1012 talk that transcend(s) Buddhas and patriarchs. Anyway, what do you call 'Buddha' and what do you call 'patriarch' when you talk without hesitation of 'statements that transcend Buddhas and patriarchs'?\[As to the 'escape from the three realms' [of sensuous desire, form, and formlessness] about which you ask: Come on, get hold of these three realms! What perceptive faculty1013 is there to hinder you? What object of perception1014 is there that can be given to you?1015 What bowl do you clearly understand?1016 On what do you base your perception of difference? [Though] they go all out in working for the benefit of beings, [even] the old sages cannot help you; what they say -- 'everything is real', and 'all things as they are are true' -- cannot be perceived.

[Likewise,] when I say to you: 'Right now, is anything the matter?', I have already misled you. If you in actuality have not yet attained entry,1017 then for a time go into yourself and investigate thoroughly on your own: What, besides wearing a robe, eating, moving bowels and urinating, is the matter?1018 What's the use of knowing how to give rise, without the slightest reason, to so many kinds of delusive thoughts?

Again, there's a bunch [of people] who in a vulgar manner stick their heads together, manage to quote some saying of the ancients, have their intellect memorize and their delusive thoughts evaluate it, and say: 'I've understood the Buddhist teaching!' They busy themselves with nothing but discussions and pass the time following their whim. In turn, they come to feel that this is not what they want; [they travel] to thousands of places over myriads of miles and abandon their parents as well as their teachers. What frantic urge1019 is it that drives the clamorous1020 crowd which behaves this way to go on
And [the Master] chased [the monks] out with his staff.

**INSTRUCTION 8: 548c8-16**

In the hall [Master Yunmen] said:

As it is known that shallowness of virtue is the trend of these times, and that this generation is living at the end of the resemblance period of Buddhist teaching [it follows that] nowadays, when monks go north they call this 'worshipping Manjusri', and when they go south they say they 'journey to Manyue'. [People who] go on such pilgrimages, though styled 'mendicant monks', just squander the alms of the faithful. What a pity! What a pity! When asked they turn out to be completely ignorant; they just busy themselves with passing their days at their own whim. If there are two or three who, by frantically learning and informing themselves widely, manage to absorb some current sayings, they look everywhere for similar words and get approved of as masters. They lightly dismiss superior men, [thus] creating karma of misfortune. Don't say, when some day the king [of hell] Yama pins you down, that nobody warned you! Whether you are an innocent beginner or late learner, you must raise your spirits! Don't vainly memorize [other people's] sayings -- a little bit of reality is better than a lot of illusion -- for later on you'll just deceive yourself.

What is the matter? Come forward [and tell me]!

**INSTRUCTION 9: 549b28-c06**

In the hall [Master Yunmen] said:

"You lot who err hither and thither on pilgrimages: you all, whether you come from south of the [Yellow] River or north of the each and every one of you has his native place. Now, do
you know it? Give it a try, come forward and tell me -- I'll attest it for you! Is there anybody? Is there anybody?

If you don't know [your native place], then it turns out that I have deceived you. Would you like to know? If your native place is in the north, there are Master Zhaozhou and Manjusri of Wutaishan; both are in [this Dharma Hall] here. If your birthplace is in the south, there are Xuefeng, Wolong, Xiyuan, and Gushan who are all in [this Dharma Hall] here. Would you like to get to know [them]? Meet them in here! If you don't see [them], don't pretend! Do you see [them]? Do you see [them]? If you don't: watch me ride out astride the Buddha Hall! Take care!"
you'd reach this stage, you could still not even dream of a true monk. You wouldn't even meet one in a three-house hamlet!"

The Master suddenly seized his staff, drew a line on the ground, and said: "All is in here." He drew another line and said, "All has gone out of here. Take care!"

**INSTRUCTION 11: 550c27-551a4**

In the hall, [Master Yunmen] said:

"If today I bandy around words with you, [you will still] not know good from bad when shit turns to ash, piss burns, and [when in some future life you'll be] a dirty pig or a scabious dog. You make your living in a shit pit! That's why I say: You must grasp the whole universe, the great earth, the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings, all the Buddhas of the three worlds, and the verbal teachings of the whole empire's masters at once right on your eyelashes!

But even if you'd be able at once to distinguish them clearly right there, you'd still be a fellow out of luck, one who jumps into the shit pit without the slightest reason. If [such a chap] should ever visit my assembly of patchrobed monks, I'd break his legs!"

At that time three monks stepped forth simultaneously and bowed. The Master said: "A single indictment takes care [of all three of you]."

**INSTRUCTION 12: 551a10-24**

Someone asked: "The old masters said that there is an ultimate principle. How about the matter of the ultimate principle?"

The Master said: "How are you going to deal with what's in my hand?"

[The monk] insisted: "I'm asking about the matter of the ultimate principle!" The Master hit [him] with his staff, crying: "Moo! Moo!" Just when [the ultimate principle] is shattered and gotten
rid of, you say: 'I request your teaching [about it]!' This sort [of man], wherever he goes, knows just how to adapt everything at random to his one scheme. Step forward and let me ask you: You're usually on the meditation platform, holding discussions about going up [beyond duality] and going down [into duality], about transcending the buddhas and going beyond patriarchs. Now tell me: has the water buffalo got the meaning of 'transcending the buddhas and going beyond the patriarchs'?

The monk said: "Just before, somebody has already asked this!"

The Master replied: "This [kind of answer] is what you can learn on the meditation platform. There's no need for [people] who, when something is, say 'it is', and when something isn't, say 'it isn't.'"

The monk said: "If [the water buffalo] has got [the meaning of 'transcending the buddhas and going beyond the patriarchs'], what does he wear a fell and carry horns for?" The Master said: "By [your question] I know that you're just one who memorizes words [of others]."

[Master Yunmen] added: "Come, come! Let me again ask you lot: You carry your staff across your shoulders and say 'I practice Chan' and 'I study the Way'; so you're searching for some meaning of 'to go beyond the buddhas and transcend the patriarchs'. Here's my question to you: is there, [in all actions] during the twelve periods [of the day] -- walking, standing, sitting, lying, shitting, pissing -- [and everywhere including] the vermin's market in the privy and the lined-up mutton traded at market stalls, a sense of 'transcending buddhas and going beyond patriarchs'? Those who are able to tell me, come forward! If there's nobody [who can], don't prevent me from going [wherever I please] east or west!" With this, [Master Yunmen] left his teacher's seat.

**INSTRUCTION 13: 552a4–25**

In the hall [the Master] said:
Reverend monks! Even though [you] say "what [on earth] is the matter?", you still put a head on top of a head, add frost on top of snow, wink an eye in the coffin, and burn moxa on a moxa burn scar. This is quite a mess!

Now what should you do? Every one of you must strive for himself to obtain [a better] rebirth. Don't futilely tramp around, simply wanting to get hold of some idle words, waiting for some master's mouth to move, then asking about Chan and Dao, transcendence and immanence, this and that, and stuffing [the words] which you noted down on big rolls of copying paper into the bags of skin [that you are]. Wherever you go you stick your heads together in threes and fives around the fireplace, and many voices murmur in speculation: "These are words of eloquence, those are words uttered spontaneously on the spot; these are words based on events, those are words of essence, that is, [words] which let the master or mistress in your house appear." You devour [these words], and when you have gobbled [them] down, you do nothing but talk in your sleep, saying "I have understood the Buddha Dharma". It's clear that by such pilgrimages you'll never ever attain rest.

Again, there is a bunch [of people] who, as soon as they hear some talk about rest, shut their eyes [while being] in hell, make their living in a rathole, and sit under a dark mountain where ghosts roam, thinking "this is it", and saying, "I found some way in." Do they see it even in a dream? What crime would it be to beat ten thousand [people] of this kind to death? This is called 'right from the outset no chance to meet an accomplished one.' After all, these are just windbags.

If there really is something you see, come and show it to me, I'll discuss it with you! Don't senselessly -- and without knowing good from bad -- join the rat race of sticking your heads together and discussing words. Don't let me see you [doing this]; if I caught you and found out about the wrong you did, I'd have to cut you in half. Never say that I didn't tell you!

Is there any blood under your skin? What good is it to willfully victimize yourself everywhere? You bunch of exterminators of
Buddhism! You’re no more than a pack of wild foxes! What are you here for?"

With his staff, [Master Yunmen] at once chased [the monks] out.1089

**INSTRUCTION 14: 552b25-c8**

In a formal sermon [Master Yunmen] said:

"Well, what has since ancient times been the matter? Anyway, right now I cannot help saying to all of you: What thing is there in the whole universe that is an object for you or stands in relation to you? If there is a [thing as small as a] needle tip that forms an obstacle or constriction for you, come seize it for me! What is that which you call 'Buddha' and 'patriarch'? What is that which you call mountain, river, the great earth, sun, moon, and stars? What do you take to be the four [physical] elements and the five components [of a human being]? When I talk this way, I call it 'talk by a granny from a three-house hamlet'. If I'd happen to come across a real pilgrim and he'd hear me talk like this, he couldn't be reproached if he grabbed my leg and threw me down the steps [of the teacher's platform].

Nevertheless [I ask you]: for what reason is this so? Don't take advantage of your glib mouthpiece for haphazard answers. You must be this kind of man! If the ground on which you stand gets examined by me, and, being cornered, you get your legs broken: could I be reproached for that?

This being understood, is there now anyone to ask about the essence of Chan? Let me reply with one turn [of phrase]; then you may go wherever you like!"

Just when some monk was about to ask, the Master hit him with his staff full on the mouth. Then he left his seat.
INSTRUCTION 15: 553a13-28

In a formal sermon the Master said:

"All of you who come and go without the slightest reason: what are you looking for in [this temple] here? I only know how to eat, drink, and shit. What else would I be capable of doing?

You're making pilgrimages all over the place, studying Chan and asking about the Way. Let me ask you: how about that which you could learn in all those places? Try presenting that!"

Again, he said: "In the meantime, you cheat the master in your own house. Do you see what I mean? When you manage to find a little slime behind my ass, you lick it off, take it to be your own self, and say: 'I understand Chan, I understand the Way!' Even if you manage to read the whole Buddhist canon -- so what?!

The old masters couldn't help it: when they saw you run about wildly, they spoke to you of 'supreme wisdom and nirvana' [and thus] were misleading you -- they drove in a stake and tied you to it. Again, when they saw that you didn't understand, they said to you: 'It's not supreme wisdom and nirvana.' [Even if] you'd know the sort of thing [I'm talking about], you wouldn't be okay. To make matters worse, you're looking for comments and explanations by others. Since a long time, all of these exterminators of Buddhism have been like this. Why did they make it to this day?

When I was on pilgrimage some time ago, there was a bunch of people who gave me explanations. They didn't have bad intentions, but one day I saw through them [and realized] that they are laughing-stocks. If I won't die in the next four or five years, I'll hack off and shatter the legs of these exterminators of Buddhism one by one. Right now there are plenty of temple priests everywhere who fake it: why don't you go and join them? What dry piece of shit are you looking for in [this temple] here?"

The master stepped [from his chair] down on the floor, and with his staff he hit and chased [the monks] out [of the hall] at once.
One day the Master said:

"Because of compassion, all the old masters held since olden days conversations which fell into the weeds. One knows people through their words, and one could not do this if they had held talks that were outside the weeds. And if there are such conversations which fall into the weeds and allow knowing people through their words, there will also be words that are repeated and conversations that are held.

Haven't you read [the following episode]: Reverend Yangshan asked a monk, "Where have you just come from?" "From the Lu mountains," replied the monk. Yangshan said, "In that case, did you visit the Five Elders Peak?" "I've never been there," answered the monk. Yangshan rejoined, "You've never visited the mountains at all." Master [Yunmen] said: "These words are all [examples of] having conversations in the weeds for the sake of compassion."

Once the master said:

When the light has not broken through, there are two kinds of disease: the first is when nothing is clarified and there are objects (things) facing you. The second is when, having been able to pierce through to the emptiness of all separate entities (dharmas), it is as if there were in a hidden way some object (thing). This, too, happens when the light has not broken through.

Furthermore, the Dharma body has also two kinds of disease. The first is when, while being able to reach the Dharma body, one has not forgotten subjective views due to one's attachment to separate things (dharmas, objects), and one still stagnates at the Dharma
body's borderline. The second is when, though one has managed to penetrate through to the Dharma body, letting go of it is not possible. Examine thoroughly what [ground] there is to put on airs! 1115

INSTRUCTION 18: 558c17-20

Once the Master held up his staff and said: "The whole universe, the great earth, killing and giving life: all is in [this staff] here."

A monk then asked, "How is it with killing?" The Master replied, "Utter confusion." 1116 The monk went on, "And how about giving life?" The Master said, "You got to serve as rice steward." 1117 The monk continued, "What about when it's neither killing nor giving life?"

The Master got up and exclaimed, "Great Perfection of Wisdom!" 1118

INSTRUCTION 19: 562a18-22

Instructing the assembly, [Master Yunmen] said, "When it is brought up once, one does not talk about it a second time. What is 'bringing it up once'?

He continued, 1119 "If you're not in accordance with it, seek some way in. [Even if] Buddhas [numberless] as specks of dust are on your tongue, and the holy teachings of the three [Buddhist] canons are under your feet, it's not as good as being enlightened! Now is there anyone who is enlightened? Come forward and try expressing it!

In place [of the silent assembly,] he said, "The family attachment of an adopted child."

With regard to the first words [about 'bringing it up once] he said in place [of his listeners], "Although [the capital] Changan is pleasant, [it's not a place to stay for long]." 1120

203 SELECTED INSTRUCTIONS
INSTRUCTION 20: 565a15-17

Instructing the assembly, [Master Yunmen] said, "What is a sharp statement that does not reveal its point?"1121

On behalf [of the audience] he said, "These days, people must quite obviously keep talking."1122

The Master thereupon produced the following religious verse:

"A sharp statement that does not reveal its point
Imparts before it is even spoken.
If you step forward and your mouth babbles1123
I know that you're very much unsettled."1124
SELECTIVE BIBLIOGRAPHY
A. Reference Works; B. Inscriptions; C. Collections;
D. Non-Buddhist Texts; E. Buddhist Texts; F. Modern Works

A. Reference Works

- BD (Bukkyógo daijiten): see under Nakamura
- BEB (Bukkyó kaisetsu daijiten): see under Ono
- BMZ (Dunhuang bianwen siyi tongshi): see under Jiang
- CBS (Chúgoku bukkyōshi jiten): see under Kamata
- CZJ (Chúgoku zenshū jìaei sakum): see under Suzuki, Íeísuo

B. Inscriptions


C. Collections


- JLY (Jiliyuan / Shitsurien): see under Hujaku


- KG (Kattô gozen): see under Mujaku


- W (Daikanwa jiten): see under Moroishi

205 BIBLIOGRAPHY
B. Inscriptions


Lei, Yue 雷嶽, Dahan shaozhou yunnenzhuan guangtai chenyan gu guangtai dashi shixingbei (bing xu) 大漢韶州雲門山光泰禪院故光泰大師棟銘文 (copy): "True Nature Stele [for] the Late Great Master Guangtai from Guangtai Chan temple on Mt. Yunmen in the Great Han [kingdom]'s Shaozhou [district]." (959). In: Tokiwa, Daijô 常盤大定, Shinbun bukkyôshiseki kenenshu 禪佛石碑研究手冊, 1931, pp. 115-121.
C. TEXT COLLECTIONS

- DHBW (Dunhuang bianwenji): see under Dunhuang
- T (Taishö shinsu dai sókyö): see under Taishö
- ZGSS (Zengaku sōsho): see under Zengaku
- ZZ (Dainippon zokuzo kyö): see under Dainippon

D. NON-BUDDHIST TEXTS

- DD: see under Daodejing
- JWDS: see under Yue, Juzheng
- Liang 梁. Nanhan shu. Contains the Nanhan wenzi le. 
- LY: see under Lunyu
- Nanhan wenzi le: see under Liang
- NHJS: see under Wu, Lanxiu
- NHS: see under Nanhan shu
- NHWZL: see under Liang
- Tongzi 通志. By Zheng Qiao 鄭樵 (1149).
- Wu, Lanxiu 吳蘭修, Nanhan jianshi zhi 南漢金石志.
- YWDS: see under Ou-yang, Xiu
- ZHZ: see under Zhuangzi

E. BUDDHIST TEXTS
- LDHY: see under Liandeng huiyao.
- Lengjie, Shi: Lengjie shiziji. T. 85 [2837].
- Liandeng huiyao 祖源智慧語要. ZZ 136.
- Lingspring, Zh. ZZ 136.
- Linjilu 临济录. T. 47 [1985].
- LNL: see under Linjilu.
- LNL: see under Linjilianlu.
- LJ82: see under Lengjie shiziji.
- Longxing fujia buannian tonglun 隆興佛教編年通論. ZZ 130.
- Lotus Sutra: see under Miaofa lianhuajing.
- LXYL: see under Longxing fujia buannian tonglun.
- Masu yulu 马祖语录. ZZ 119.
- Miaofa lianhuajing 妙法蓮華經 (Lotus Sutra). T. 9 [222].
- Mohr bahun boluomi jing 墨河般若波羅蜜經. T. 8 [223].
- Zhujia yulu 振絃語錄. ZZ 119.
- Zhujia yulu: see under Zhujia yulu.
- Zhujia yulu 雪絃語. ZZ 119.
- Zhujia yulu: see under Zhujia yulu.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 119.
- Zhujian yulu: see under Zhujian yulu.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 138.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 119.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 119.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulu 五家語. ZZ 135.
- Zhujian yulus 云門語. T. 47 [1988]. For the Song text version, see under Gusunsu yulu.
F. MODERN WORKS

- Chavannes, Édouard, "Le Royaume de Wou et de Yôeh." Young-pao 17 (1916), 37-49.
- Chikusa, Masaki 竹林雅也, "Tô / Godai ni okeru Fukken bukkyô no tenkai 唐/五代における福建仏教の展開". Bukkyô shinbun 佛教新聞 7.1 (1973), pp. 24-44. PB BN
- Hisamatsu, Shin'ichi 久松義一, *Some Philosophical, Religious, and Aesthetic Aspects*


- Iriya, Yoshitaka, "Unmon no zen とその向う. In: Iriya, Yoshitaka, Jiko to chōetsu 自己と超越, pp. 77-86.

- Jan, Yün-hua, "Buddhist Historiography in Sung China." Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft 114 (1964), 360-381.


- Kusan Sunill, Kūe Koutousa, Seung Ju Gun (Cholla Namdo 543-431: Song Kwang Sa Honas 213 BIBLIOGRAPHY


- Ogisu, Jundô 荻須純道, "Zenshûshiwa: Goke shichîshû (san) 一 Umon Zenji to Umonshû 會司禪師主會司宗 ZenhunKô 樺文化 Nr. 3 中國 1965.

- Pei, Yuehai 彭edges, Gushu ruzi jishì 虚字集釋. Beijing, Zhonghua shuju 中華書局, 1954.


- Shôbô, Köyû 椎名宏雄, "Umon kôroku to sono shôrokubon no kaisô 雲門語録とその抄録本の系統". Journal of Sôtô Studies (Shôbô kenkyû 宗學研究) 24 (March 1982), 103-136.
FACETS OF
THE LIFE AND TEACHING
OF CHAN MASTER
YUNMEN WENYAN
雲門文偃
(864-949)

A Dissertation
Submitted to
the Temple University Graduate Board

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
of
Doctor of Philosophy

by
Urs E. App
May 1989

Volume II
APPENDIX 1: PREFACES

PREFACE TO THE YML (dated 1053)

In: Zuting shiyuan 祖庭事苑 (ZZ 113: 26d2-15)

Master [Tianyi Yihuai] composed a preface which is quoted in the following:

"The Great Master [Yunmen]'s religious name was Wenyen. He succeeded to Chan Master Xuefeng [Yicun]. On the order of Prince Liu of Guang, he first resided at Shaozhou's Lingshu [temple]; later he moved to live on [Mt.] Yunmen. He was honoured with the title 'Genuine Truth'. He taught for more than fifty years, and [though] 130 years have passed since, there are words from formal sermons 講堂, from [talks which] took up old [sayings or events] 舉古, and from statements with substitute [answers] 堂代. But as there were indications that [these words] were getting dispersed in China's Chan communities, it is a fortunate event that they got collected and that printing blocks were made from them. They will be of help to many; when Chan adepts enter [the Master's] room and ask for guidance, they tend to read sayings and are lead astray by mistakes in accounts. Alas! We are far from the time of the sages! Fish eyes are mistaken for gold of Yen and jewels of Chu, and dust and sand (worldly defilements) are prevalent."

"Hearing that [Yunmen's words] got cut [like] autumn chrysanthemums or spring orchids and bamboos, I constantly thought about their elimination and disappearance but did not yet take measures to fulfill my long-cherished wish. [But] this summer, when staying at the Qiupu [temple], I took care to stay away from the community and was able to open and read this text. Then I took the brush to correct it by condensing 剪繁 and by adding what was lacking 补闕. Afterwards I established its order. Most of those who apply themselves to the Confucian path and are bound to be excluded from [Buddhism's] profound meaning, [but also] those turned toward the Great Way, get lost in confusion among many useless rhetorical flowers and empty absurdities."
This text is by one who is not confused, describes facts as they are, and has a firm grasp of reality. For a wise person, this verbose preface is thus but an accumulation of useless letters."

Written on the fifteenth day of the fifth month of the fifth year of Huangyou (皇祐 5; 1053) at the Qiupu Jingde Chan temple (秋浦景德禪院) by the Dharma-transmitting monk [Tianyi] Yihuai (義懷).

**PREFACE TO THE YML (DATED 1076)**

In: *Yunmen guanglu 雲門廣錄* (T47: 544c28-545a12)

The lamp of the patriarchs was successively transmitted over hundreds of years. It is excellent and surpasses anything of the kind; transcending present and past, it is utterly profound and supremely spiritual. [Though] the Way flourishes, those who practice it in the empire are just a handful; their very best is represented by the great and venerable Master Yunmen. He changed freely between gripping firmly and letting go, and between unfolding and folding.1133 When he extended himself [like] the great rivers and the seas, fish as well as dragons got enough space to swim. When he squeezed heaven and earth in his hand, demons and spirits did not have any path to tread on. Even plants and trees prostrated before him, and earth and stones emitted light for him.

His transmission to posterity comprises responses to occasions 對機, records from [the teacher’s] room 室, statements and substitute [answers] 垂代, critical examinations 勘辨, and the biographical record. Now, [as the text] was dated and contained some errors, I collated 參考 it and had the correct and unique new printing blocks carved so that [the text] may be eternally disseminated and help making the forging and tempering1134 of one’s very own matter1135 the alpha and omega.1136

This precipitous world being [in constant change like] tiles that break and ice that melts, it is certain that if there are several schools and divided sects [one] will not avoid getting confused and
prone to errors. [But] discussing merits and writing about virtue means already cheating the sages of old, and tracing a model and establishing an example may just be good for hoodwinking future students. If the top of one's head has the eye [of wisdom], where will one meet with Yunmen?

25th day of the third month of the 53rd [sexagesimal] year in the Xining reign (熙寧丙辰; 1076).

Preface by Su Xie 蘇潔, in charge as Vice-legate of Transport of the Regions East and West of the Zhe River with Authority over Exports 權發遣兩浙轉運副使公事.
## APPENDIX 2: BIOGRAPHICAL CHART

(Dated events are underlined, inferred events in parentheses, information about sources in italics)

### (TANG DYNASTY)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>CYCLE</th>
<th>REIGN</th>
<th>EVENTS</th>
<th>AGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>864</td>
<td>甲申</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td>Yunen is born in Jiaxing</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>865</td>
<td>乙酉</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>866</td>
<td>丙戌</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>867</td>
<td>丁亥</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>868</td>
<td>戊子</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>869</td>
<td>己丑</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>870</td>
<td>庚寅</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>871</td>
<td>辛卯</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>872</td>
<td>壬辰</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>873</td>
<td>癸巳</td>
<td>咸通</td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>874</td>
<td>甲午</td>
<td>乾符</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>875</td>
<td>乙未</td>
<td>乾符</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>876</td>
<td>丙申</td>
<td>乾符</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>877</td>
<td>丁酉</td>
<td>乾符</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>878</td>
<td>戊戌</td>
<td>乾符</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>879</td>
<td>己亥</td>
<td>乾符</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>880</td>
<td>庚子</td>
<td>廣明</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>881</td>
<td>辛丑</td>
<td>中和</td>
<td>[Acc. to CC entry into Kongwang temple]</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>882</td>
<td>壬寅</td>
<td>中和</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>883</td>
<td>癸卯</td>
<td>中和</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>884</td>
<td>甲辰</td>
<td>中和</td>
<td>Ordination in Changzhou</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>885</td>
<td>乙巳</td>
<td>光啓</td>
<td>Several years of study under Zhi Cheng</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>886</td>
<td>丙午</td>
<td>光啓</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>887</td>
<td>丁未</td>
<td>光啓</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>888</td>
<td>戊申</td>
<td>文德</td>
<td>[May have gone to Huzhou around this time]</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>889</td>
<td>己酉</td>
<td>龍紀</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>890</td>
<td>庚戌</td>
<td>大順</td>
<td>[Stayed with Huou for some years]</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>891</td>
<td>辛亥</td>
<td>大順</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>892</td>
<td>壬子</td>
<td>景福</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>893</td>
<td>癸丑</td>
<td>景福</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>894</td>
<td>甲寅</td>
<td>乾寧</td>
<td>Beginning of pilgrimage [cf. also XFL]</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>895</td>
<td>乙卯</td>
<td>乾寧</td>
<td>Stayed a number of years with Xuefeng</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>896</td>
<td>丙辰</td>
<td>乾寧</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>897</td>
<td>丁巳</td>
<td>乾寧</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>898</td>
<td>戊午</td>
<td>光化</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>899</td>
<td>己未</td>
<td>光化</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>900</td>
<td>庚申</td>
<td>光化</td>
<td>[May have left Xuefeng around this time]</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>901</td>
<td>辛酉</td>
<td>天復</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>902</td>
<td>壬戌</td>
<td>天復</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>903</td>
<td>癸亥</td>
<td>天祐</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>904</td>
<td>甲子</td>
<td>天祐</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>905</td>
<td>乙丑</td>
<td>天祐</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>906</td>
<td>丙寅</td>
<td>天祐</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>907</td>
<td>丁卯</td>
<td>開平</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>908</td>
<td>戊辰</td>
<td>開平</td>
<td>Death of Xuefeng</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Biographical chart** 220 **APPENDIX 2**
## (SOUTHERN HAN DYNASTY)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>CYCLE</th>
<th>EMP</th>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>REIGN</th>
<th>EVENTS</th>
<th>AGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>909</td>
<td>己巳</td>
<td>烈宗</td>
<td>(劉隱)</td>
<td>開平 3</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>910</td>
<td>壬午</td>
<td>烈宗</td>
<td>(劉顯)</td>
<td>開平 4</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>911</td>
<td>辛未</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 1</td>
<td>visit to Caoqi, head monk at Lingshu</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>912</td>
<td>癸酉</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 2</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>913</td>
<td>甲戌</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 3</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>914</td>
<td>乙亥</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 4</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>915</td>
<td>丙子</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 5</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>916</td>
<td>丁丑</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 6</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>917</td>
<td>戊寅</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 7</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>918</td>
<td>己卯</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 8</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>919</td>
<td>甲辰</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 9</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>920</td>
<td>乙巳</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 10</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>921</td>
<td>丙午</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 11</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>922</td>
<td>丁未</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 12</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>923</td>
<td>戊申</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 13</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>924</td>
<td>己酉</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 14</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>925</td>
<td>丁亥</td>
<td>乾宗</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾化 15</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>926</td>
<td>庚子</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 1</td>
<td>Construction of Mt. Yunnen temple begins</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>927</td>
<td>己丑</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 2</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>928</td>
<td>戊寅</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 3</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>929</td>
<td>丁卯</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 4</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>930</td>
<td>丙辰</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 5</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>931</td>
<td>乙巳</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 6</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>932</td>
<td>甲午</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 7</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>933</td>
<td>丁未</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 8</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>934</td>
<td>戊申</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 9</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>935</td>
<td>己酉</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 10</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>936</td>
<td>庚戌</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 11</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>937</td>
<td>辛亥</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 12</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>938</td>
<td>壬子</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 13</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>939</td>
<td>癸丑</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 14</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>940</td>
<td>甲寅</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 15</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>941</td>
<td>乙卯</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 16</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>942</td>
<td>丙辰</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 17</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>943</td>
<td>丁巳</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 18</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>944</td>
<td>壬午</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 19</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>945</td>
<td>辛未</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 20</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>946</td>
<td>庚申</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 21</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>947</td>
<td>己酉</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 22</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>948</td>
<td>戊戌</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 23</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>949</td>
<td>丙子</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 24</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>950</td>
<td>丁丑</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 25</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>951</td>
<td>辛亥</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 26</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>952</td>
<td>庚午</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 27</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>953</td>
<td>丁亥</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 28</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>954</td>
<td>戊戌</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 29</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>955</td>
<td>壬申</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 30</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>956</td>
<td>甲午</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 31</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>957</td>
<td>丙申</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 32</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>958</td>
<td>戊戌</td>
<td>高祖</td>
<td>(劉巖)</td>
<td>乾亨 33</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**YEAR AFTER DEATH**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>EVENTS</th>
<th>AGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>visit to Caoqi, head monk at Lingshu</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Audience with Emperor</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Stayed one month at Imperial Palace</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>............................的</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>(587 days in palace) ............................的</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Died on May 10; ............................的</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Biographical chart

221

### APPENDIX 2
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>CYCLE</th>
<th>EMP</th>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>REIGN</th>
<th>EVENTS</th>
<th>AGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>959</td>
<td>己未</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>+10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>960</td>
<td>庚申</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>+11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>961</td>
<td>辛酉</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>+12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>962</td>
<td>壬戌</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>+13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>963</td>
<td>癸亥</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>+14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>964</td>
<td>甲子</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>+15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>965</td>
<td>乙丑</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>+16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>966</td>
<td>丙寅</td>
<td>後主</td>
<td>劉鋤</td>
<td>大寶</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>+17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 3

MAP TO MASTER YUNMEN'S LIFE

Biographical map 223
## APPENDIX 4

### CHRONOLOGICAL LIST OF THE MAIN BIOGRAPHICAL SOURCES

1. Yunmenshan guangtai chanyuan kuangheng dashi xinglu
   祖堂集行錄
   Abbreviation: YX 祖堂集
   949

2. Chodang chip (Zutangji, Sodóshū)
   祖堂集
   Abbreviation: CC 祖堂集
   952

3. Dahan shaizhou yunmenshan guangtai chanyuan gu kuangheng dashi shixingbei (bing xu)
   大漢詔州雲門山光泰院故匡大師質性碑 (并序)
   Abbreviation: SY64 碑銘
   959

4. Dahan shaizhou yunmenshan daju chanshi daciyan kuangheng dashi beiming (bing xu)
   大漢詔州雲門山大覺寺大慈圓匡大師碑銘 (并序)
   Abbreviation: SY64 碑銘
   964

5. Jingde quandenglu 景德傳燈録 (Chinese texts)
   Abbreviation: COL 景德傳燈録
   1004

6. Jingde quandenglu (Korean text)
   景德傳燈録 [高麗本]
   Abbreviation: COLK 景德傳燈録 [高麗本, Yanagida ed.]
   ??

7. Quanfa shengongji 傳法正宗記
   Abbreviation: ZZZJ 傳法正宗記
   1061

8. Jianzhong jingguo xudenglu 建中靖國續燈録
   Abbreviation: IDL 建中靖國續燈録
   1101

9. Zuting shiyuan 祖庭事苑
   Abbreviation: ZSYY 祖庭事苑
   1108

10. Yunren guanglu 雲門廣錄 (other than sources 1 and 13)
    Abbreviation: YML 雲門廣録
    1130

11. Yufang yilu 遊方遺録
    Abbreviation: YFTL 遊方遺録
    1130

12. Chanlin senbaozhuan 禪林僧寶傳
    Abbreviation: SBZ 禪林僧寶傳
    1122

13. Lunxing fujiao bianli tongzun 隆興佛教編年通論
    Abbreviation: LFTL 隆興佛教編年通論
    bef. 1127

14. Poguo yuanwu chanshi bianyuan 佛果園悟禪師輯要
    Abbreviation: BYL 佛果園輯要
    1128

15. Lianjiao huiyao 聯燈會要
    Abbreviation: LDBY 聯燈會要
    1183

16. Wudeng huiyuan 五燈會元
    Abbreviation: WDBY 五燈會元
    1253

17. Wuji shengong san 五家正宗記
    Abbreviation: WZZZ 五家正宗記
    1254

18. Fouz lidai tongzai 佛祖歷代通載
    Abbreviation: FTZZ 佛祖歷代通載
    1341

19. Shiabi jigu lue 釋氏稽古略
    Abbreviation: SBJL 釋氏稽古略
    bef. 1355

---

**List of biographical sources**

224

**APPENDIX 4**
APPENDIX 5:
ANNOTATED LIST OF IMPORTANT BIOGRAPHICAL SOURCES

1. YUNMENSHAN GUANGTAI CHANYUAN KUANGZHEN DASHI XINGLU 雲門山光泰禪院匡真大師行錄: "Biographical Record of the Great Master Kuangzhen of the Guangtai Chan temple on Mt. Yunmen".

Texts used: T47(1988)575c3-576a18 / Song text (Taiwan National Library)
Abbr.: XL 雲門行録: Biographical Record
Date: May 25, 949 (day of Yunmen's burial)
Author: Lei Yue 雷嶽

The author of this text occupies a position of particular importance with respect to the Master's biography because he also wrote the first stone inscription. He was a high (and highly decorated) official in the administration of the Nanhan kingdom (see p. 10).

The record gives a straightforward account of Yunmen's life. It differs from all other sources in that it does not contain a single word uttered by Master Yunmen. This could be connected with its composition for the burial, or it could indicate that Lei Yue wrote it with the intention of joining it to a collection of the Master's words.

The history of this biographical record is not clear. It bears a very early date (fifteen days after the Master's death!). Close comparison of its content with that of the stele (8959; translated on p. 10 ff.) from the hand of the same author Lei Yue reveals so few discrepancies that their common authorship and origin around the same period seem likely. They are for instance the only two sources to mention Yunmen's descendence from a certain Han 翰 (see p.11), and they do this in almost the same terms. However, the possibility of later revisions of this record cannot be excluded. The biographical record's "story of the missing head monk" (cf. note 83 A/B) is one major indication in this direction: the other early sources make no mention of it, but in later ones this story becomes increasingly detailed and colorful.

Another reason for suspecting later revision is the story about Lingshu's death and Yunmen's takeover of the abbotship.11

As this biography is not mentioned in the 1053 preface (cf. Appendix 1), and no comments to it are found in the ZHTS 祖庭事苑, one cannot affirm much about the history of this record prior to 1076. However, the fact that the Chinese text of the CBL 景德傳燈錄 does not include anything about Yunmen's death and the opening of the stupa suggests that in 1004 the author of the CBL 景德傳燈錄 had a YML text which did not include this Biographical Record. The first indication of its inclusion in the Extensive Record appears in the preface dated 1076 by Su Xie 蘇獻 which expressly mentions it as part of the YML (YML 545a5; translated in Appendix 1); in the process of collation and correction of the whole YML text, Su Xie probably did not spare the biographical record.

2. CHODANG CHIP 祖堂集 (chin.: Zutangji, jap.: Sôdôshû): "Collection from the Hall of Patriarchs"
Because of their early origin in circles who knew Yunmen and because of their history of transmission, this text and the two stone inscriptions (sources 3 and 4) form the most reliable sources for Master Yunmen's biography. The Chodang chip's authors were Korean monks who studied under Yunmen's teacher Xuefeng; they wrote this book in 952 when only three years had passed since the death of Yunmen. When it was rediscovered in the early 20th century, it was found to have survived almost a millennium in a Korean monastery library. As the text had in all likelihood not been edited in the meantime, it could well be our oldest unedited biographical source.

This biography has several interesting features: While its information about the Master's name, birthplace, the first teacher (Master Cheng 澄), the first temple (Kongwang 空王), etc., is essentially not different from that given by the other four earliest sources, it does (unlike all other sources) not at all mention Master [Daozong of] Mushou. In the light of the obvious similarity of Mushou's and Yunmen's teaching styles, this is all the more surprising. Could it be that the authors of the Chodang chip wanted the already famous Yunmen firmly on the side of their own (and Yunmen's) master Xuefeng? Whatever the reason, this is a significant omission in a biography which otherwise is quite detailed.

The Chodang chip's account of the first exchange between Yunmen and Xuefeng as well as the passage that follows it (cf. notes 71 and 73) share almost identical wording with the oldest stone inscription; did this part of the Chodang chip reach the author of the first stele in the years between 952 and 959? Or is this simply due to identical accounts by witnesses, or to commonly used contemporary expressions? This creates in any case some link between the Chodang chip and the stone inscription which was written seven years later in 959.

The last facts mentioned in the Chodang chip's account of Yunmen's life are that the southern [Han] court esteemed him highly and honored him with the purple robe and the title "Great Master Kuangzhen." According to both stone inscriptions, this event took place in the year 938 (cf. note 114). Interestingly, no mention is made of Yunmen's death. Is it possible that the news of this event had not reached the authors Jing and Yun in the time between May of 949 and the year 952? In spite of the considerable distance between Mt. Yunmen and the Fujian area, this seems quite unlikely. This could confirm Yanagida's contention (cited by Demieville*) that the writing of the Chodang chip started much earlier than 952.

3. DAHAN SHAOZHOU YUNMENSHAN GUANGTAI CHANYUAN GU KUANGZHEN DASHI SHIXINGPEI (BING XU) 大漢韶州雲門山光泰禪院故匡真大師性碑 (并序)：
"True Nature Stele [for] the Late Great Master Kuangzhen from Guangtai Chan temple on Mt. Yunmen in the Great Han [Kingdom]'s Shaozhou [district]."
This stone inscription, written ten years after the Master's death by the official Lei Yue who had also composed the Biographical Record (see above, source 1), is the earliest comprehensive and unaltered source for the biography of Yunmen. This is why it can function as the basic text with which information found in other sources can be compared (see our annotated translation of the biographically relevant part on pp. 10 - 17).

The biographical part is preceded by a passage in which Master Yunmen is said to expound nothing other than the Buddhist truth and to stand in the lineage of the Buddha's dharma descendants. After the account of the Master's burial, Lei Yue mentions some important monastic officers as well as a lot of people (108 names are given) who came from the imperial palace and took part in a ceremony to the memory of the Master. The inscription closes with a series of six poems.

Since this inscription served as point of reference for our investigation of similarities and differences found in other texts, the reader is referred to the notes of our translation for detailed comparative observations. The biographical content of this inscription has its closest parallel in the second stele which was written only 5 years later by Chen Shoushong 陳守中.

4. DAHAN SHAOZHOU YUNMENSHAN DAJUE CHANST DACITYUN KUANGSHEN HONGMING

DAHAN BEIMING (BING XU) 大漢韶州雲門山大覺禪寺大慈雲匡聖宏明大師碑

Text used: Tokiwa pp.113-115
Abbr. : 9559 實性碑
Date : January 12, 959
Author : Lei Yue 雷巖

The reason for writing another inscription just five years after the first one was an event that is mentioned at the end of this source: an apparition by the late Master in the dream of a certain Ruan Shaozhuang 阮串霞 in which he ordered the opening of the stupa. When this was done, the body of the Master was found to have no trace of decomposition, and it was brought to the capital where it was venerated during about a month before being put back into the stupa. The biographical content of the first stele is mirrored in this one; seen together with the prevalent avoidance of identical words (except in quoting), this leaves no doubt that the second author took the first inscription as a model.

This stele is the last of the early sources. Though the Biographical Record (source 1) quotes
none of the Master’s words, and the Chodang chip (source 2) contains no reference to Mushou and not much biographical information about the latter part of Yunmen’s life, one can say that the four earliest sources give a remarkably similar portrayal of Yunmen’s life. The authors of these four sources treat the life of the Master with sober admiration; as they knew him personally and were furthermore conscious of contemporary readers who were in the same position, one can expect a certain reluctance to invent wild stories. Later authors were less inhibited in this respect; the famous anecdotes about Yunmen’s broken leg (see note 63), his arrival at Xuefeng (note 71), and the portrayal of Master Lingshu’s spiritual powers (notes 89 and 91) show this clearly.


The author Daoyuan was a disciple of Tientai Deshao (天台德韶), an heir of the founder of the Fayan school, Fayan Wenyi (法眼文益). He therefore belonged to the lineage originating with Yunmen’s co-disciple Xuansha Shibei (玄沙師備). This work was presented to the Northern Song emperor Zhenzong (真宗; re. 997-1022) in 1004, but it was not published until 1011, i.e. 62 years after Master Yunmen’s death. It contains little biographical information about the Master but reproduces a fair amount of his sermons and exchanges. The content of its biography is consistent with the four oldest sources: home town, name, enlightenment under Huzhou, training under Xuefeng, and head monk and eventually master at Lingshu. It is more interesting to note what Daoyuan did not mention: why does this text with its frequent accounts about the deaths of Chan masters not lose one word about Yunmen’s death? Furthermore, one would think that, had he known about it, Daoyuan would have found the story about the dream appearance and opening of the Master’s stupa worthy of mention. While this event triggered the composition of the second stele in 964, it may not have been included in the early version(s) of the Records of Yunmen which Daoyuan certainly possessed (cf. chapter II, pp. 27-29). The same can be said of the account of Yunmen’s death which first appeared in the biographical record (source 1) and the two stone inscriptions. Daoyuan probably had some early Records of Yunmen which neither included the biographical record (YHL 575c2-576a18) nor the account which follows it about the opening of Yunmen’s stupa (575b15-16). The scarcity of biographical information in this text may be due to lack of information. This is not surprising in the light of the fact that the Song Gosengzhuan 宋高僧傳 contains no biography of Yunmen. The few bits of information in this text stand in marked contrast to the Korean version (source 5). This is a major argument in support of the view that the Chinese text is older.

Annotated biographical sources

Text used: **ZGSS 禪學叢書 [Yanagida ed.] Vol.6**
Abbr. : **CDL 景徳傳燈録 [高麗本,Yanagida ed.]**
Date : Unknown
Author : Xuanci Daoyuan (宣慈道源, n.d.)
Editor : Unknown

This text gives a much more extensive biography of the Master than the Chinese text. It includes a description of Master Yunmen's death and of the opening of the stupa as well as some stories which became popular at a later time. The entire text of this biography can be found, with few and insignificant differences, in the Chinese text of the CDL 景徳傳燈録 (source 6) and the WBY 五燈會元 (source 16). The configuration is the following:

- **Title, home town, lay family name**: Practically identical with CDL T51[2076]356b27
- **Training under Zhi Cheng, ordination, awakening under Mushou, hurt leg**: "" with WBY 22138:276c4-12
- **Journey to Yuefeng**: "" with CDL 356b28-29
- **Dharma transmission, pilgrimage, arrival at Lingshu**: "" with WBY 276d4-9
- **Death of Lingshu, abbotship of Yunmen**: "" with CDL 356c1-3
- **Teaching for 30 years, death of Yunmen, dream appearance, opening of stupa, posthumous title**: "" with WBY 280d16-281a2

The included stories (such as the one of the hurt leg and the arrival at Lingshu) indicate that the Korean text incorporates elements of later origin; the last part describing the Master's death and the miracles following it suggests also that the Korean version of the CDL 景徳傳燈録 is later than the Chinese text. However, it is not clear exactly when it was compiled. The fact that the WBY additionally contains passages which are virtually identical with parts of the present WML may indicate that the WBY is later than this source. Further investigation could show that this Korean text is based on (or represents) one of the WBY's major sources.

7. **Quanfa Zhengzongji 傳法正宗記**: "Record of the Dharma Transmission in the Correct [Chan] Sect".

Text used: **T 51[2078]757b10-758a16**
Abbr. : **ZJZJ 傳法正宗記**
Date : 1061
Author : Fori Qisong (佛日契嵩, 1007-1072)

The author of this book belongs to the fifth generation of the Yunmen line. His interest
focused on lineage: 12 lines of biography are followed by 30 lines enumerating 88 disciples of Master Yunmen. The biographical information is consistent with the earlier sources (though the first teacher Zhi Cheng and the place of ordination are not mentioned by name, and no words by Yunmen are cited). None of the stories which may indicate later origin or revision appears. Interestingly, the last event described is the Master's move to Mt. Yunmen. Nothing is said about his death (possible influence by CDL but not by CDLKI, but Qisong adds a short description of Yunmen's teaching style (757b19-20; cf. note 121) and says that at the time (i.e., in 1061) Yunmen's teaching was highly esteemed in the whole empire and was called "Yunmen school 雲門宗.

8. JIANZHONG JINGGUO XUDENG LIU 建中靖國續燈録: "The Jianzhong Jingguo [era] Supplementary Record of the Lamp".

The author was a distinguished scholar-monk in the 7th generation of the Yunmen school. As this work was intended as a continuation of the CDL 建中靖國續燈録. it is natural that not much place is given to a master whose biography and words have already been mentioned. However, Weibo's biography of Yunmen gives more weight than others to the role of Xuefeng. Because the whole biography occupies just a few lines, it is translated here: "Ch'an Master Yunmen Wenyan of Shaanxu first visited Chen Zunsu of Muzhou and discovered the mind ground 聲明心地. He went on to enter the mountain ranges [of Min] and called on Xuefeng. One day [Xuefeng] happened to take the [teacher's] seat [in the Dharma Hall]. A monk asked, 'What about the Buddha?' Xuefeng said, 'Good Heavens! Good Heavens!' Hearing this, the master [Yunmen] at once got rid of his doubts 忽釋所疑 and was in perfect accord with the core of Chan 契會宗要. Later, the sovereign Liu of Kuang requested him to stay at [Mt.] Yunmen. He transmitted the eye of the true Dharma. This is the only source which mentions a thorough breakthrough under Xuefeng.

9. ZUTING SHIYUAN 祖庭事苑: "Collection of Topics from the Garden of Patriarchs."

This text contains a biography of Yunmen and a commentary on 209 words and expression that appeared in an old lost text of the YNL (cf. chapter II, p. 30 ff.). Comparison of the commentary

Annotated biographical sources 230 APPENDIX 5
with today's YML text shows that the version which Muan based his commentary on probably included only a few lines of today's third chapter. This is of particular interest because it is the third chapter of today's YML text which includes most biographical information of the YKL. The fact that Muan does not comment on Yunmen's biography but rather writes one himself strengthens doubts as to the early datation of most of the YML's present third chapter. The information about Yunmen's life given by Muan has some notable aspects. One can isolate five elements to serve as test cases for analyzing the history of sources:

1. The scene of Yunmen's enlightenment at Manzhou with the story of the 'broken leg';
2. Yunmen's arrival at Mt. Yuefeng and the "iron cangue" story;
3. Yunmen's arrival at Lingshu and Master Lingshu's psychic powers (the story of the missing head monk);
4. The circumstances surrounding Lingshu's death and Yunmen's takeover;
5. The opening of the stupa and the miraculously preserved body.

Muan mentions a specific temple where Yunmen was ordained (Doushuai yuan). The only other source giving this name is SBZ 蟬林僧寶傅 ZZ137:224b11. This is one indication of a link between these two sources. Further comparison of these two sources reveals that, with the exception of the "no-headmonk story" and some details about exchanges, they have a very similar content.

1. If the Korean CDL 景志備錄 should be found to have been composed earlier than 1108, it would be the first source to tell the story of Yunmen's broken leg; if not, it would be Muan. Afterwards, essentially the same story appeared also in the SBZ 蟬林僧寶傅 and from there may have found its way into most later sources.
2. The "iron cangue" story which deals with Yunmen's spectacular arrival on Mt. Yuefeng could also be traced back to Muan's biography of Yunmen; SBZ 蟬林僧寶傅 ZZ137:224c2-4 and LDHY 聯編本 ZZ136:413c6-8 give similar accounts which (probably at a later point) were embroidered with all sorts of details. It is the "embroidered" version which appears in the third chapter of the YML (YFYL 遊方錄 T47|1988|573b10-22).
3. Interestingly, the story of the missing head monk is not mentioned by Muan but appears in the SBZ 蟬林僧寶傅 which may be its first source. Muan provides no information about the circumstances of Lingshu's death, but it is said that the ruler of Guang ordered the prefect He Xifan to request Yunmen's succession to Lingshu's abbotship. Detailed accounts of Lingshu's prophecy about his own burial and of his letter to the emperor are first given by XL 雲門行錄 T47|1988|575c26-576a3 and SBZ 蟬林僧寶傅 ZZ137:224d12-17.
4. Muan tells the story of the Master's dream appearance and the opening of the stupa in detail. The parallel versions given in the YML (575b7-16) and in SBZ 蟬林僧寶傅 ZZ137:226a1-8 nurture the suspicion that this story (and possibly other biographical elements such as the story of Lingshu's death and of Yunmen's takeover -- and maybe even the whole YFYL 遊方遺錄 T47|1988|573b04-575a20) found their way into the YML around the beginning of the 12th century when Muan was writing the ZSBY 祖庭事苑.
10. **YUNMEN GUANGLU** 雲門廣錄："The Extensive Records of Master Yunmen"
(all parts except source 1 [XL 雲門行錄] and source 11 [YFYL 遊方遺錄]).

Tests used: T47(1988)/Song text (Taiwan National Library)
Abbr.: YFYL 雲門廣錄
Date: 1120 (?)
Author: Shou Jian 守堅

The bulk of the YML's biographical information is contained in sources 1 and 11, but there are a few elements that appear in other parts. In particular, there is the petition (YML 567a19-b16) on behalf of Yunmen delivered to the ruler of Guang by the high official He Xifan 何希範. In it Yunmen, then head monk at the Lingshu temple, is highly praised, and the emperor is asked to approve his installation as abbot of the temple. No date is given, but since Master Lingshu deceased in 918 and Yunmen became abbot in 919, this petition must stem from either one of these years.

Furthermore, the YML contains some exchanges between officials or the emperor and Master Yunmen (YML 545b1, 545b2, 545b5, 553a9, 553a11). There are also some passages which show that the master spent some time in the capital (553a8, 553c22, 571a27-b9). The last one of these passages says that the master spent 67 days in the capital.

The entry '入京' ('entered the capital') appears among three items in the ZTSY 祖庭事苑 commentary (ZZ 113:8a1-4). The expressions commented on before and after these three items form a continuous sequence whose links appear on pp. 565 - 566 of the YML's second chapter. The three items in question, however, probably stem from today's third chapter (YML 571a-b). This short passage and the laudatory poems (YML 575b-c) are the only parts of today's third chapter which the ZTSY 祖庭事苑 commented upon. The rest of the third chapter may have been added between 1108 (completion of ZTSY 祖庭事苑) and 1120 (completion of YML).

11. **YUFANG YILU** 遊方遺錄: "Posthumous Record of [the Master's] Pilgrimage".

Tests used: T47(1988)573b4-575a20 / Song text (Taiwan National Library)
Abbr.: YFYL 遊方遺錄
Date: 1120
Author: Shou Jian 守堅

It is unclear whether this text stems also from the hand of the YML's compiler Shou Jian. It relates Yunmen's various encounters with monks and masters, from Suzhou to Lingshu. Yunmen's meeting with Suzhou is portrayed in a very similar manner as in WDBY 五燈會元 ZZ138:276c7-11 and CDLX 景德傳燈錄 [高麗本,Yangida ed.], p.551; however, no hurt foot is mentioned here. Again, its account of Yunmen's arrival at Xuefeng is practically identical with that given by WDBY 五燈會元. Because of its content and detail, late origin seems probable for this story. This source is not mentioned in the prefaces of 1053 and 1076, and it is not un-
reasonable to suggest 12th century origin or revision for this part of the YML. For the majority of later encounters, this text is our only source. On the whole the impression is strong that this is a later work, pieced together without much regard to the historical sequence of the encounters.

12. **CHANLIN SENGBAOZHUAN** 禪林僧寶傳: "Transmission of Treasures from the Chan Tradition".

Texts used: ZZ 127 / Kamakura Gosan 五山 text
Abbr. : **SBB 禪林僧寶傳**
Date : 1122
Author : Juefan Huihong (覺範慧洪; 1071-1128)

Huihong devoted a full chapter of this text to Yunmen. The biography of the Master goes into great detail; it is probable that the scholar-monk Huihong was aware that the Song gaozongshuan 宋高僧傳 does not contain any biography of the Master. This source is the first one to give detailed accounts for all of the test cases mentioned above (source 9); Yunmen's enlightenment on having his foot hurt, his arrival at and first interview with Yuefeng, the story of Lingshu's missing head monk and Yunmen's arrival, the circumstances surrounding Lingshu's death and Yunmen's accession, and the dream appearance followed by the opening of Yunmen's stupa are all related in colorful detail. No wonder that later authors were influenced by these accounts; it appears that the majority of subsequent writers diligently added more details to these stories.

Huihong, who claims to have seen a picture of Yunmen, is the only biographer to give a description of Yunmen's physical appearance. He was also the first author to mention an exact date for the beginning of Yunmen's 67-day stay at the imperial palace (Aug. 22, 948). Similarities to both ZSSY 祖庭事略 and the YML 禪門廣錄 suggest that the erudite author made use of all available sources when writing this biography. However, sources 2 to 4 were probably not among these.

13. **LONGXING FOJIAO BIANNIAN TONGLUN** 隆興佛教編年通論: "General Treatise by Year of Buddhist Teaching [written in] Longxing".

Text used : ZZ 130: 383a5-d8
Abbr. : **LTL 隆興佛教編年通論**
Date : before 1127
Author : Shishi Zuxiu (石室祖統; ? - after 1127)

The author of this text was a Chan monk and historian who, inspired by the Sima Guang's 司馬光 Zizhi tongjian 資治通鑑 ("Comprehensive Mirror for Aid in Government"; presented in 1084), set out to describe in chronological order all notable events and figures in Chinese Buddhist history from A.D. 64 to the later Zhou (後周; 951-960). The rather long biography of Yunmen is
found at the end of this work. Zuxiu compiled information from different sources: the account of Yunmen’s enlightenment resembles that of source 1 (IL 雲門行収), that of the arrival at Xuefeng is similar to source 11 (IFYL 遊方遇緣), and the text of the story about the dream appearance and opening of the stupa is similar to that given in YML 576b7-16. As the first chapters of this book reproduce the text of the CDL 景德傳燈錄, one can assume that Zuxiu also consulted the CDL 景德傳燈錄 while writing Yunmen’s biography. This assumption is supported by Zuxiu’s brief and unadorned account of Lingshu Hin’s death (353a18-b1); it stands in marked contrast to many other, more verbose, sources but is very similar to CDL 景德傳燈錄 T51 [207]日 1356cl. Lack of any firm evidence of influence from 8HZ 禪林僧實傳 may indicate that this biography was written earlier, or that Zuxiu did not get access to the 8HZ 禪林僧實傳.

The author’s discussion (lnm 論 353c18-d8) contains remarks on Yunmen’s records and their influence.

14. FOGUO YUANWU CHANSI BIYANLU 佛果圖悟禪師碧巖錄: "The Green Grotto Record of Chan Master Foguo Yuanwu".

Texts used: T 48[2003] / It.5 1953
Abbr. : BYL 碧巖錄
Date : 1128
Authors : Xuedou Chongxian (雪貴重頭; 980-1052) and
Yuanwu Roqin (圖悟克勤; 1063-1135)
Compiler : Puzhao (普照; n.d.)
Editor : Guan Wudang (闊無黨; n.d.)

This text, published in 1128, consists of 100 lectures given by Yuanwu Roqin 圖悟克勤 on the subject of a collection of 100 koan with appended poems by Xuedou Chongxian 雪貴重頭. Xuedou was a famous master in the fourth generation of the Yunmen line who injected new vigor in the Yunmen school. Many of the koan appearing in the Biyanlu feature Master Yunmen. Though Yuanwu did not provide a systematic biography of the Master, he goes into some detail concerning some central scenes of Yunmen’s life. In particular, case 33 contains a colorful account of Yunmen’s awakening, the “no-head monk story”, the story of Lingshu’s death, and unique details on Yunmen’s prolonged visit to the imperial palace. It is remarkable that in each of these cases except the last, substantial differences exist between the different extant texts. Other information given only in this text includes a three-year stay at ministry president Chen Cao’s home, a conversation at Master Qianfeng’s temple, and details about Yunmen’s attendant Xianglin 香林.

15. ZONGMEN LIANDENG HUYAO 宗門聯燈會要: "Collected Essentials from the Chan Tradition’s Successive [Records of the] Lamps".

Text used : ZZ 136
Abbr. : LDHY 聯燈會要
Date : 1183
Apart from an account of Yunmen's arrival at Xuefeng\(^{14}\) which resembles that of the CBZ 禪林僧寶傳, almost no biographical information is found in this source.

16. **WUDENG HUTUYUAN 五燈會元** : "Compendium of the Five Lamps".

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text used</th>
<th>ZZ 138</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abbr.</td>
<td>WDUY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>1253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Dachuan Puji (大川普濟; 1179-1253)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Almost the entire biography given by this text can also be found in other sources, namely, in the YHL 遊方通撮 and the CDLI 景德傅燈錄 [高麗本]. The correspondence of the biography to these two texts is as follows:

**WUDY**
- Youth, ordination, early studies, encounter with Meizhou, awakening, journey to Xuefeng (276c4-10)
- Arrival at Xuefeng, iron cangue story, first encounter with Xuefeng (276c12-d4)
- Private transmission, travels, arrival at Lingshu (276d4-9)
- Teaching at Lingshu and Yunmen for 30 years, death, dream appearance, opening of stupa (280d15-281a2)

**OTHER SOURCES**
- CDLI 景德傅燈錄 [高麗本], Yanagida ed., p.551c6-d2 (encounter with Meizhou and enlightenment also similar to YFYL 遊方通撮 T47[1988]574b5-10).
- CDLI 景德傅燈錄 [高麗本], Yanagida ed., p.555d2-7. (Yunmen's words of request to Juan are also identical to YHL 576b8-9).

The fact that this text contains entire passages from the third chapter of the YHL --- while CDLI 景德傅燈錄 [高麗本] does not --- supports the hypothesis that the CDLI is older than the WUDY 五燈會元.

17. **WUJIA ZHENGZONG ZAN 五家正宗贊** : "Tribute to the Correct Lineage of the Five [Chan] Houses".

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text used</th>
<th>ZZ 135</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abbr.</td>
<td>WJZZZ 五家正宗贊</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>1254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Zisou Shaotan (希叟紹曇; n.d.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This source is the last one to have a somewhat original version of the Master's biography: Mu-hzhou slammed the door on Yunmen's leg just after meeting him,\(^{1144}\) and the story about his first meeting with Xuefeng (otherwise almost identical with T**YTL** 三昧玄法錄 T49[1986]573b10-22) has an ending resembling that of SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 ZZ137:224c2-4.\(^{1144}\) The death of Lingshu and the circumstances of Yunmen's takeover are, except for a different beginning, related in the manner of the Ichiya text of the BYL 毗耶耶 case 6.\(^{1144}\)

18. *FOZU LIDAI TONGZAI* 佛祖歷代通載: "Chronological Comprehensive Account of the Buddha and the Patriarchs".
- Text used: T 49 [2036]
- Abbr.: FZTT 佛祖歷代通載
- Date: 1341
- Author: Meiwu Mianchang (梅屋念常, 1282-1341)

The text of this biography is virtually the same as that of LITL 隆興佛教編年通論 (source 13 above). However, it does not contain the LITL's "discussion" (353c18-d8).

19. *SHISHI JIGU LUE* 释氏稽古略: "Summary of Historical Research on Buddhism".
- Text used: T 49 [2037]
- Abbr.: 99JGL 释氏稽古略
- Date: Between 1341 and 1367
- Author: Baoghou Juean 買淵覺岸

Juean's biography of Yunmen is in several respects similar to that of source 12 (SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 especially the stories of Yunmen's enlightenment, of the "missing head monk", and of Lingshu's death and Yunmen's takeover). However, there are some peculiarities: no word is lost in this source about Yunmen's arrival at Xuefeng, and the arrival of Yunmen at Lingshu's temple is said to have happened in 930. Early sources and other texts, however, say that Yunmen arrived there after a visit to the Sixth Patriarch's grave in 911, and that in 910 he was already living at his new temple on Mt. Yunmen.
APPENDIX 6: LOST AND EXTANT TEXTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>N0</th>
<th>TEXT/AUTHOR/PUBLISHER</th>
<th>SOURCES; RELATIONS TO OTHER TEXTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10th cent.</td>
<td>T1</td>
<td>Notes taken by disciples, edited by Shou Jian 守堅. Not extant.</td>
<td>Referred to in ZTSY (1053 preface), Linjianlu, and BYL. Traces in CC and CDL.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10th/early 11th cent.</td>
<td>T2</td>
<td>Early manuscripts. Editor(s) unknown. Parts probably later printed as 雲門對機録和雲門和尚語錄 (雲門古録). Not extant.</td>
<td>Probably edited and enlarged versions of notes; referred to in ZTSY (ch. 1). Printed versions mentioned in the Tongshilue 道志略; 1149). 雲門對機録 prob. used by CDL.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1053</td>
<td>T3</td>
<td>Printed edition by Tianyi Yihuai 天衣義懷. Text lost, but preface extant.</td>
<td>Referred to in ZTSY 1 and 2 (preface). Yihuai edited and arranged earlier sources (quite possibly T2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11th cent.</td>
<td>T4</td>
<td>Text which Muun Shangqing commented in the ZTSY (ch.1). Not extant.</td>
<td>Mainly based on T2 (雲門對機録, 雲門古録) and T3 (cf. ZTSY ch. 1 and 2). Preface different from T3's.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1076</td>
<td>T5</td>
<td>Text edited and prefaced by Su Xie 蘇熙. Text lost, but preface extant.</td>
<td>Possibly similar to T3 and T4 but more comprehensive (first to include &quot;Critical Examinations&quot; and &quot;Biogr. Record&quot;).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1143-1147 (1120?)</td>
<td>T6</td>
<td>New edition in 3 chapters, compiled and published by Yongjue Zongyan 空覺宗演.</td>
<td>New edition of T5; text was compared with older versions and corrected. Contains most corrections proposed by ZTSY. Some materials added (pilgrimage record, testament, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1257</td>
<td>T7</td>
<td>Republication of T6 by Layman 覚行 of Hangzhou as appendix of the Gousunyuulu 古尊宿語録. Extant in Taiwan's National Library, Kyoto's Byosokuin, etc.</td>
<td>Republication of T5. Possibly inclusion of additional material. First complete extant text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Late Kamakura (14 C)</td>
<td>T8</td>
<td>Five Mountains (gosan 五山) edition. Extant at Byosokuin, etc.</td>
<td>Reproduction of T6 with added details and some added characters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1613</td>
<td>T9</td>
<td>Republication by 宗鉄 in Kyoto; Extant at 東洋 etc.</td>
<td>May have taken over T5 (?).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1615</td>
<td>T10</td>
<td>Text contained in the Ming Ming Tripitaka's Gousunyuulu 古尊宿語録; juan 15-18. Extant at Komazawa University, etc.</td>
<td>Improved version of T7.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1640</td>
<td>T11</td>
<td>Published by 敦賀屋久兵衛 in Kyoto. Extant at Komazawa University etc.</td>
<td>Printed with corrected plates of T9.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bdo period</td>
<td>T12</td>
<td>Published by 長村半兵衛. Extant at Komazawa University etc.</td>
<td>Reprint of T11 without publication details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1928</td>
<td>T13</td>
<td>Taisho Tripitaka edition (Vol. 47)</td>
<td>Based on T8, compared with T10 and T11.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lost and extant YML 237
## Appendix 7

**Content of Early Records of Yunmen**

(Sources in square brackets; italic numbers indicate sequence inside a text)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes</th>
<th>Taken by</th>
<th>Occasions</th>
<th>12-hour</th>
<th>Statements and Teachings from Master's Room Examinations Record</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early MSS.</td>
<td>Corr. to Yuannin</td>
<td>[ZTSY]</td>
<td>[ZTSY]</td>
<td>[ZTSY]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>序</th>
<th>12-hour</th>
<th>Statements and Teachings from Master's Room Examinations Record</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1053</td>
<td>前</td>
<td>[ZTSY]</td>
<td>[ZTSY]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>序</th>
<th>12-hour</th>
<th>Statements and Teachings from Master's Room Examinations Record</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1076</td>
<td>前</td>
<td>[1076P]</td>
<td>[1076P]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Extant**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>序</th>
<th>12-hour</th>
<th>Statements and Teachings from Critical Biogr.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1076</td>
<td>前</td>
<td>[1076P]</td>
<td>[1076P]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Record of Pilgrimages**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>序</th>
<th>Testament</th>
<th>Instructions</th>
<th>Petition/dream account</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1076</td>
<td>前</td>
<td>[1076P]</td>
<td>[1076P]</td>
<td>[1076P]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Lost and Extant YML 238 Appendix 6
### APPENDIX 8

**CHODANG CHIP 祖堂集 AND YML**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CC (祖堂集)</th>
<th>YML (雲門廣錄; chapter)</th>
<th>REMARKS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.91,14 - 3.92,08</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>Biography. No obvious relation to YML biography.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.92,08 - 3.92,09</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>One exchange; not found in YML</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.92,09 - 3.92,10</td>
<td>566a8 (II; 垂示代語)</td>
<td>One almost identical exchange; context somewhat different</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.92,10 - 3.93,12</td>
<td>553b11-18 (I; 十二時歌)</td>
<td>The CC's songs are substantially different and much longer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.93,12 - 3.94,08</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>Zongluo verses (宗跡偈). Not found in YML.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.94,08 - 3.94,10</td>
<td>566a22-24 (II; 垂示代語)</td>
<td>Similar passage; in CC it is a monologue, in YML a dialogue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.94,10 - 3.94,13</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>One exchange; not found in the YML.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.94,13 - 3.94,14</td>
<td>550b19-20 (I; 對機)</td>
<td>One almost identical exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.94,14 - 3.95,02</td>
<td>549a29-b2 (I; 對機)</td>
<td>One almost identical exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.95,02</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>Short exchange not found in YML.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.95,02 - 3.95,04</td>
<td>546a17-19 (I; 對機)</td>
<td>Very similar exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.95,04 - 3.95,06</td>
<td>571a03-5 (III; 勸辨)</td>
<td>Similar exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.95,07 - 3.95,08</td>
<td>570b18-19 (III; 勸辨)</td>
<td>Similar exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDL (景德傳燈録)</td>
<td>YML (雲門實錄)</td>
<td>REMARKS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>356c2-3</td>
<td>545b1-2</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>356c2-14</td>
<td>545b16-26</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical instruction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>356c15-28</td>
<td>546c20-546a4</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>356c19-357a3</td>
<td>546d19-23</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357a6-8</td>
<td>546d11-14</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357a9</td>
<td>547a2</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357a10-27</td>
<td>546d28-c16</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical instruction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357a28-c11</td>
<td>547a4-b15</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357c13-25</td>
<td>548b7-21</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357c17-358a6</td>
<td>548c8-15</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>358a7-10</td>
<td>549a6-11</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359a11-18</td>
<td>549b18-c6</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359a19-20</td>
<td>550b27-29</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359a21-b3</td>
<td>550a22-55</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359a4-6</td>
<td>551c20-22</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359b6-25</td>
<td>552a4-24</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c8-9</td>
<td>??</td>
<td>Not found in YML</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c29-359a1</td>
<td>567b24-27</td>
<td>(III:勉辨) Somewhat different exchange.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c29-c10</td>
<td>549b8-10</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c3</td>
<td>549b32</td>
<td>(I:對機) Beginning of exchange identical; YML goes on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c3-3</td>
<td>546c20-22</td>
<td>(I:對機) Questions identical, but answers reversed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c4-6</td>
<td>548b24-25</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c5-9</td>
<td>??</td>
<td>Not found in YML</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c10</td>
<td>553c14</td>
<td>(I:居) Identical verse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c11-12</td>
<td>545c5-6</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c12-14</td>
<td>549a23-b2</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c15</td>
<td>552c24-25</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c16-17</td>
<td>540c4</td>
<td>(I:對機) Identical question, different answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c17-18</td>
<td>540b22-23</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c18</td>
<td>553a2</td>
<td>(I:對機) &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c19-22</td>
<td>548c1-2</td>
<td>(I:對機) Slightly different exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c21-22</td>
<td>546b15</td>
<td>(I:對機) Essentially identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c22</td>
<td>549c12-23</td>
<td>(I:對機) Somewhat different question, identical answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c23</td>
<td>547c2</td>
<td>(I:對機) Identical question, somewhat different answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c24</td>
<td>546a24</td>
<td>(I:對機) Identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c25</td>
<td>546c2</td>
<td>(I:對機) Diff. question, same first answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c26</td>
<td>(546c17)</td>
<td>(I:對機) No second answer in YML</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c27</td>
<td>550c16-17</td>
<td>(I:對機) Slightly different exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c28</td>
<td>546c9</td>
<td>(I:對機) Different question, identical answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359c29-359a1</td>
<td>(552a27)</td>
<td>(I:對機) Different question and setting, ident. answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359a1-3</td>
<td>551b19-21</td>
<td>(I:居) Essentially identical verse</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## APPENDIX 10

### ZUTING SHIYUAN 祖庭事苑 AND YML

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ZTSY chapter</th>
<th>Lost YML chapter</th>
<th>1ML chapter/part</th>
<th>Remark/Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2a9</td>
<td>545a8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Entries from ZTSY 2a9 to 3a15 (first 24 items) do not appear in today's YML text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2a11</td>
<td>545a9</td>
<td></td>
<td>(with an insignificant chance exception) not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2a14</td>
<td>545a10</td>
<td></td>
<td>It is likely that these 23 items stem from an old preface which is now lost.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2a17</td>
<td>545a11</td>
<td></td>
<td>This hypothesis is supported by the fact that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b4</td>
<td>545a12</td>
<td></td>
<td>subsequent entries in the commentary (starting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b8</td>
<td>545a13</td>
<td></td>
<td>with 3a15) correspond the the beginning of the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b13</td>
<td>545a14</td>
<td></td>
<td>YML text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b14</td>
<td>545a15</td>
<td></td>
<td>The commented items appear neither in the 1053 nor in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b16</td>
<td>545a16</td>
<td></td>
<td>the 1076 preface.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No correspondence in the YML for these items;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(probably stem from an old, lost preface)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3c1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3c6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**CHAPTER 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ZTSY chapter</th>
<th>Lost YML chapter</th>
<th>1ML chapter/part</th>
<th>Remark/Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3a15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>From ZTSY 3a15 to 6a14, almost all of the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>75 commented items are found in the first</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>chapter of the YML.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Not only that: they appear in almost exactly the same</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>order. The 7Taishō page, section, and line numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>in the YML column on the right show a steady</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>upward progression -- proof that today's text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>is very similarly arranged as the one on which ZTSY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3c1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>author Huan commented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3c6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Of the three items that were not located in the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>YML, one (ZTSY 5b12: 通) is a frequently encountered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>particle. The two other items (4a6: 起気, and 4d5: 次第) could point to slight textual differences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Such differences probably are traces of the efforts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>of the succession of editors that &quot;corrected&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>and &quot;arranged&quot; the text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>However, the surprisingly small number of such</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>differences and the sequential linkage of the ZTSY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3d16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>comments to the extant YML text indicate that</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the first chapter of the text (except the preface, of course) emerged remarkably unscathed from editorial manipulations.

In the course of his commentary on this first chapter, ZTSY author Huan refers once (3d11) to the "Old Record of Yunmen" (雲門古錄) and twice to the "Old text of Tianyi" (天衣古本; 5c16 and 5d8). The second text is frequently adduced by Huan in order to support his proposed corrections. We notice that the extant YHL text follows these corrections most of the time. This indicates that a later editor of Yunmen's records (who may also have had access to the Tianyi text of 1063) took Huan's suggestions to heart. The item commented here (ZTSY 5d6) appears in an exchange of Master Yunmen with a Daoist priest. To judge from the sequence of Huan's commentary, it probably followed one of the instructions that are now found in YML 552c.
From ZTSY 6bl0 to 6c5, some expressions are taken up which stem from the poems now found at the very end of the YHL's third chapter (576b-c). This shows that Huan's basic text had, like the "Record of Yunmen's Responses to Occasions" (雲朝對機錄) mentioned in ZTSY 6c5, these poems appended to the first chapter. The poems themselves and their order, however, appear to be the same.

Four items from the beginning of chapter two (下) of Huan's basic text are not found in today's YHL; some difference of content is thus likely.

The rest of Huan's second chapter corresponds, to judge from commented items, rather closely to the second part of the extant YHL's second chapter, i.e. the "Statements and Substitute Answers" (垂示借吾; YHL 553c24-561c4). The overall sequence of this section and the following ("Essence of Words from Inside the Master's Room") is the reverse of that in Huan's commented text, but inside both sections no great divergences of order are noticed between Huan's and our text.

This item was not found in the YHL.

It appears that Huan's text contained at this place a small section of the "Critical Examinations" (勘辨). [That only two entries in Huan's commentary can be unequivocally related to these Examinations which form almost one fifth of our YHL text (much of its third...
Huan knew as "Yunmen's records". Furthermore, this could be an indication that Huan did not know the 1076 edition (if that edition, as its preface affirms, indeed contained these "Examinations").
Some different material appears to have been present at the end of this section. The expression commented upon in 10b13 (趙州無賓主) is a Chan commonplace.
APPENDIX 11

XUKAI_GUZUNSU_YUYAO 續聞古尊宿語要
(ZZ 118) AND YML

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>XQTV</th>
<th>YML (雲門廣錄; chapter)</th>
<th>REMARKS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>439c03-05</td>
<td>545b02-05</td>
<td>Practically identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439c05-06</td>
<td>545b12-14</td>
<td>Identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439c06-08</td>
<td>545b28-c1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439c08-10</td>
<td>545b04-06</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439c10-12</td>
<td>545c07-10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439c12-13</td>
<td>545c18-19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439c13-17</td>
<td>545c20-546a5</td>
<td>Almost ident. instruction (some different graphs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439d08</td>
<td>546a10-11</td>
<td>Identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439d09-13</td>
<td>546a19-24</td>
<td>Almost identical instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439d13-14</td>
<td>546a27-28</td>
<td>Identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439d14-15</td>
<td>546b09-10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>439d16-44a13</td>
<td>546b28-c17</td>
<td>Almost ident. instruction (some different graphs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440a14-c13</td>
<td>547a04-b17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440c14-16</td>
<td>547b28-c2</td>
<td>Identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440c16-17</td>
<td>547c19-20</td>
<td>Almost identical exchange (some different graphs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440c17-18</td>
<td>548b05-07</td>
<td>(beginning different)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d02-06</td>
<td>549c28-550a3</td>
<td>Slightly different address (beginning, graphs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d07</td>
<td>550b05-06</td>
<td>Identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d07-8</td>
<td>550b15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d08-10</td>
<td>550c04-05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d10-11</td>
<td>550c19-20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d11-13</td>
<td>551b24-25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d14-15</td>
<td>551c14-15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440d16-44a15</td>
<td>552a04-25</td>
<td>Almost ident. instruction (some different graphs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441a16-c8</td>
<td>552b25-c8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441b09-10</td>
<td>552c27-29</td>
<td>Identical exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441b10-c01</td>
<td>553c13-16</td>
<td>Almost identical verse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441c03-05</td>
<td>554a13-15</td>
<td>(II;室中語要) Identical talk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441c06-09</td>
<td>554b16-19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441c10-11</td>
<td>554b22-24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441c12-13</td>
<td>554b28-c01</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441c14-17</td>
<td>555a03-07</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441c18-d02</td>
<td>555b28-c02</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441d03-05</td>
<td>555c03-06</td>
<td>graph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441d06-07</td>
<td>555c09-11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441d08-10</td>
<td>555c28-556a01</td>
<td>Identical talk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441d11-13</td>
<td>556b29-557a02</td>
<td>Identical except for different graph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441d14-15</td>
<td>557a28-b01</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>441d16-18</td>
<td>557b29-c02</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442a01-05</td>
<td>558b20-25</td>
<td>Identical talk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442a08-15</td>
<td>560a17-26</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442a16-18</td>
<td>560b01-03</td>
<td>graph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442b01-04</td>
<td>560b04-07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442b05-07</td>
<td>Identical talk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442b08-12</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442b13-16</td>
<td>Identical talk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442b17-03</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442c03-04</td>
<td>Identical talk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442c04-06</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442c06-07</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442c08-09</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442c09-11</td>
<td>Identical except for different graphs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442c11-12</td>
<td>One character and some graphs different</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442c12-15</td>
<td>Identical talk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442d01-15</td>
<td>Identical account except for some diff. graphs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>442d15-443a06</td>
<td>Identical account</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>443a06-15</td>
<td>Identical account</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>443a15-b08</td>
<td>Identical account</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>443b08-13</td>
<td>Identical account</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>443b13-15</td>
<td>Identical account</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>443b16-c03</td>
<td>Identical account</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## APPENDIX 12

### TRANSLATED YUNMENLU PASSAGES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Passage</th>
<th>English Title</th>
<th>Page Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>544c28-545a12: Appendix 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a15-b01: Instruction 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a16-17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a18-20</td>
<td>p. 75-80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a21</td>
<td>p. 89</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a23-24</td>
<td>p. 154</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a23-25</td>
<td>p. 71,108</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a26-27</td>
<td>p. 72,108</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545a27-b1</td>
<td>p. 131</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545b02-5</td>
<td>p. 43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545b08-10</td>
<td>p. 131-41</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545b14-15</td>
<td>p. 120-15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545b15-18</td>
<td>p. 81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545b15-27 Instruction 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545b18-20</td>
<td>p. 73-15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545b20-23</td>
<td>p. 73-120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546c08</td>
<td>p. 124</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545c10-11</td>
<td>p. 74,151</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545c17</td>
<td>p. 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545c18-19</td>
<td>p. 153</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545c19</td>
<td>p. 155</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545c20-24</td>
<td>p. 77</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545c20-546a5 Instruction 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>545c28-546a2: p. 88,186</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a02-3</td>
<td>p. 78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a10-11</td>
<td>p. 159</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a19-24 Instruction 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a19-20</td>
<td>p. 132</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a24-25</td>
<td>p. 136-118</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a25-27</td>
<td>p. 120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a27-28</td>
<td>p. 54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546a28-b1</td>
<td>p. 109</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b02-3</td>
<td>p. 124</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b03-5</td>
<td>p. 120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b11-14</td>
<td>p. 79</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b20</td>
<td>p. 120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b20-22</td>
<td>p. 52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b27</td>
<td>p. 183</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b28-29</td>
<td>p. 76</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b39-4</td>
<td>p. 109</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b40-5</td>
<td>p. 132</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b41-2</td>
<td>p. 77,151</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b42-17</td>
<td>p. 118</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b18-19</td>
<td>p. 56,116</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b20-24</td>
<td>p. 92,122</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b22-24</td>
<td>p. 53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b23-24</td>
<td>p. 54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b27-29</td>
<td>p. 137</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b39-4</td>
<td>p. 116</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b40-5</td>
<td>p. 69</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b41-2</td>
<td>p. 93</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b42-17</td>
<td>p. 132</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>546b43-4</td>
<td>p. 158</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Instruction Type</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>550c20-21</td>
<td>p. 54, 122</td>
<td>550c03 : p. 81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>550c21-22</td>
<td>p. 73</td>
<td>550a05-7 : p. 87, 176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>550c27-551a4</td>
<td>Instruction 11</td>
<td>550a04-6 : p. 127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>550c27-551al</td>
<td>p. 153</td>
<td>550a08-10 : p. 171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>550c28-551al</td>
<td>p. 78</td>
<td>553a04-7 : p. 52, 95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551a01-3</td>
<td>p. 168</td>
<td>553a04-6 : p. 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551a07-9</td>
<td>p. 55</td>
<td>553a13-14 : p. 169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551a10-24</td>
<td>Instruction 12</td>
<td>553a14-16 : p. 77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551a17-18</td>
<td>p. 69</td>
<td>555a16-18 : p. 76, 150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551a19-23</td>
<td>p. 188</td>
<td>555a19-21 : p. 92, 166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a20-24</td>
<td>p. 128</td>
<td>555a20-23 : p. 78, 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551b07-9</td>
<td>p. 116</td>
<td>555a22-23 : p. 85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551b12-13</td>
<td>p. 129</td>
<td>555c01-3 : p. 76, 170, 179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551b14-15</td>
<td>p. 83</td>
<td>555c04-09 : Instruction 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551b20-22</td>
<td>p. 82</td>
<td>555c17 : p. 177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551c06-7</td>
<td>p. 116</td>
<td>555b10-11-24 : Instruction 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551c07-10</td>
<td>p. 53</td>
<td>555b13-14 : p. 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551c12-13</td>
<td>p. 121</td>
<td>555c21-23 : p. 115, 178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551c20-22</td>
<td>p. 128</td>
<td>555c22-23 : p. 166, 177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551c22-25</td>
<td>p. 55, 118</td>
<td>555c23-24 : p. 110, 175, 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551c28-29</td>
<td>p. 51</td>
<td>555c24-25 : p. 123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>551c29-552al</td>
<td>p. 120</td>
<td>555b02-5 : p. 123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a01-3</td>
<td>p. 88, 119</td>
<td>555b05-9 : p. 157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a04-25</td>
<td>Instruction 13</td>
<td>555b14-17 : p. 63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a04-5</td>
<td>p. 83</td>
<td>555b16-19 : p. 120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a06-7</td>
<td>p. 74</td>
<td>555c12-14 : p. 113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a06-10</td>
<td>p. 93-94</td>
<td>555c15-18 : p. 61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a07-10</td>
<td>p. 137</td>
<td>555c21-23 : p. 144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a13-15</td>
<td>p. 94</td>
<td>555c24-28 : p. 64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a15-18</td>
<td>p. 93</td>
<td>555d07-9 : p. 45, 110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a19-20</td>
<td>p. 132</td>
<td>555d07-9 : p. 45, 110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a22-24</td>
<td>p. 108</td>
<td>555d09-14 : p. 95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a22-25</td>
<td>p. 136</td>
<td>555d10-14 : p. 111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552a23-27</td>
<td>p. 71</td>
<td>555d11-15 : p. 111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552b05-7</td>
<td>p. 53, 119</td>
<td>555d12-16 : p. 93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552b10-12</td>
<td>p. 156</td>
<td>555d14-18 : p. 82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552b20-22</td>
<td>p. 73</td>
<td>555d15-18 : p. 82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552b25-28</td>
<td>Instruction 14</td>
<td>555d16-20 : p. 111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552b27-28</td>
<td>p. 72</td>
<td>555d20-21 : p. 123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552b29-25</td>
<td>p. 91</td>
<td>555d27-31 : p. 47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552c04-5</td>
<td>p. 91</td>
<td>555e05-8 : p. 85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552c05-8</td>
<td>p. 69, 129</td>
<td>555e10-14 : p. 88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552c13-17</td>
<td>p. 83</td>
<td>555e15-19 : p. 88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552c18-22</td>
<td>p. 95, 182</td>
<td>555e20-24 : p. 112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552c24</td>
<td>p. 124</td>
<td>555e21-25 : p. 112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552c24-26</td>
<td>p. 94</td>
<td>555e26-27-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552c26-27</td>
<td>p. 51</td>
<td>555f01-3 : p. 111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Translated passages**

**APPENDIX 12**
TRANSLATED STELE PASSAGES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page Range</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8959 110.11-14</td>
<td>p. 10, note 63a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8959 111.11-114.1</td>
<td>pp. 10-17, note 71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8959 112.15-113.3</td>
<td>p. 8, note 75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8959 112.16</td>
<td>p. 74, note 114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8959 113.11-13</td>
<td>p. 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8959 113.16-114.1</td>
<td>p. 9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# APPENDIX 13

## LIST OF NOTES ON CHAN VOCABULARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expression</th>
<th>Endnote Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anshan 按山 / 按山</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benfen 本分</td>
<td>184, 993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benlai wushi 本來無事</td>
<td>947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bofu ye 菩福業</td>
<td>1032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boxiang 鉢囊</td>
<td>990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bozasui 百雜碎</td>
<td>830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulu feng guju 不露鋸骨句</td>
<td>1121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bu zhuobian 不著便</td>
<td>994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canchan 参禪</td>
<td>1101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caoxi 曹溪</td>
<td>1007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ce 塹</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chanchuan 禪床</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changan sui le 長安離樂</td>
<td>1120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changdao zhi ji 唱道之機</td>
<td>937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chang lianchuan 長連床</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chengdang 承當</td>
<td>977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chuankou ling 傅口令</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chui zheyao 植折腰</td>
<td>1087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chumu wushi 觸目無滯</td>
<td>819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chushi 出世</td>
<td>1107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chuxin houxue 初心後學</td>
<td>1035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dadi buyu zuojia 打底不遇作家</td>
<td>1084</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dadi quanshou 大地全收</td>
<td>587</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dai jiao 戴角</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dailei 帶累</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daode 道得</td>
<td>611</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daoli 道理</td>
<td>1012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daoshao 道著</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dayezhai 打野</td>
<td>1020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dazhangfu han 大丈夫漢</td>
<td>992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dianjian 點檢</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dier ji 第二機</td>
<td>666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dingding 釘釘</td>
<td>1034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dongqu xiqu 東覓西覓</td>
<td>766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dongxing xixing 東行西行</td>
<td>1099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ersanji 二三機</td>
<td>1051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E ye 惡業</td>
<td>988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fa benfa wufa 法本法無法</td>
<td>771</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fafa benlai fa 法法本來法</td>
<td>770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fangzhang 方丈</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fantou 飯頭</td>
<td>1117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feiju shishi ju 非旬始是旬</td>
<td>464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feng suishen 粉骨碎身</td>
<td>489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuzi 揊子</td>
<td>1054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ganshijue 乾屎橛</td>
<td>1108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genjiao xia 根脚下</td>
<td>983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geteng 葛藤</td>
<td>1086</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geteng she 葛藤社</td>
<td>746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gong bulang shi 功不浪施</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gongxujiu 公才語</td>
<td>1076</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guo 復得</td>
<td>1052</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guang fei zhao jing 光非照境</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guang an 過患</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guren 古人</td>
<td>995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hei manmandi 黑漫漫地</td>
<td>763</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hei qi xiangsi 黑漆相似</td>
<td>1028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hengshuo shushuo 橫說豎說</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hualu 話路</td>
<td>1030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huamen zhi shuo 化門之說</td>
<td>1005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huangquan 黃泉</td>
<td>750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huatou 話頭</td>
<td>1002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huayaoian 花葉柵</td>
<td>616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hubing 鎖餅</td>
<td>1010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huzhong 胡種</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huzhongzu 胡種族</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jian 鑑</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jian 翼</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jiangwei 將謂</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jiangwei 將為</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jian wen jue zhi 見聞覺知</td>
<td>1013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jiazhou daxiang 嘉州大像</td>
<td>760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jie liu 捕流</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jieshiwen 借事問</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jing 境</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jingchu sapohe 靜處薩婆诃</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jinseng er yuzhen 金聲而玉振</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jiuchu dachu yu 就處打出語</td>
<td>1077</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jize 極則</td>
<td>1064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juan shu dezhi 巻舒得志</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jujue 聖覺</td>
<td>594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juli ceng feng 句裏藏鋒</td>
<td>974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juli chengji 句裏呈機</td>
<td>941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keshuihan 睡睡漫</td>
<td>967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laopo shuohua 老婆說話</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laoye 老爺</td>
<td>724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laoye laoniang 老爺老孃</td>
<td>1079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Layue ershiwu 腊月二十五</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Layue sanshiri 腊月三十日</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liangji yong yiduan bu 兩斤麻一段布</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu shih 六識</td>
<td>1014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luantong 亂統</td>
<td>1066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lue xu 捨虛</td>
<td>982</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lue xu han 捨虛模</td>
<td>962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lünian 驴年</td>
<td>1080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lünian mengjian 驴年夢見</td>
<td>657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luocao 落草</td>
<td>1109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luoluo li 逻逻李</td>
<td>598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maimo 埋沒</td>
<td>948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mending 門庭</td>
<td>765, 942</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mending zhi shuo 門庭之說</td>
<td>965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mie huzhong 滿胡種</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minyan ren 明眼人</td>
<td>946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muqian wu yicao 目前無異草</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nannan 喃喃</td>
<td>1123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naseng 無僧</td>
<td>1006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nianque 擊却</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ouou 呼呼</td>
<td>1065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pangjia 傍家</td>
<td>1039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pidai 皮袋</td>
<td>1075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pingchen 平沈</td>
<td>1008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pingchu 平出</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pingzhan 平展</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qiancha tongche 千差同輈</td>
<td>1004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qianchui 鉛鎚</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qidian badao 七題八倒</td>
<td>1116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qianli duolizuan 秦時楟桿</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qitong 漆桶</td>
<td>645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qixi 氣息</td>
<td>1115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qizong beheng 七縱八橫</td>
<td>835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quanhui 鈆煬</td>
<td>697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qujia 去就</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qumu 曲木</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu xing 取性</td>
<td>1029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruan ming 熱煬喝</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rili kan shan 日里看山</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruhe shi xuener ziji 如何是學人自己</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rulu 入路</td>
<td>996, 1083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Runi rushui 入泥入水</td>
<td>488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rutou chu 入頭處</td>
<td>1017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanjiaocunli han 三家村裏漢</td>
<td>656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanjiaocunli laopo shuhua 三家村裏老婆說話</td>
<td>1094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanqian daqian shijie 三千大千世界</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanzang wusheng 三藏五乗</td>
<td>938</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shahuo linshi 殺活臨時</td>
<td>836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shanfu tieniu 陝府鐵牛</td>
<td>624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shangcaiyu 上才語</td>
<td>1076</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shangdaren 上大人</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheng se fa 聲色法</td>
<td>1014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheng xiang wei chu chang sanmei 聲香味觸常三昧</td>
<td>646</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shengyuan suo zai 生緣所在</td>
<td>1041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifa zhu fawei, shijianxiang changzhu 是法住法位、世間相常住</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shihui niaohuo nizhu jiegou 境灰尿火泥垢狗</td>
<td>737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shijie 時節</td>
<td>767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shilai 適來</td>
<td>612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shiseng 師僧</td>
<td>1023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoujiao 手腳</td>
<td>664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shouqu 受屈</td>
<td>1088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shuang lin 雙林</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shuiguiu 水 特牛</td>
<td>1067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shunzhu 順朱</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sida 四大</td>
<td>1092</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siji 死急</td>
<td>1019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sima yi 死馬醫</td>
<td>972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suiyu shiren 隨語識人</td>
<td>1110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiandao 順倒</td>
<td>858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti lu 體露</td>
<td>761</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tipozong 提婆宗</td>
<td>756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiwu 體語</td>
<td>1078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toujiao 頭角</td>
<td>989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tou shang an tou 頭上安頭</td>
<td>1071</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuosheng 託生</td>
<td>1074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wan rou zuo chang 蟹肉作瘟</td>
<td>979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wo shi buhuo yi 我事不獲已</td>
<td>958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wufeng 無分</td>
<td>993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wufeng zaza zhi bo 無風匪匪之波</td>
<td>821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wushi bajiao 五時八教</td>
<td>939</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wu shih 無事</td>
<td>947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wushiren 無事人</td>
<td>822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wuwei 無為</td>
<td>866</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wuyun 五雲</td>
<td>1093</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xiangdao 向道</td>
<td>1122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xiangji 像季</td>
<td>1022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Chan vocabulary notes</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xiang maimo 楊埋沒</td>
<td>942</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xiangshang yiqiao 向上一覧</td>
<td>823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xianzheng gongan 現成公案</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xiaoshi 小師</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xiao xin shi 消信施</td>
<td>1027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xingen 信根</td>
<td>987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xinghai 性海</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xingzao 性燥 / 性躁 / 性憤</td>
<td>662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xingzao han 性憤漠</td>
<td>662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xueren jishi buming 學人己事不明</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xueren 學人</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xue shang jia shuang 雪上加霜</td>
<td>1072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xu ..... shide 須.....始得</td>
<td>1096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yanluo wang 閻羅王</td>
<td>1033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yanzhong you xiang 言中有響</td>
<td>409, 973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yanzhuan 驗主問</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yibo 衣鉢</td>
<td>674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yicheng 一乘</td>
<td>940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yiduan shi 一段事</td>
<td>985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yinke 印可</td>
<td>1031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yiren zongheng 任縱橫</td>
<td>747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yize yu 一則語</td>
<td>976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yizhuan 一轉</td>
<td>1098</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yizhuang lingguo 一往領過</td>
<td>1062</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yuren shiren 遇人識人</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You sheme shi 有什麼事</td>
<td>947, 1037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhanboguo 占波國 / 占婆 / 驚波</td>
<td>752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhanyang liang shou 扮兩手</td>
<td>648</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhao wen dao 朝聞道</td>
<td>675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhao wo remen 著我熱吻</td>
<td>444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhaozhou shiqiao 趙州石橋</td>
<td>759</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zheng hao bian 正好辯</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhenzhong 珍重</td>
<td>997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhijiang yiwen lai 置將一閑來</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhiyou 知有</td>
<td>1063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhi zhi ren xin jian xing cheng fo 直指人心、見性成佛</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhufa wuyi zhe 諸法無異者</td>
<td>870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhuobian 著便</td>
<td>994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhuoran 嗎然</td>
<td>1011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhupu 注破</td>
<td>1053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zijia 自家</td>
<td>954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zongcheng 宗乘</td>
<td>1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zongheng shizi 縱樹十字</td>
<td>970</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zuji genjiao xia 自己根腳下</td>
<td>983</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. The most important are the editors of ZOD 禪學大辭典 (biography on p. 1101b); Suzuki Tetsuo 鈴木哲雄 (“Umon Bao’en to Nankan 雲門文暹と南康,” Indogaku bunkyôshiseki 寶學佛教史紀 vol. 33.1 [Dec. 1984], pp. 30-55); Shiina Kôyû 椎名宏雄 (“Umon kôroku to sono shôrokubon no keitô 雲門語錄とその抄録本の系譜,” Journal of Sôtô Studies [Shûgaku kenkyû 禪學研究] 24 [March 1982], 189-195); Nagai Namashi 永井政之 (“Umon no goroku no seiritsu ni kansuru ichi kôsatsu 雲門語録の成立に関する一考察,” Shûgaku kenkyû 禪學研究 13 [1981], pp. 111-115); and Cen, Yuelü (Yunwen shanzi 雲門山志, Hongkong, 1951).


5. Biographical information is found in CC 祖堂集 5.104.12 ff., CDL 景德傳錄 Y51(2076)291a20 ff., and WDBY 五燈會元 ZZ138:73d.

6. VDBY 五燈會元 ZZ138:73d gives his age when he died as 96 years and the length of his monkdom as 76 years. Since Muzhou is said to have been head monk under Huangbo Xiyun 賀鑒希運 who (according to ZOD 禪學大辭典, p. 192b) died between 847 and 859, we can assume that in 856 Muzhou was at least about 30 years old, but probably he was older. Since Yuanen visited Muzhou about 40 years later (around age 25) around 890, Muzhou must have been at least 70 years of age (and possibly substantially older) at the time of this visit.

7. Cf. also Yanagida’s remarks on Muzhou and his records in “Goroku no rekishi 語録の歴史,” Tōhōkaikan 東方学院 (Kyoto) 57 (1985), pp. 577-578.

8. This inference is supported by the nianpu section of Master Xuefeng’s record which says that in the year 894 (age of Xuefeng 73) Wenyuan, Xuanzang, Qingsong, and Guizong became Xuefeng’s disciples (ZZ215: 490a11-12).


10. Not more is known about this man than that his name appears in CDL 景德傳錄 Y51(2076)388a29 as one of two successors of Guizong Danquan 靈宗丹權. For Guizong, cf. note 32.


13. Several masters were called Wolong [cf. Suzuki, Tetsuo 鈴木哲雄, Chôgaku renshû jisanai sakain 鍾離正直真一拾金].

NOTES
14. This mountain, situated in the Houguan district north of Fuzhou, was one of the principal centers of the Xuefeng / Xuansha line (cf. ZGD 神學大辭典, p. 39b). If Yunmen's conversation with Anguo Huiqiu took place on Mt. Wolong then one could infer that this was between 908 (Xuefeng's and Xuansha's death; Huiqiu's move to Mt. Wolong) and 911 (Yunmen's visit to Caoqi).

15. 此山現在名為自縣, 是在福州的侯官縣, 為漢朝時的太學之一。Xuefe 時,哥峰/ Y. uansha 玄沙 line (cf. ZGD 神學大辭典, p.93b). 1f Yunm帥, s conversation with Anguo Huiqiu took place on Ht. Wolong then one could infer that this was between 908 (Xuefeng's and Xuansha's death; Huiqiu's move to Ht. Wolong) and 911 (Yunmen's visit to Caoqi).

16. This is Master Changqing Hui1eng 長慶慧域. Biographies are found in CC 祖堂集 10, SGSC 宋高僧傳 13, CDL 景德傳燈錄 17, VDBY 五燈會要 22, and WDBY 五燈會元 13 contain biographical information.

17. This mountain is in the Linchuan district 臨川縣 in the northeast of the modern Jiangxi province, about 80 km southeast of Lake Poyang.

18. Jap. Sôzan Honjaku (曹山本寂; 840-901); one of the fathers of the modern Sôtô school. Lived from 840-901. For biographical sources, see ZGD 神學大辭典, p.1163c.

19. This mountain was originally called Heyushan 荷玉山 but was renamed Caoqsh in the memory of the Sixth Patriarch who was often called Caoqi 曹溪 after his place of residence in northern Guangdong. Caoshan is situated about 120 km south of Lake Poyang in the Linquan district 臨川縣 of today's Jiangxi province.

20. This mountain is in the Linchuan district 臨川縣 in the northeast of the modern Jiangxi province, about 80 km southeast of Lake Poyang.

21. Jap. Sôzan Honjaku (曹山本寂; 840-901); one of the fathers of the modern Sôtô school. Lived from 840-901. For biographical sources, see ZGD 神學大辭典, p.1163c.

22. This mountain was originally called Heyushan 荷玉山 but was renamed Caoqsh in the memory of the Sixth Patriarch who was often called Caoqi 曹溪 after his place of residence in northern Guangdong. Caoshan is situated about 120 km south of Lake Poyang in the Linquan district 臨川縣 of today's Jiangxi province.


24. C：HR 中國禪宗名人索引 (p.278) has several masters who bear this name and are associated with Xuefeng of his disciples. Unfortunately their biographies do not give any definite dates. However, Anguo Hongtao 安國弘多 is said to have studied under Xuefeng, left on pilgrimage, and came back to Master Xuefeng. Thus he could already have been old at the time of Yunmen's visit. Furthermore, he is the only one of the men in question here who has a biography in the CC 祖堂集.


26. The first is only once mentioned by name (CDL 景德傳燈錄 T51[1076]334a20), but from the second we also have a few dicta (CDL 景德傳燈錄 T51[1076] 334a11-15; name only in 334a15).

27. Xinzhou 信州 lies about 150 km southeast of Lake Poyang in the northeast of today's Jiangxi
province.

28. Biographical information is found in CC 祖堂集 3.45, CDL 景德傳燈錄 T51(2076)350b, and VDHY 五燈會元 ZSI38:132d.

29. It is also found in SBZ 祖林僧賓傳 ZSI37:224c-d, YBL 碧簡録 P.48(2003)172a-b, and VDHY 五燈會元 ZSI38:280c.

30. For more information on this man and biographical sources see ZGD 禪學大辭典, p. 871.


32. Guizong Danquan is a dharma successor of Yunju Daoying. For biographical information see ZGD 禪學大辭典 p.836b, and CDL 景德傳燈錄 T51(2076)362c, VDHY 五燈會元 ZSI38:250d, and VDHY 五燈會元 ZSI38:313b-314a.

33. Cf. YHL 574c15.

34. YHL 雲門廣錄 YL(1988)574c18.

35. If this was Guanxi Zhixian, a successor of Linji Yixuan 蘭極義玄 who lived in Guanxi 滬溪志聞, and died in 895, then this visit would have taken place at the very beginning of Yunmen's pilgrimage, right after leaving Mushou. This would, however, contradict other evidence, in particular: 1) Mushou's advice to go to see Xuefeng; 2) the statement by Yunmen that he was a pilgrim for 17 years (YHL 575a27); and 3) the year of arrival at Xuefeng (see p. 4 and note 8). For biographical information concerning this master, cf. ZGD 禪學大辭典 p.418c. Biographical elements are found in CC 祖堂集 5, 138; CDL 景德傳燈錄 T51(2076)294b; Guangdenglu 雲門廣錄 ZZ 135: 356c; LDHY 聯燈會要 ZZ136:302b; VDHY 五燈會元 ZSI38:313b-314a.

36. Cf. XWBS 新五代史.

37. Cf. also 5964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p. 118.8-10.

38. The text on which this translation is based was published in Tokiwa, Daijô 常盤大定, Shina bukkô shisetsu kenjûshi 支那佛教史跡紀念集, Tokyo: Bukkô shisetsu kenyûkai 佛教史跡研究會, 1951, pp.110 lines 1 to 14 and p. 111 line 11 to p. 114 line 1. Tokiwa's text reproduces the inscription on the stele and is thus more trustworthy and complete than versions of the text which were published earlier (in NHJSZ 南漢金石志, NHWSL 南漢文字錄, etc.).

39. Zhongguang daayuanxian 重光大淵獻 the character yuan 湾 formed a laeuna in Tokiwa's text and has been substituted on suggestion of Prof. Iriya. Zhongguang corresponds to xin 幽 and dayuanxian to hui 惠.

40. All sources give this name except CC 祖堂集 3.91,14 which has Wenchan 文禅.

41. YDL 建中靖國續燈錄, SBZ 祖林僧賓傳, YBL 碧簡録, and LDHY 聯燈會要 do not mention this family name. All other sources do.

42. The NHJSZ 南漢金石志 and NHWSL 南漢文字錄 versions of this text give (as does XL 南華錄) YHL(1988)575c6-8) Prince Jiong of Jin 齊王問 instead of 995's 'Qi Wujiong of Jin 晋齊五同.' The man in question is Prince Jiong of Qi Qi wang Jiong 齊王問 whose biography is found in chapter 59 of the History of the Jin Dynasty (Jin shu [Beijing: Zhonghua shuju 中華書局, 1974, pp. 1605

260 NOTES
ff.)]. Wu other source mentions Yumen's descendance from Zhang Han (520-596). Zhang Han was a man from
Wu, who became government official in Loyang. His biography appears in chapter 92 of the Jin shu
(zhibi, p. 2384).

45. S959 當性碑 [Tokiwa], p. 111 is the only source which records this move and its reason.

44. Chan masters often got their name from their place of residence ("Master so-and-so from here
or there"). For some famous residents of certain places, the place name alone came into use, for
instance "Master Muszhou" was used to refer to "Master Danzong of Muszhou" (cf. note 57).
Strictly speaking, Yunmen could not be called "Yumen" before the year 928 when he moved to Mt.
Yumen. However, the consistent use of one name (Yumen Yunmen) may assist in minimizing confusion
arising from the use of several names (lay, religious, residence names, honorary titles, posthumous
names...) for a single monk.

45. By subtracting the age at Yunmen's death which both stone inscriptions give from the year of
death one finds that the year of Yunmen's birth was 964 (in the fifth year of Xiantong (咸通).

46. Located in the northeastern extremity of present-day Zhejiang province, between Hangzhou and
Shanghai. All sources mentioning Yunmen's birthplace give Jiaxing; only S959 adds "subprefecture"
郡. SSJG 释氏稽古略 T49(2037/650c12 and S965 僧傳總錄 373a do give Xuhsui 西水 an birthplace,
but according to SSJG this corresponds to Jiaxing. The same is true for Xuhsui 秀州, mentioned in
WZZZ 五家正宗集 375a, p. 485b7.

47. CC 祖堂集 3.91,14-32.1 specifies that Jiaxing is located in the Wu prefecture of Suzhou 蘇州中
府 and ZTSY 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113:1d11 says that it is found in Eastern Wu 東吳, while S964 碑銘
[Tokiwa], p. 116 indicates that Suzhou is in the kingdom of Wu 越. In some later texts (CDL 景
德傳燈錄 TS1 2075/355b17, SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 ZZ137, p. 224b11, and PZTZ 佛祖歷代通傳
T49/2035/64a14) Suzhou is replaced by Gusu 姑蘇 which is an old designation for the Wu district 越縣
of Jiangsu province, while others (SSJG 释氏稽古略 T49/2037/650c12, WZYL 五家總錄, and SBZ 僧傳總錄)
replace it by Zhe 趙, which in Sung times included the northeastern portion of today's Zhejiang and the
southeastern portion of the present Jiangsu province.

48. Chu chen 出塵. Literally, "to leave the dust [of worldly defilement]." XL 雲門行錄
T47(1988/575c6 says that from the age of seven or eight years he detested vulgarity and aspired to
be exemplary. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p. 116 mentions that he did not fit the ordinary pattern 與常時流,
was very conscious of his spiritual inclinations 自高釋性, and wished to leave lay life when he had
only just finished his childhood years 恭束髮. Only CC 祖堂集 3.91,14 gives a specific age, 17 years,
for Yunmen's entry into the Kongwang temple 王寺.

49. This temple is given by a number of other sources (S964 碑銘, CC 祖堂集, XL 雲門行錄, CDL 景
德傳燈績 [高麗本], WDBY 五燈會元, and SSJG 释氏稽古略. But only the two stele say that it was
located in Jiaxing.
Several sources neither mention this temple nor its master Zhi Cheng 志澄 and give Muskou (臨済; see
note 51) as Yunmen's first master (ZTSY 祖庭事苑, CDL 景德傳燈績 [宋], 雲門行錄, WDBY 五燈會元, and PZTZ 佛祖歴代通
傳). ZTSY 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113:1d11 and SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 ZZ137:224b11 are the only sources which give a
different temple name: Douhsui yuán 元虎院, but no location is mentioned. SBZ says that that is where
he entered monastic life 得度, while ZTSY states that he got ordained there 受業. Could it be
that this is the name of the temple where the ordination platform (cf. note 51) was located?

50. Tong 童. This function appears only in this text; S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], pp. 116-117 and WZZZ 五家
正宗集 ZZ135,485b7 say that Yunmen received his first training 受業 at Kongwang temple. S964 碑銘

261 NOTES
adds that he became Zhi Cheng's foremost disciple.

51. S955 親性碑, S964 碑銘, COLK 景德傳燈録 [高麗本], WDBY 五燈會元, and S970L 釋氏稽古略 all have this master. XL 雲門行錄 does not give the title "Vinaya master," and CC 祖堂集 3.92.1 names him "Vinaya and Chan master Cheng" 澄律師．

52. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.116 states that he was intelligent by birth and as a child had a very dignified appearance 幼足神風, he also did not forget sutras and verse after one glance. XL 雲門行錄 T47[19381575c10-11] mentions that he used to recite sutras without needing to read many of them again; by his innate intelligence he acquired knowledge, and he was eloquent by nature. This last characterization is also found in COLK 景德傳燈録 [高麗本], Yanagida ed.], p.55Ib and WDBY 五燈會元 ZZ3136, 276c5. ZZJ 傳法正宗記 T51[20781757b11 says that Yunaen was endowed with extraordinary intelligence 天性幸頁f吾 and stood out from the other boy attendants. The 12th-century biographical collection entitled SHZ 聖林僧寶傳 is the only source which includes a description of Yunaen's physical features (ZZ137:224b12-13): "His character was of outstanding force. His face was bony with strong jaws. He was extraordinarily sharp and stood out from the crowd. His eyes were narrow and wide, with pupils like lacquer dots. His eyebrows were elegant and close to the eyelashes, and his gaze was steady and penetrating." Why could the author of this text, Juefan Huihong 慈恩慧洪 (1071-1128), give such a detailed description of Yunaen's features? The answer is found (though with a curiously different description) in the same text (226a9-12) when Juefan writes: "When I read Yunaen's words, I was struck by his quick-witted speaking ability. The pool [of his words] whirls and the waves are dangerous; [they] are without bounds like the milky way. When I thought of his features, I imagined an extraordinarily imposing and magnificent man, like [Great Master] Cien 慈恩 and [National Teacher] Dada 大達. [However,] when I had the chance to see his statue, he sat there weakly with a bent back on a barbarian bench, had a broad forehead and a flat vertex, just like a missionary Master of Discipline. Is it that his outstanding wisdom and abundant virtue could after all not be caught in an external appearance?"

53. Located approximately 80 km northwest of Suzhou, Changzhou is given as place of ordination in S955 親性碑 and S964 碑銘. ZZ113:idilI says he got ordained in the Doushan yuan (cf. notes 6 and 49). Other texts (XL 雲門行録 T47[19381575c10], COLK 景德傳燈録 [高麗本], Yanagida ed.), p.55Ib, and S970L 釋氏稽古略 T49[20371850c25] give Piling 昆陵 which corresponds to Changzhou. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 additionally points out that Yunaen read sutras, recited religious verse, and worked hard. CC 祖堂集 3.92.2 says that he was ordained on a jimo 春卯 date when he came of age, i.e. at age 20. Jimo ordinarily refers to the sixteenth year of the sexagesimal cycle, but the only year in question here would be 919 which is much too late (at that time he had, according to the stone inscriptions, already spent several years in Guangdong). Could this refer to an auspicious date?

54. S955 親性碑 and XL 雲門行録 T47[19381575c10-11] are the only sources which mention public lectures. COLK 景德傳燈録 [高麗本], Yanagida ed.), p.55Ib and S970L 釋氏稽古略 T49[20371850c25] say that he attended to Cheng for several years; the other sources make no mention of any of this.

55. Si fen 四分. This is an abbreviation for Si fen lu 四分律. The Four-Section Vinaya in 60 juan, T22[1428]567-1014. This is a version of the Dharmagupta vinaya translated into Chinese by Zhu Fonian 竺佛念 and others between 410 and 412 in Chang'an.

Most sources agree in saying that Yunaen studied either just the Four-Section Vinaya [XL 雲門行録 T47[19381575c11], S955 親性碑 [Tokiwa], p.111, and WJZZ 五家正宗記 ZZ135:485b7-0] or the Vinaya division 律部 of the Buddhist canon (COLK 景德傳燈録 [高麗本], Yanagida ed.), p.55Ib, WDBY 五燈會元 ZZ3136:276c5, and S970L 釋氏稽古略 T49[20371850c25]. CC 祖堂集 3.92.1 states that Yunaen studied the Four-Section [Vinaya] according to the Nanshan [school] and the [Lotus Sutra’s] Three Vehicles according to the Middle Way 四分於南山鄭三車於中道. ZZJ 傳法正宗記 T51[20781757b12 mentions that
he studied all three divisions of the Buddhist canon and that before long he was proficient in all of them. SNZ 禪林僧俗傳 ZZ137:224b13 says that Yunmen was very well versed in both the Great and the Small Vehicles.

56. Some of the texts give a reason for Yunmen's leaving of his first master: XL 雲門行錄 T47{1988}575c11 says that he left him since his nonsect discipline was already vigorous and pure, and that his capacity for enlightenment appeared from the depths of his heart. [Tokiwa], p.111 explains that he left upon hearing of Chan master Daosong of Mughou. CDL 禪林僧俗傳 [高麗本, Yanagida ed.], p.561, VDHY 五燈會元 ZZ138:216c7, and SSJG 飯氏稽古略 T49{2073}850c25 say that he left Master Cheng because the matter of his self was not yet clarified. He stayed at the Kishan temple at 九華山寺 ZZ137:224b13 and in an interesting passage [高麗本, Yanagida ed.], p.561, VDHY 五燈會元 ZZ138:216c7, and SSJG 飯氏稽古略 T49{2073}850c25 say that he left Master Cheng because the matter of his self was not yet clarified.

57. SSZ9 禪林僧俗傳 [Tokiwa], p.111, SSZ4 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117, and XL 雲門行錄 T47{1988}575c12 all give him the same name: "Chen Zunsu of Mughou" 陳尊宿. Other texts have other common appellations of this master, namely "Chen Zunsu of Mughou" 陳尊宿 (CDL 禪林僧俗傳 [宋], CDL 禪林傳燈錄 [高麗本], ZZJ 祖庭事略, XYL 一佛正宗記, XDL 傳中華國聖僧錄, and SSJG 飯氏稽古略), "Chan Master Song of Mughou" 陳尊宿 (YSFL 遊方道錄, ILHY 陸興佛教編年通論, and PZHY 佛祖時代編), or simply "Mughou" 聞州 and VDHY 五燈會元. SSZ 禪林僧俗傳 ZZ137:224b16-c1 says that Mughou was the successor of Huangbo; in other texts Mughou's lineage is not mentioned.

58. Huangbo pai 黃藥敷: the line of transmission coming from Huangbo Xiyuan 黃藥希運, the successor of Macu Daoji's 百丈道協, disciple Saizhang Huashai 百丈懷海, XL 雲門行錄 T47{1988}575c12 and SSZ 禪林僧俗傳 ZZ137:224b16 say that Mughou was the successor of Huangbo; in other texts Mughou's lineage is not mentioned.

59. XL 雲門行錄 T47{1988}575c12-15 has: "He knew that his way did not conform to the times and had retired to his native place. Withdrawn in an old temple, he nevertheless attracted the people of his time and responded to the demands of the world. Whenever he gave interviews to people who came, his way of speaking was abrupt and agile and he gave no room for considerations." SSZ4 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 just says that the lock of his gate hung high and was hard to get in. The BYL 碧巖語錄 case 6, T48{2003}145c16-18 contains the following passage: "Mughou [was tuned to his students as exactly as an] astronomical instrument which follows the movement of the stars 隨機, and [his actions were as fast and spontaneous as] the zigzag [of a lightning] 焰電. It was indeed difficult to gather and stay 深入 around him. Whenever he received someone, he grabbed him by the collar as soon as he crossed the threshold, and said: 'Speak, speak!' If there was any hesitation he pushed him out and said, 'Out in time drill!' [for this expression, see note 62 below]. Cf. the similar text in CDL 禪林傳燈錄 TS1{2076}23b9-10.

60. Juan shu dezi 學人己事不明, "Folding and unfolding", or "wrapping up and opening out" is also found in PJS 鳳凰居士語錄 ZZ120:295f (Iriya tr.2G 禪の語錄 Vol.7, p.93) and in an interesting passage of the BYL 碧巖語錄 case 5, T48{2003}144c19-20: [Yunmen's master Xuefeng's] insight and function are simultaneous, and folding and unfolding are in accord in his preaching. Principle and phenomena are not two; he practices both the provisional and the real 無用同時卷舒齊, 理事不相偏異 and so.

61. Xuoren jishi huming 學人己事不明. Xuoren is used to refer to oneself when facing a master. The matter of my self (jishi): "self" is translated as a separate word to convey the sense of ziji 自己 in MWKL 碧巖語錄 ZZ118:112a6: "A monk asked, 'What is my self?' 如何是學人自己."
62. Qin shi duō li ruăn 當時的佛陀; Lit., "Qin time drill." This expression refers to the giant stone drills which became useless after the discontinuation of the construction work on a gigantic palace during the Qin dynasty (221-207 B.C.) because of the death of the emperor who had wanted to live in it, Qin Shi Huang. According to Hujaku Dōchū 荒川道一, p. 182 of this book, this expression either refers to there being no entry or to something useless. The phrase "time drill" could be interpreted as "that self is totally useless"; there is also a possible connection of "good for nothing" to Muzhou's first question: "What good is it to come here again and again?"

63. Fa wèng 發問. -- The CC 祖堂集 makes no mention at all of this episode.

-- XDL 建中靖國錄 1-4-18 ZZZ136:25a9ff., says that Yunmen "first went to see Chen Zunsu of Muzhou and realized the mind-ground 真心地." A later passage (25a10-11) of the same text, however, indicates that he must at this time still have had doubts and awakened under Xuefeng: "One day [Xuefeng] took the teacher's seat and a monk asked, 'What is a Buddha like?' [Xuefeng] said, 'Good heavens, good heavens!' When he heard this, Master [Yunmen] at once was freed of his doubts and was in complete accord with the essential teaching of Chan 白蓮宗, so he immediately said: "The matter of my self is not clarified.' Chan master [Daozong] pushed him out with his hand saying 'Qin time drill!' Through this Master [Yunmen] opened up understanding." [Daozong Mu]zhou

-- Some of the other sources give just a brief account of it. CDL 佛祖歷代傳 2-38964 碑銘 T51(2076)56b28: "First he visited Chen Zunsu of Muzhou and discovered the great meaning."

-- The more detailed accounts fit into the following four categories:

A. Many visits; 9059 實性理 [Tokiwa], p. 112 and 9964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p. 117. 2-39764 碑銘 has a slightly different account: "[Yunmen] came and went during several months. One day Chan master [Daozong] suddenly asked: 'What is it that you keep on coming for?' [Yunmen] answered, 'The matter of my self is not clarified.' Chan master [Daozong] pushed him out with his hand saying 'Qin time drill!' Through this Master [Yunmen] opened up understanding." [Daozong Mu]zhou

B. One visit, no hurt foot; 25a10. XDL 建中靖國錄 1-4-18 ZZZ136:25a9ff., says that Yunmen "first went to see Chen Zunsu of Muzhou and found the essential meaning of the mind." A later passage (25a10-11) of the same text, however, indicates that he must at this time still have had doubts and awakened under Xuefeng: "One day [Xuefeng] took the teacher's seat and a monk asked, 'What is a Buddha like?' [Xuefeng] said, 'Good heavens, good heavens!' When he heard this, Master [Yunmen] at once was freed of his doubts and was in complete accord with the essential teaching of Chan 白蓮宗, so he immediately said: "The matter of my self is not clarified.' Chan master [Daozong] pushed him out with his hand saying 'Qin time drill!' Through this Master [Yunmen] opened up understanding." [Daozong Mu]zhou

C. One visit, hurt foot: 25a10. XDL 建中靖國錄 1-4-18 ZZZ136:25a9ff., says that Yunmen "first went to see Chen Zunsu of Muzhou and found the essential meaning of the mind." A later passage (25a10-11) of the same text, however, indicates that he must at this time still have had doubts and awakened under Xuefeng: "One day [Xuefeng] took the teacher's seat and a monk asked, 'What is a Buddha like?' [Xuefeng] said, 'Good heavens, good heavens!' When he heard this, Master [Yunmen] at once was freed of his doubts and was in complete accord with the essential teaching of Chan 白蓮宗, so he immediately said: "The matter of my self is not clarified.' Chan master [Daozong] pushed him out with his hand saying 'Qin time drill!' Through this Master [Yunmen] opened up understanding." [Daozong Mu]zhou
worthy with thorough understanding. [Daozong Muzhou's] old temple had its gate closed, and he was weaving footwear out of bulrush in order to take care of his mother. [When Yunmen went to visit him] he had hardly opened the door when the old master pinned him and said, "Speak, speak!" [Yunmen Wen] was flabbergasted, and before he could find the time to answer [Daozong Muzhou pushed him out] and said, "Qin time drill!" Then he shut his door and injured [Yunmen Wen]by right foot."

This text mentions only after a paragraph about Master Daozong Muzhou that "[Yunmen Wen] was flabbergasted, and before he could find the time to answer [Daozong Muzhou pushed him out] and said, "Qin time drill!" Then he shut his door and injured [Yunmen Wen]by right foot."

differs slightly at the end (no mention

Yunmen broke his leg) and has no word of his awakening on this occasion. [WJZZ] 113:485b8-9 explains that Daozong Muzhou, when seeing Yunmen, shut the door, jammed Yunmen's leg and broke it, and said "Qin time drill." Yunmen greatly awakened.

D. Three visits: CDL 景德傳燈錄 [高麗本], 1:226cf-11 have practically the same text; YFYF 游方遺録 all give a considerably shrunk account of these events: "On his first visit, in addition to being pushed out, the door was slammed, and Yunmen broke his leg" and":p has no mention of his awakening.

"Afterwards, during several years, he visited [Daozong Muzhou] and conversed with him; profundities were entered and the depths plumbed." S964 碧巖錄 case 6, T48[1983]156c18-22 has a somewhat more colorful account (cried out in pain, etc.) and describes only the third visit (cf. Cleary tr., pp.37-38). The WDBY version goes: "The moment [Daozong Muzhou] saw him come he shut the gate. At that Master [Yunmen] knocked at the gate. [Daozong Muzhou] said, 'Who is it?' Master [Yunmen]: 'It's me'. [Daozong Muzhou]: 'What's the matter?' Master [Yunmen] said, 'The matter of my self is not yet clarified. I implore you to give me guidance.' [Daozong Muzhou] opened the door, cast a glance, and withdrew. In this manner, Master [Yunmen] knocked at the door on three consecutive days. On the third day, when Muzhou opened the door, Master [Yunmen] forced his way in. [Daozong Muzhou] seized him and said, 'Speak, speak!' As Master [Yunmen] hesitated, [Daozong Muzhou] pushed him out saying, 'Qin time drill!' Then he shut the door and hurt one of Master [Yunmen]'s feet. In this way Master [Yunmen] attained awakening.

64. XL 雲門行撮 T47[1988]156c16-17: "Afterwards, during several years, he visited [Daozong Muzhou] and conversed with him; profundities were entered and the depths plumbed." S964 碧巖錄 [Johnson], p.117: "Interrogating [his master Daozong], he had reason to stay for several years." BYL 碧巖錄 case 6 [Itô, op. cit., p. 32]: "Whenever Yunmen spoke from that moment on, his discourse was similar to Muzhou's. After this, Yunmen stayed for three years in the home of the ministry president Chen Cao."

(For Chen Cao, governor of Muzhou and Buddhist scholar, see CDL 12, WDBY 4, and BYL 碧巖錄 case 33. No mention of him is found in historical sources.)

65. XL 雲門行撮 T47[1988]156c17-19: "[Muzhou Daozong knew that [Yunmen's] spiritual capacity was abundant and vast, and he felt that a helpful device could be applied. So he addressed him saying, 'I am not your master. At present, Xuefeng Yicun is suitable (for you) to visit and be taught by. Don't stay here any longer!'" CDL 景德傳燈錄 [高麗本], 1:37; TSY 祖庭事苑, LXYL 龍興佛教編年通論, BYL 碧巖錄, WDBY 五燈會元, FZT2 佛祖歷代通載, and S964 釋氏稽古略 all state that Master Muzhou Daozong directed Yunmen to go to Xuefeng Yicun. CC 附錄, S964 碧巖錄, ZZJ 傳法正宗記, YFYF 游方遺録, XDL 建中靖國續燈錄, SBZ 祖庭傳信, and LDBY 聯會要略 do not mention this, but XFL 雪峰語叢 ZZ119: 486d1 says: "Muzhou told him: 'In the south there is Master Xuefeng. Why don't you go there?"

66. Min 閩, one of the tenth century Ten Kingdoms, corresponding geographically roughly to today's Fujian province.
67. *Xiangyu* 鷄骨, "Elephant Bone": a mountain about 50 km northwest of Fuzhou, the capital of the kingdom of Min and today's Fujian province. This mountain was also called *Xuefeng* 雪峰, "Snowy Peak." The chronological record in *juan 2* of the *XVault 穆堂語錄* states that in the year 875 the name *Xiangyu xuefeng si* 象骨雪峰寺 was given to Master Xuefeng Yicun's temple. Edward H. Schafer mentions in his *The Empire of Min* (Rutland/Tokyo: Tuttle, 1954, pp.11-12) sources for additional information about this mountain and about the story of its naming by Shenzhi (番知; king from 899 to 955 and famous patron of Buddhism). This story is also found at the beginning (*juan 1*) of the *Xuefeng shi* 雪峰志.


69. *Xuefeng Yicun* 雪峰動字 (822-908). Biographical elements found in *CC 祖堂集* 7, *CDL 景億傳燈錄* 16, *BYL 碧巖録* case 5, *WDBY 五燈會元* 7, *SGSC* 12, *XDF* 《雪峰語錄》 7, etc. Additional information is found in *Quanjing wen* juan 826 and in a text written before his death (ZT113:485c).

70. The Chinese text is 何得到諾麼. Prof. Iriya suggested that "諾麼" hardly makes sense in this context and that "與麼" ought to be substituted, as found in *CC 祖堂集* 3.92, 3-4 (which has an otherwise strikingly similar account of this first meeting). Alternative translations are: "How were you able to get like this?" or "How is one able to become such?" *ZT137:224c3* all have 因甚到與麼 "How did it come to this?" (or alternatively, "How did you get like this?").

71. *Zhong yin quanj* 韻印全機.

-- *CC 祖堂集* 3.92, 3-4 has an account of this first meeting with Xuefeng which has practically identical wording with *9959 耆性碑*.

-- *ZZJ 傳法正宗記* XI113:651, and *SBZ 神林僧寶傳* 22137:524c3 all have 因甚到與麼 "How did it come to this?" (or alternatively, "How did you get like this?").

-- The rest of our sources includes rather different portrayals of this first meeting; they can be grouped in the following way:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td><em>LITL 峰興佛教現今通論</em> and <em>FZTJ 佛祖是做己</em> both share a text which is in content not different from <em>YFLY 遊方遺撮</em> BI19:48242-12.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td><em>TFLJ</em> (T47【1988】573b10-22) &quot;When Master [Yunen] arrived at the village [at the foot of Mt.] Xuefeng, he met a monk and asked: 'Does Reverend today go up the mountain?' The monk affirmed, and Master [Yunen] said, 'I entrust you with a case — talk to the abbot [Xuefeng Yicun], but you must not say that these are someone else's words.' The monk consented, and Master [Yunen] continued: 'After your arrival at the monastery you will see the abbot take the high seat in the Dharma Hall [to give a formal sermon]. As soon as the assembly has gathered, go forward and say at once: This old fellow! Why...&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

266 NOTES
doesn't he rid himself of the iron cangue around his neck?' The monk followed Master [Yunmen's] instructions exactly. When Xuefeng saw the monk talk like this he descended from his seat, blocked his chest, seized his, and said: 'Quickly, speak! Quickly, speak!' As the monk did not answer, Xuefeng let him loose and said, 'These words were not yours.' The monk insisted that they were. When Xuefeng said, 'Attendant, bring me rope and stick, will you!' The monk admitted: 'They were not my words but those of a monk from Zhejiang down in the village. He instructed me to come and say this.' Xuefeng said, 'You of the assembly, go to the village and welcome the spiritual guide, the master of knowledge of 500 persons!' The following day Master [Yunmen] ascended the mountain. As soon as Xuefeng saw him he said, 'Because of what were you able to reach such a state of enlightenment?' Master [Yunmen] lowered his head. After this [they were like] two matching pieces of a tally.

B. Different questioner, iron cangue, verbal exchange, rubbed eyes

Only WJZ222 [ZJZ 13:1d15-c1] has this version. The first part of the story is almost identical with the YPYL exchange version translated above. The verbal exchange and what follows, however, is most similar to the LDHY text and goes: 'The next day Master [Yunmen] ascended the mountain. As soon as Xuefeng saw him he said, 'Because of what were you able to reach such a state of enlightenment?' Master [Yunmen] rubbed his eyes with his hands and ran out. [Xuefeng] was surprised about this.'

C. Yunmen asked himself, iron cangue, verbal exchange, rubbed eyes

2TSY [ZJZ 13:1d15-17]: "After [Yunmen's] arrival Xuefeng went up to [the teacher's] seat in the hall. [Yunmen] came in front of the assembly and said, 'Why don't you get rid of the 300-pound iron cangue around your neck?' Xuefeng stepped down from his seat, took hold of [Yunmen], and said, 'How did it come to this?' Master [Yunmen] rubbed his eyes with his hand.

SBZ 謝林岳傳 and LDHY 禪燈會要 have somewhat different texts, but their content is virtually the same. SBZ 謝林岳傳 ZJZ 13:224c2-4: "[Yunmen] called on Xuefeng [Yi]cun. [Xuefeng Yi]cun had hardly taken the orange [teacher's] seat in order to preach the Dharma to the assembly when [Yunmen Wen]yan went against custom in coming forth from the assembly and saying with a burning gaze, 'Why don't you get rid of the 300-pound iron cangue around your neck?' [Xuefeng Yi]cun said, 'How did you get like this? Why are you like this?' [Yunmen Wen]yan rubbed his eyes with his hands and ran off. [Xuefeng Yi]cun in his heart was surprised about this.'

D. Different verbal exchange

SBZ 禪燈會要 case 5, T46 [2003]:145c23-25 gives the following account: "Muzhou directed [Yunmen] to go to Xuefeng. Having arrived there he stepped forth from the assembly and asked, 'What about the Buddha?'. Xuefeng said, 'Don't talk in your sleep'. Yunmen bowed, and during three years he exerted himself.

72. Jie liu 截流. This expression is also found in LJJ 順流 T441985:497a17; see notes in LJS pp. 69-70 and LJLD pp.45-46.

73. Dai jiao 戴角. Horns are usually mentioned in connection with delusion (cf. note 73). Here, it is stressed that although Yunmen was an awakened person he did not make a show of it. The CC 祖堂集 (3.92, 3-5) text corresponds almost character for character to S959 from Yunmen's salutation to the carrying of horns.

74. Fan sheng 凡聖. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 also speaks of one thousand students and says that all four kinds of devotees [monks, nuns, male and female laitypersons] came.

75. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 speaks in the same terms of Yunmen's practice under Xuefeng. CC 祖堂集 3.92, 3-5 says: "Often, when visiting [Xuefeng], [Yunmen] asked about obscure points, and there was mutual agreement in their views and judgments." XL 錢門行録 T471988:575c20 says that Yunmen was in accord with Xuefeng with regard to the Dao. All sources mentioned in note 71A say that they were like two matching pieces of a tally.

76. Lifting the hem was an ancient sign of respect [M5, 270b]; here it presumably refers to medita-
tion practice. Cf. 8964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117: "More than a thousand persons a year tucked up their robes, and [pilgrimage monks] holding staffs came [like] clouds from all four directions."

77. 8964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 has instead: "In the manner of a wild crane he rose high above the flock's path; he had locked the gate of Chan in his heart." ZTSY 相談事典, ZZ 113:1d17: "Since then he shook the community's seats.

78. This phrase stems (though 8959 has jian 'see' instead of bai 'to encounter') from the Canon of the Great Seal attributed to Shi tou Xiqian (700-790) and is found in the last chapter of the CDK 景德傅煜錄 [高麗本, Yanagida ed.]. p.551b and WDHY 五燈會元 ZZ138:27664-6 give an account which is very similar to XL's.


80. 梁积 司日安 由 河沿誤 -段布. One jin corresponded to about 600 grams. 8964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 goes on: "The monk still did not understand and asked again what it meant. Master [Yunmen] said, "On top of that, I offer three feet of bamboo 三尺竹."

81. Bu na 由納: "Prock", an expression used for "monk". In the mouth of Chan masters, abuse sometimes is a form of praise.

82. Unless this "intimate accord" is related to it, no reference is made in this text to a secret or open Dharma transmission. 8964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 says that while Yunmen was in Xuefeng's assembly "the transmission took place in secret 會有傅受" IL 雲門行錄 T47[1988]575c21-22 reports that Xuefeng secretly conferred the seal of the Chan tradition on Yunmen and that since then Yunmen spoke in place of Xuefeng. ZTL 傳法正宗記 T51[2078]575b13-14 says that after having thoroughly grasped the essence of Chan under Mazhou, Yunmen went to get approval from Xuefeng, and that "from then on he hid his light and was completely integrated into the assembly." CDK 景德傅煜錄 [高麗本, Yanagida ed.]. p.551b and WDHY 五燈會元 ZZ138:27664-6 speak of a secret transmission that took place after long years of study and inquiry, and 8956 藩氏智古錄 T49[2037]861al has Yunmen leave Xuefeng when he had obtained by secret accord the essentials of the heart-mind 心宗. The rest of our sources does not contain any reference to a transmission or secret accord.

83. XL 雲門行錄 T47[1988]575c21-22: "When Master [Yunmen's] instruction came to an end, he left the [Fujian] mountains and visited the various regions. He inquired into and scrutinized the different ways. His sharp eloquence was of utmost fierceness and widely known in the world." CDK 景德傅煜錄 [高麗本, Yanagida ed.]. p.551b and WDHY 五燈會元 ZZ138:27664-6 give an account which is very similar to XL's.

84. Yun song yan chu zhu 遇松個住. The character for "droop" is 倬 -- the same as 耳 that is found in Master Yunmen's name Wen'yan.

85. 8964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 gives the same account of this scene and Xuefeng's words and explains that Fan is the Dharma appellation of Master [Yunmen]. Interestingly, no other source contains anything about this.

86. 8964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 says the same thing.
87. Caqiq, Pi'ian. Place in the Qujiang district of Northern Guangdong. The Sixth Patriarch is said to have repeatedly sojourned in Caqiq's Baolinsi 寶林寺 and to have taught there from 677 till 713. In 711 he ordered that a pagoda for his coffin be built there. (Cf. Paszoszcz, Philip B., *The Platform Sutra of the Sixth Patriarch*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1967, p. 71 ff.) This visit to Caqiq is mentioned only in S955 寶性碑, S964 碑銘, and SBZ 錦林僧傳.

88. Lingshu 鈐樹. Refers to the Lingshu yuan 鈐樹院 in Shaohou 芝州, which corresponds to present-day Qujiang 鈐江 in northern Guangdong.

89. Commonly called Lingshu Zhisheng 鈐樹知聖 or Lingshu Bumín 鈐樹如敏, successor of Changting 賦清, a co-disciple of Huangbo Xiyun 黃罙西運 under the famous Baishang Huihai 百丈懷海. Died in 820. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 adds in small characters "Old master Bumín 如敏長老." The two stone inscriptions, CBL 景德傳燈錄 (宋), and ZZJ 侍法正宗記 do not mention Master Zhisheng's psychic powers, but several other sources either mention it briefly or tell a story about it: the story of the missing head monk.

A. Brief mention is made in CC 祖堂集 and ZZJ 傳法正宗記. CC 祖堂集 3.92,6-7 says that Master Lingshu Zhisheng had, without knowing Yunmen, become close to him. He had assisted him even before they met. ZZJ 傳法正宗記 T51[2078]757b15 says that Lingshu [Bu]min was a man of extraordinary powers who was reputed to know what happens in distant places. LITYL 除興佛教編年通論 ZZJ30:353a17-18: "Chan Master Lingshu Zhisheng had long waited for Wenyan, and when his arrival was close, he also told the assembly to welcome him."

B. The story of the missing head monk:

XE 鐵門行錄 TVR[1988]575a23-25 features this story:

"Later [Yunmen] arrived at the temple of Chan master Lingshu Zhisheng. Zhisheng had already intuited his coming. Suddenly he beat the drum and announced to his followers: 'Please go to welcome the head monk.' At the time Master [Yunmen] had indeed arrived. Before this, Zhisheng had resided in Lingshu and kept the [head monk's] first seat in the main hall empty. His followers had repeatedly urged him to appoint a head monk, but Zhisheng had not consented. Once he had said, 'The head monk has just set out on his pilgrimage.'"

CDBL 景德傳燈錄 [高德本], Yanada ed.], p.561b and WDBY 五燈會元 ZZJ18:276d6-9 share the following text: "Later [Yunmen] arrived at Lingshu and was [thus] without his knowledge acting in conformity with Chan master [Lingshu] Zhisheng's explanations about receiving his head monk. Before this, Zhisheng had stayed for twenty years at Lingshu but had not appointed a head monk. He used to say, 'My head monk is born', 'My head monk is herding cattle', and 'My head monk is on pilgrimage.' One day he ordered [the monks] to toll the temple bell and greet the head monk outside the temple gates. The assembly went out to greet Master [Yunmen] who indeed arrived."

The different BYL versions (cf. Itö, Yuten 伊藤敏典, Hekiganshu teihon 碧巖論傳本, Tokyo: Hisosha 理想社, 1961, p.23) feature details from both of the versions translated above.

SBZ 錦林僧傳 ZZJ37:224d8-12 gives a somewhat more colorful account:

"Before this, [Lingshu Bu]min had not appointed a head monk. When there were people who urged him to do so, [Lingshu Bu]min said: 'My head monk has already left home to become a monk.' After some time, when they again made a request, Min said, 'My head monk is on the monk's pilgrimage and has awakened to the Dao. Some time later he was again asked and said, 'My head monk had already crossed the [Nan-] Ling [mountain range]. Wait just a little while longer.' A few days later [Yunmen Wenyan] arrived. [Lingshu Bu]min greeted him, laughed, and said: 'We were honored to wait for a very long time; [but] why did you come so late?""

90. Jiaoqi 胶漆, literally "glue and lacquer", an image used for deep and inseparable friendship. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 gives a similar description of their relation.
The two stone inscriptions and CC 祖堂集 do not mention that Yunmen was made head monk, but all other sources do.

91. Both stone inscriptions contain this prediction. CC 祖堂集 and WWII 祖庭事苑 do not touch upon this at all, but the other sources tell different stories about Master Zhisheng's death and a letter (testament) addressed to the emperor by Zhisheng.

The shorter versions of this story (CDL 景興傳鏡, ZJZT 傳法正宗記, and LTYL 陸興佛教編年通論) simply say that when Master Zhisheng was about to pass away he sent a testamentary letter to the sovereign with the request that Yunmen succeed him.

Longer versions go as follows:

XL 蓮門行規 T47(1988)575c26-576a3: "When Zhisheng was about to die he wanted Master [Yunmen] to take over his position. So he secretly wrote [this] in a [confidential] letter to the emperor and said to his disciples: 'When after my death someone of the imperial family design to come here please hand this over to him'. And indeed, the emperor came to visit the mountain; Zhisheng had foreseen his coming. He went up to the main hall, crossed his legs, and passed away. When the emperor arrived he had already died. The sovereign questioned Master [Yunmen] about instructions left [by the late Master]. The disciples presented the letter and handed it over. Opening it he found the following words: 'The [enlightened] eye of man and heaven [is] the head monk of the [monk's] hall 大千眼目堂中上座 The sovereign ordered the prefect He Xin 何希範 to arrange the ceremonies [of inauguration] and requested Master [Yunmen] to take over [Zhisheng's] assembly.”

SBZ 禪林僧實傳 ZJZT:224d12-17: "Not much later the lord of Guangzhou, Prince Liu, was planning to take up arms and follow [Master Lingshu Buxin]'s decision on whether the monk was good or not. [Lingshu Buxin] knew of this in advance; with his own hand he sealed a box and said to his attendant: 'When the Prince comes, go forth to present this to His Majesty.' After this he sat down in good spirits and died. The Prince indeed arrived and heard that [Lingshu Buxin] had already passed away. In great consternation he asked, 'When did he get ill so as to die suddenly in this manner?' The attendant thereupon brought forth the box and offered it to the Prince in conformity with [Master Lingshu Buxin]'s instructions. The Prince opened the box and found a letter which said, 'The eye of man and heaven [is] the head monk of the [monk's] hall 廣州作到時免天眼目堂中上座' The sovereign ordered the prefect He Chengfan 何承範 to ask [Yunmen Wenjian] to succeed to his [master's] dharma chair.

The BYL 碧巖錄 came 5, T48(2003)146a2-7 gives an account which is similar to SBZ 禪林僧實傳 except for the outcome: "The Lord or Guangzhou understood the meaning [of the Master's sudden death (?)] and abandoned the idea of waging a war." The Ichiya 一夜 text [IC, Yuten 伊麗献血, Heikishô bu teihon 碧巖集本, Tokyo: Rikôka 理想社, 1993, p.31] text of the BYL 碧巖錄 is quite different: "One day Lord Liu of Guangzhou came to the monastery in a carriage named Snowy Heron. Lingshu had had advance knowledge of this and put a note in an incense box which said, 'The one who occupies the first seat in the monk's hall is an [enlightened] teacher of heavenly and human beings. The Lord then saw Lingshu inside his living quarters where he had assumed the sitting position and had immediately passed away. The Lord was very irritated and asked the monk in charge of temple affairs whether there was any message [left by the master]. The attendant produced the incense box, and the Prince asked for the reason. The attendant said, 'Yesterday the master, knowing in advance of Your Majesty's coming, explained that Your Majesty in a former incarnation had been a travelling salesman selling incense, and that he himself, when he had been in charge of receiving guests [at a monastery], had once not approved of Your Majesty's coming, and so on.' Then [the Prince] opened the box.
features a different beginning: "Whenever King Liu entered the temple, [Master] Lingshu did not come to greet him. The King wanted to inquire about his fault. Lingshu already knew this and left this world. When the King arrived the assembly told him about this [death of the master]."...

SSJGJ Lingshu lives in the Eighteenth Century, autopreface 12 has a version of the story which is similar to the Taisho text of YBL. YBL case 6 except for Lingshu's death: He instructed his attendant to give the box to the Lord of Guang. A monk asked just then: "What is the meaning of the patriarch's coming from the West?" Lingshu assumed the sitting position and passed away.

92. Gaozu 高祖. According to XNDS 五代史 65, this is Liu Yan 劉霰 who in the year 917 had elevated himself to the position of Emperor.

93. Shao shi 郞石: an interesting geological formation in the Quijiang district of Hangzhou consisting of 36 rocks.

94. Shell 舍利 (abbreviation of shellac 舍利絨): the relics left after the cremation of a Buddha or saint. They are usually placed in a stupa.

95. S694 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 gives a similar account of the prophecy and its fulfillment but does not mention ashes and statue. No other source deals with these events.

96. S694 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 has instead: "At this time, Master [Yunmen] was encouraged by imperial decree to speak out and ordered to expound the Buddha dharma. He was presented with a robe bearing a crest 章服. For other honors conferred upon Master Yunmen, see note 114.


98. S694 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 specifies that this ceremony was for members of the army and common citizens. The CCB texts and MBDY say that on the day of the Eitai ceremony the emperor was present.

99. This text is the only source which mentions these epithets. S694 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118 says that he formed a wide basin of the Han river and that his words without fail astounded the listeners.

100. ZS7 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113.2a1: "From then on he greatly promoted in the whole empire the way of Azurefeng." The DTL 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117: Hekiganshō tokei 碑銘集成本 Tokyo: Bōsōsha 理想社, 1963, p.32, states that "whenever Yunmen spoke from that moment [of awakening] on, his discourse was similar to Xuzhou's."

101. Xiangou wu jiao 目前無異草: This exchange is found in YML 雲門演録 T47[1988]545b-2. It is also mentioned in S694 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117. Yunmen's answer may simply mean 'grass is grass'. However, grass is also a symbol for delusions; so Yunmen may also mean 'there is no special delusion; delusion is delusion'. On the other hand, enlightenment is likened to 'no an inch of grass in ten thousand miles'.

102. This sansōif (問、如何本來心。師云、舉起分明。) is also found in S694 碑銘 [Tokiwa] p.117 and in YML 雲門演録 T47[1988]545b3.
103. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 adds after this exchange: "On that day the questions on the subject of Chan followed each other without interruption, and [Master Yunmen's] answers were written down and transmitted to the world." For other sources that mention the writing down of Yunmen's words, see p. 22 ff.

104. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 gives a reason for this request: "Later, Master [Yunmen] got tired of receiving and entertaining people and wished to reside at a remote and pure place. He turned to the emperor with a request to change his place of residence." Cc 祖堂集 does not mention this move at all; all the other sources mention it briefly. XDL 建中靖國頌燈錄 says that Liu, the Lord of Guang, asked the master to move to Yunen.

105. Literally, "to open up Mt. Gate-of-the-Clouds." Mt. Yunmen is situated in northern Guangdong, approximately 25 km south of present-day Lechang 江. For detailed geographical information, cf. Jiantang shu 新唐書 ed. p.1036]. This is the mountain from which Master Wenyuan as well as his temple got the names under which they became famous. XL 雲門行錄 T47[1988]576a5 says that ruins were reclaimed and that foundations of a large new building were laid on Mt. Yunen.

106. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117 gives a somewhat different but not less poetic description which features a deep red curtain of morning mist, and evening dew shimmering like a net of pearls.

107. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117: "More than a thousand persons a year tucked up their robes, and [pilgrim monks] holding staffs came [like] clouds from all four directions."

108. This text is the only source mentioning this.

109. Lingshan hui 龍山會. Lingshan is an abbreviation of Lingjushan 龍鷲山, the Vulture Peak in the ancient Indian kingdom of Sravasti where the Buddha is said to have uttered the words contained in the Lotus Sutra. XL 雲門行錄 T47[1988]576a5-7: "His style of Chan spread out in all four regions, and he widely disseminated the Dharmic teaching. Those who became his disciples and entered his room to get individual guidance were countless. 雲門入室者莫可勝紀." ZZJ 建法正宗記 T51[2078]575b16-19: "[Yunmen's] audience was broad and students from all four directions turned to him as inevitably as water flows downward." ZZJ 祖庭事苑 ZZ113:2a1-2: "Like spikes around the hub of a wheel many disciples assembled around him." XDL 建中靖國頌燈錄 ZZ136:25a12: "He transmitted the eye of the true Dharma." SBZ 禪宗僧傳 ZZ137:224d17: "Students from the whole empire heard about him and came."

110. Guangtai chanyuan 光大薀源. This donation is also mentioned in S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.117: "The monks of the monastery sent a letter to the court announcing the completion of the construction. A door plate presented by the emperor read 'Chan Temple of Illumined Peace'."

111. Up to here this exchange is, in a slightly different form, also found in XDL 雲門行錄 T47[1988] 555a9.

112. Zuoyou jie songlu 左右街僧錄. According to M10,945 xijing can also mean "clue".

113. Zhi xijing 知鏡性. According to M10,945 xijing can also mean "clue".

114. Guangzhen 匡真. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118-1-3 also mentions an audience with the Emperor in 938, but only the exchange (translated above) about the original mind is given and what follows is somewhat different: "The Emperor knew that the Master [was like a] grotto that embraces the secret
of heaven and earth, and he steadily increased his veneration; that day he wanted to confer upon the Master the office of Inspector of the Temples of the Capital. He lowered himself to ask him several times, but [the Master] was dispensed. The following day he bestowed the title "Great Master of Genuine Truth" on Master [Yunmen] and extended his stay for ten days. He presented [the Master] with silver, silk, incense, and medicinal herbs from the imperial treasury and sent him back to his home temple."

Before coming to speak of the Master's move to Mt. Yunmen, XL 鄭門行錄 Y4[1988]576a3-5 says that "the emperor respected and praised [Yunmen]. He repeatedly summoned him to the Imperial Palace. Each time he asked [Yunmen] about something he was concerned about and received answers and spontaneous reactions [of Master Yunmen]. The sovereign admired him more and more. Subsequently he gave him the purple robe and the title [Kuangzhen]." CC 祖堂集 3.35,7-8: "The Southern [Han] court esteemed him highly, and because of the influence of his virtue [Yunmen] was given the purple robe and the title 'Great Master Kuangzhen'."

In the ninth month (of the ninth sexagesimal cycle; 甲子) the sovereign summoned him several times to the Imperial Palace, questioned him about the Dharma, and treated him with the courtesy due to a teacher."

SS/BL 释林僧寶傳 Z4[1988]571b8-10. In the commentary to this passage of the XL, 2737 祖庭事苑 8a1 says that this happened in the year Qianyou 4 (= 951). This appears to be a mistake, as the same text (2a2-3) gives the commonly accepted date for Yunmen's death (Qianyou 2; 949).

The YBL 碑銘 case 6,74[2003]456a12-15 gives an anecdote that Cleary 1977, p.39 translates as follows: "One day King Liu summoned the master to spend the summer in the palace. Together with several other venerable abbots, he was to receive the questions of the courtiers and expound the Dharma. Only one man, the master Yun Men, did not speak, and there was no one on familiar terms with him. One of the palace functionaries wrote a verse and posted it in the Green Jade Hall:

Cultivation of great wisdom - only that is Chan
Silence, not clairvoyance, is in order for the Chan school.
Ten thousand kinds of clever talk - how can they be as good as reality?
They are beaten by Yun Men's total silence."

SS/BL 释氏稽古略 Y4[2037]850c13-14 has one more different story: "In the 45th year [of the sexagesimal cycle; 948] the sovereign summoned [Master Yunmen] several times to his palace to expound the Dharma and showed him the courtesy due to a teacher. He conferred the title 'Chan Master Kuangzhen' on him. In the seventh month he invited him to the Imperial Court to receive offerings. In the ninth month [Yunmen] took leave of the sovereign and returned to the mountain."

115. 3964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118: "After this the Emperor often directed his thoughts [towards Yunmen] and frequently honored him with gifts."

116. This imperial title reads as follows: 大聖文武玄德大明至道大廣孝皇帝. The bearer of this title is, as 3964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118 points out, Emperor Zhongzong 中宗. According to XWCS 新五代史 65 [中華書局 ed. p. 814 ff.] Liu Sheng 刘晟 came to power in 943 after arranging the assassination of his elder brother and in the same year received a title similar to the one mentioned here (大聖文武大明至道大廣孝皇帝) from the Congregation of Vassals (for an alternative translation, see Schafer 1954, p.360). XWCS 新五代史 65 [中華書局 ed. p. 817] states that he died in the autumn of
958 and got the temple title 慈恩 "Zhongzong" 中宗. His posthumous title 聿 is "Shining Sage of Civil and Military Arts, August Emperor of Bright Filial Piety 文武光聖明孝皇帝" (9553 獵性碑 [dated Jan. 12, 959] was written shortly after Liu Sheng's death).

117. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118 does not mention this.

New Five代史 65 [中華書局 ed. p. 814 ff.] speaks of a veritable killing spree directed especially toward his brothers; this may have to be taken cum grano salis as the whole chapter is out to show how barbarous those savages in the deep south were.

118. Sanjiao 三教: Buddhism, Taoism, and Confucianism.

S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118 says that "his widely beneficial imperial virtue brought peace to the nine circumscriptions" and that the Emperor "always respected the Three Gems" (三寶: Buddha, Dharma, and Sangha)."

119. Liushu ji 六铢衣. One zhu is the weight of 100 grains of millet, i.e. a small fraction of an ounce (1/24th or 1/48th of an ounce). This garment is said to be the one which heavenly beings wear (cf. M 2.62a where the Dirghapada Ⅰ 1 [1] is quoted).

120. The inscription was: "頁光之塔瑞雪之院". This visit as well as the presents and the inscription are also mentioned in S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118.

121. Zongfeng 宗風. ZZJ 傳法正宗記 75(12078)757b19-20 gives the following description of his teaching style: "His style of teaching was fierce and sudden 喧迅, and its content was rich and to the point 益至." For information in the Blue Cliff Record on this see also pp. 96 ff.

122. Professor Iriya suggested to replace chi 持 by te 特. This character should be at the end of the sentence; Tokiwa's punctuation does not make much sense. The following character chăng 常 is a homophone of and probably stands for 常.

123. Yunmen tells his listeners that they themselves should make an effort; they should put the blame for their lack of understanding not on the lack of a master but on themselves. Cf. YML 雲門廣論 T47(1988)55a3-4 where Yunmen says at the beginning of a sermon: "If you don't understand, you must not say after thirty years that you haven't met any master."

124. Cf. YML 雲門廣論 T47(1988), 55a3-4. Yunmen means that all three are equally guilty.

125. Zheng hao bian 正好邊. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p.118 gives the same exchange which is not found in the YML. Zheng hao bian also occurs inNZHL 陵州論譯 22:115d5 where Master Muzhou says: "Come on, step forth! Bright is black. Just the right argument 皓是黑正好辯! ' The monk was speechless."

126. You chu yisi 逐出一字. Cf. YML 雲門廣論 T47(1988)549b10: "[A monk] asked, 'What about Chan?" The Master said, 'Is it all right if I take this one character in my fingers and let it disappear?'"

127. This refers to the set expression: What was the intention of the patriarch [Bodhidharma]'s coming from the West?

128. Hili kan shan 日麗看山. Cf. YML 雲門廣論 T47(1988)545c1 for another occurrence of this expression. Kajaku Dōshū (R. 葛藤語蜜 [Yanagida ed.], p.1133) explains that it means "太分明" (very distinct, very evident) and cites the following passage from SBGC 正法眼藏 31: "To say 'At night it's dark' is just like saying 'In the sunlight one sees the mountain'."

129. Pronouncements of similar content also appear several times in the YML 雲門廣論 (545b19,NOTES
130. The Master seems to say that the condition of delusion, though only extant for the deluded one (for the awakened, 'nothing is the matter'), is the chance of the unawakened to break through delusion.

131. The editors which wrote the YML's prefaces had similar motivations; see Appendix 1.

132. ZLJ 傳法正宗記 T51(2076)757b19-20: "His style of teaching was fierce and swift, and its content is said to be rich and to the point. Now the whole empire esteems [this teaching] highly and calls it Yunmen school."
The BYL 碧巖輯錄 (esp. cases 6, 8, and 14) also contains details about Yunmen's teaching style. Cf. pp. 96 ff.

133. *Yi jiai* 心印. Cf. note 1031.

134. *Shuang lin* 雙林. Refers to the safari trees under which the Buddha is said to have entered nirvana.

135. Professor Iriya suggested to read zhang 障 instead of the character given in Tokiwa 113.10.

136. S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p. 118 says that on the tenth day of the fourth moon of the 46th year (949) Master Yunmen lacked sleep and appetite while his activities were still unimpeded; all of a sudden he addressed all of his disciples with the words: "Coming and going are constant; now is my turn to go... (one character missing)." The rest of the death scene including the admonitions is identical to 2959 獨性碑. XL 雲門行錄 T47(1988)576a8-12: "On the tenth day of the fourth month of Qianhe 7 (949), [Master] Yunmen passed away. In the morning he had composed a message to take leave from the sovereign and at the same time set forth his testament. Then he had folded his legs and died. Having had the honor of receiving an imperial gift of a stupa inscription, it was ordered in the Master's last will that his body was to be placed as it was inside his living quarters, and that the stupa inscription donated by the sovereign be properly displayed there. [He ordered] not to build a special stupa. In accordance with these instructions the disciples buried the Master in his living quarters and considered his stupa to be there."

137. Zhoubian 著便, S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p. 118 is the only other source that relates this anecdote. For Zhoubian, cf. note 994.

138. Zhoubian 著便, S964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p. 118 is the only other source that relates this anecdote. For Zhoubian, cf. note 994.

139. Cf. note 137 for the Master's admonitions contained in S964 碑銘 and XL 雲門行錄. LYYL 隆與佛教編年通論 ZZ13:353c1:1: "In his last will he ordered [with regard to] his stupa that his whole body [be placed] in his living quarters. See also the Master's "Admonitions to Posterity" in YML 雲門行錄 T47(1988),575b12-c2.

140. Short biographies of "Zhixiang, the Great Master Shixing of Mt. Baiyun" 白雲山賢性大師志 appended are found in CODL 景德傳燈錄 T51(2076)384b25 ff., WDBY 五燈會元 ZZ138 juan 15), etc. (cf. ZCO 論學大辭典, p. 436b).

141. S939 南華書 17, 12a-b includes the following biography: "Reverend Shixing 實性, family name Chen 陳, was originally called Zhixiang 志祥. He hailed from Pengzhou (彭州; today's Pengchuan 封川 in Guangdong province). He was registered at Caosi 寬溪 and is said to have been Yunmen's principal successor. When [Yunmen] Venzan was about to die, he proclaimed that he endowed Shixing with the Dharma succession. Shixing's Chan activity was perfect and bright, and he was capable of releasing [people from illusion]. He is reputed to have had a tendency to civililities towards"
Emperor Houzhu (the last emperor of Nanhan, re. 958-971). Once he was summoned to the Imperial Palace and given the permission to found a temple on a mountain in Shaokou. He built a temple called Baiyun (白雲 "White Clouds"). This [temple name] came to be used as his name, and people referred to him as Chan Master Baiyun."

S964 碑銘 (Tokiwa), p.118 also mentions this transmission, and so does XL 雲門行錄 T47(1888)-576a13.

141. Mt. Baiyun is found approximately 15 km northwest of Qujiang in northern Guangdong province. This mountain is also mentioned in a poem in one of Master Yunmen's poems (TML 雲門廣記 T47(1888)-553b20).

142. Of all other sources, only XL 雲門行錄 T47(1888)-576a mentions this. Before giving its account of Master Yunmen's death XL 576a7-8 says: "Now Great Master Shixing of Mt. Baiyun is the most eminent [of Yunmen's countless disciples]." 'Now' presumably means 949 when XL was written. After telling of the death and burial of Master Yunmen, XL 576a13 continues: "Master [Yunmen] had first transmitted the Dharma to his disciple Shixing so that he succeed to the teacher's seat. All [disciples] considered that Shixing had already promulgated the Way and instructed monks [and was thus qualified as successor]. However, there was an upheaval in the assembly, and disciple Faqiu 法球 thereby succeeded to [Yunmen's] seat. Ah! The justice of the world is annihilated!"

143. All the sources except one that mention a date (S959 實性碑, S964 碑銘, XL 雲門行録, ZTY 祖庭事苑, SHZ 禪林僧寶傳, WDBY 五燈會元, and SSJGL 釋氏稽古略 agree; LITL 隆興佛教編年通論 does not give month and day. The one exception is SZBY 僧寶封關.24, p.373 which says that the Master "died during the Changxing period 業興中卒" which comprises the four years between 930 and 933. Is this simply a mistake or were there other sources on which SZBY based its claim?

144. Chao jie 朝奠. Jie stands for jielu 謹露: dew on scallion. This dirge is sung on the morning of a burial.

145. Shiwei 式微 is a chapter title of the Classic of Poems 詩經.

146. Song Yun 宋雲 was an ambassador from Wei 魏 who met Bodhidharma on his way back from the West to China. This encounter which is said to have happened three years after Bodhidharma's death is described for instance in CC 祖堂集 1.11ff.

147. See CC 祖堂集 1.32,9 ff. where this is said of Mahakasyapa. The three-peaked mountain is called "Hen-foot-mountain" jizu shan 鳥足山 because it has such a shape.

The author seeks by these references to put Yunmen into the category of Bodhidharma and Mahakasyapa.

148. Fangzhang 方丈: ten square feet, allusion to the legendary room of Vimaakirti. In Chan this usually refers to the living quarters of the head of a temple.

XL 雲門行録, CDLX 景德傳燈録 [高麗本], WDBY 五燈會元, and SSJGL 釋氏稽古略 also mention the placing of the master's whole body into his living quarters. SHZ 禪林僧寶傳 22137:226a1 just says that they buried his whole body.

149. 法齡七紀二僧臘六旬六. 86 years is the Chinese age which starts with one at birth. In the West he would have said to be 85 years old. The only other source mentioning his age and his "monk's age" is S964 碑銘 (Tokiwa), p.118. It furnishes the same information.

150. See Appendix 6.

151. Translated in Appendix 1.
152. See below, p. 24 ff.

153. Cf. below, p. 35.

154. See my comments to this biographical source (number 11) on pp. 232-233.

155. See chapter I, p. 4 ff.

156. Shiina, Kōyū 椎名宏雄, "Umon kōroku to sōrōkubon no keitō 雲門広録とその抄録本の系統". Journal of Sôtô Studies (Shūgaku kenkyū 宗學研究) 24 (March 1982), 189-196. This article also includes several tables (p. 191, 193, and 194) and a chart (p. 196) which gives a summary of Shiina's view of the influences and connections between the various texts and fragments.

157. Shingaku [Tokwa], p.112. Cf. also note 103.

158. Shingaku [Tokwa], p.117.

159. This differs from Nagai's argument (Nagai, Masashi, 伊藤新之 "Umon kōroku no seiritsu ni kansuru ichi kōsetsu 雲門の語録の成立に関する考察". Shūgaku kenkyū 宗學研究 13 (1971), pp. 111-112). Nagai quickly draws the conclusion that the first stone's author thought of Shou Jian when writing this passage, and that those 'other words' refer to the records of Master Yunmen. Thus he thinks to have proof that Shou Jian had completed the redaction of Yunmen's records within 10 years after the Master's death. However, Nagai's conclusions appear to be unwarranted when both passages and their context are taken into consideration.

160. That note-taking was practiced even before Yunmen's time is documented in LJM 臨濟錢開 (1985) 591c14-16. Sasaki (p.31) translates: "Students of today get nowhere because they base their understanding upon the acknowledgment of names. They inscribe the words of some dead old guy in a big great notebook, wrap it up in four or five squares of cloth, and won't let anyone look at it."

161. Linjian lu 林間錄 2214b:591b.

162. Master Yunju 雲居 of the Fuyin temple 佛印寺 lived from 1032 until 1098 and belongs to the fourth generation of the Yunmen line.

163. These constitute the first and part of the second chapter of the YML. See p. 19.

164. Xianglin Chengyuan 香林澄遠, lived from 908 to 987.

165. Chan Master Mingjiao 明教禪師 is the posthumous name of Yunmen's disciple Shuangquan Shikuan 雲門廣録相.


169. This was pointed out by Nagai (op. cit., pp. 111-112); he refers to Nukariya, Kaiten 忍滑谷

277 NOTES
174. Great Master Jingben 淨本式卸常寶 "Great Master" originally was an honorific appellation of the Buddha and of bodhisattvas; it came into general use for Chan patriarchs and frequently forms part of honorary and posthumous titles conferred by imperial courts. The master referred to here is Master Yunmen Changbao.

175. ZTSY 祖庭事苑 Z2112:216d.


178. Hubei 楚 is the nonosyllabic name of the Hubei region. It can also refer to one of the Warring States kingdoms (destroyed in 222 B.C.) or to four of the sixteen kingdoms during the Oriental Jin period (the first was founded in 349 A.D.).

179. Chu 楚 designates either Hubei alone or both Hunan and Hubei. It is also the name of a famous ancient kingdom (740 - 223 B.C.).

180. Qiupu 秋浦 is a place in the southwestern part of the Guichi district (貴池 市) of Anhui province. As mentioned at the end of this preface, Master Yihuai stayed at the Jingde (景德) temple.

181. Cf. ZTSY 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113: 8d10, 8d11, 8d13, 9b7, 9b12, 9d4, 9d8, 9d9, 10a5, 10a14, and 10a18.

182. ZTSY items which are not accounted for in the extant YKL text include the following: ZTSY 3b12 返, 4a6 起無, 4d5 聲壁, and 8c14 明星; the last one seems to come from the first juan of the present text but is mentioned under 開中 in the ZTSY.

183. Qianchui 鉛鎚 the blacksmith's tongs and hammer. This expression is often found in connection with religious training (for instance in the prefaces of the LJJ 三門 and of the BYL 碧螺錯 ). Cf. Kujaku Dōchū's comment in XC 葛藤語録 [Yanagida ed.], p.903.

184. Benfen 本分. Cf. also note 993. The expression Benfen qianchui is for instance also found in the third chapter of the Records of Master Ningjue (明前鈍晴記). After a monk mentioned Master Deshan's beating somebody, Ningjue said: "In the manner of pure gold which is refined a hundred times, one must forge and temper one's very own matter." (W41[1996]856b19).

278 NOTES
185. *Jinsheng er yuzhen* 金聲而玉振. Literally, "the sound of the metal [bell] and the vibration of the [sounding] stone". Bell and sounding stone produce two of the traditional eight sounds (the others are brought forth by pottery, hides, silk strings, wood, gourds, and bamboo). Orchestral performances started with the sound of the bell and ended with that of the sounding stone; hence the meaning "beginning and end". Cf. ML1,469a-b.


187. For biographical sources and information about Zhongyan see *ZGD 禪學大辭典*, p.715b and the introduction to *LJLY 臨濟錄 [Yanagida tr.]*.

188. Shiina, 1982 p.190. Shiina came to this conclusion based on information found in the fifth chapter of the "Xuefeng Gazetteer" 雪峰志. The *ZGD 禪學大辭典*, p.715b does not give any dates for the birth and death of this man.

189. In "Zenseki kaidai 樺籍解題" (Nishitani Keiji 皆井啓士 and Yanagida Seizan 柳田聖山 eds., *Zenkè goroku II 鼎家語錄 II*. Tokyo: Chikuma shobō, 1974, p. 478), in *LJLY 臨濟錄 [Yanagida tr.]*, p.17, and in "Goroku no rekishi 語錄的歷史", *Tōhō gakubō 東方學報*(Kyoto) 57 (1985), p. 578, Yanagida does not furnish any evidence other than the similarity of the editing of the *YNGL* and that of the *LJLY 臨濟錄*. As Zongyan's LJL job was finished in 1120 and Ma Fang wrote the LJL preface, Yanagida gathers that the YNL job was also being done around this time.

190. Shiina bases this view mainly on evidence found in chapter 4 of the "Gushan Gazetteer" 鼓山志. There (光緒二年版, 卷四, 12a-13a) it is said that Zongyan moved to Mt. Ca in the year 1143, and that in 1145 he moved again to Mt. Xuefeng. Shiina concludes that if Zongyan died in 1146 (see note 188) he must have edited the *YNGL* between 1143 and 1145. There is no firm evidence to contradict this argument.

191. *YNGL 雲門廣錄*(1988):496b6-7. *LJL 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.]*, p.65 translate *dian jian* 〔點檢] as "examined and corrected". Demiéville explains in the preface to his translation (p.12) that this means "revised by punctuating".


195. Komazawa University 駒澤大學 in Tokyo possesses a photocopy of this Taiwan text; the writer is in possession of a photocopy of that copy.

196. See above, p. 35.

197. See Shiina, op. cit., p. 189.

198. See above, p. 35.

199. See Shiina, op. cit., p. 190.

200. See Shiina, ibid.
201. This version was reprinted by Sōtetsu 雲門綾 (1533-1612; see ZGD 須德大藏經, p. 743d) in Kyoto; see additional information in Shiina, op. cit., p. 193 (Text nr. 8).

202. Shiina, op. cit., pp. 192-193. Shiina also mentions that our texts 錄(19881548, 548b19, and 555c28 are found at Komazawa University's library.


204. See Shiina, op. cit., p. 192.

205. Pingzhan 平展: see note 205.

206. Yuren shiron 還人識人: see note 206.

207. Laopo shuobao 老婆話語: see note 207.

208. The implication seems to be that the monks think of nothing but food, and that even their going back and forth between the Monks' Hall and Dharma Hall is related to this.

209. Several songs of identical or similar title from different masters are known; in addition to the five mentioned in ZGD 須德大藏經, p. 491d, a song of the same title is found in the great song collection in the last jian of the YML 須德大藏經 禪學大藏經, 567b7-567b8.

210. Different and substantially longer version of Yunmen's "Song of all twelve time periods of the day" is found in CC 祖堂集 3.92,10 ff., but the same text has no trace of Yunmen's religious verse.

211. Hongzhuo shuobao 紅字種說: explain this way and that, talk freely any way one likes. See other occurrences in this text: 546a19, 549c26, 550c18, 557b4, and 557b5. This expression appears to be used both in a positive (expose the Dharma in various ways) and a negative sense (just repetitive talk).

212. Hewan zing 紅眼種: something without any significance. Cf. DSH 大慧書 筆(1998): 925a12: "What lamps of dirt are the Buddha and Bodhidharma, and what noise of a hot bowl are the three vehicles' twelve divisions of teachings?"

213. 楊威 謂 or 一日. This expression usually implies a change of opinion: "Up to now I used to think that....[but it turned out that this is not the case]." See for example YML 雲門廣迅 筆(1988): 548c18 ('And I [falsey] used to think you were clever!') and LHL 臨濟淄 筆(1985): 504a2 ('I always used to think you were just an ordinary chap [but in reality you aren't']).

214. See for instance YML 554a24-b2 and 555c7-8.

215. Fuxiuuei --佛照: Yongjia Yuanjue 永嘉玄覺 (665-713) who is said to have received the Sixth Patriarch's transmission after one night's stay at the patriarch's temple.

217. SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 Z1137-225d3 ff. puts the following quote directly in Yunmen's mouth; furthermore, the master's subsequent comment differs. The quote seems, with insignificant differences, from Seng Zhao's 信業 Baorenwuji lun 般若無知論 which forms part of the famous Zhaolu 禪錄 (T 45[1858]:154c10-11).


219. Cf. Zhuangzi 莊子 8.9-10: "Though the duck's legs are short, to stretch them would make it suffer; though the crane's legs are long, to cut them shorter would make it mad. Thus: what is long by nature needs no cutting off, and what is short by nature needs no stretching."

220. SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 Z1137-225d4 has instead: "It's just that the tall [has] a long Dharma body and the short a short one."


223. Parts of this sermon are also found in BYL 碧蓮錄 case 83, T48(2003):206c29-209a19.

224. Shangdare 順上人. These are the first three of a row of simple characters which according to legend young Confucius wrote to his father; from the mid-Tang, they were used for the instruction of beginners. The whole row is as follows: 上大人丘乙化三千七十士,爾小生八九子,父不知禮也 (Cf. KX 葛藤語彙 [Yanagida ed.], p. 1022 where several other examples are listed, and Yanagida's Junzen no jidai: Sodôbô monogatari 純樺の時代, 552b6 and 554c16, 570b12, and 570b15. 552b6 ff. reads: '[A monk] asked, 'I request your instruction, Master!' Master [Yunmen] said, 'ABCDSP 上大人丘乙已.' The monk went on, 'I don't understand.' Master [Yunmen] said, 'GHIJKL 化三千七十士.'"

225. Shunzhu 順住. When learning how to write, Chinese children used to trace the instructor's red characters and overwrite them in black ink. See the examples and Mujaku's explanation in KX 葛藤語彙 [Yanagida ed.], p. 946 and ZKB 禪林書集解苗 [Yanagida ed.] pp. 1137-8.

226. Gong bulang ski 功不浪施: see also 563a15 and 569b1 in the present text, and BYL 碧蓮錄 cases 27, T48(2003):167c24 and 77, 204b18 as well as the commentaries cited in ZKB 禪林書集解苗 [Yanagida ed.] p. 1132.

mean? It is to be taken in by form, sound, scent, taste, touch, and separate entities (fa 無) and not being able to detach oneself from them. It is seeking knowledge and looking for understanding in the words and phrases of the [Buddhist] scriptural teachings and of ancient worthies.

228. Dianjiao 錄校: In connection with textual work, this expression means 'to examine/verify and revise/correct' (cf. JLJ 錄校). In the context of Chan practice, however, the located examples indicate that 'to examine' or 'to verify' may be appropriate as a translation. See for instance the other two occurrences of this term in the present text (558a24 and 558c24), and PJS 錄校.

229. Ce 則. See BWZ 敘境之文字義通釋, p. 258 for examples supporting the rendering "cramped." This pronunciation by Yunmen corresponds to BYL 錄校 case 2, T48[2003] 141b20 where sōai 鏡 appears instead of ce in an otherwise identical sentence.

230. Daoshao 道著: see note 437.


233. For a short comment to each of Fenyang’s question types, see ZGD 神學大辭典, p. 1106 a-b.

234. See the short biography of this monk in Zen Dust, p. 359. Huiyan Zhizhao was a 12th-century monk in the Yangqi-line of Linji Chan (third generation after Dabai Zonggao 大慧宗杲).


236. See note 1108.


238. See section H of this chapter, pp. 143-144.

239. Tantouwen 餘音問; see BYL 習顏錄 case 9, T48[2003]149b5-7.

240. For this and the following responses of Yunmen, see note 224.

241. Prof. Iriya indicated that this quote stems from the Benwangjing 仁王經. The original form which was arranged by Yunmen reads as follows: 自性清净，名本無性，即是諸佛一切智智。


244. Yao 要. This response could also mean "exactly", "important", "necessary", "essence", etc. Cf. Luk (Chan and Zen Teachings II, p. 203) who translates the slightly different text of MDHY 五燈會元 22:138: 279c7.
245. YML 545c8, 545c17.
246. YML 545c12, 545c15, 546b20, 546b25, 549c17, 550b20, 551b22.
247. YML 545c19, 546a8, 547b18.
248. YML 550b15.
249. YML 545c10, 574a28.
250. YML 546b4.
251. YML 546b5.
252. YML 554c13-14.
253. YML 547b19.
254. YML 545c18; for questions about specific forms of samādhi see YML 546a10-11, 546b8, and 552b3.
255. YML 547c4.
256. YML 545c5, 548a6, 549b27, 553b3, 556c6-7, 557a24.
257. YML 545b14.
258. YML 549a28-29.
259. YML 549b12-13, 549c7.
260. YML 548c1.
261. YML 548c25.
262. YML 551c28.
263. YML 549a11-12.
264. YML 551c29.
265. YML 550a11.
266. YML 545b28.
267. YML 545c1, 547c2, 548a27, 550c6-7, 551c8.
268. YML 549a20.
269. YML 550b10.
270. YML 546a7-8, 550a13.
271. YML 554c18.
272. YML 545b10-11.
273. YML 548b5, 550b19.
274. YML 545b15.
275. YML 551a28-29.
276. YML 546a5.
277. YML 546a24, 553b3-4.
278. YML 546a16.
279. YML 545b13.
280. YML 546a15.
281. YML 546a29.
282. YML 551a7-8.
283. YML 551b7-8.
284. YML 549a25, 551c24.
285. YML 545c4.
286. YML 546b18.
287. YML 546a19.
288. YML 550c20-21.
289. YML 548c18-19.
290. YML 551b24.
291. YML 549c18-19.
292. YML 546a25.
293. YML 548c21; cf. also 550b15-16.
294. YML 546c27, 549b10, 553a9-10.
295. YML 549b16-17.
296. YML 551c15.

308. See YML 548a1: "[A monk] asked, 'The matter of my self is not clarified. What is your instruction?'

309. Beke shi xuere ziji 如何是學人自己. See YML 545c5, 548a6, 549b27, 553b3, 556c5, 556c7, and 557a24.

310. Zhi chi ren xian jian xing fo 直指人心，見性成佛. On the origin and history of these verses and for a slightly different rendering which inspired the one given above, see: Miura and Sasaki, Zen Dust. Kyoto: The First Zen Institute of America in Japan, 1966, pp. 228; and Tanagida Seisan's 柳田聖山 Shoki senshūishō no kenkyū 初期禪宗史書の研究, Kyoto: Hōbkan 法藏館, 1967, pp. 472 ff.

311. The clearest exposition of this is found in DeMartino, Richard J., The Zen Understanding of Man. Ph. D. dissertation, Temple University, 1969, pp. 26-58. Of course this is also a central theme of Buddhist scriptures such as the Vimalakirti sutra.


314. Panshen Baoji 盤山寶積, a successor of Mazu Daoyi 馬祖道一. Few biographical details are known. Cf. ZGD 禪學大辭典, p. 1130d.

315. Guang fei zhe jing 光非照境. Literally: "The light is not [one that] illuminates objects." Jing is an often-used term; it refers to some object, state, realm, surroundings, etc. The rendering 'objects' is chosen in this context because it is here used in contrast with the light which stands for the 'I' or subjective mind. In other texts, one finds equivalent subject/object pairs: man (ren...
and objects (jing 境) in LJJ 臨濟録 T47[1985]497b17 ff. et passim; mind (xin 心) and jing in P33 廣居士論錄 ZZ120:31a16 and JGL 絕倫論 [Tokiwa ed.] p.58a; perceptive ability (neng 能) and jing 境 in XIM 懸心録 T51[2076]457b2 etc. The phrase quoted by Yunllen is found in CC 祖堂集 4.78.1, preceded by: "The moon of mind is lone and round; its light engulfs the myriad phenomena." Cf. Huangbo's ZFY 信心法要 T47[2012]381a20: "The ordinary man holds on to objects (jing), the man of the Way holds on to mind. When mind and objects are both forgotten it is the true [Buddhist] teaching. 凡夫取境、道人取心。心境雙忘乃是真法。"

316. YML 557a1.


318. The Taisho text has sisi 自自, but the Song text omits the second character. The same sentence (with jin 直 instead of si) appears also in YML 553b22 where Yunmen mentions this as a saying from some old master.

319. Guangming 光明: a simile for awakened wisdom which breaks the darkness of delusion.

320. YML 553a8-9. This short talk which appears twice in this text (here and 563b22) is also found in BHL 禪學大辭典, case 86, T48[2003]211b21 and VDBH 五燈會元 ZZ138:278b6.

321. Lengyanjing 楞嚴經, T 29[915].

322. Tiansao 颠倒: lit., upside down. In Buddhism, this term is often used for the opposite of the true, enlightened way of being and seeing: man's state of delusion. For examples, see BD 仏教語大辞典, p.991-c-d.

323. Bulai 如來: The 'Thus-come' (Tathagata), one of the titles of the Buddha.

324. See p.176.

325. The Taisho text differs here from the older and more reliable Song edition: Taisho gives only nian ye 拈也 while the Song text has nian ye 拈了也.

326. Quwu 曲木: chair with round arm- and backrest used by Chan masters for sermons etc. See photograph in ZOZ 禪學大辭典, p.212.

327. Chanchuan 禪床: meditation platform or bench on which the monks practice seated meditation inside the monk's hall.

328. Chuankou jing 傳口令: This rarely encountered expression has been commented upon in several places (for example ZOZ 禪學大辭典, p.890d; KG 葛藤語纂 [Yanagida ed.], p.1017; ZGK 禪語要錄 p.236b; ZOK 禪語要錄 p.122; SL 禪語要錄, p.53; LJJL 臨濟録 [Yanagida tr.], p.159; LJJL 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], note 140 on p.79). Most commentators point out that this expression refers either simply to the passing on of information inside a village or to a game similar to "telephone" where each person has to repeat to his neighbor the words he has just heard. Judging from the context of this passage and a similar one in LJJ 臨濟録 T47[1985]501c18, we come to the following conclusion: 1. There is the element of hearsay, i.e. one does not speak out of one's own experience but passes on what others have said about something. 2. The information thus obtained and transmitted is disfigured and changed, particularly so if passed on by some old chatterboxes in a small village who like nothing better than gossip.

NOTES
329. Shui ye nan xiao 水也難消: see Iriya's note to ZFYY 47(2012A)386-387 (ZG 傅心法宴 Vol. 8, p. 90). Yunmen seems to imply that these monks are so utterly worthless creatures that they don't even merit receiving and consuming water, a natural resource available to everyone.

330. See note 1013.

331. See note 1014.

332. YML 548b10-11.

333. YML 552b26-27. See note 1091.

334. YML 552b26-27. See note 1091.

335. Baoyong 寶公. It is unclear to whom Yunmen refers here. An almost identical quote followed by the same remarks by Yunmen appears in ZFYL 47(1988)141a1-9 ff. In that text, however, the initial quote is attributed to Yongjia (i.e., Yongjia Xuanjue, a successor of the Sixth Patriarch).

336. Ushou 我身. Literally, 'to lay out flatly', 'to spread out', 'to present openly'. A rare expression found only once in the Yunmenlu. One interesting example is found in BYL 碧巖錄 case 25, T45(2003)141a9 ff. "During twenty years there were quite a few people who laid out (pienthan) their contents to the teacher to present their understanding."

337. Cf. YML 546a1.

338. See YML 548b10, 551a4-5.

339. YML 558a20 ff., 558b16.

340. YML 547b15, 563cff.

341. Gujiu 去就: ordinarily meaning 'taking or leaving' or 'advancing and retreating', this expression often signifies 'behavior' or ' deportment'. It can also mean '[to leave something else away] and adhere to this (WZ 2, 671c). In Chan literature (for example YML 碧巖錄 T47(1988)548b-50 and BYL 碧巖錄 case 1, T48(2003)141a9 ff.) it appears to mean 'behavior' and is most of the time used with the verb zuo 作. For additional examples see NO 宗教文化,(2012)1, p. 945 and BWZY 鳳凰文庫,(2012)1, p. 87 ff.

342. Pingzhan 平展. Literally, 'to lay out flatly', 'to spread out', 'to present openly'. A rare expression found only once in the Yunmenlu. One interesting example is found in BYL 碧巖錄 case 25, T45(2003)141a9 ff. "During twenty years there were quite a few people who laid out (pienthan) their contents to the teacher to present their understanding."
and coming from monk's and Dharna hall is related to this.

346. **Lúnian 阿年.** See note 1080.

347. **WML 55a21;** see translation of entire passage on pp. 203-204.

348. The Song text has **jian 見** where the Taisho text gives **you 有.** The latter version would read: "Is there a lantern?"


350. **Yi bucheng, er bushi … 不成，二不是.** See WML 55a19, 56a14, 56b12, and 57a13.

351. Shitou Xiqian 石頭希遷 (700-790), second generation after the 6th Patriarch, author of the *Cantongqi 佉邁要 (CDL 509b7-21).* See biography in Miura/Sasaki's *Zen Dust,* p. 300 ff.


353. See note 310 above.

354. The Chinese text is as follows: 頭口、怎麼也得不到、不怎樣也得不到、怎樣了不得、子作何生。The given translation is congruent with the one given in Iriya's translation in *WZLI 馬千區苦* (1989), p. 108. A modern formulation which says the same thing is Hisamatsu Shin'ichi's "fundamental koan" which goes: "If nothing is of any avail, what do you do?" (どうしても行かなければどうするか).

355. Hisamatsu Shin'ichi 久松真一 (Dharma name: Hōseki 抱石) lived from 1889 to 1990.


357. **WML 54b20-21.**

358. **WML 55b26.**

359. **WML (54a27, 54b18, 54b16.**

360. **WML 55a13.**

361. **WML 54b16, 54b15-16 et passim.**

362. **WML 55a24.**

363. **WML 54c17, 550 c15, 551c1, etc.**

364. **WML 54c28, 54c21, 54b10, 550b16, 552c6, 553a9, etc.**

365. **WML 54c22, 54c28, 54a15, 55a5.**

366. **WML 54b18, 54c19, 550a2, et.**

Lue xu han 據虚漢. Cf. note 982.

This may or may not allude to the Chinese proverb "Donkey lips do not fit a horse's mouth" (驢嘴不對馬嘴).

Guohua 通惠: see note 227.

Dianjian 發檢: see note 228.

Pingchuo 平出. Cf. YHL 548a2 ff., 548c1 ff., 548c2 ff.

Pingshen 平生: see note 205.

Yuren shiren 遇人識人: see note 206.

Deshan Xuanjian (德山宣鑑; 780-855), the teacher of Yunmen's master Xuefeng Yicun (雪峰義存; 822-908).

Muzhou Daowen (文州道文), another of Yunmen's teachers. See chapter I, p. 3.

This expression which acquired much fame especially after Dogen is first encountered here and in the Muzhou section of juan 12 of the *CDL* (Yanagida ed., p. 1057b) mention the present example.
390. *Hie huzhong* 胡種種: The rarely found expression *huzhong* refers, as Mujaku Dōchū convincingly demonstrated [Yanagida ed., pp. 1000-1001], to 'Buddhists'; sometimes the form *huzhongzu* 胡種族 ('Buddhist race') is also encountered (for example YKL 雲門廣錄 T47[1988]553a22 and BYL 碧崖語錄 [Yanagida ed.], p. 1008 lists several interesting examples of *huzhong* in Chan literature; this expression was, as ZTSY ZZ 113:4d17 points out too, used both in a negative (scolding) and positive (praising) sense. Cf. also YKL 555a11, 553a25, and XFL 雪峰語錄 ZZ119:477a17.

391. Chang lianchun 長連春: According to ZGD 禅學大辭典 (p. 889a) this was a platform inside the monk's hall on which either five or ten people could meditate. Cf. also SKS 碧崖語錄 [Yanagida ed.], p.802 and 799.

392. Dayezhai han 打野樺漢. See note 1020.

393. YML 573c12-14.

394. YML 553a17, 558a1, 568c6.

395. YML 546b11, 547b7 ff., 552a7, 553a16 ff.

396. YML 546b4, 547a28 ff., 559b8, 553a15 ff.

397. YML 546c13, 546c15, 552c4, 587b22, etc.

398. YML 546b18, 551c6, 551a15.

399. 553a15 ff., 573b16.

400. NML 馬祖語録 ZZ119:406a3-4. A more literal rendering of *Wumen wei famen* 無門為法門, though not different in content, would be: "[taking] no-gate as Dharma-gate."

401. See above, p. 66.

402. See pp. 107 ff.

403. *Shifang* 十方. lit., "the ten directions": the eight points of the compass plus zenith and nadir. Cf. LJIS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p.73 (note 71).

404. The last case of the appropriately named *Gateless Barrier* [YWL 無門關 case 48, T48[2005] 299al-7] takes up this theme in a question to Master Qianfeng 乾峰. The text corresponds to YML 雲門廣錄 T47[1988]555a3-6]. I translate this interesting 'case' as follows: "Once Master [Yuezhou] Qianfeng [越州 乾峰] was asked by a monk: 'The holy ones of the whole universe have a single way to nirvana. I wonder where the entrance to this way is.' [Qian]feng held up his staff, drew a line, and said, 'It's in this.' Later the monk asked Yunmen for his instruction. Yunmen held up his fan and said, 'The fan jumps up to the [highest] thirty third heaven [on top of Mt. Sumeru] and hits the nose of [the supreme deity of that heaven,] Sakra Devendra. The carp of the Eastern Sea gives a blow, and it rains cats and dogs.' In the YML version of this episode, Yunmen asks the question "Do you understand?".

405. For Huike's biography, see Miura/Sasaki's Zen Dust pp. 38 - 40 and p. 240 ff.
406. The Chodang chip 神堂集 account which is translated here differs in interesting ways (see next note) from other traditional accounts such as the most famous one which is translated in Miura, Isshu, and Fuller Sasaki, Ruth, Zen Dust. Kyoto: The First Zen Institute of America in Japan, 1966, pp. 35-40.

407. Yanagida's translation of this passage (Zengoroku 種語錄, p. 450a) is much influenced by traditional accounts and fails to bring out the essential point which Bodhidharma made: if what is sought is the very heart-mind of the seeker, finding it is impossible; likewise, it is impossible for someone else to confer peace of mind. The story of Yajnadatta who seeks for his own head (YHL 云巖語錄 T47[1985]457c19 ff.) expresses the same idea, and so do other topoi such as "a fellow who sits in a rice basket yet starves to death, is up to his head in the water yet dies of thirst." (YML 55a1)

408. In this context, the role of doubt is extremely important; it will be discussed in section Η of this chapter.

409. Yanzhong you xiang 言中響, Lit., "there's an echo in the words." Prof. Iriya suggested that this simply means "good word," or in this context, "good question." Other occurrences of this expression in the YML (546a22 and 548a15) and several in the Blue Cliff Records (for instance YHL 云巖語錄 case 26, T48[2003]166c21) seem to confirm this interpretation. For another possible interpretation in a different context, see note 973.

410. YML 552c22.

411. YML 546c9.

412. YML 555c1-2: Congmei rushe fei hao 從門入者非實. This expression (with bushi jizhen 不是家珍 instead of fei hao) stems from the story about Master Xuefeng’s awakening (YHL 云巖語錄 ZZ9: 473a4); it appears also in YML 云巖語錄 T47[1985]566a3, YHL 云巖語錄 T48[2003]145a10 (case 5) and 166c27 (case 22) as well as in the preface to the WNG 無門關 T48[2005]292b13.

413. A similar but shorter conversation is found in YML 553a9-10: "His imperial majesty [the emperor] asked, ‘What is Chan?’. The Master said, ‘Your imperial majesty have a request, and your servant the monk responds [to that].’

414. YML 546c3.


416. Changqiu Huleng 長慶慧棱 (851-921), a co-disciple of Yunmen under Master Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存. For biographical information, see Zen Dust pp. 291-294 and ZCD 親學大辭典, p. 1054.

417. Cf. also section Η of this chapter, p. 80 ff.

418. See section Η of this chapter, p. 142 ff.

NOTES
419. Cf. for instance YML 546c27-28, 548a27-28, 549b10, 551a9, 552c24, and 559a9-10.

420. The first two "sentences" of Mawangdui text one (甲) of Daodejing 道德經 chapter 1 read as follows: "道可道也非道也名可名也非名也. (see Van Liangfeng 關梁峰, Mawangdui boshu laozi shitan 马王堆帛書老子試探. Taipeh: Luotu shu chubanshe 洛園書出版社, 1965, p. 12). In the 'tentative' translation by Max Kaltenmark whose English rendering by Roger Greaves is cited here (Lao Tzu and Taoism, Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1969, p. 30), the Chinese transcription has been changed from Kaltenmark's Wade-Giles to Pinyin.


423. Changdao zhi ji 唱道之機. See note 937.


425. Luesheng jia shuang 雪上加霜. See note 1072. It is possible that Yunmen addressed this to his disciples: "You should not add..." but the sudden end of this sermon suggests a reflection of Yunmen on his own teaching activity.


427. To mention just two examples from these two domains: the theologia negativa of Pseudo-Dionysios Areopagita (5/6th century) and Arnold Schönberg's (1874-1951) opera "Moses und Aron".

428. See p. 160 ff.


430. Jiaowei bie chuan, buli wenzi 教外別傳, 不立文字。

431. Dier yi 第二義: "conventional" or "worldly" truth. See p. 160.

432. Nianque 祛却: to take away, get rid of. Cf. Mujaku's collection of examples in KG 葛藤語義 [Yanagida ed.], p. 947. The present text features 13 occurrences of this expression; 546c26, 547b22, 560a14, and 563b26 illustrate its usage well.


434. Lingsuo 領過: this legal expression is found in two other passages of this text: 551a4 and 551c29. Cf. also note 1062 to rishuang lingguo 領過.

435. See section J of this chapter.
435.  


437.  *Daozao* 道著: used both lightly as 'to say' or 'to tell' and, in a somewhat heavier or more general way, as 'to express verbally', 'to state positively'. Examples for the first usage abound in this and other texts; for instance *YML* 碧巖録 case 6, *T48* [2003]146a17. The second usage where verbal expression of the absolute is pointed at can also be illustrated by many passages, for instance *YML* 562c17, *PJS* 居士語錄 ZZ120:30a1, *ZZL* 趙州録 ZZ118:157d15, and *BYL* 碧巖録 case 23, *T48* [2003]166a11.

438.  The earliest source for this saying (though with a slightly different text) seems to be *CC* 祖堂集 2.21,2 (see also 2.24.14 and 4.13.6). Its author is likely to be Chan Master Chuanzi Deckeng 船子德誠 (? - 880), a successor of Master Yasuan Weiyuan 業山惟嚴 (745-828). It appears in the form cited by Yunmen in *T48* [2003]176c19 ff.: "in the vast ocean twelve water buffaloes are used as bait on the hooks and only a frog can be caught.

439.  *Zhijiang yuwen lai* 針江語聞. Even more than his teacher Huashou 交退 (ZZ118: 114d1, 115a2), Yunmen liked to challenge his students to formulate questions. See *YML* 碧巖録 case 6, *T48* [2003]146a17, 564c9, 565a13, 566a27, 567a4, 569a12, 564c23, 565b18, and 572a20.

440.  *Jian* 鍏. Implied could be: examine (this bowl), or examine (me). Such requests for a master's reflection are also found in *YML* 碧巖録 case 6, *T48* [2003]146a17, 564c9, 565a13, 566a27, 567a4, 569a12, 564c23, 565b18, and 572a20. The same word is mentioned in *BYL* 碧巖録 case 22, *T48* [2003]166a17 as one of three words ('three-word Chan') which Yunmen used to teach.

441.  *Paogou diao kunjing, diaode ge baxa* 探勾釣昆明, 探得個花下: probably a proverb. See additional examples in *YML* 碧巖録 ZZ118: 113c13 and *BYL* 碧巖録 case 91, *T48* [2003]176c19 ff.: "In the vast ocean twelve water buffaloes are used as bait on the hooks, but he could only catch a frog.'

442.  A similar text of the rest of this short talk is also found in *SHZ* 聖経輯傳 ZZ137: 225d5 ff.

443.  *Geteng* 與藤: see note 1086 and p. 82.

444.  Zhao wo reman 赵我被問: Zhao functions here as a particle indicating passive mode. The word of the Song text is misprinted 蓋 in the Taisho text. For reman ('utterly fooled'), cf. also *YML* 碧巖録 case 57, *T48* [2003]176c19 ff. and case 98, *ZZL* 176c24.

445.  *Yue shang jia shuang* 月上加霜: See note 1072.

446.  *Sian yi* 思問意: See note 972.

447.  *Shige showu* 是何所云: This question was a favorite one of Yunmen's teacher Xucfeng. See for instance *YML* 碧巖録 ZZ119: 476a9, 476a14, 476b12-13, 476d4, 476d6, et passim.


449.  Prof. Iriya pointed out that this is implied here; cf. the parallel passage in *YML* 546a21-22.

450.  I.e., as in *YML* 546a22 (see instruction 4, p. 195), the realization that the master's words are no more than medicine given to a dead horse.
451. Jingchu sapoke: A formula used at the end of magic incantations in esoteric Mahayana Buddhism. Jingchu is a quiet place, sapoke corresponds to the Sanskrit svâhâ, a magic formula which is supposed to bring about fulfillment of one's wishes and good luck; it originated in Vedic religion where it was used in the worship of gods (cf. BD 6:378a7, p. 801c). While this formula is rare in Chan literature, it is used several times by Yunmen (549b26, 552c17, 558c24, 572c11, and 572c17).

452. Xiangxin: See p. 145.

453. Cf. YML 566c14: "A monk asked, 'What is a phrase that is in concordance with enlightenment?'
Master [Yunmen] said, 'Exposed'."

454. See note 458.

455. YML 547a19-20.

456. Cf. DDJ 532a chapter 41: "The highest power (德) is like a valley ... The Dao is hidden and nameless..."

457. Yunmen apparently experienced such appreciation; the stone inscription of 964 says that "the Emperor knew that the Master is like a valley that holds the secret of heaven and earth; his veneration steadily increased." (9964 碑銘 [Tokiwa], p. 118.)

458. Cf. BYL 575a case 7, 740 (2003)7a22: "Whatever you pick up, there's nothing that's not IT."


462. Shishuang Chuyuan 石霜楚團 (986-1039), a contemporary of Yunmen who studied under Fenyang Shandao (947-1024) and became Shandao's Dharma heir. These two teachers stand at the origin of both major traditions which carried the teachings of the Linji line through the ensuing centuries. Biographical and source information about Chuyuan Shishuang is found in Zen Dust pp. 212-3 and in ZCD pp. 760a-b.

463. Feiju 非句.

464. Feiju shibi ju 非句始是句. An alternative English rendering [No-phrase first is a phrase] is also inferior to the most elegant and literal German rendering: "Erst ein Nicht-Satz ist ein Satz."

465. Luofu 罗浮: Yunmen refers to Mt. Luofu situated in the east of Zengcheng district. According to the Guangdong province of the region of South China; this mountain is said to have been the place where the famous Cehong acquired the skills of an immortal. About a decade after Yunmen's death, Prince Liu Chang of Nanhan Province built a palace on this mountain which was renowned for the beauty of its plum trees. See [大英百科全书] 9.38c-d.

466. Shaoshou 韶州: This is the region of South China where Yunmen's temple is situated.
467. Sanqian daqian shijie：千大千世界: this is one huge cosmology, consisting of one thousand million small worlds; each of these small worlds contains Mt. Sumeru, surrounded by seven continents, eight seas, and a ring of iron mountains. See SH Soothill/Hodous, p. 61b.

468. This refers to the totality of the Buddhist scriptures. See LLL3 臨漱録 [Sasaki tr.], p. 67 (note 13).

469. YHL 546a19-20. For songsheng shiMAS 紙横十字, see note 970.

470. YHL 546b11-12.

471. YHL 546b12.

472. YHL 545a6-7.

473. Jingsheng er yuwen 金聲而玉振. See note 185.

474. YHL 552c22. Cf. also YHL 546c14, 547b3-4, 547b17, 548b15, etc.

475. YHL 546c14.

476. YHL 556c1-2.

477. Wunai...be cannot be helped", "cannot help...". It is possible to interpret this sentence to the effect that the sages cannot deal with your self, that your self is beyond their efforts.

478. Dongshan Shouchu 洞山守初 (910-990). For biographical sources, see CZJ 中國禪:古人名索引, pp. 276-77. Sayings by this master are collected in vol. 126 of the ZZ collection under the title Dongshan Shouchu Chanshi yuyao 洞山守初禱告要.

479. The given translation is Cleary’s (The Blue Cliff Records vol. 1, pp. 84-86). An almost identical text of this statement is included in YHL 572a28-b3, but these words are not attributed to Dongshan but simply to "a monk".

480. YHL 545a22.

481. MZL 馬祖語錄 ZZ119:407a13. Cf. the commentary in MZL 馬祖語錄 [Iriya tr.], p. 54.

482. YHL 547b2-3.

483. Cf. YHL 551c25-27: "A monk said [to Master Yunmen], 'The agony is profound.' The Master said, 'Exactly, exactly!'

484. YHL 545b18-19.

485. YHL 553a13.

486. YHL 552c6-7.

487. See chapter I, p. 3, and note 63.

295 NOTES
488. *Rūni rusṣin* 入泥入生: this expression is used for compassionate masters who spare no effort for the sake of their disciples. See Mujaku Dōchū's explanation in *KG* 菖薜語義 [Yanagida ed.], p. 1043. His examples do not include YHL 547b2 and 573c21 nor BYL 白華錄 case 15, T48[2003]155b28 and case 16, 156b11 etc. Araki Hengo's 無木見悟 note in ZC 藤の語録 Vol. 17, p. 18 is simply a reformulation of Mujaku Dōchū's explanation in the second chapter of the *Daie zenji sho kōrōshū* 大慧禅師書持持珠.

489. *Fengu suishen* 粉骨碎身. This expression stems from ZD6 永嘉慧遠觀 T48[2014]396c21: "Crushing one's bones and tearing one's body to pieces is still not sufficient recompense [for the teacher's efforts on our behalf] 粉骨碎身未足餌."  

490. This fear of the student formulated by his master is mentioned once in ZZ13 聖傳語録 ZZ118:118a8 and several times in the YHL: 557a26-27, 567b23, 569b20, and 569c28. Yunmen said this only in place of someone who was unable to answer.

491. *KG* 菖薜語義 [Yanagida ed.], p. 1043; an identical explanation is found in the second chapter of his *KKG* 大慧語録書持持珠.

492. YHL 547a16-17.

493. YHL 550c1. See also 547a11-13 where Deshan and Muzhou show the same ability, and LYL 皇華録 T47[1985]497a5 and 499a10.

494. YHL 558c29.

495. These activities of the master will be discussed in the following two sections of this chapter.

496. The rest of this conversation was used -- though in a slightly different form -- as case 54 of the Blue Cliff Record (BYL 藤の語録 T48[2003]186b19-25) and in WDH 無德會元 ZZ138:279d4-6.

497. *Yiduanshi* 一段事. See note 985.

498. *Benshi* 本師: either the Buddha or Bodhidharma.

499. *Layue sanšíri* 書月三十日: literally, 'the thirtieth day of the twelfth [lunar] month'. Probably corresponds to 'five to twelve'. This is the only occurrence in this text, but Yunmen uses *layue ershiwu* 書月二十五 ('the twenty fifth day of the twelfth month', or possibly 'ten to twelve') several times: YHL 545b28, 546c23, and 548c21.

500. *Quan* 曲木: see note 326.

501. *Chanchuan* 珍陳: see note 327.

502. *Chunzhou ling* 傳口令: see note 328.

503. *Zuofo* 祖佛. For the alternative translation "patriarch-buddhas", see note 986.


Cases 6, 14, 15, 27, 33, 47, 50, 54, 56, 62, 77, 83, 86, and 97.

Cases 8, 22, 34, and 88.

These are the stories about attendant Yuan (Yunllen and Chen Cao (case 100 221a24). Deshan Yuanlli is protagonist in five out of forty eight cases of the Wumenguan [無門關 T48(2003) 157a28 f.], and about Yunnen and Baling (case 100 221a24).

Yunllen is protagonist in five out of forty eight cases of the Wumenguan [無門關 T48(2005), cases 15, 16, 21, 39, and 48], and in eight out of one hundred cases of the Congronglu [從容錄 T48(2004), cases 11, 19, 31, 40, 78, 82, 92, and 99].


This translation is from Cleary, Thomas & J.C., The Blue Cliff Record. Boulder & London: Shambhala, 1977, p. 94.

For biographical information, see references in CZJ 中國佛祖人名索引, p. 286 b.


528. BLYL, case 27, T48[2006]a167c16.

529. BLYL, case 50, T48[2006]a185b11-12.

530. Translation by Cleary, Thomas & J.C., op. cit., p. 554.

531. Translation by Cleary, Thomas & J.C., op. cit., p. 536.


533. Translation by Cleary, Thomas & J.C., op. cit., p. 149.


543. Blyth, R.H. op. cit. p. 117.

544. Blyth, R.H., op. cit., p. 120.


553. Blyth, R.H., op. cit. p. 139.
554. Blyth, R.H., op. cit. p. 139.
559. Wu, op. cit., p. 213.
566. Wu, op. cit., p. 221.


577. This seminar took place at Hanazono College in Kyoto between 1982 and 1985.

578. This theory is mentioned in Iriya, Yoshitaka 人矢義高, *Jiko to Chôetsu* 自己と超越, p. 29 ff. and p. 82 ff.

579. Iriya, Yoshitaka, op. cit., p. 82.

580. YML 548b16, 545b18, 549b28, 546c8 ff.

581. YML 552a23, 553a13.

582. YML 547a1, 546b13, 546a5, and 548b2 respectively.

583. See for example *LLJ* 臨濟錦 *T47*[1985]497b8, 497b28, etc.; *XWL* 雪峰語録 *ZZ119*:472b14, 473b5, 477a3, etc.

584. This is a quote of *XXM* 信心録 *T51*[2076]457a18.

585. *Firiuju* 毘盧炬: This refers to Hongjia Yuanju 逢嘉圆觉, who is said to have received the Sixth Patriarch's transmission after one night's stay at the patriarch's temple.


587. *Daqi quanshou* 大地全收, Cf. also 548b2 and 563c4, and Master Luopu's saying: "The moment a single grain of dust arises, the whole world is contained in it." (YML *T47*:547a23, 555c7, and 556b16).

588. This quote and Yunmen's subsequent remarks are also found in *WDBY* 五燈會元 *ZZ138*:278d15-17.

589. *WDBY* 五燈會元 *ZZ138*:278d16 adds: "raised his hand and...".

590. *Habing* 東港: "Sesame bun". According to Prof. Iriya (ZG 禪の語録 Vol.15, p.230) this refers to a baked bun made from wheat flour dough and sprinkled with sesame seeds. This sort of bun (10-15 cm in diameter) originated in China's western territories but seems to have been common also in other regions of China in Yunmen's time.
591. Manto 湯棟: a steam cooked rice flour dumpling, usually with some filling.

592. This refers to the Jiao tung ban ro boluosi jing 交光班波洛蘇經 T84[245]:893c.

593. The quote omits the first part of the sentence: "The purity of all-encompassing wisdom is due to..."

594. Jujue 舉俱: In Chan literature, this expression appears to be used both as a noun and a verb. As a noun it signifies 'a reminder to awaken', i.e. the presence, acts or words of a master which reminds students to awaken (cf. for example YHL 善願語錄 ZZ118 and XPL 言論語錄 ZZ119). In the present case we have a verb which appears to mean 'to remind and be aware of', 'to remind and make aware of', or simply 'to become aware of' or 'to realize'. Some good examples for verbal usage are contained in Master Dahui's letters, for instance DHS 大慧著 T47[1998]916b25: "If you constantly remind yourself and are aware of [two sayings by Master Zhaozhou and Master Yunmen], there will certainly be an entry after some time!" See also other examples in ZH 禪語錄 Vol.19, pp. 51, 57, 171, and 226.

595. Qiancha tongche 千差同辙: see note 1004.

596. Rusbi wo wen 如是我聞: The set phrase which stands at the beginning of many Buddhist texts.

597. There are dozens of examples in both the NZHL 北中華語錄 ZZ118 and the XPL 雲譯語錄 ZZ119.

598. Luoluo li 魯洛李. Notes to the Taisho text indicate that variant texts have a different li, namely, 喃 ('mumbling', 'muttering') instead of 李. It can, according to Morokoshi 大原誠 (see vol. 11, p.203) stand for 嘟. Indeed, YHL 557a7 has 'muoluo li' written this way. 魯洛李 means either 'scattered', 'sparse' or refers to the non-Chinese Luoluo population of Yunnan, Guizhou and Siquan. Thus this expression could possibly mean "to mumble [something in the] luoluo [language]." The only other passage where it occurs in this text would be translated as follows: "One day [Master Yunmen] said, 'The ultimate Way has no difficulty; just avoid picking and choosing.' How about 'not picking and choosing'? He added, 'The Tathagata's wondrous-shaped body mumbles [in] Luoluo.' In place of the audience, Yunmen] said, 'It doesn't come out.' To the first word (about the ultimate Way) he said, 'The ancients have said it all.'" (YHL 557a6-8)

599. This Beverend is likely to be Master Anguo Huiqiu (安國慧球; died 913) who was a disciple of Yunmen's "dharma brother" Xuansha. 興沙師傅.


601. This sermon is also found in MDBG 五燈會元 ZZ138:280a10-12.

602. Lüniu mengjian 需牟夢見: See note 667.

603. See note 976.

604. Nie hushong 汝胡種: See note 390.


606. Da ye shai han 打野相慣. See note 1020.


609. These questions are probably inspired by a saying which Yunmen quoted in YML 59a28-29: "A man of old said, 'If you understand, you [reap] the enjoyment [of meritorious actions] on the way. If you don't understand, worldly truth pervades everywhere.'"


611. *Daode* 道德: "to be able to speak / say". With the Japanese monk Dōgen 道元 -- who devoted chapter 39 of his Shōbōgenzō 正法眼藏 to this theme -- this expression acquired overtones which were not present in Tang and Five Dynasty Chan. There this expression had, as many others in Chan literature, both a common and a religiously loaded meaning. Questions like "where are you from" or "how are you" and phrases such as "take care of yourself" belong to this category. Here, Yunmen does not just ask "can you tell me" but challenges his disciples: "Are you able to express your [awakened] self?"

612. *Shilai* 道來. This expression ordinarily means "unexpectedly", "accidentally" (cf. M 11,166a). In Chan literature, however, it appears to signify "so far", "up to now", "before". See *TOC* 正法眼藏 [Yanagida ed.], p. 365 for examples. The *CC* 祖堂集 contains the following good example: "Before [shilai] he used to say that no-mind is the Way; now he says that body-and-mind originally are the Way." (1,133,11)

613. The small night soil pot possibly refers to the Master's own initial silence, while the big one could describe the assembly's silence.

614. See note 224.

615. *Dadi quanshou* 大地全收: see note 587.


617. *Sanjie weixia* 三界唯心: For the source of this quote, see Yanagida's note to LJJ 至極録 T47(1985)500a19 in LJJ 至極録 [Yanagida tr.], p. 134.


620. *Liangzhou* 長州: Place name. Corresponds to today's Changde district of Hunan province 湖南省 常德県. Since Liang means "brilliant", Yunmen probably used the literal meaning as pun.


302 NOTES
622. See for example IFL, Z2119:475a1, 475c2, 478d3, and 478d9.


624. Shanfu tie nio 鉄牛: "The Iron Ox is supposed to have been built by the legendary King Yu to stem the flood of the Yellow River some four thousand years ago; its head is in Henan, and its tail is in Hebei." (Cleary, Blue Cliff Record II, p.287). ZGD adds that this ox was revered as a protective deity; passers-by sprinkled water over it. Chinese sources about this ox are cited in KG 葛藤語簧 [Yanagida ed.]. This ox is also mentioned in BYL 碧龄最 case 6, T48[2003]146a20.

625. Danjia guozhuan 搪枷過收: cf. also YKL 555c29 and KZHL 鞠叫語錄 ZZ118:14c18, 16a7, and 16a6. Further references are found in KG 葛藤語簧 [Yanagida ed.].

626. Dazhao 假道; see note 437.


628. Suzuki, Daisetz T., ibid.


640. LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p. 2.

The verbal suffix *qu* suggests an imperative. For *geteng* see note 1086. Both CDL and *WDHY* have only *geteng*; these texts thus read: "All the Buddhhas, [countless like] grains of sand, are engaged in discussions in [this line] here."

Slightly different texts of this short sermon are found in CDL T48[2003]144c27 (translated in Chang, *Original Teachings* p.280) and in *WDHY* ZZ138:278c2-4 (translated in Luk's *Chan and Zen Teachings II*, p.196).

See also examples in the BYL 碧蝶集 (for instance case 5, T48[2003]144c27) and in KG 五燈會元 [Yanagida ed.], p.933.

Yang mentions this state of perfect concentration once more (555a27 ff.): "[The Master] cited [the saying] "Seeing, hearing, bodily sensation, and knowing: no obstruction. Sound, odor, taste, and touch: permanent perfect concentration."

This episode is also related in *WDHY* ZZ138:277b9 ff. and in BYL 碧蝶集 case 16, T48[2003]156c16 ff.

*Zhan jiang shuo* 展兩手: Cf. other episodes where Yumen extended his hands in YML 570a23 ff. (corresponding to BYL 碧蝶集 case 54, T48[2003]188b19 ff.), and in YML 557a17, 559c13, 560a1, 563a8, and 569a3.

See notes 65 and 354.

Many examples are translated in this chapter's section on Yumen's questions.

For examples, see this chapter's section on Yumen's answers.

*Fibo* 衣服: the monk's robe and bowl. This expression is also used to refer to all possessions of a monk. A good example of this is found in this text (YML 547b9). See SKS 禪林集器箋 [Yanagida ed.], p.827.

*Geteng* 起藤: see note 1086.

*Dailey* 努力: see note 426.


Sanjiscuoli han 殷家速拉: Literally, "fellow from a three house hamlet". Cf. also BYL 碧蝶集 case 9, T48[2003]149b14: "If you understand it this way, then any yokel from a three house hamlet understands more about the Buddhist teaching than you do."
657. Lunian mengjian 騙作夢見. Yunmen liked this expression; it appears no less than seven times in this text (554a19, 554a23, 554b27, 555a11, 564b4, 572b10, and 574c23). The donkey is not part of the Chinese twelve animal cycle; thus 'year of the donkey' appears to mean 'never' (cf. KG 葛藤語言主 [Yanagida ed.], p. 906). An alternative translation of the whole expression is 'You'll never see it even in a dream!'

658. Qusu 曲木: see note 325.

659. Chanchuan 諮床: see note 327.

660. Chuankou ling 諮口令: see note 328.

661. YML 547a4-b17. Similar texts of this public instruction are found in CDL 景德傅娃盟主 T51(2076) 357a28-c12 (translated in Chang, Original Teachings pp. 286-288) and WDHY 五燈會元 ZZ138:277d1-278a18 (translated in Luk II, pp. 190-193). Furthermore, the first four lines (YML 547a1-8) are are contained in SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 ZZ137:225a11-14.

662. Xingzao 性燥. The Ming text of the YML as well as the CDL 親德傅娃盟主 have a different zao (燥), and in BYL 碧巖錄 case 7, WA(2003) 147a19 one more zao is found in the expression xingzao han 性懸煩. Mujaku Dôchû (KG 葛藤語言主 [Yanagida ed.], p. 920) explains that both 性懸 and 性燥 mean "sharp", "intelligent", "outstanding". Cleary translated the above-mentioned BYL 碧巖錄 passage in this sense: "Even if you discern it before sound and cut off the tongues of everyone in the world, you're still not a sharp fellow."

663. The breaking of legs is also mentioned in YML 551a3 and 553a26, and again in the context of a master's strong disapproval with regard to the accomplishment of a student. These are, incidentally, the only passages in the YML text (excluding biographical materials) which could be adduced by a proponent of the theory that Yunmen's leg got broken by his master Huzhou 昀州.

664. Shoujiao 手脚. Each of the three times that this expression is used in this instruction, it has a different meaning: here it refers to a person's activity, in 547b10 to someone who helps others, and in 547b13 to arms and legs.

665. Chengdang 承當. See note 977.

666. Dier ji 第二機. Primary action refers to spontaneous awakened expression. The YML's account of Master Yunmen's travels contains the following anecdote: "[Yunmen] asked Wolong 品1自!: 'Which function is that which one can learn on the long meditation platform?' [Wolong] said, 'Secondary function.' Master [Yunmen]: 'How about primary function?' [Wolong]: 'Tightly bound straw sandals.'" (YML 573c13-15)

667. Deshan Xuanjian 德山宣鑑; 780-865), the teacher of Yunmen's master Xuefeng Yicun (雪峰義存; 822-908).

668. Huzhou Daoming 昀州道明, another of Yunmen's teachers. See chapter I, p. 3.

669. Tianzheng gongan 現成公案: see note 388.


671. This may or may not allude to the Chinese proverb "Donkey lies do not fit a horse's mouth" (驢脣不對馬嘴).
NOTES
688. *Xianzheng gongan* 現成公案: see note 389.


690. *YML* 54a12, 55a28, and 57a9; *CDL* 臨清傳記 (T51[2076] 291b7 and *MZH* 錦州語録 ZZ118:115d13-14.

691. See *Wei ao jing* 維摩詰所詣記 (Vimalakirti Sutra), T14[475], chapters 3 and 4 (539c14 - 544a18).


697. *Quanhui 维摩*, a trap. So far, I found this expression only here and in *YML* 玄沙語録 ZZ125:179c1. I translate the latter as follows: "Please, Master, discuss it without falling into phrases and without falling into traps." Iriya et al. (note on p. 83 of *Genba kôroku I*) take this expression to mean 'fixed pattern', 'category'. My different interpretation is not only based on the present YML passage where 'category' would be strange, but also on *YSV* 玄沙語録 ZZ113:70c where *guan* is said to correspond to *quanhui 維摩.* Indeed, the text of *WY* 玄沙語録 ZZ138:277b2 which tells the same story as the present YML episode gives the latter characters (which *Luk, Chan and Zen Teachings II* p.166 translates questionably as 'corners'). These latter characters are in turn explained and illustrated in *Zhang* 義海源流, p. 737. Zhang says that this and a whole range of similarly written compounds mean the same as *quantao 困套*, i.e. 'snare' or 'trap'.


700. See the next section (I) of this chapter.

701. "Gateless Barrier" is the well-chosen title of a very famous collection of *koan* (WKG 鬧門關 T48[2005]).


704. Preface of the *YHL* 碧巖語録 T48[2003]139a6 et passim.

705. See above, p. 66.
706. See page 76 ff.


710. Today, this anecdote which opens "The Gateless Barrier" (WBG 無門關 case 1, T48[2005]292c21-22) is probably the most famous koan.

711. The translation is from LJLS 聖錄 (Sasaki tr.), pp. 11-12.

712. Not only monks at the feet of the master felt this effect; even present-day researchers are not immune. A case in point is the excellent sinologist and buddhologist Paul Demieville who, driven among other reasons by fascination with and admiration of Master Linji, spent a number of years researching and translating the Master's records and then confided to Anna Seidel that after all he was not quite sure whether Linji was a quack or a great master, whether he was fake or genuine.

713. Changqing Huileng 長慶慧棱 (854-932), a co-disciple of Yumen under Master Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存. For biographical information, see Zen Duz pp. 251-254 and 聖學大辭典, p. 105d.

714. This quote is also found in BYL 碧巖録 case 18, T48[2003]158c16 and case 31, 171b16.

715. Rutou chu 入頭處: see note 1017.

716. Translation from LJLS 聖錄 [Sasaki tr.], p. 7.


718. BYL 碧巖録 case 57, T48[2003]190c27.


721. The translation of the last sentence stems from LJLS 聖錄 [Sasaki tr.], p. 13.


723. Chengdang 承當. See note 977.

724. Laoye 老爺. This could simply refer to the masters of the Chan school. However, analysis of the use of this expression in this and other texts indicates that it more likely is a reference to one's own true self. The expression is used three times in this text. Once (551b3) a monk asks: "When the assembly gathers like a cloud, what should it discuss?" The Master replied, "Deceiving the laoye of your own house." The other occurrence (552a13) is clearer: "You're trying to comprehend the master or mistress of your own house." The appearance of the word 'mistress' laoniang 老儷 is a reason for favoring the given interpretation, as there were no known female Chan masters. Cf. also
725. See p. 136 ff.


727. *Tianmo 天魔*; one of four or five Maras (魔羅). The king of the sixth heaven at the top of the world of desire, this demon king obstructs the Buddhist truth and interferes when someone tries to do good. For sources, cf. BD 仏教語大辞典, p. 985a. See also SH Soothill/Hodus, p. 148a.

728. A possible alternative translation: [Someone] asked [Master Yumen], "What is the monk's practice?" The Master replied, "[I] can't understand." [The questioner] carried on, "Why is it that [you] can't understand?" The Master said, "Just hold on to 'I can't understand!'"

729. This exchange for case 77 of the BYL 聖傳錄 (T46 (2003) 204b11) and, with an insignificant textual difference, case 9 of YXYG 襲雲頌古 (2G 祖堂集, Vol. 15, p. 229). Places where a different answer is given to the same question include CC 祖堂集, 3.94.13, CDL 聖傳傳錄, TS1 (2076) 33Sa1-6, and BYL 聖傳傳錄, ZZ18:113b8. I translate the last as follows: "[A monk] asked, 'What is a statement that transcends Buddha and goes beyond the patriarchs?' Master [Mushou] at once took his staff and showed it to the assembly: 'I call this a staff; what do you call this?' The monk was speechless. Master [Mushou] once again took the staff, showed it, and said, 'It is you who asked about a statement that transcends the Buddha and goes beyond the patriarchs, isn't it?' The monk was speechless. Hubing: "Sesame bun". According to Prof. Iriya 仏道共語集, Vol. 15, p. 230 this refers to a baked bun made from wheat flour dough and sprinkled with sesame seeds. This sort of bun (10-15 cm in diameter) originated in China's western territories but seems to have been common also in other regions of China in Yumen's time.

730. Zhuanz 現言. See note 1011.


732. Both CDL 聖傳傳録, TS1 (2076) 33Sa6 and WDHY 五燈會元 add reo 人 between ji 記 and shuo 說.

733. See note 675.

734. Yingtao 性鐙. See note 652.

735. Geteng 葛藤: see note 1086.

736. Shuo geteng 說葛藤. For geteng see note 1086.

737. Shihui nianhua nihou jiegou 剔除常火現諸病狗: Maybe this whole phrase which was not found elsewhere should probably be taken literally as a strong curse: "Shit - ash - piss - fire - dirty pig - scabious dog! You don't even know good from bad!"

Yunllen also uses hindrance in the expression *wri* in the *FHY 五燈會元* have signifies (translated in *Chan and Zen*).

Vietnam. This passage appears also in *Luk’s Chan and Zen Teachings II*, p. 196.

Both *CDL* and *VDHY* have only geteng; these texts thus read: "All the Buddhas, [countless like] grains of sand, are engaged in discussions in this line here."

Slightly different texts of this short sermon are found in *CDL* (translated in Chang, *Original Teachings* p. 290) and in *VDHY* (translated in Luk’s *Chan and Zen Teachings II*, p. 196).

The almost identical sermon in *YML* 564a1 has: "Now is there anyone who can understand?"

This passage appears also in *VDHY* 2218:280a18 and in *BYL* 746(2003)192b2.

In Chan, this refers to the 15th Indian patriarch Kanadeva’s school. As a successor of Nagarjuna, he was thought to be the author of the *Baiju* （*P30(1569)*） and also stands for the whole Three-Treatise tradition (*Sanlunzong 三論宗*). Yunmen mentions this school one
not time (565b1). Cf. also BYL 湛然録 T48(2003)154a2-5 and the note by Iriya et al. in ZG 禪師語錄 Vol.15, p. 47.

757. This short anecdote is also found in BYL 湛然録 case 13, T48(2003)154a2-5 and in WDBY 五燈會元 ZYI38:279d1-3.

758. The earliest source for this saying (though with a slightly different text) seems to be CC 湛然録 2.21.2 (see also 2.84, 14 and 4.13.6). Its author is likely to be Chan Master Chuanzi Decheng (588-680), a successor of Master Yueshan Weiyuan (612-680). It appears in the form cited by Yunmen in CDL 坛經 T51[1075]156a25 and also in BYL 湛然録 case 42, T48[2003]180a8.

759. Zhaozhou shiqiao 鐵州石橋: This stone bridge is mentioned several times in ZGL 趼州録. see ZG 禪師語錄 Vol.11, pp. 271, 272, 347, and 404. It is also featured in BYL 湛然録 case 52, T48[2003]187a21 ff.: "A monk asked Zhaozhou, 'For a long time I have thought of the stone bridge of Zhaozhou, but now that I've come here I just see a log bridge.' Zhaozhou replied, 'You just see the log bridge, you don't see the stone bridge.' The monk asked, 'What about the stone bridge?' Zhaozhou answered, 'It lets horses cross, it lets horses cross.' For additional information on the history of this bridge, see Iriya et al.'s note in ZG 禪師語録 Vol.15, p. 153-4.

760. Jiaoshou daxiang 鐵州大像: A famous colossal stone image of Maitreya which stood in Jiaoshou. It was built during the Tang period by a monk of the name Hasteon (496-577) according to another tradition, Daoxuan 道宣 (483-541). Cf. BYL 湛然録 case 38, T48[2003]177a26: "This is one shout does not only cut off your tongues. Oh! It startles the iron ox of Shensi into a run and frightens the huge [Maitreya] image of Jiaoshou to death!"

761. Ti lu 跳露: this expression is often translated by "body exposed" (see for instance Cleary, Thomas & J.C., The Blue Cliff Record. Boulder & London: Shambala, 1977, p. 167 and Lu, K'uan-yü (Charles Luk), Ch'an and Zen Teaching (Second Series). London: Rider, 1961, p. 201). However, the following passage would suggest that "the essence is manifest" might be a more appropriate rendering: "An Ancient said, 'The spiritual light shines alone, far transcending the senses; its essence is manifest, genuine and permanent. It is not captured in written letters.'" (BYL 湛然録 case 82, T48[2003]194b25-26)

762. This forms case number 27 of the Blue Cliff Record (BYL 湛然録 case 27, T48[2003]167b24-25.

763. Hei manman 剛漫漫地. Cf. LJJ 根現録 T47[1985]649b17 where the same expression is used by Master Linji to describe his own past: "In the past, when I had as yet no understanding, all about me was utter darkness." (LJJ 根現録 [Sasaki tr.], p.38).


765. Mending 門庭. As in YML 門庭案録 T47[1985] 545a24, this expression appears to signify "[Chan] teachings".

766. Dongyu xiqu 東遊西趣. While this can also simply mean "look East and look West" (as in CC 湛然録 4.127-13 where Deshan 越山 "went in front of the Dharara Hall, looked East and looked West, and then left"), Yunmen is likely to have said qu to express "inquire" (cf. M10, 340).

767. Shijie 時節. While this word usually stands for 'season' or some other 'division of time' or some 'time period' like a 'moment', Chan masters often use it when talking about the need to tailor their teaching (and the student's efforts) to the present occasion and circumstances. An interesting
aspect of such 'occasions' is that the same words can, depending on the occasion and circumstances, acquire different meanings. See for instance CC 景德傅 4.120,11 and BYL 這律錄 case 4 and 14, T48(2003)1435B and 154c4.


770. Fafa benlai fa 法本來法: This is a verse attributed to the first Indian patriarch Mahakashaya. A tentative translation of the whole poem reads as follows: "[Though] each dharma is at root a dharma, there is neither dharma nor non-dharma. How can there in one single dharma be dharma and not-dharma?" 法本來法 無法無非法 何於一法中 有法有非法 (CDL 景德傅僧錄 T51(2015)205b3-4). This poem takes up the theme of Shakyamuni's verse earlier in the same text: "[Though] a dharma at root is a dharma without dharma, the dharma-less dharma still is a dharma. Now if you adhere to dharmalessness, how can each dharma still be a dharma?" 法本法無法．無法法亦法。今付無法時．法法何曾法。[CDL 景德傅僧錄 T51(2015)205c1-2].

771. Fa benlai wu 法本來無法: See Shakyamuni's verse in the preceding note.

772. This quote, Yunan's question, and the ensuing exchange with the monk are also found in WDBY 五燈會元 E2138:278b8-11. In the Blue Cliff Records, as so often, only one part is offered as a koan: the quote is presented as the Master's own words and forms, stripped of his subsequent remark and the ensuing exchange with the monk, case 87 of the BYL 法本法無法 T48(2003)212a1ff.

773. Zhaolzus 中論 T30(1564) nr. 24, verses 8 and 9.


779. Murty, T.R.V.: op. cit., p. 244. Note 4 on p. 244 gives the source of this quote.


782. Murty, T.R.V.: op. cit., p. 239.

783. Some of these issues are discussed and many references to further literature are found in Sprung, Mervyn (ed.), The Problem of Two Truths in Buddhism and Vedânta. Dordrecht (Holland) / Boston: Deidel, 1973.

784. The clearest such description is found in DeMartino, Richard J., The Zen Understanding of


787. See also Derek Bodde's note in Fung, Yu-lan, A History of Chinese Philosophy Vol II. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1953, p. 295. However, this interpretation and the arguments in the scheme are the author's. This is particularly the case for italicized parts of this scheme.

788. This concept was advanced by and is discussed in DeMartino, Richard J., The Zen Understanding of Man. Ph. D. dissertation, Temple University, 1969, p. 124 ff.

789. See HG 464 ff.

790. Erdiheming zhongdao 二論合明中道: the third of Jizang's three kinds of Middle Way. See Jizang's Zhongguanlu shu 中觀論疏 BZGL 百丈廣錄 ZZ119:83a1-2. This translation presents a lucid description and analysis of these three kinds of Middle Way.

791. Feiiken Feisu zhong 相是非中: HG 465a refers to Sanlun suangyi 三論玄義 BZGL 百丈廣錄 ZZ119:83a5 and 466a5.


793. HG 466b.

794. The most recent translation of this chapter is found in Graham, A.C., Chuang-tzu: The Inner Chapters. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1981.

795. BZGL 百丈廣錄 ZZ119:83a1-2.


797. BZGL 百丈廣錄 ZZ119:83a8-9.

798. The above translations from the Extensive Records of Baizhang, and particularly this one, are in spite of some differences much indebted to Thomas Cleary's pioneering effort (Cleary, Thomas [tr.], The Sayings and Doings of Pai-chang. Los Angeles: Center Publications, 1979).

799. LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p. 5.

800. This translation is inspired by that of LJLD 臨濟錄 [Deleitville tr.] p. 72, but Deleitville's conclusion that "Chan refuses to distinguish between good and bad" (note on p. 74) can be very misleading if understood at an everyday level. On that level, for instance the Chan masters' scathing criticisms which certainly presuppose some distinction between good and bad would be impossible.

801. See the note on the origin of this quote in LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], pp. 73-74 (note 80).

803. Part of this translation stems from Cleary, Thomas J.C., *The Blue Cliff Record*. Boulder & London: Shambhala, 1977, p. 44. Snapping one's fingers is a gesture which frightens and chases away evil spirits.

804. Not much is known about Master Qingyuan Weixin 青原惟信 except that he lived in the Song, was a successor of Huitang Zuxin 許堂祖心 in the Huanglong 黃龍 line of the Linji 禪宗 tradition. For biographical sources see *ZGD* 禪學大辭典, p. 1241a. Jizhou 吉州 is located in Jiangxi province.

805. Such differences of character were sometimes expressed in nick-names also used to characterize lineages, for instance: "Yunmen the emperor, Linji the general, Weiyang the minister, Fayan the merchant, and Caodong the peasants." Cf. *ZGD* 禪學大辭典, pp. 78c, 748c, and 1295a.


807. See also above, p. 107.

808. See *KGB* 玄沙鵞録 ZZ126:17Sd17 (Iriya translation and note vol. 1, pp. 12-14.)

809. Iriya, op. cit., p. 86.

810. LJL 臨濟録 *T47* [1885]498b18-19; translation from *LJLS* 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], pp. 13-14.

811. The most famous example are Zhaozhou's contradictory answers to the same question about the existence of a Buddha nature in plants or animals. See ZGL 經錄 ZZ118: 157c6-9 and 161b14-15.

812. See below, pp. 202-203.

813. As long as no contrary evidence exists, we may thus assume that Yunmen, having awakened in his mid-twenties and having undergone 30 further years of monastic training, was an accomplished master when he, at age 64, became abbot of his own temple. Since the bulk of notes by his disciples were almost certainly taken after the Master's move to Mt. Yunmen, an analysis of the *Records of Yunmen* - such as that suggested by Prof. Iriya -- which seeks to identify three discrete biographical stages in Yunmen's teaching would without any doubt be bound for failure.

814. In *Wubu* 五燈鵞録 ZZ138:275a3-5, these words are presented as Yunmen's own.

815. *Ersheng* 二乘: The small Vehicle ( Hinayana or Theravada; *xiaosheng* 小乗) and the great Vehicle (Mahayana 大乗) of Buddhist teaching.


817. See for instance instructions number 11 and 17 of chapter IV.


819. *Chou wuxi* 視目無清: *Chou* ('to strike the eye') is an expression which appears in the

314 NOTES
820.  **Xinghai** 杭海: The deep and boundless sea is a simile for truth / true reality. Cf. for instance BD 仏教語大辞典, p.713a.

821.  毛逢 Ezra zhi bo 毛風西 匍之穴: This expression is also found in EZGL 百丈語録

ZZ113:85b10 where knowing of the waves which are all around without any wind is likened to 'the gross within the subtle', while letting go of such knowledge while knowing is said to be like the 'subtle within the subtle, i.e. the sphere of the awakened ones. The expression "stirring up waves where there is no wind" (wufeng qilang 無風起浪) is found in other texts; it is mostly used to point out the lack of preconditions for enlightenment. A typical example is found in case 16 of the EZGL 百丈語録 (T48[2003]155a21): "A monk asked Jingqing: 'I am breaking out and ask you, Master, to break in.' Yuanwu comments: "What good is it to raise waves where there is no wind?"

822.  wushiren 無事人: For wu zhi cf. note 947. This is the only occurrence of wushiren in this text. The EZL 百丈語録 contains a passage (T47[1985]499b11) that contrasts the Buddhas and patriarchs which are 'men without concern' with people who create karmas by striving and practising. The closeness of wushi to Zhuangzi's wuwei 無為 is striking. In the guise of a 'translation' of EZL 百丈語録 case 12 T48[2003]155c12, Kundert (Bigyan p. 245) gives an appropriate interpretation of wushiren: "...a man of peace, free of all things and without concern about any matter."

823.  xiangshang qijiao 向上 竅跤: For xiangshang see p. 155. Qijiao can both mean 'the single opening' or 'the single most crucial point'. The latter possibility is given preference here. For 'hole' or '[body] opening', the EZL uses the compound kongqiao 孔窩 (546b1, 564c12, 571a19).

824.  This short talk is cited with a slightly different end in EZGL 百丈語録 case 36, T48[2003]174c18-20.

825.  Zhuanju 轉句.

826.  The corresponding text in EZGL 百丈語録 case 36, T48[2003]174c20 adds: "[You must further realize] the single opening beyond [duality], and you'll be able to sit in peace. 向上 竕 起解瞑坐."

827.  See particularly sections F and H of this chapter.


830.  Boassui 百雜碎: literally, "a hundred miscellaneous pieces". This expression appears only twice in this text. The other occurrence (566a15) reads: "Vimalakirti's realm of wonderful joy is [shattered to] a hundred pieces." Cf. Iriya's note in PJS1 鳳居士語録 [Iriya tr., 後の語録 Vol.7], pp. 135-6. See also EZGL 百丈語録 ZZ113:111c1-2.

831.  This short section is also contained in WDBY 五燈會元 ZZ138:220a8-10. That text contains a small textual difference (會元 instead of 會元) which changes the reading considerably. Both rhythm and content suggest that the WDBY's text is corrupt.
See also instruction 17 of chapter IV.

Qiṣoṣ bāhāṇg 七縱八橫: This expression, rare in secular literature, is quite often found in Chan texts (once in WZHL [Sasaki tr.], ZZ 18:116a12, six times in this text [546b27, 558c29, 559b18, 560a6, 560a7, 560a8], and quite frequently in the BYL [typical example in case 7, T48(2003)147a22]). Its literal meaning is 'seven lengthwise, eight across'. Textual evidence is strong (particularly BYL case 7, T48(2003)147a22 and case 9, 149b22) for the argument that it means the same as zōnghèng 撒, namely, 'freely', 'as one likes' (see 諸橋 27 日 19..103 間, vol. 8, p.1157b, but not vol.1, p.93c!).

Shāhuō lǐnsī 演活臨時: The same expression is found in Yuanwu's introductory 'pointer' to case 9 (BYL T48(2003)149a14: "with a sharp sword in his hand, he can kill or give life as the occasion requires. [...] In the midst of death he finds life, and in the midst of life he finds death.


See sections G and H of this chapter.

Translation from LLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], pp. 18-19.


DeMartino, Richard J., op. cit., p. 137.


DeMartino, Richard J., op. cit., p. 147.

DeMartino, Richard J., ibid.

DeMartino, Richard J., ibid.

TML 55b23, 558c14, 560c12, and 573a13.


LLS 臨濟錄 T47(1985)497c].

Instruction number 17, translated on pp. 202-203.

See notes to instruction number 17.
Though the duck's legs are short, though the crane's legs are long, this famous concept does not signify simple non-action or not-doing; rather, it stands for 'doing without doing' or 'actionless action'. This is succinctly expressed in DDJ 《道得經》 chapter 3: "[The perfect man] acts without acting; thus everything is managed 无为而无不治."

In DDJ 《道得經》 chapter 3, these words are presented as Yunmen's own.

Ersheng 生乘: The small Vehicle (Hinayana or Theravada; 小乘) and the great Vehicle (Mahayana 大乘) of Buddhist teaching.

Furthermore, the master's subsequent comment differs. See note 217.

Zhuāngzǐ 莊子 8.9-10: "Though the duck's legs are short, to stretch them would make it suffer; though the crane's legs are long, to cut them shorter would make it sad. Thus: what is long by nature needs no cutting off, and what is short by nature needs no stretching."

Kohe banre 高会百 Rei: "It's just that the tall [has] a long Dharma body and the short a short one."
871. *Shīfa zhu fawei, shijianxiang changshu* 五燈會元 五燈會元: see note 221.

874. This passage appears also in *WDHY* 五燈會元, *BYL* 碧巖錄 case 60, *T48* [2003]1178a5. Note 221.

875. See especially the examples in section F of chapter III.


878. *YML* 551b19, 568c14, 569c12, and 573a13.


880. See DeMartino, Richard J., op. cit., p. 149.

881. Ibid.

882. This sermon is also found in *WDHY* 五燈會元, *BYL* 碧巖錄 case 40, *T48* [2003]1178a5. Note 221.


884. *Sanjiangu hao* 三家村號. See note 656.


887. See section G5 of this chapter.

888. Translation from *LJLS* 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p. 11.


891. *YML* 558c10-11.


898. Translation from LJLS 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], p. 3.
899. Translation from LJLS 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], pp. 8-9.
900. Translation from LJLS 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], p. 15.
901. TML 553a8-9, 563b22-23.
902. In BYL 碧樹是 case 62, T48(2003)193c22 ff. where these words are cited, the text says, "Within heaven and earth, in universal space, there is a treasure, hidden inside the mountain of form."
903. TML 563c16.
904. TML 558b16.
905. Fiduanshi 本師. See note 985.
906. Benshi 本師: either the Buddha or Bodhidharma.
907. Layue sanshirī 腦月三十日: see note 499.
916. Translation from LJLS 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], p. 11.
918. Translation from LJLS 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], pp. 9-10.


923. This is a quote of XXM 信心銘 TS1[2076]457a18.


925. YNL 547a19-20.


927. YNL 555c5-6.

928. YNL 547c11-12.


931. The translation follows, with the exception of an omitted remark in square brackets, LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p. 12.


933. Suzuki, Daisetz T., op. cit., p. 128. This is the final poem to a six-picture version described by Suzuki.


937. Changdao zhi ji 明道之機. Changdao literally means "voicing the Dao" or "giving voice to the Dao." In Chinese Buddhism this expression was used for "teaching [of the Buddha dharms]." Here, Master Yunmen employs it in the sense of "teaching by words." The following interesting passage from the CC 祖堂集 3.23 ff. illustrates one aspect of this "occasion": "[A monk asked,] 'The Ancients said that the Dao is beyond words. But if the Dao is beyond words, who is able to establish this?' Master [Yungai Zhiyuan] said, 'Borrowed words give voice to the Dao; the Dao does not verbalize itself.'"

938. Sansang wusheng 三藏五乘. Each vehicle leads to a specific karma reward. Several different
sets of “five vehicles” were current in China (cf. SB 112b). As ZTSY 第五%
3a8-b2 points out, Master Yannan probably thinks of the Tientai set: 1. Rebirth among men by observing the five commandments 持戒得人乘; 2. Rebirth among devas by observing the ten forms of good actions 行善得天乘; 3. Rebirth among grāvyakas by cultivation of the four noble truths 柒空乘; 4. Rebirth among pratyekabuddhas by application of the twelve nidanas 修十二因革得菩薩乘; 5. Rebirth among bodhisattvas by being equipped with the six paramitas 設六度行得菩提乘. According to the Shaolun (T45,158a) the first two are worldly vehicles 象乘 while the last three belong to the vehicles of world-leavers 出世間乘.

933. Wo shi bajiäu 五時八教: This refers to the Tientai classification of the Buddha's teachings into five periods. Cf. for instance Takakusu 1947, 151 ff. and Chen 1964, 305 ff. This is also commented upon in ZTSY 祖庭事苑 3b3-11.

940. Ticheng 一乘: the “one vehicle” (Ekayana), or the “vehicle of oneness”. According to Wakahara (BD 488), “one” means “non-dual”, and “vehicle” signifies a teaching that carries sentient beings towards awakening. In Chinese Buddhist movements other than Chan, this expression was usually employed for the fundamental teaching of a particular sect as recorded in the basic scripture of that sect. Tientai Buddhism as a whole thus came to be called Ticheng. However, in the Chan movement its meaning was different. As Iriya points out (PJSI, p.97; corresponds to T48[2012]384560-23), the emphasis in the Chan movement of the Tang period was in general not on scriptural teachings about or of the one vehicle but rather on one's own realization of “the one [non-dual] mind”. This realization was seen as the one and only vehicle. As one illustration of this, Iriya cites a passage from Huangbo which I translate: “Thus it is said, 'the Buddha expounded all his teachings in order to save my whole heart-mind. As I have no heart-mind at all, what use are all the teachings?' From the Buddha down to the patriarchs, all have spoken about nothing but this: they exclusively discussed about the one mind which is called ‘the one vehicle’. Hence, even if one searches throughout the universe, there is no other vehicle.” (cf. ZC8, p.97; corresponds to T48[2012]384560-23).

941. Juli chengji 句裏有機: Xuetou's poem to case 9 of the BYL 碧巖錄 (T48[908v149c18ff.])
547a8.

943. Shige ren 是簡人. The same expression is found in YHL 547a8.

944. Jiangwei 江偉: see note 213.

945. This sermon is found, with minor textual variations, in CDL 景德道德論 (T51[2076]356c4-16, CDL 景德道德論 [T51[2076]355c1-15, CDL 景德道德論 [T51[2076]355c1-15], and WDBY 五灯会元 (2213b:276d11-277a1). A translation of the CDL text is found in Chang, Original Teachings, pp.283-284, while the WDBY text was translated in Luk II, pp.183-184. Comparison of this translation with Chang's and Luk's reveals major differences which for the most part are not based on textual differences.

946. Ninjan ren 明眼人. Cf. other occurrences of this expression in CC 祖堂集 4,10.4 and 4,134.13, and in PJSI 魔居士語録 [Iriya tr., 論の語録 Vol.7], p.147 {Sasaki/Iriya/FRaser tr., p.67}.
947. Conglai you shee shi (JL) (T71[1985]489b13-15 is on the same line. Sasak et al. (p.13) translate benlai wushì as "from the beginning there is nothing to do"; in context, this reads: "Followers of the Way, right now the resolve man knows full well that from the beginning there is nothing to do. Only because your faith [in this] is insufficient do you ceaselessly chase about; having thrown away your head you go on and on looking for it, unable to stop yourself." However, the present and other passages of the YHL make "nothing is the matter" (in the sense of "nothing is wrong") seem preferable as a rendering of wu shì 無事, and "what's the matter?" ("what's wrong?" or "is anything the matter?" appear to be the translations of choice for you shee shi 有什麼事.

948. Xiang maio 湯西北. While there are examples in Chan literature where this expression means "burying" (CC 須堂集 1.19.1 ff.; T47[1995]649b16, it is here and elsewhere in the YHL (as well as in modern Chinese) used for "leaving someone in the dark" or "misleading someone". This is supported by the textual variation found in the corresponding passage of the CDL (CDL 須堂集錄 (T51[2076]356c8) which has man ni (deceiving you) instead of the YHL's xiang maio.

949. WDUH 五燈會元 ZE138:276d15 unfolds the implicit meaning by giving "your mouth's eloquence" (gugui 口快).

950. Hei manaandi 黑漫漫地. See note 763.

951. Genri 根思. CDL 須堂集錄 (T51[2076]356c10 gives genjing 萬性 instead, and the given translation of genri follows this line.

952. Wending 門庭. See note 765.

953. Donggu xiqu 東越西歸. See note 766.

954. Shi ru xija 是汝自家. For this use of shi see Iriya 1983, pp.143-145. According to Ota (Chōoku rekishi bunpō, pp.110-111), xija in its nominal use meant during the Tang and Five dynasties the same as xiji 自己, namely, "I" / "myself".

955. Xiangshang xiangxia 向上向下: see p.146.

956. Mi xia ji cha 拟心即差. Cf. notes in ZG 神の言語 Vols. 8 (p.36), 9 (p.122), and 11 (p.91). In these notes this expression which occurs in ZFPF 信行之法, ZEL 赤州論, and JLJ 乗じた as well as in Zongai's CTV 蟹相ぎ羅録, is related to mi xia yi cha 拟心以差. This last expression is found in one of Seng Zhao's (CPDZ) replies to Liu Yian (YHL:157a6 ff.). As the four characters following this YHL passage (kuan fu you yun 構府有言) are not different in meaning from those following the Zhaolun's (kuan nai you yun 構乃有言), it can be said that this YHL passage is more clearly related to the Zhaolun passage than any of the above-mentioned Chan texts. Robinson (Early Madhyamika, p.155) translates only up to the Zhaolun passage in question: "The flourishing of words and traces (footprints) produces heterodox paths. But words have something that cannot be traced. Therefore the skillful speaker of words seeks to express what cannot be expressed, and the skillful tracer of traces seeks to trace what cannot be traced." I translate what follows: "[Now in the case of] the ultimate principle, the mystery of emptiness: if setting one's heart-mind [on some object] is already wrong, how much more must one, in speaking [about it], fear to veer off and to be far from what is pointed at!" (For an alternative Japanese translation of this, see Yaukamoto et al.'s Jōron kenkyū, p.54). Cf. also YHL 真宗集 90, T48[2003]-215a22: "Direct your mind [on something] and you err; move your thoughts and you're obstructed.

957. Slightly different texts of these sermons are found in CDL 須堂集錄 (T51[2076]355c15-357a4

968. *Wo shi buhwo pi 我事不便利*. Other typical occurrences of this expression (LJL 臨濟錄 T51[1986]502a14; BYL 碧錄 T48[2003] cases 5 [144c22] and 8 [148c18] are also in the context of a master who sees himself forced to use discursive teaching as expedient means for the benefit of the listeners. Linji 臨濟 begins his very first sermon (496b12) with these words: "Today, I, this mountain monk, having no choice in this matter, have perforce yielded to custormy etiquette and taken this seat" (tr. Sasaki et al., p.1). Cf. also the notes by Deméville (LJLD 臨濟錄 [Deméville tr.] p.25) and Yanagida (LJLY 臨濟錄 [Yanagida tr.] p.213.

969. Cf. note 947.

970. Cf. note 948. Another possible translation could be: "If I tell you that right now nothing is the matter, we are already burying each other [under verbiage]. In The Golden Age of Zen, p. 219, Wu translates even more freely: "...I am already burying the real thing under verbiage."

961. CDL 景德傳録 T51[2076]356c18 adds "just" which is implicit anyway.

962. Cf. pp. 81-82.

963. Thin silk crêpe is a simile for a delusion which is hardly perceptible but nevertheless present. Cf. ZGD 神學大字典, p. 1250d.

964. *Figie you xin 一切有心*. Mending *shi xinhou 門庭之說*. For mending see note 155 above. Wu [The Golden Age of Zen, p. 220] renders this expression as "decorating on the door of our house", which is also a possibility. One could also (quite plausibly in the context of Yunmen's next sentence) take it to mean "[mere] talk of Chan teaching" in contrast to one's own realization.

965. See note 941.

966. *Keshuiba ft "sleepy chap" or "dozy chap". Cf. Yuanwu's poetic description of this state of ignorance: "Sleeping with open eyes in broad daylight" (BYL 碧錄 case 6, T48[2001] 147a16).

967. *Keshuan 脑痘痘*: "sleepy chap" or "dozy chap". Cf. Yuanwu's poetic description of this state of ignorance: "Sleeping with open eyes in broad daylight" (BYL 碧錄 case 6, T48[2001] 147a16).


969. See LJL8 臨濟録 [Sasaki tr.], p. 67 (note 13).

970. *Zongcheng shizi 縱橫十字*: Literally, "vertically [from North to South] and horizontally [from East to West] crosswise". Cf. also CC 揚堂集 5.94,3-4 and NG 蓬藤語録 [Yanagida ed.], p. 1044.

971. The implied zuo 作 is added in both SBZ 禪林僧寶傳 and WDBY 五燈會元.

972. *Sima yi 死馬醫*: Prof. Iriya suggested that this might refer to quackery claiming the ability of bringing a dead horse back to life. From two passages in this text (546a21 and 552c13) as well as other examples (CC 揚堂集 3.66,3; T48[2001]4a21; several in NG 蓬藤語録 [Yanagida ed.], p. 1004-5) it is clear that this expression is used by Chan teachers to humbly or self-ironically describe their
own activity. Whether it is alluding to quackery or not, the implication seems to be that giving medicine to a dead animal is an utterly useless effort which can never produce a result.

973. Fanzhong you xiang. Verbal expression echoes someone's understanding and realization; if these are shallow, it is readily apparent to the master. In his comment on a line by Xuetou, Master Yuanwu mentions this kind of echo: "Echo. When fish swim through, the water is wudded." (BYL Hany Zen dictionaries give different definitions; CDL Sudeh found 556a10-28 (translated in Chang, Original Teachings, p.286) and in VDBH 547a10-28 (translated in Lu, K'uan-yu (Charles Luk), Ch'an and Zen Teaching (Second Series). London: Rider, 1961, pp.189-190).

974. Jili chang feng. Some texts of this sermon are also found in CDL (Sudeh found 556a10-28 (translated in Chang, Original Teachings, p.286) and in VDBH 547a10-28 (translated in Lu, K'uan-yu (Charles Luk), Ch'an and Zen Teaching (Second Series). London: Rider, 1961, pp.189-190).


977. Chaozhong 重著. Mos:122b gives "to accept/assume/take over/take upon oneself" as one meaning of this expression. Many Zen dictionaries give different definitions; Aizawa for instance defines it as "to affirm another's words" (p.163; Aizawa copied his example from KG 華語語篇 [Yanagida ed.], p.921). Yanagida (Zhongzhu, p.301) says that this expression was used by criminals when acknowledging their crime; unfortunately no source is given. Examples in the TML (546b4, 546c9, 547a10, 549b22, 562b2, and 563a24) do not support Yanagida's explanation; rather, it seems to occur as a general expression (sometimes with a critical undertone) in various contexts.

978. Cf. the following interesting passage of the present text (556a25-26): "What one calls 'Buddha Dharma' ('Buddhist teaching') has never yet been verbally expressed (dao ziao 道著). To express it verbally is dropping shit and spraying piss."

979. Wan rou suo chuang 無肉作語. This expression also appears (with cheng instead of suo 作) in the preface of the oldest extant "Chan" monastic code, the Chanyuan guangui (compiled around the year 1100 by a monk of the seventh generation in the Yunnan line, Master Gujue whom we recall). It appears to signify a well-intended but completely superfluous and even harmful effort, an effort which is entirely absurd (as there is no boil to begin with) than "cutting out flesh to patch up a boil" (wan rou bu chuang 亡肉補瘡). The latter is an idiom which originated in the Tang.

980. "All the same" may mean that in spite of the given arguments the master's discourse still has a function -- namely, to lead the student to his very own actualization. Cf. TML 546c13-14.

981. Tianti 田地.
982.  *Lue xu* 倉悉, literally 'plundering the empty'. This expression is not very often encountered in Chan literature, but this text (547a20, 547b14, 549a5, and 550b11) and the *YKL 禪宗論* (Z2119: 571b9, 574b5, *et passim*) contain it several times. It is also found once in *LJLS 臨濟錄* (Sasaki tr., Z2101:1) in the context of empty talk and flattery that are exchanged between neighbors who are prying on each other. 'Indulging in vain talk' or 'bragging' are alternative translations. When used as a noun, 'windbag' may be the most appropriate rendering; in this case, *han 汗* is often appended to *lue xu* (for instance in YML 546c27, 547a13, 548c4, 551a5, 552a19, and 572b17). For the latter expression, see also *BYL 禪宗論* case 10, *Y18* [2003] 150a16, 150a27, and 150b15-18.

983.  *Zuji genjiao xia* 自己根腳下. A possible alternative translation is 'dig below the standpoint of your self'. The expression *genjiao xia* 根腳下 is also found in the writings of Ta Hui 大慧 (*T47*, 873a8 and 910a25) where it is used to characterize the true practice (which is shunned by those who "love confusion" and who "turn their back on what is correct").

984.  Cf. *WLL* 延續學 *T48*, 385c17 (Z2 888 8, p. 118) and *YKL* 禪宗論 *Z2126*: 180b and 191c.

985.  *Fiduanshikai* -- a note. In *BYL 禪宗論* p. 21 (*T48*, 162a17-19), Yunmen uses this expression in answering a question about "the time when father and mother are not yet born": "From ancient times to the present, there is just this one thing: it is not yet born, without attainment and loss, without birth and non-birth." Cf. *YML* 552c18 and notes 184 and 993 on *benfen 本分*.

986.  *Zuofi 祖佛*. Can also be translated as "Patriarch-Buddha" (cf. *LJLS 臨濟錄* [Sasaki tr., p. 7 and p. 71]). Yanagida writes that this expression arose in the Chan movement of the late Tang. *Fouou 佛祖* was used earlier, and Yanagida thinks that the reversion of the two characters expresses an emphasis on 'patriarch' (*LJLS 臨濟錄* [Yanagida tr.], pp. 73-74). The *LJLS 臨濟錄* has several almost identical formulations (*T47*, 497b8; 497c1; 502a13). The one which is most strikingly similar to this passage of the *YKL 禪宗論* reads as follows: "This very you standing distinctly before me without any form, shining alone -- this can expound the Dharmas and listen to it! Understand it this way, and you are not different from the Patriarch-Buddha." *T47*, 497b28-c1; tr. *LJLS 臨濟錄* [Sasaki tr.], p. 3.

987.  *Eingeshin* 信根 *LJLS 臨濟論* [Sasaki tr., p. 2] translates this expression (from *LJLS 臨濟論* 496c2) by "root of faith", *LJDS 臨濟論* [Demiéville tr., p. 28] as *confiance* (confidence, trust). Demiéville adds "in yourself" by way of a note (op. cit., p. 29) in which he justifies his choice of *confiance* rather than *foi* (faith). This term has played an important role in Chinese Buddhism; the *Awakening of Faith* 大乘起信論, for instance, aims as a whole at awakening this "root of faith" in the reader (cf. Hakeda 1967, p. 24). Ta Hui said (*T47*, 876b17) that it is "the basis of becoming a Buddha".

988.  *E ye* 惡業. "Evil conduct in thought, word, or deed, which leads to evil recompense; evil karma" (Soothill/Hodous, p. 372). Yunmen uses this expression to characterize sentient beings (*YKL 禪宗論* 549b6). Tu Hui (*T47*, 385a23) elaborates on this by saying that everything an ordinary [unenlightened] person (*su ren 俗人*) does, hears, and sees is nothing but the ego (cf. also the remarks of Miao 癒 about this theme (*T47*, 973c13)). Linji 明照 throws light on this from the viewpoint of the enlightened one (*T47*, 499b ff.); he states: "When I look back over the past twelve years for a single thing having the nature of karma, I can't find anything even the size of a mustard seed" (*T47*, 499b25-27, tr. *LJLS 臨濟論* [Sasaki tr.], p. 19).

989.  *Toujiao 头角* "horns", and weeds (*cao 草*), are in Chan literature often associated with dualistic attachment or delusion in general. Cf. *BYL 禪宗論* 95 (*T48*, 218a13-21): "Where there is a Buddha, you must not stay; if you do, horns sprout. Where there is no Buddha, quickly run past; if you don't, the grass will be ten feet high." *Horns* are also mentioned in connection with verbal explanations or statements (*shushe 說著*) that do not come out of enlightened wisdom. *BYL 禪宗論* has
several examples (CC 2.17, 7; 3.99, 7-8; 4.118, 10; 4.120, 6). In CC 聞善集 4.119, 13 Nanquan (南方) says: "As long as wisdom is not reached, [1] absolutely forbid verbal statements (sūkṣaṅke 说著). If you talk (sūkṣaṅke 说著), horns will sprout." Cf. also CDL 聞善録 751, 381b29.

990. Buoxiang 素香: "bowl bag". The 'bowl bag' is the sack in which monks carry their begging bowl and other small necessities when they are on pilgrimage." [LJLS 臨濟録 (Sasaki tr.), p.78, note 130).

991. Cf. LJLS 臨濟録 499c10: "The non-dependent man of the Way who right now before my eyes is listening to my discourse, clearly distinguishable, [it is you who've] never yet lacked anything." [LJLS 臨濟録 (Sasaki tr.), p.20].

992. Dazhangfu han 大丈夫漢. This term is also found in other Chan texts (for instance T47, 500c27 and 502b29) and has been translated as "resolve fellow" (LJLS 臨濟録 (Sasaki tr.), p.27) and as "un gaiillard qui est un grand homme" (a fellow who is a great man) (LJLS 臨濟録 (Deomerville tr.), p.125). Dazhangfu 大丈夫 han alone has been rendered as "a man of great will" (Suzuki, Manual, p.36) and "great men of power" (BYLC 保藏録 (Cleary tr.), p.533). The happiest translation, which we attempt to follow here, has been proposed by Iriya et al. in ZG 祖巖録 Vol.15, p.243: ichinamae no otoko - 人前 の男 (which has a good German counterpart in "eine ganz Portion" ["a whole portion"]). A description of such a man can be found in T47, 396b3ff. (tr. by Suzuki in Manual pp.96-97).

993. Vufen 有分. Cf. Iriya [ZG 保藏録 Vol.7, p.103] on yufen 有分 (which has been translated as "to be endowed with it" in LJLS 臨濟録 (Sasaki tr.), p.60). Iriya emphasizes the connection of this term with others such as benfeng 本分 and feishang 脱上 and thus links yfen 有分 to one's potential to get enlightened. See also Demiéville's masterly discussion of the various meanings of "分 in the Annuale du Collège de France 1948-49, pp.158-160.

994. Bu zhuobian 不著便. An alternative rendering is "to be in bad shape". This otherwise rather rare expression is found seven times in this text (546c9; 551a2; 553a21; 566b10; 566b20; 567c2; 571c7). In the LJLS 臨濟録 (506b23-c1) it is understood as "not doing well" (LJLS 臨濟録 (Tanagida tr.), p.272 and Sasaki tr., p.61). Demiéville (p.240) translates it as "Je n'ai pas de chance" [I have no luck] and refers to two passages in CC 聞善集 (2.92, 9 and 2.112, 6) that "seem to have this meaning". One may note that in both of these passages this expression is used by Yunmen's teacher Tufeng 雲峰. Especially the second indeed supports Demiéville's rendering. The positive form zhuobian 著便 is found on both stelae which were erected in Yunmen's memory; both use it in the same context: When Yunmen was already losing strength and approaching death and an attendant brought him hot [medical] broth, he handed the bowl back with the words: 'First: I'm fine; second: you are fine. First: I'm fine; second: you are fine.

995. Quren 古人. The passage in YML 54a21, among others, indicates that this expression is also used for living or recently deceased masters.

996. Bulu 入路. YML 54a24-25 explains how these words are to be used in practice: "Try to get a firm hold on [them], pondering on them from all angles -- after days or years, an entrance will by itself open up."

997. Zhensheng 真僧. In LJLS 臨濟録 (Sasaki tr., p.2 et passim) this is translated as "take care of yourselves". Demiéville explains in a note (LJLS 臨濟録 (Deomerville tr.), p.29) that this was a current expression used when saying good-bye, and that among Buddhists this could be understood in a spiritual sense. He thus renders it as salut which includes this double meaning. Conversely, Gruesse Gott is an example of a greeting which for most German speakers has no religious connotation; but among Christians it can be used in its obvious "religiously loaded" sense.
According to these words probably have to be seen in contrast to words that come out of the rut (chu-che 出轍); the latter are described by Hainzhong in the following way: "Not one, not different; not limited, not eternal; not coming, not going": these are living words, words that come out of the rut. 'Neither bright nor dark, neither Buddha nor sentient being': all [of these words] are like this (BCL 百丈語錄 ZZ19:88b1-2). Accordingly, 'words that put the thousand differences into a rut' would be so-called 'dead words', i.e. 'words of positive metaphor, dead words, words for ordinary people.' (BCL 百丈語錄)

999. In a lecture (June of 1983) Professor Iriya pointed out several similar passages in the records of Yunmen's co-disciple Xuansha. For instance in YKL 碧巖語錄 (T48(2003)194b6-10; translated in Cleary, pp.492-493) and ZG 禪語錄 (ch. 9) contain part of the text.

1000. Anshan 案山 (sometimes written 案山): According to ZGD 軍學大辭典, p.13d this refers to a low mountain standing in front of a higher one. The latter is called zhushan 主山 ('main mountain'). This explanation is based on a passage which is cited, among others, in BYL 碧巖語錄 (Yanagida ed.), p.988. The Records of Yunmen contain another example which is not mentioned in BG: "Thunder [on the] anshan, rain [on the] zhushan." The examples indicate that the meaning of anshan could indeed be a low mountain or hill in the foreground which contrasts with some bigger one in the background. The fact that the corresponding passage of the BYL 碧巖語錄 (T48(2003)194b8) says not just 'pick up the anshan' but 'pick up the anshan in front of you' (拈面前按山) supports this. No basis appears to exist for Luk's and Cleary's translation of anshan as "immovable mountain".

1001. From here on, the BYL 碧巖語錄 and ZG 禪語錄 (ch. 9) texts differ completely.

1002. Bao tou 藤頭. This expression appears to have been used well into the Song period with the simple meaning of "conversation" or "subject of conversation" (cf. for instance the examples given in M10,455b). It is found only once in CC 祖堂集 (3.52) in a passage similar to YML 549a25-b2: "[A monk] asked, 'How about when I swallowed all in one gulp?' Master [Yunmen] said, '[Then] this old monk is in your belly.' The monk said, 'Why should you be in my belly?' Master [Yunmen] said, 'You reproduce my words!'" The two occurrences in the Kuetou songgu 雪覆頭古 (ZG 禪語錄 Vol.15, pp.112 and 143) also have the above-mentioned meaning. With and after Tabul Zonggao (大全宗果; 1089-1163), however, Bao tou was increasingly used to refer to a phrase given by a Chan master to his student in order to have the student raise doubt. Such a Bao tou often consisted of the kernel or in some cases the whole of a gongan (公案; jap. こankan). Cf. for instance ZG 禪語錄 Vol.17, pp. 132 and 182.

1003. The first part of this sermon (YML 548b2-5), the exchange (548b5-7), and the second part of the sermon (548b7-22) are included wholly or partly in the following texts:

- VDBH 五燈精華 ZZ138:278b11-16 gives the whole text with minor differences (translated in Luk's Ch'an and Zen Teaching II, pp.194-5).

- CDL 聖懺傳録 T51[2076]577c13-27 includes almost the entire second part of Yunmen's sermon. This somewhat different text is translated Chang's Original Teachings, pp.286-289.

- BYL 碧巖語錄 case 77, T48[2003]204b11-12 takes up part of the exchange (YML 548b5-8) and of the following sermon (BYL 204b18-26, TML 548b7-15). Cf. Cleary's Blue Cliff Record pp.506-7.

- CRL 從容錦 T48[2003]277b7-17 quotes, with minor differences, TML 548b2-12.

1004. Gionsha tougohe 皆事同遮. These words probably have to be seen in contrast to words that come out of the rut (chu-che 出轍); the latter are described by Hainzhong in the following way: "Not one, not different; not limited, not eternal; not coming, not going": these are living words, words that come out of the rut. "Neither bright nor dark, neither Buddha nor sentient being": all [of these words] are like this (BCL 百丈語録 ZZ19:88b1-2). Accordingly, 'words that put the thousand differences into a rut' would be so-called 'dead words', i.e. 'words of positive metaphor, dead words, words for ordinary people.' (BCL 百丈語録)
1005. *Humen zhi shuo* 化門之說. Nakamura (BD 66026a4, p.293c) explains that *huamen* refers to the perspective of saving sentient beings. Chan literature has many examples for this use of *huamen*, for instance T47 631c13 and T48 517b2.

1006. *Naseng* 道僧: "patchrobed monk". In the YML and other Chan texts this expression is sometimes used with the implied meaning of "true monk" or "accomplished monk" (see for instance YML 547a7, 552b2, 555c5, etc.; this is the case here. However, examples where *naseng* simply means "monk" are also frequently met with (for instance in YHLM 聖州語錄 case 30 Y48[2003]:169c27-28, etc.).

1007. *Caoli* 景河: place in the Quijiang district (曲江縣) of northern Guangdong province, famous for the Baolinsi (寶林寺) where the Sixth Patriarch is said to have sojourned and taught (cf. Yanagida, *Platform Sutra* p.71 ff., and *Zen Dust* p.167 ff.). As seen here, this expression often refers to the Sixth Patriarch himself.

1008. *Pingchen* 平沈: The given translation is tentative; it aims at conveying the image of an object that sinks despite being in horizontal position. Alternative translations: "...will sink quietly", or "He will sink at the same rate as the Sixth Patriarch's Unique Way".

1009. *Daoze* 道德. See 611.

1010. This exchange forms case 77 of the YML 聖州語錄 (Y48[2003]:204b11) and, with an insignificant textual difference, case 82 of 

1011. *Zhuoran* 独然. This expression is usually written differently (獨然). It is often used in Chan literature (for instance YML 551c26, 565c3, 566c14, YHLM 113a11, 115a1, etc.). More information and examples are found in KG 聖州語錄 [Yanagida ed.] p. 979 and in his ZKB 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113:5-10 comments on this expression in the context of YML 551c26. If one guesses that Muan commented upon the first occurrence of an expression in his text, one would have to conclude that the present passage originally did not feature this expression, or that it was found at a different place inside the YML text.

1012. *Baoli* 八理. The Ming text of the YML, TDBY 五燈全元, and CDL 聖州語錄 has left this out, but the YML 聖州語錄 and CDL 聖州語錄 faithfully took it over. In a lecture [October of 1981], Prof. Iriya suggested to either leave this out or add *tso* 作: ". . .by indulging in [vain] speculations".

1013. *Jian wen jie shi* 邊聞接事. Literally, "sight, hearing, feeling, knowing". This refers to the six "sense" faculties or functions; *jie* 聞 ("feeling") includes the faculties of smell, taste, and touch, and *shi* 知 stands for consciousness. See also next note.
1014. Sheng se fa 禪世界: this either means "dharma of sound and form" or, more likely, points to all objects of perception (cf. BD 仏教大辞典, p.724a-b) by enumerating the first two and the last of the six kinds of objects of perception. The following is a table of the six perceptive faculties (liu shihi 六識; also called jian wen jue zhi [see preceding note]) and their corresponding objects (correspondence to the preceding note's faculties is indicated in brackets): Six perceptive faculties (六識) | Objects of perception
--- | ---
[sight] | 形体 yanshi
[hearing] | 形声 ershi
[smell] | 形香 bishi
[taste] | 形味 sheshi
[touch] | 形知 shenshi
[learning] | 形法 fa

1015. The text of CDL 禅學武藏, TF1 [2007] 357c17 (有甚聲色可與汝可) makes more sense than the possibly corrupt 有甚聲色法與汝可.

1016. Cf. LJL 臨濟報佛, TF7 [1985] 506b5 and BYL 碧野集 case 36, TF8 [2002] 218c14. In both texts, the monks are asked: "What bowl are you looking for?"

1017. Butou cho 入頭處: "(place of) entry", "clue". This does not refer to the very beginning of religious practice but rather to some realization attained after strenuous effort. Cf. Huangbo's ZFHY 傳心要佛 TF8 [2012] 138b6-7: "If you devote three, five, or ten years [to this] you will without fail attain entry, and [then you] will spontaneously understand." See also YHL 547b1 and 549a16, WXHL 陸州語錄 ZZ119:112a4 and 113d14, etc.

1018. Cf. LJL 臨濟報佛, TF7 [1985] 498a16-17: "Followers of the Way, the Buddhist teaching does not necessitate any effort. Just be ordinary and without concern -- defecating, urinating, putting on clothes, eating food, and lying down when tired." (Cf. the slightly different translation in LJL 臨濟報佛 [Sasaki tr.], pp.11-12).


1020. Dayenai 打野鼠. There are several explanations of this expression. ZCD 禪學大辞典, p.1236c takes it to mean "to do something useless". Zhai means, according to HS:490b, the root of a withered tree. According to Professor Iriya (KG 神話語録 Vol.15, p.142; references provided) this expression is based on a Fujian adage and means "a boisterous gathering", or "going around and raising clamor". Cf. also Mujaku Dōchū (KG 菩提語録 [Yanagida ed.], p.1017) where this expression is cited from the LODY 陸州語録 chapter 21. The YHL contains a good number of examples: 548a11, 549b5, 559a2, 568c17, 570b24, and 574c6. Alternative translations are given by Chang (Original Teachings, p.289: "beating an old stump") and by Cleary (Blue Cliff Record p.332: "make noise gathering wood"). The former is a translation of the CDL 禪學武藏 passage corresponding to our present YHL passage TF5 [2007] 357c17; the latter is a translation of BYL 碧野集 case 48, TF9 [2003] 183c20-21.

1021. This sermon is found with minor textual differences in CDL 禪學武藏 TF5 [2007] 357c20-358a7 and in WBDY 禪僧合元 ZZ118, 278c10-17. Alternative translations: Chang, Original Teachings, pp.289-
1022. Shiisieng (師僧). In CWJL Buddhist Dictionary, XXI.18:112a - 8 and PJS 龍居士語録, ZZ.10:28c16 (ZD 禅的語録 Vol.7, p.57) this expression appears to mean "teacher(s)" or "master(s)". Here, the argument seems to call for a wider meaning, such as "monks" of "masters and monks". Shiisengxian appears to mean "a real monk" or "a real master" (cf. BYL 舌中のcase 53, T48 [2003:172b7]).

1023. The most famous site of Manjusri worship in China was Mt. Wutai (Wutaishan 峨眉山) situated near the northeastern border of Shansi province. "Manjusri Bodhisattva was believed to appear frequently on the mountain to teach the Dharma, and thousands of monks as well as common people would make pilgrimages there to pay homage to him. For an account of Wu-t'ai-shan written between 838 and 847 by the Japanese monk Bnin, see Edwin O. Reischauer: Bnin's Travels in T'ang China, pp.194-211." (LJLS 諤起居語録 [Sasaki tr.]. pp.74-75, note 86). Cf. also Kamata 堂塔史, pp.112-113 and Mochizuki 釋教大辞典, pp.1239-1243.

1024. Hengyue (衡嶽) for instance in the corresponding passages of CDL 舌花事論, T51 [2075:357c29] and WDBY (Peking ed.) ZZ.138, 27c11]. According to ZD 舌花事論, p.351b the designation Hengyue, Hengju, or Hengshan (衡山) are the names of either a 400 m long mountain range consisting of 72 peaks or of one 1200 m high peak. This peak is counted among the Five Sacred Peaks of China and has enjoyed the visits of various emperors. In the Ch'an tradition the Hengyue mountain range gained fame as the place of residence of such Ch'an celebrities as Nanyue Huairang (南嶽懷英, 677-744; cf. ZD 舌花事論, p.98b) and Shitou Xiqian (石頭希遷, 700-780; ZD 舌花事論, p.201b; Zen Dust pp.300-302). Cf. Kamata’s historical sketch (CBS 中國佛教史論, pp.302-303) and Mochizuki 釋教大辞典, p.1044.

1025. Nanyue (南岳), mountain range, situated in the Hengzhou prefecture of Hunan province (湖南省 湖南), also named Hengyue (衡岳) for instance in the corresponding passages of CDL 舌花事論, T51 [2075:357c29] and WDBY (Peking ed.) ZZ.138, 27c11]. According to ZD 舌花事論, p.351b the designation Nanyue, Hengyue, or Hengshan (衡山) are the names of either a 400 m long mountain range consisting of 72 peaks or of one 1200 m high peak. This peak is counted among the Five Sacred Peaks of China and has enjoyed the visits of various emperors. In the Ch'an tradition the Hengyue mountain range gained fame as the place of residence of such Ch'an celebrities as Nanyue Huairang (南嶽懷英, 677-744; cf. ZD 舌花事論, p.98b) and Shitou Xiqian (石頭希遷, 700-780; ZD 舌花事論, p.201b; Zen Dust pp.300-302). Cf. Kamata’s historical sketch (CBS 中國佛教史論, pp.302-303) and Mochizuki 釋教大辞典, p.1044.

1026. Bipu (比丘). From the Sanskrit bhiksu.

1027. Xiao xin shi (小心事). Cf. LJLS 諤起居語録, T47 [1985:500c3-4] (LJLS 諤起居語録 [Yanagida tr.]. p.140): "Blind fools! Wastefully squandering the alms given them by believers everywhere and saying, "I am a renouncer of home!" all the while holding such views as these!" (Quoted from LJLS 諤起居語録 [Sasaki tr.], p.25).

1028. Hei qi xiangzi (黑漆桶). Lit. "like black lacquer". Black lacquer (and also 'black lacquer bucket' bei qi tong 漆漆桶) has two different meanings: it signifies either pitchblack ignorance and sticky clinging (cf. GC 1.24, 13 ff.) or the sphere where all opposition and differentiation is overcome (cf. BYL 舌中辞典 case 86, T48 [2003:211b15/211c16]).
1029. *Qu xing* 取性. A colloquial expression meaning "at whim" or "at one's own sweet will." The *YML* has two more occurrences of this expression: T17(1988)547b9 and 548b20. Cf. also Nakamura Dôchô's KG 祖堂集成 (Yanagida ed.), p.970.

1030. *Hua lu* 話路. Here tentatively translated as "current sayings," possibly just means "those", "topic", or "word". This is the only time this term appears in the *YML*, and I have been unable to locate it in other texts with the exception of the passages in CDL 五燈會元 (751[2076]358a3) and *WDHY* 五燈會元 (ZZ138, 273c13) which reproduce this sermon. Both ZGD 五燈會元, p.1227a and Nakamura's BD 仏教語記大辞典, p.14674 define it as "all sorts of topics of talk related to Chan practice"; as basis of their definiton they adduce only the CDL passage just mentioned (Nakamura's reference to CDL 358a is a misprint).

1031. *Pinke* 印可. This Buddhist term is used both as a verb ('to sanction', 'approve of', 'certify [by seal]') and as a noun ('sealed approval', 'certification'). Examples for its verbal use include

**YML** 遍智所說經 T14(475)539c25-26 and *LJSZJ* 極轉所記 T85(2837)1230a14 (BD 平證語記 Vol.2, p.287; Faure Diss., p.733). I translate the *LJSZJ* passage as follows: "Again, it is said that emptiness has neither center nor sides, and that the same is true for the body of all Buddhas. This is what is at issue when I sanction your clear sight of Buddha nature."


*YML* 印 carries the connotation of "mind seal" or "spiritual seal" (ringjing 心印 by which a master recognises a disciple as his [enlightened] spiritual successor). Cf. Nakamura Dôchô's KG 祖堂集成 (Yanagida ed.), p.990; ZGD 仏教語記大辞典, p.55a; BD 仏教語記大辞典, p.68b; *LJLS* 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p.74 (note 84); *LJLD* 臨濟錄 [Demiéville tr.], pp.44, 79, and 247).

1032. *Bofu ye* 博學業. Yunmen is not alone in warning against these dangers; Linji issues the same warning: "Followers of the Way, don't have your face stamped at random with the seal of sanction by an old master anywhere, then go around saying, 'I understand Ch'an, I understand the Way.' Though your eloquence is like a rushing torrent, it is nothing but hell-creating karma." (LJLJ 臨濟錄 T17(1986)49b20-22; LJLL 臨濟錄 [Yanagida tr.], p.103; translation from LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p.14).

1033. *Yanluo wang* 閻羅王 (sft. Yama-raja). This figure has different roles in the Vedic, Brahmanic, and Buddhist traditions; in the last, he is the terrible King of Hell who presides over the judgment of the dead.

1034. *Dingding* 釘釘. Cf. *YML* 雲門廣録 T17(1988)568a2 for the only other occurrence of this expression in this text.

1035. *Chuxin houwe* 初心後學. There are two main possibilities of interpretation:

a) *Chuxin* refers to a young person with short practicing experience, and *houwe* (or *wanwe* 翔學) is someone who decided to embark on the Buddhist Way in his later years. With regard to their realization of Buddhist teaching, both are still beginners. Translation: "A young beginner and/or a late starter" [cf. ZGD 仏教語記大辞典, p.597a].

b) *Chuxin* is an adjectival modifier of the noun *houwe*. Translation: "A beginner-minded late learner", or "an innocent old practitioner". Cf. CC 祖堂集成 3.46,9.

1036. Both CDL 五燈會元 T51[2076]358a5 and *WDHY* 五燈會元 (ZZ138, 273c16 add ren 人 between ji 記 and shuo 説.

1037. *You sheng shi* 由生事. The connection of this question with the preceding passage seems on
the surface to be abrupt. After having denounced pilgrimages, the memorising of sayings, etc. as "a lot of illusion", Yunmen asks his students to get down to their own situation, their "reality": "Is anything the matter with you?"

This same question appears at quite a few other places in the same text (YML 瞻門廣錄 545b18, 546b16, 552a4, 554b10, 567c07, 568c19, and 570a1). YML 瞻門廣錄 548b16 reads: "What, besides wearing a robe, eating, moving bowels, and urinating, is the matter?", and 545b18 "Now let me ask you: What has so far been the matter? What are you lacking?". Cf. also LJJL 臨濟錄 547(1986); LJJL 臨濟錄 (Yanagida tr.), p.102; LJJL 臨濟錄 (Rasaki tr.), p.13 which I translate as follows: "Followers of the Way, right now the full-fledged fellow knows perfectly well that from the beginning nothing is the matter."

1038. The text of this sermon is found, with small differences, in CBL 景德傳燈錄 T51[2076]358a11-19, translated by Chang in Original Teachings, p.290.

1039. Pangjia 僧家. This expression (which does not appear in any current dictionary of Zen terminology) seems to mean "(getting lost) on sidepaths", "(getting) off the right track" (LJJL 臨濟錄 [Yanagida tr.], p.82; BD 佛教語大辭典, p.1247d; Iriya lecture June 1984). Demiéville notes (LJJL 臨濟錄 [Demiéville tr.], p.66) that the vulgar meaning of this expression which literally means "neighbor" is unclear. According to Iriya, jia is here a suffix without specific meaning. In most occurrences which I have so far located, this expression appears as a modifier of a noun or verb in connection with a critical appraisal of pilgrimages or of the monks' futile quest in general (cf. CC 祖堂集 3.78,1; 5.5,9; LJJL 臨濟錄 547[1985]1497c28; 500a25; 501a20; 501b11; YML 562c20, etc.)

1040. Henan haibei 河南海北. If, as Iriya suggested (lecture June 6, 1984), hai could refer to the Great Lake (Taihu 太湖), this whole expression could signify "all of China": all of South China (south of the Yellow River), and the whole north (north of the Great Lake and the Yangtze River).

1041. Shengyuan suo sai 生緣所在. Shengyuan alone also means "birthplace" or "native place". Though this meaning is not mentioned in ZCD 祖堂集 3.9,11; 3.104,3; 5.108,1; ZJL 長沙傳記 ZZ118: 154b10; ML 臨濟錄 547[1986]548c2, etc. I find examples from this and other Chan texts show clearly that this is what it means (cf. CC 祖堂集 3.108,3; 5.108,1; ZJL 長沙傳記 ZZ118: 154b10; YML 臨濟錄 547[1986]548c2, etc.).

1042. The corresponding CBL 景德傳燈錄 text T51[2076]358a13 substitutes a conditional phrase for this interrogative one: "Now, if you know it...".


1044. Cf. note 1024.

1045. Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存 (822-908), one of Yunmen's principal teachers. See p. 4.

1046. Wolong 雲龍, Wolongshan 雲龍山 ("Mt. Sleeping Dragon"), situated in the Houguan district in the northern vicinity of Fuzhou city (福州府治), was one of the principal centers of the Xuefeng 雪峰 and Xuansha 玄沙 lines. Several masters were called Wolong, but as Yuenen means to mention well-known figures it seems safe to eliminate those masters who lived later and those who have no biography in the CC 祖堂集 which was completed soon after Yuenen's death by monks who were also living in South China. As a result, it seems most likely that Yuenen here thinks of Master Anguo 蘇州安福 (758-835), successor of Yuenen's older co-disciple Xuansha Shibe (玄沙師備, 835-839). After Xuansha's death in 908, Master Anguo went (on request of the ruler of the Min kingdom 蘇州安福 (758-835), successor of Yuenen's older co-disciple Xuansha Shibe (玄沙師備, 835-839). After Xuansha's death in 908, Master Anguo went (on request of the ruler of the Min kingdom 闍國) to the Anguo temple on Mt. Wolong (cf. ZCD 祖堂集 493b). Biographical information on this master is found in CC 祖堂集 12, CBL 景德傳燈錄 21, LJJL 臨濟錄 26, and WYHY 親迎 8.
1047. There are again a number of masters who were referred to by this temple name. Following the elimination process mentioned above, it seems likely that the master in question is Xiyuan Daan 大安 (793-883), Dharma heir of Baizhang Huaihai 百丈懷海. He succeeded to Guishan Lingyou 鼎山靈佑 and received the honorary purple robe and a title in 873 (cf. ZGD 詩集大辭典 18a). For biographical information, see SGZ 宋高僧傳 12, CC 祖堂集 17, CDL 景德傳 7, and VDHY 五燈會元 4. CDL 景德傳 751[2076]358a16 gives Xitang 西當 instead of Xiyuan; this is very likely to be a copyist's error.

1048. There are again many masters who took their name from the Gushan mountain, but only one is mentioned in the CC 祖堂集 19. Guishan Shenyen 鼎山神晏 (lived , according to Yanagida's Zenseki kaidai p. 17, from 862 to 938). He was a dharma-heir of Yunmen's teacher Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存. Biographical information is found in CDL 景德傳 18, and VDHY 五燈會元 7. A one-fascicle record of his sayings is contained in GZHYY 古尊宿語要 4 and in GZSYL 古尊宿語錄 37.

1049. Lu ru 柳輯. See note 992.

1050. Slightly different texts of this sermon are found in CDL 提唱傅程也是 T51(2076)358a21-358b4 (translated in Chang's Original Teachings pp.290-291) and in VDHY 五燈會元 22:138:278d4-14 (translated in Luk's Ch'an and Zen Teachings II, pp.196-197).

1051. Ersanjii 二三機. Chang (op.cit., p.290) takes this to mean "two or three opportunities". However, Iriya (lecture, Nov.21, 1986) suggested that this should be read as diersanjii 第三機 ("second or third level of Chan action"). The character zhong 中 which follows ersanjii and the whole theme of the sermon support Iriya's reading. The question "on which level of Chan activity" something is appears several times in this text (YML 雲門廣錄 T47[1988], 566c18, 566a1, 566c15, and 573c13).


1053. Zhupojade 注破. Other occurrences of this rather rare expression (YML 雲門廣錄 T47[1988], 562c16; BYL 碧 publié T48[2003] 156c26 and 168b21) confirm that "to elucidate", "to explain thoroughly", or "to settle the matter" are its probable meanings.


1055. Tianma 天魔: one of four or five Mara (魔羅). The king of the sixth heaven at the top of the world of desire, this demon king obstructs the Buddhist truth and interferes when someone tries to do good. For sources, cf. BD 華嚴語林 大辭典, p.985a. See also SH Soothill/Hodous, p. 146a.

1056. Geteng she 說葛藤. See note 746.

1057. Firen zongkong 任緒模. See note 747.

1058. Naseng shaı 汶僧沙彌. For naseng see note 1006. Shaıi ("Buddhist monk") is an abbreviated transcription of Sanskrit "sāmanerika".

1059. Shuo geteng 說葛藤. For geteng see note 1086.
1060. Shibui nisshoku nitte jiegou 三寶黑記非後: Maybe this whole phrase which was not found elsewhere should be taken literally as a strong curse: "Shit - ask - piss - fire - dirty pig - scabious dog! You don't even know good from bad!"


1062. Fushuang lingguo - 獼豼稜管: Zhang being the indictant or arrest warrant for a crime, Yunmen says here that all those monks committed the same crime. In the earliest stone inscription, this paragraph is added to another short sermon. The text is slightly different: sanren fushuang 三人 - 獼豼 (Tokiwa, p.11.6). Fushuang lingguo is also found in a similar context in WZHL 祖州語錄 ZZ118: 114b6 and in BYL 碧雲録 case 35, T48[2003]174b10. See also the remarks (pp. 143-144) on the earliest instances of the word gongan 公案 in Chan texts.

1063. Zhigou 知有: Analysis of all occurrences of this expression in this text shows that Yunmen uses it simply in the sense of 'to know that there is ...' (or 'to realize [that there is...]' followed by a noun (see for example 557a29, 562a15, 563a27, etc.). Good explanations with examples about a kind of zhigou which is usually not directly followed by a noun and means 'to know [this matter]' or 'to have realized [this matter]' (i.e., to be enlightened) are found in KG 葛藤語録 [Yanagida ed.] p.904 and ZG 神州語録 Vol.7, pp.108-109. Cf. also DSL 洞山峻烈神師語録 T47[1986b]520a25 ff.

1064. Jize 极则: "ultimate norm" or simply "the ultimate" are other possible translations. This exchange is the only one in this text which features this expression. Cf. WZHL 祖州語録 ZZ118:112b16, LIL 羚羊語録 T47[1985]497b22, BYL 碧雲録 case 9, T48[2003]145c7, etc. See also two interesting examples in KG 葛藤語録 [Yanagida ed.], p.901.

1065. Ouou 嘈噪: the mooing of the cow. Yunmen used this several times (555c29, 563c19, 570b9) and Linji once (LIL 羚羊語録 T47[1985]50a2a), but it is Yunmen's teacher Mushou who was most fond of this exclamation. In several instances (WZHL 祖州語録 ZZ118: 113a6, 114b10, 115b8, 116a14, 116a15) Mushou uses it after beating or before severely scolding a disciple. In CLY 萬藤語録 p.100 a commentary is mentioned which equates ouou with zuxu 與相. For meaning and examples of zuxu see Iriya's commentary to WZHL 祖州語録 ZZ119:407d12 (WZHL 祖州語録 [Iriya tr.], p.76). Where ZG 神州語録 [Tokiwa], p.117.5 has ou, ZG 神州語録 [Tokiwa], p.117.5 has cangtian 蒼天.

1066. Luanzong 亂統. Possibly: 'to throw everything into one pot', 'to press every thing into one scheme'. See other examples in this (548c23) and other texts (WZHL 祖州語録 [Yanagida ed.], p.928). It appears that this expression was mainly used by Xuefeng and his disciples Yunmen and Xuanhua.

1067. Shuiguoniu 水牯牛: a female or a castrated water buffalo. This text mentions this animal several times (551a15, 555b10-11, 559c9), but none of these passages explains what it stands for. In Chan texts, it is quite a popular animal; see for instance the episodes in the ZZL 趙州語錄 involving Nanquan (ZZL 祖州語録 Vol.11, pp. 24 and 31) and numerous episodes in the CC 祖堂集 [Yanagida index p. 958]. One of these (CC 祖堂集 4,112.1-6) reads as follows: "Monk: I don't ask about the ordinary entering the holy. How about when the holy enters the ordinary? Caoshan: Being able to become a water buffalo. Monk: How about a water buffalo? Caoshan: Indistinct and dark. Monk: What does this mean? Caoshan: [The water buffalo] only thinks of water and grass. Apart from that there's nothing it knows. Monk: What ultimate matter can it attain? Caoshan: It simply is: Encountering water, it drinks water, and encountering grass, it eats grass. Again a monk asked: What about the water buffalo? Caoshan: It does not demonstrate the fruit of holiness."

1068. Cf. CC 祖堂集 4,111.9 ff.: "[A monk] asked [Master Caoshan]: How about the monk's luggage?"
Caoshan: On the head he carries horns, and on his body a fell.'

1059. A somewhat different text of this whole sermon is found in CDL (Yamaguchi, 1985) 538b6-25. Chang translated it in his original teachings pp. 291-292. The BYL (Shitou’s Green Records) contains parts of this sermon in case 85 (210c7-15; similar to YML 552a7-15) and case 9 (144a24-26; similar to YML 552a10-12). Cf. translations of these BYL passages in Cleary pp. 60 and 549-550.

1060. You shen chi 有什麼事. See notes 947 and 1037. Here, the answer "nothing whatsoever is the matter" is implied. It is thus a statement one would expect from a person for whom everything is fine, i.e. an enlightened one.

1071. You shang an tou 头上安頭. Cf. LJL (Yanagida Jinbunkagaku kenkyûjo seminar copy) p.83 that this expression is more likely to be a con- textual reference to the human body, similar to "rice bag" (fandaizi 饭袋子; see for instance YML 572a21 and 572a23). BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) case 85, T48(2003)210c10 gives Dupi ("belly") instead of the YML’s ‘pida’.

1072. You shang jia shuang 雪上加霜. This is another simile for superfluous effort. It is often used in short comments to poems in the BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) (for instance T48(2003)149b20, 144b11, 168b8). Yunmen apparently liked this expression; it is found five times in the YML (552a5, 552a3, 557a4, 562c14, and 565c29).

1073. The above similes all apply to people who are still bound by illusion. Though they pretend to be selfless (lie in a coffin like a corpse), their ego is still alive (they wink an eye).

1074. Yousheng 託生. Literally, "to entrust one’s life". According to BD (Buddha Dharma Dictionary) p.315f, this Buddhist expression either refers to rebirth in the world (entrusting one’s life to a womb) or to rebirth in paradise (entrusting one’s life to the paradise lotus).

1075. Pidaizi 皮袋: "skin bag". Iriya pointed out in a lecture on this sermon (Jan. 21, 1986) that a monk would never carry a bag made of animal skin. This expression is more likely to be a con-textual reference to the human body, similar to "rice bag" (fandaizi 饭袋子; see for instance YML 572a21 and 572a23). BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) case 85, T48(2003)210c10 gives Dupi ("belly") instead of the YML’s ‘pida’.

1076. Gongcaiyu 公才語. Apart from the CDL’s corresponding passage (CDL 眞勘理 報文集 T51(2016)33b14) and a similar one in BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) case 85, T48(2003)210c12, no other example was found for this expression. However, Hujaku Dôchô says in the Shitsurien (Yanagida Jinbunkagaku kenkyûjo seminar copy p.83) that this expression means the same as Shangcaiyu 上才語 ("words of superior ability"). Dôchô evidently came to this conclusion because the BYL uses the latter in a passage which quotes YML 552a10-12 (cf. BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) case 9, T48(2003)149a24-26). The contrast to the following kind of words (see next note) makes it likely that gongcaiyu refers to self-expression of a master and thus indeed corresponds to shangcaiyu.

1077. Jiuwu dachu yu 先難出語: words uttered spontaneously, on the very spot. BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) case 9, T48(2003) has Jiuwu dachu yu 先難出語 which Cleary (pp. 60 and 550) translates as "words uttered in reference to the self". Yuanwu’s commentary (BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) case 9, T48(2003)149a26) indicates that these different kinds of words are expedient devices for the benefit of students who have elementary capacities.

1078. Tili yu 題語. BYL (Bodhidharma’s Green Records) case 85, T48(2003)210c13 gives Tili yu 題語 instead; this could
mean, as Cleary (p. 550) translates, "words from within the essence." This passage seems to indicate that in discussing Chan sayings, the monks distinguished between words of relative truth (dīrī) and words of absolute truth (dīrī). Based on events -- expedient medicine for specific diseases and words that embody the true self -- self-expression of the awakened person.

1079. *Loa & Lonjing*. This appears to be a reference to each person's true self. For *loa* cf. YML 551b8 and 553a16 and M2BL 致信錄 ZZ118: 113b12 and i17c17.

1080. *Lán* 至年. Literally, "in the year of the donkey." It is said that because the donkey is not one of the twelve "branches" (shier shí 十二支) from which Chinese years take their names this simply means "never" (see for instance KG 葛藤語箋 [Yanagida ed.], p. 386 and M12, 555b5). Iriya pointed out in several lectures that there probably is an additional note of contempt because donkey and dog were China's most despised animals.

1081. Of course, "rest" here has a strong spiritual connotation which is underlined in the following passage.

1082. A simile for extreme personal ostrich-policy: to close one's eyes to anxiety and unrest and pretend that one is at rest.

1083. *Rulu* 入路: "entrance," "way in," "clue" to enlightenment. This expression is most often used in a monk's request: "I implore you, master, to give me some clue" (or: "show me some way in") 之師 指點入路. See for instance YML 545c20 and 550b18, and CC 祖堂集 3.17, 7; 3, 46, 8; 5, 53, 1; 3.107, 11.

1084. *Dadi bùyì suqíja* 打底不意作家. Since it is also found in several other texts, this appears to have been a set expression. Dochû listed some examples (KG 葛藤語箋 [Yanagida ed.], p. 976) and concluded that *dadi* means "from the start," "from the start." This is the interpretation adopted here. However, as Iriya pointed out in a lecture, there is an example in COL 葛藤編集錄 17(55)207b 337c11) which demonstrates a different usage of *dadi*. There it is used with the meaning of "thoroughly accomplished".

1085. A less informal translation would be "busily" or "in a meaningless frenzy". Cf. the explanation in ZTSY 祖庭事苑 ZZ 113:5c16. Prof. Iriya mentioned that this expression was since Han times used in the sense of "senseless".

1086. *Geteng*. See LLFL 致信錄 [Yanagida tr.], p. 47 for the different meanings of this term. Cf. also KG 葛藤語箋 [Yanagida ed.], p. 958 and LLFL 致信錄 [Demienville tr.], p. 29. When this word is used in a negative sense, the meaning of 'creepers' (parasitical vegetation) is implied. Words are thus likened to creepers in which one gets entangled. In modern Chinese, *Geteng* thus came to mean "complication".

1087. *Chui zhe ra* 雜折腰. A legal term which means "to cut off at the hip." This was a punishment for criminals.

1088. *Shouga* 受屈. This means literally "to become a victim of injustice" (R 4408) or "to undergo brutal treatment", "to be bullied" (M2, 707a). Cf. also YML 545c8 and 553b17.

1089. Yunmen's teacher Muszhou used to do the same; cf. M2BL 致信錄 ZZ119: 114b5.

1091. *Fú wèi dài wèi yuàn* 叫汝父母為。*Wei dui* 論文 is translated as "is an object". *Wei yuàn* 論文 is translated as "stands in relation".

1092. *Sida* 四大: the four elements earth, water, fire, and wind. These are the elements from which all things are made. Cf. BD 仏教語大辞典, p.526c, or SH Soothill/Hodous, p. 173a.


1094. *Sanjiaocun liao po shuo* 三家村老褒語: The grandmother showers her children and grandchildren with love and kindness; in Chan texts, expressions like "grandmotherly kindness" or "compassionate like a grandmother's heart" are found. Yunmen mentioned such grandmotherly kindness several times (YML 雲門語錄 T17[1988] 552c15, 555a13, and 555b18. See KG 翻譯語录, p. 1049 for some other examples in Chan literature. In addition, the CC 祖堂集 (5.103,3-4) contains a passage where Yunmen's teacher Mazhou uses the expression "Chan of a granny from a three-house hamlet". Compassion shown by a grandmother from a three-house hamlet may be even greater since she has so few persons to distribute it to.

1095. *Yau shen ae sui guo* 有什麼罪過.

1096. *Jushi* 舌 有 有滑. This and other passages of the same kind (for instance YML 544c14 or BYL 勝門語錄 case 4, T48[2003]143b11, and DSL 這山語錄 523b18-19) indicate that the construction "ru....slide" simply means "must".

1097. *Zongcheng* 宗極. According to ZOD 禪學大辞典, p.407b the expression zongchen was used in Chan circles to refer to Chan after Bodhidharma (as opposed to other Hinayana or Mahayana movements). As often, ZOD only gives an example from Dogen's writings. There are, however, numerous examples in Chan literature. In the BYL 勝門語錄 for instance, the question "Do I have a share in the essential matter of Chan handed down from antiquity?" appears several times (BYL 勝門語錄 case 5, T48[2003]145a14; case 22, 162c25, etc.) Cf. also YML 雲門語録 T14[1988]555a8.

1098. *Yi chuan* - 言語. This is probably short for *yi chuan yu* 言語. LJLS 翻譯錄[Sasaki tr.] p.174 notes: "A Chan technical term meaning a word or phrase of deep significance or pertinence which reveals the speaker's degree of insight or which transforms the listener's mind at a crucial psychological moment. One of the best known latter instances of the term is in Case 2 of the *Wumenguan*. See R.H.Blyth: *Manokan*, p.45. This note relates to an instance of *yi chuan yu* in LJLS 翻譯錄 T47[1985]509a22. The YML contains also one such example (574a22). Cf. also ZKB 吏林僧語錄 Z2:11b13 and 115b4.

1099. *Dongxing* 東行: "go east and go west". All other occurrences in the YML 雲門語録 (T47[1988]546b8, 549c16, 550c25, 551a24 and 552c3) as well as the single example in the CC (3.54.5) support a rendering such as "go wherever one wants". YML 551a24 for instance reads: "May someone who can put it right come forward! If there isn't anyone, don't hinder me from going wherever I please". Cf. also BYL 勝門語録 case 77, T48[2003]204c18.

1100. A somewhat different text of the first few lines of this sermon (553a13-16; up to "try presenting that") is found in SBE 附錄僧語錄 Z2:127:225a1-11.
In this text, this expression is found only once more (551a10: "study Chan and learn about the Way"). Translations such as "to practice meditation" [LLJS (Sasaki tr.), p.24] and "to consult Chan masters" [LJL (Demelville tr.)] have been proposed, but the present passage and other examples of usage (particularly ZDO [1985b26]) suggest that a less specific translation ("to learn about Chan", "to study Chan") is to be preferred.

This episode forms case 34 of the BYL 薄黃錄 T48[2003]172c19-24.

1104. Cf. LJL 臨濟錄 T47[1985]497c11: "Bodhi and nirvana are like itching posts for asses."

1105. Bu shuobian 不著便. An alternative rendering is "to be in bad shape" or "to be out of luck". See note 994.

1106. See note 380.

1107. Chuski 出世: this expression is often used for the appearance of Buddhas in the world (cf. DD 仏統語辞典, p.672); such instances are also found in this text (547a27, 550b26-27, 550b22). But in passages such as this one and LJL 臨濟錄 T47[1985]505b26, a rendering such as "to become a temple priest" or "to become head of a temple" (cf. LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p.55) appears to be more appropriate.

1108. Ganshijue 干洗槽: Much commented upon, this expression was usually translated as "shit-wiping stick" [cf. LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], pp.3 and 68 (note 24), Yanagida tr. p.52, Demelville tr. p.33 (includes numerous references)]. Using mainly passages from the Yunmen-ji, Prof. Iriya has recently made a convincing case for the translation given here, "dry piece of shit" [Iriya, Yoshitaka 入矢義高, Jiko to eiketsu pp.94-101. A key argument is a passage in Master Dahui’s recorded sayings: "The dog which bites into human excrement (shijue) is not a good dog (咬人屎腸不是好狗)." T47[1998]872a1-2].

1109. Luocao 落葉: As Mujaku Dōchū (KG 1990) points out with authority, this is a vernacular expression referring to a teacher who from his position above lowers himself compassionately into the weeds of delusion and ignorance. In the BYL 薄黃錄 one finds also some examples of it being used for the ones who have fallen into delusion (for instance T48[2002]156c13 [case 16] and 163c7 [case 22]).

1110. Suiyu shiren 来雨神人. Yunnan uses this phrase a second time in the following context: "[Master Yunnan] mentioned Zuefeng who had called a monk to step forward. The monk came forward and Zuefeng asked: 'Where are you going?' "To group work," replied the monk. Zuefeng said: 'Go!' Master [Yunnan] commented: 'This is 'following words to get to know a man.'" [YML 淄某澤錄 T47[1988]555a22-23].

1111. "Light" (guang 光) is commonly used in Chan texts as a simile for enlightenment. Linji (LJL 臨濟錄 T47[1985]498b13) describes enlightenment as follows: "Everywhere is purity, light penetrates all directions, and the myriads things are, as they are, one." Penetration or breaking through (toutei 脫透) is, as the second character tou also indicates, associated with liberation. See for example LJL 臨濟錄 T47[1985]500b24, BYL 薄黃錄 ZZ119:407b3, BYL 薄黃錄 T48[2003]172c19-24.
1113. Tiqie chu buming 切處不明. Yunmen expressed his most pressing problem in similar terms when he went to see Master Moshou: "The matter of my self is not clarified" (jishi buming 已事不明); see note 61.

1114. Fashen 法身.

1115. Gu 古 气息 'breath', 'to breathe'. This is the only occurrence in this text. The context suggests some meaning like 'what reason is there to puff oneself up?' The Linjilu (LJJ 臨濟錄 T47(1985)502c01) also contains a single passage with this term: "A great man does not put on the airs of a great man." (In this case, Demièville's translation [p.161] makes more sense than that of Sasaki et al. [p.37]).

1116. Qidian badao 七颠八倒 confusion, disorder, chaos, upside down. Japanese sources tend to take this as 'writhing in agony' (shittellu), but was unable to find an example for such a reading in Chinese sources. A passage by Zhuxi 朱子 cited in 大意書 ah7[1998]933c17 for instance reads: "Just watch the Wu 五 [gongan/kôan 公案] right in the confusion (qidian badao) of daily life."

1117. Fan tou 鳜頭 "The monk in charge of the preparation and cooking of the rice in a nonastery, i.e., the supervisor of the rice department" (LJLS 臨濟錄 [Sasaki tr.], p.82 note 17).

1118. Makebore boluom 摩訶般若波羅蜜. The following two (BTL) respectively three (WBT) sentences are also found in BTL 臨濟錄 case 62, T46(2003)194b ff. and in WBT 五燈會元 ZZ138:280a ff.

1119. Changan sui le 長安雖樂 the implied "it is not a place to stay for long" is added in BTL 臨濟錄 case 64, T46(2003)195b14: "A man of old said, 'Though Changan is pleasant, it is not [a place] to stay for long 長安雖樂, 不是久居'."

1120. Bulu feng guju 不露風骨句. For gu as 'sharp' see 大漢語事典 vol. 12, p. 5698 (meaning nr. 4). In WNG 無門關 case 24, T48(2005)296a19 features an identically pronounced but differently written phrase: 不露風骨句. The following three lines of the religious verse are identical to those of Yunmen's verse translated below; I propose that it means "A sharp statement which does not reveal its character". Other renderings were proposed by Hirata [ZG 神的語錄 Vol.18, p. 94 and note on p. 96], Shibayama [Zen Comments on the Mumonkan, p. 181], and Dumoulin [Mumonkan; Die Schranke ohne Tor, p. 100]. See also third note after this.

1122. Xiangdao 向道: 'to talk constantly'. This translation follows NG 菩薩語錄 [Yanagida ed.], p. 963. For LJJ 臨濟錄 T47(1985)499c6 I suggest a translation which differs from Sasaki et al.'s (p.20). They translate xiangdao by "to approach the Way": "If you meet a man on the road who has penetrated the Way, above all do not try to approach the Way." My proposed translation would be: "If you meet a man on the road who has penetrated the Way, above all do not constantly talk." Similarly, the passage in PJS 龜居士語録 ZZ120:25b18 would read: "I keep saying that you mustn't hold it as a principle" rather than "I just said you mustn't hold it as a principle" given in PJS 龜居士語録 [Sasaki/Irizu/Fraser tr.], p.59.

1123. Nan nan 南南 'to babble', 'toumble', 'to chatter'. The YML contains only one other occurrence of this expression (552al1), but in other texts it is found several times: XPL 窪山語録.
This twenty-character verse is quoted in WKG (無門慧眼) case 34, T48[2003] 286a19-20; the first line is, as mentioned above, a little different ('character' instead of 'point'). Though Hirata [2003b Vol. 1, p.96] mentions that the verse stems from the Records of Yunmen, he neither noticed this difference nor did he take the nominal form of this expression in the preceding question of the YNL ("what is ... ") into account. If one does what Hirata did not do, the case for taking fengfu 風骨 as an adjective (see Hirata, op. cit., note on p. 96) is weak indeed.

Tianyi Yihuai 天衣建幢 lived from 993 until 1064. Cf. page 25.

This prince (or, as he called himself, emperor) Liu 劉 was either Liu Yin (劉隱; re. 909-911) or Liu Yan (劉顗; re. 911-942).

Cf. note 88.

Cf. note 105.

Shuanghong 翳鳯. According to S959 羽異縉 this title was conferred upon Master Yunmen in the year 338.

Yen 宓 is the monosyllabic name of the Hubei region. It can also refer to one of the Warring States kingdoms (destroyed in 222 B.C.) or to four of the Sixteen Kingdoms during the Oriental Jin period (the first was founded in 349 A.D.).

Shu 楚 designates either Hubei alone or both Hunan and Hubei. It is also the name of a famous ancient kingdom (740-223 B.C.).

Qiupu [Jingde] 秋浦 is a place in the southwestern key of the Quichi district of Anhui province. As mentioned at the end of this preface, Master Yihuai stayed at the Jingde temple.

Juan shu 卷舒, "folding and unfolding", or "wrapping up and opening out". For other examples see note 60. The meaning of this expression is clarified in a passage of the BYL (碧飯記) case 5, T48[2003]144c19-20: "[Yunmen's master Yufeng's] insight and function are simultaneous, and folding and unfolding are in accord in his preaching. Principle and phenomena are not-two; he practices both the provisional and the real 照用同時卷舒齊日屆理事;r:-~二種實並行." 

Qianchui 錙拋 the blacksmith's tongs and hammer. This expression is often found in connection with religious training (for instance in the prefaces of the LJJ [臨濟續] and of the BYL [碧飯記]). Cf. Mujaku Boku's comment in KG 葛藤語簧 [Yanagida ed.], p.903.

Beifen 本分. Cf. note 993. The expression Beifen qianchui is for instance also found in the third chapter of the Records of Master Mingjue (明覺師語錄). After a monk mentioned Master Deshan's beating somebody, Mingjue said: "In the manner of pure gold which is refined a hundred times, one must forge and temper one's very own matter." (T47[1996]686b19).

Jinshtong or yushen 金聲而玉振. Literally, "the sound of the bell and the vibration of the [sounding] stone". Bell and sounding stone produce two of the traditional eight sounds (the others being sounds brought forth by pottery, hides, silk strings, wood, gourds, and bamboo). Orchestral performances started with the sound of the bell and ended with that of the sounding stone; hence the meaning "beginning and end". Cf. W11,465a-b.
1137. *Naime* 埋沒. See note 948.

1138. Cf. note 91 for a translation of the passage in question, and the remarks under source 9 of this annotated list of biographical sources.

1139. The following is a list of Muan's entries with corresponding passages in today's YML:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>祖庭事說</th>
<th>CHAPTER EXPRESSION</th>
<th>雲門畑録</th>
<th>T 47</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 8a1</td>
<td>丁</td>
<td>YML 下</td>
<td>571a27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 8a3</td>
<td>丁</td>
<td>YML 下</td>
<td>571b04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 9a18</td>
<td>室中</td>
<td>白</td>
<td>YML 下</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 10b13</td>
<td>室中</td>
<td>趙州無寶主</td>
<td>YML 下</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6b10</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>出三句語</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6b15</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>頭頭物物傷</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6b16</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>畢候</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6b17</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>眼中</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6b18</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>商量</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6c2</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>佛德難非過</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6c3</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>終語</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6c4</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>什方</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2TSY 6c5</td>
<td>上</td>
<td>同一万</td>
<td>YML 下/頭</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1140. For a thematical grouping of all different versions of this story, cf. note 63.

1141. For all different versions of this story, see note 71.

1142. Cf. note 89 for different accounts.

1143. Cf. note 91.

1144. Cf. note 49.

1145. Cf. note 89.

1146. Cf. note 63c.

1147. Cf. note 71.

1148. Cf. note 71c.

1149. Cf. note 71 a and b.

1150. Cf. note 89. If CDL 康德傅儲量 should found to be older than SSL, it would be the first source for this story.

1151. Cf. note 63d.

1152. Cf. note 71a.

1153. This is translated in note 52.
1154. See page 8.
1155. Cf. note 91.
1156. Cf. note 63d.
1157. Cf. note 89.
1158. Cf. note 91.
1159. Cf. note 114.
1163. Cf. note 71 b and c.
1164. See note 63c.
1165. See note 71b.
1166. See note 91.